This chapter of <u>DA</u> takes its theme from Paul's letter to the Galatians rather than from one of the four gospels. Its content is theological rather than narrative. It seeks to set the coming of Christ in the context of God's promises and providence. Arthur White describes this chapter along with chapters 1 and 2 as being the "general introductory chapters" of <u>DA</u> and notes that these chapters were being worked on by Marian Davis in 1896 when the book "was thought to be nearing completion." 1

Our studies show that this chapter was constructed for the most part from eight Ellen White articles and letters dating from the 1890s. Most of these materials were written in Australia when Ellen White was working on the life of Christ. We do not find the theme treated in Spiritual Gifts or such a chapter in Spirit of Prophecy. Volume II of Spirit of Prophecy does devote a few paragraphs to the religious beliefs and practices of the Jewish people at the time of the first advent of Christ.

Since this study quotes from an earlier text of Ellen White only when the earlier text indicates greater dependency upon a source or helps to confirm the use of a particular source, we are providing a list of these articles and where they may be found in their entirety. In the following list of references the identification of the Ellen

larthur L. White, Ellen G. White: Volume 4, The Australian Years (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1983), p. 385.

White article or manuscript as used in our study is given first after which we indicate the number of sentences quoted from that article in our comparison of literary parallels. We then provide the title of the article and where it may be found.

- 1. ST(90) [14 sentences] "God Made Manifest in Christ," ST Vol. XVI, No. 8 (Jan. 20, 1890).
- 2. MS(24) [10 sentences] Sentences begin with the section entitled, "The Causes of the Jewish Rejection of Christ," MS 24, March, 1891, pp. 20-22.
- 3. ST(94) [26 sentences] "God's Love Unmeasured," ST Vol. XX, No. 14 (Feb. 5, 1894). Sentence numbers begin about the middle of the article.
- 4. Lt(43) [3 sentences] Letter of Ellen White written from N. S. W., Australia, on June 14, 1895, to Dr. J. H. Kellogg, pp. 18-25.
- 5. RH(95) [17 sentences] "Satan's Malignity Against Christ and His People," RH Vol. XXXII. No's. 43, 44 (Oct. 22, 29, 1895). This material is taken from the EGW letter to J. H. Kellogg mentioned under entry 4 above.
- 6. FE(399-401) [21 sentences] "The Divine Teacher,"
 from MS 9, 1896 (copied March 23, 1896).
- 7. BE(97) [5 sentences] "Christ the Life Giver," BE Vol. XII, No. 10 (March 8, 1897).
- 8. ST(98) [3 sentences] "The Truth as It Is in Jesus", ST Vol. XXIV, No. 24 (June 16, 1898).

The articles used by Marian Davis relating to the

content of this chapter originated as late as twenty years before the death of Ellen White. We have been able to locate Ellen White's handwritten text only of MS 24, 1891. According to the White Estate records, this manuscript was copied in 1903 by C. C. Crisler. Once in this chapter and only seldom elsewhere we make reference to a letterbook which contains a working copy of the first 39 chapters of DA in their pre-publication state. Where the text of this editor's copy is closer to a source we have indicated this stage of the DA text as DA(MS).

Other than her use of the Bible (5 sentences), Ellen White appears to have made use of three authors in the composition of her supporting articles used to prepare this chapter of DA. These are: E. W. Thayer, Sketches from the Life of Jesus, Historical and Doctrinal, Fleming H. Revell Co., 1891 [SLJ]; William S. Kennedy, Messianic Prophecy, and the Life of Christ, Barnes & Burr, 1860 [MP]; and John Harris, The Great Teacher, Second Edition, J. S. and C. Adams, 1836 [GT].

The reader is reminded once again that this study limits the comparison to verbal expression. Parallels have to be rather close and in a sequence which indicates literary dependency. And since the actual handwritten materials of Ellen White were edited and re-worked by her copyists and bookmakers, the closer we can move the

¹A photocopy of the relevant portions of MS 24, 1891, and the text as copied by C. C. Crisler appear in Appendix D, as does also Lt(43), 1895, to Dr. Kellogg.

comparison to the point of origin, i.e., the first writing of Ellen White, the better chance we have of making an accurate comparison, even though we are not able to utilize these earlier compositions in our final comparison figures. Our point of comparison is a chapter in a book, not an isolated letter, manuscript article, or portions thereof which have been combined at a later time with other texts and independent writings to form the finished chapter. These earlier writings can, however, help to establish the claim that Ellen White at some point was using a given source.

comparisons which follow. the textual In left-facing page contains the Ellen White text and the right-facing page shows the source text. The sequence follows the DA text which is presented in full for each The earlier writings of Ellen White have been inserted where they seem best to represent the same context and theme development. The content of the earlier writings will not always match the content of the DA sentence after which they occur. The sequence of thought does not always remain the same between texts which use the same or similar sentences. If the earlier writing contains a number of sentences where both the verbal expression and the order of development matches a source, we will insert them in the DA text in the same order. If they correspond to the DA sentence, but not the DA sentence order, we will match content rather than sequence. When the earlier sentence

contains a source parallel treating a subject not included in the <u>DA</u> text, we will insert the sentences in their original order in a location where other sentences from this same document match the DA text.

The pre-DA materials have been indented for easier identification.

Verbatim words appear in boldface type and the more obvious paraphrased portions have been underlined along with verbatim expressions. Following the Ellen White sentence, the source reference is given in brackets and the evaluation appears within closed parentheses. The source reference indicates the initial letter of the author's surname, the page where the literary parallel may be found in the source indicated, and the sentence number. By glancing to the right-facing page the reader may note the source text which is introduced by the same page and sentence number. The author's last name and the initials taken from the major words of the source title follow the quotation of the source text.

- DA1/31 "WHEN the fullness of the time was come, God sent forth His Son, . . . to redeem them that were under the law, that we might receive the adoption of sons." [Gal. 4:4, 5.] (B2)
- DA2/31 The Saviour's coming was foretold in Eden. [T/2.8] (P3)
- DA3/31 When Adam and Eve first heard the promise, they looked for its speedy fulfillment. (I1)
- DA4/31 They joyfully welcomed their first-born son, hoping that he might be the Deliverer. (I1)
- DA5/31 But the fulfillment of the promise tarried. (I1)
- DA6/31 Those who first received it died without the sight. (I1)
- DA7/31 From the days of Enoch the promise was repeated through patriarchs and prophets, keeping alive the hope of His appearing, and yet He came not. [K/174.2] (I2)
- DA8/31 The prophecy of Daniel revealed the time of His advent, but not all rightly interpreted the message.

 [K/175.6] (12)
- DA9/31 Century after century passed away; the voices of the prophets ceased. (I1)
- DA10/31 The hand of the oppressor was heavy upon Israel, and many were ready to exclaim, "The days are prolonged, and every vision faileth." [Ezek. 12:22.] (I1)
- DAll/31 But like the stars in the vast circuit of their appointed path, God's purposes know no haste and no delay. [T/22.1] (I2)

- 13.5 But when the fulness of time was come, God sent forth his son, made of a woman, made under the law, to redeem them that were under the law. [Thayer, SLJ]
- 2.8 The announcement to Adam of the appearance of a divine personage, who should also be the seed of the woman, who should crush the head of the old serpent, regain man's lost inheritance, and atone for human sin . . . [Thayer, SLJ]

- 174.2 We remember the Patriarch's remark, that "Judah's sceptre should not depart till Shiloh come;" we remember the promise of an eternal dominion to the family of David: and still more vividly shines the vision of Daniel. [Kennedy, MP]
- 175.6 The seventy weeks, too, were well nigh fulfilled. If Daniel were a prophet of the Lord, the Anointed would then appear. [Kennedy, MP]

[See Thayer 22.1 below]

- DA12/32 Through the symbols of the great darkness and the smoking furnace, God had revealed to Abraham the bondage of Israel in Egypt, and had declared that the time of their sojourning should be four hundred years. (II)
- DA13/32 "Afterward," He said, "shall they come out with great substance." [Gen. 15:14.] (B2)
- DA14/32 Against that word, all the power of Pharaoh's proudempire battled in vain. (I1)
- DA15/32 On "the self-same day" appointed in the divine promise, "it came to pass, that all the hosts of the Lord went out from the land of Egypt." [Ex. 12:41.] (B2)
- DA16/32 So in heaven's council the hour for the coming of Christ had been determined. [T/22.1] (I2)
- DA17/32 When the great clock of time pointed to that hour, Jesus was born in Bethlehem. [T/22.1] (I2)
- DA18/32 "When the fullness of the time was come, God sent forth His Son." (B2)
- DA19/32 Providence had directed the movements of nations, and the tide of human impulse and influence, until the world was ripe for the coming of the Deliverer. (I1)
- DA20/32 The nations were united under one government. [T/21.6] (P3)
- DA21/32 One language was widely spoken, and was everywhere recognized as the language of literature. [T/21.8] (P2)

22.1 It was the fulness of time; the world was fully ripe for the event. The clock of destiny had struck the hour:

God is in no haste about his special operations. [Thayer, SLJ]

- 21.6 While the dominion of Rome so oppressed the nations; it yet unified the world, and harmonized it into the semblance of one family. [Thayer, SLJ]
- 21.8 When we further consider that there was, as it were, one universal language, superseding by its copiousness and fulness all others,—the language of literature, of cultivation, of the arts, and of trade and commerce,—we easily see that the whole world had almost become one family: [Thayer, SLC]

DA22/32 From all lands the Jews of the dispersion gathered to Jerusalem to the annual feasts. (II)

DA23/32 As these returned to the places of their sojourn. they could spread throughout the world the tidings of the Messiah's coming. (I1)

DA24/32 At this time the systems of heathenism were losing their hold upon the people. [K/174.7] [T/14.5] (12)

DA25/32 Men were weary of pageant and fable. [K/174.7] [T/14.5] (I2)

DA26/32 They longed for a religion that could satisfy the heart. [K/174.8] [T/16.3] (I2)

DA27/32 While the light of truth seemed to have departed from among men, there were souls who were looking for light, and who were filled with perplexity and sorrow. [H/4/49] (P3)

ST(90)1 At the first advent of Christ, darkness covered the earth, and gross darkness the people. [H/7/49] (B1)

ST(90)2 Light and truth seemed to have departed from among men, and Satan appeared to reign in undisputed power. [H/4-7/49] (I2)

ST(90)5 Many were sighing, "What is truth?" [H/5,6/49] (P3)

MS(24)2 The most learned men in the days of Christ,—philosophers, legislators, priests,—in all their pride and superiority, could not interpret God's character. [H/3/49] (P2)

- 174.7 Certain it is, that the best forms of heathenism then began to wane. They had come to their flowering and fruitage; they had done what they could, and were about to die. [Kennedy, MP]
- 14.5 Christ came as soon as idolatry had lost its hold upon any considerable portion of mankind. [Thayer, SLJ]
- 174.8 The better part of the heathen were yearning for a new religious development. [Kennedy, MP]
- 16.3 Idolatry had begun to destroy itself; and the great heart of humanity was yearning after the true and living God; and this was the proper time for his interposition.

 [Thayer, SLJ]
- 4/49 Reason, confident in her resources, had sent forth her sons under all auspices, and in every direction: but they returned, defeated and disheartened; the footsteps of truth could nowhere be found. [Harris, GT]
- 7/49 Darkness covered the earth, and gross darkness the minds of the people. (Isaiah 60:2) [Harris, GT]
- 5/49 In vain had generation after generation asked, in its way to Oblivion, 'What is truth?' [Harris, GT]

MS(24)3 They could not discern spiritual things. [H/3/49] (P3)

MS(24)4 The ancient pages of the oracles of the gods were turned over and over again, but did not give the wise men any help in solving the problem.

[H/6,9/49,50] (P3)

DA28/32 They were thirsting for a knowledge of the living God, for some assurance of a life beyond the grave.
[H/19/50,51] (12)

MS(24)20 Would human ignorance give way? [H/19/50,51] (P3)

MS(24)21 Would there be a thirsting for a deeper knowledge of God? [H/19/50,51] (P2)

ST(90)7 They were thirsting for a knowledge of the living God, for some assurance of a life beyond the tomb. [H/19/50,51] (I2)

DA29/32 As the Jews had departed from God, faith had grown dim, and hope had well-nigh ceased to illuminate the future.
[H/8/49+] (12)

DA30/32 The words of the prophets were uncomprehended. (I1)

DA31/32 To the masses of the people, death was a dread mystery; beyond was uncertainty and **gloom**. [H/8,17/49,50+] (12)

DA32/32 It was not alone the wailing of the mothers of Bethlehem, but the cry from the great heart of humanity, that was borne to the prophet across the centuries,—the voice heard in Ramah, "lamentation, and weeping, and great mourning, Rachel weeping for her children, and would not be comforted, because they are not." [Matt. 2:18] (II)

- 6/49 The devotee had urged the inquiry at the shrine of his god; the priest, at his altar of sacrifice; the sage had repeated it as he walked amidst the works and wonders of creation; but nothing was heard in reply; nothing, but the faint and bewildering echo, 'What is truth?' [Harris, GT]
- 3/49 Legislators, philosophers, and poets--the pride of their time, and the boast of the species--had toiled to construct a system whose top should reach unto heaven; but in vain; they built only to the clouds. [Harris, GT]

[See Harris 9/50 below.]

19/50,51 In this remarkable passage, we behold the divine philosopher, rising from a mournful survey of human ignorance, turning with an air of despondency from every earthly resource, yet eagerly thirsting for a knowledge of God, and virtue, and futurity, till his thirst grows into a desire for celestial aid, and his desire matures to an anticipation, and even a prediction, which God was actually intending to fulfil; perhaps indeed, we err in not cordially recognising in his language the presence of heavenly inspiration. [Harris, GT]

8/49+ Nor can the state of Judea be regarded as an exception to the prevailing gloom. [Harris, GT]

ST(90)3 Rival sects existed, and among those who professed to be the servants of God were displayed love of pre-eminence and strife for power and position. [H/9/50] (I2)

MS(24)16 So long had they neglected to study and contemplate the Bible, that its pages were to them a mystery. [H/10/50] (P3)

MS(24)17 They turned with aversion from the truth of God to the traditions of men. [H/10/50] (P2)

DA33/32 In "the region and shadow of death," men sat unsolaced. [Matt. 4:16] [H/21b/51] (B1)

ST(98)3 Men were sitting in the shadow of death. [H/21b/51] (V2)

DA34/32 With longing eyes they looked for the coming of the Deliverer, when the darkness should be dispelled, and the mystery of the future should be made plain. [H/21b/51] (I2)

MS(24)14 The earth was languishing for a teacher sent from God; but when He came just as the living oracles specified He would come, the priests and the instructors of the people could not discern that He was their Saviour, nor could they understand the manner of His coming. [H/15/50] (12)

this gloom to be lifted, and God revealed to the world. [H/14,15/50] (P3)

ST(98)5

A teacher from heaven must come to [H/15/50] (P3)

- 9/50 There, indeed, the ancient oracles of God were yet extant; but their still small voice, heard only, at any time, by the attentive listener, had been long since overpowered and silenced by the dogmas of their professed interpreters, and the clamors of rival sects. [Harris, GT]
- 10/50 The spiritual import of the sacred volume, like the seven-sealed roll of the Apocalypse, had long been closed to the Jew; and when the lion of the tribe of Judah prevailed to open it, the aversion with which they turned from the sight, showed how unaccustomed they were to gaze on the truth. [Harris, GT]
- 21b/51 what must have been the wishes and aspirations of those who, with a keen perception of their exigence, were sitting in darkness and the shadow of death? [Harris, GT]

- 14/50 If she would relieve the gloom, she must descend, and shine, and dissipate it with her actual presence. [Harris, GT]
- 15/50 All things proclaimed the urgent necessity that the world should be visited by 'a teacher sent from God.'
 [Harris, GT]

DA35/33 Outside of the Jewish nation there were men who foretold the appearance of a divine instructor.
[H/16,22/50,51] (P3)

ST(90)8 There were men not of the Jewish nation who prophesied that an inspired instructor would come to teach them of the truth. [H/17,18/50] (P3)

DA36/33 These men were seeking for truth, and to them the Spirit of Inspiration was imparted. [H/18/19/50] (P3)

DA37/33 One after another, like stars in the darkened heavens, such teachers had arisen. (I1)

DA38/33 Their words of prophecy had kindled hope in the hearts of thousands of the Gentile world. [H/20/51] (P3)

DA39/33 For hundreds of years the Scriptures had been translated into the Greek language, then widely spoken throughout the Roman Empire. (I1)

DA40/33 The Jews were scattered everywhere, and their expectation of the Messiah's coming was to some extent shared by the Gentiles. [H/22/51] (I2)

DA41/33 Among those whom the Jews styled heathen were men who had a better understanding of the Scripture prophecies concerning the Messiah than had the teachers in Israel. (I1)

DA42/33 There were some who hoped for His coming as a deliverer from sin. (I1)

DA43/33 Philosophers endeavored to study into the mystery of the Hebrew economy. [H/24/51] [K/174.8] (I2)

- 16/50 Not only did this awful exigence exist, it was extensively felt and acknowledged; and, by many of the more enlightened heathens, a Divine Instructor was ardently desired. [Harris, GT]
- 17/50 In illustration of this, the language of Plato has been often cited; nor is it easy to conceive of any thing more conclusive and striking than his picture of Socrates advising his pupil to forego the usual sacrifices until a teacher should be sent from on high. [Harris, GT]
- 18/50 In another place, speaking of such an inspired teacher, he represents, with prophetic sagacity and precision, that 'he must be poor, and void of all qualifications but those of virtue alone; that a wicked world would not bear his instructions and reproofs; and therefore, within three or four years after he began to preach, he would be persecuted, imprisoned, scourged, and at last put to death.' [Harris, GT]

[See Harris, 19/50 above.]

- 20/51 And in uttering the desire which his words disclose, we may take it for granted, he was clothing the thoughts of a thousand bosoms, venting the secret and cherished longings of unnumbered hearts. [Harris, GT]
- 22/51 Now the appearance of a Divine Instructor, thus absolutely necessary, and ardently desired, might have been warrantably expected. [Harris, GT]

- 24/51 Besides, the very presence and nature of the Jewish economy was a standing evidence that such was his gracious intention. [Harris, GT]
- 174.8 Greeks and Egyptians began to frequent the Hebrew festivals, and to look thitherward for a new faith.

 [Kennedy, MP]

- DA44/33 But the bigotry of the Jews hindered the spread of the light. [K/174.9] (P3)
- DA45/33 Intent on maintaining the separation between themselves and other nations, they were unwilling to impart the knowledge they still possessed concerning the symbolic service. [K/174.9] (I2)
- DA46/33+ The true Interpreter must come. [H/25,26/51] (P3)
- DA47/34 The One whom all these types prefigured must explain their significance. [H/25-29/51,52] (I2)
- DA48/34 Through nature, through types and symbols, through patriarchs and prophets, God had spoken to the world.
 [H/23,25/51] (P3)
- DA49/34 Lessons must be given to humanity in the language of humanity. (I1)
- DA50/34 The Messenger of the covenant must speak. [H/37/52] (P3)
 - BE(97)10 The messenger of the covenant, the Sun of Righteousness, must rise upon the world. [H/37/52] (P1)
- DA51/34 His voice must be heard in His own temple. (I1)
- DA52/34 Christ must come to utter words which should be clearly and definitely understood. (I1)
- DA53/34 He, the author of truth, must separate truth from the chaff of man's utterance, which had made it of no effect. (I1)

174.9 Hebrew bigotry and exclusiveness alone prevented them from making still greater advance. [Kennedy, MP]

25/51 Bearing the marks of a celestial origin, and fraught with important truth, it yet veiled its meaning in types and enigmas, the solution of which remained to be given. (26) Here were mysteries—where was the interpreter? (27) Here were shadows—the substance, 'the very things themselves,' must be at hand. [Harris, GT]

23/51 Indubitable evidence existed that God already had spoken to man, at sundry times, and in divers manners; and as the ignorance of the world was still unreclaimed, and there was no intimation that his voice had been final, there was ground to anticipate that, in his own time, he would break the silence again. [Harris, GT]

37/52 For, reading on to its closing lines, we find it predict him as the Messenger of the covenant who was yet to come; and the Sun of Righteousness yet to arise. [Harris, GT]

DA54/34 The principles of God's government and the plan of redemption must be clearly defined. (I1)

DA55/34 The lessons of the Old Testament must be fully set before men. (I1)

DA56/34 Among the Jews there were yet steadfast souls, descendants of that holy line through whom a knowledge of God had been preserved. (I1)

DA57/34 These still looked for the hope of the promise made unto the fathers. [H/31/52] (I2)

DA58/34 They strengthened their faith by dwelling upon the assurance given through Moses, "A Prophet shall the Lord your God raise up unto you of your brethren, like unto me; Him shall ye hear in all things whatsoever He shall say unto you." [Acts 3:22.] [H/31/52] (B1)

ST(90)10 They rejoiced in the promise that God had made to his servant Moses: "I will raise them up a prophet from among their brethren, like unto thee, and will put my words in his mouth; and he shall speak unto them all that I shall command him. [Deut. 18:18] [H/31/52] (B1)

ST(90)11

whosoever will not hearken unto my words which he shall speak in my name, I will require it of him." [Deut. 18:19] [H/32/52] (B1)

DA59/34 Again, they <u>read</u> how the Lord would anoint One "to preach good tidings unto the meek," "to bind up the brokenhearted, to proclaim liberty to the captives," and to declare the "acceptable year of the Lord." [Isa. 61:1, 2] [H/35a/52] (B1)

31/52 'For Moses truly said unto the fathers, A prophet shall the Lord your God raise up unto you of your brethren, like unto me; him shall ye hear in all things whatsoever he shall say unto you'. [Harris, GT]

32/52 'And it shall come to pass, that every soul, which will not hear that prophet, shall be destroyed from among the people'. [Harris, GT]

35a/52 Unfolding it farther, we read that he should preach the gospel to the poor, and proclaim the acceptable year of the Lord; [Harris, GT]

DA60/34 They read how He would "set judgment in the earth," how the isles should "wait for His law," how the Gentiles should come to His light, and kings to the brightness of His rising. [Isa. 42:4; 60:3.] [H/35b/52] (B1)

DA61/34 The dying words of Jacob filled them with hope: "The scepter shall not depart from Judah, nor a lawgiver from between his feet, until Shiloh come." [Gen. 49:10.] [K/174.2] (B1)

DA62/34 The waning power of Israel testified that the Messiah's coming was at hand. (I1)

DA63/34 The prophecy of Daniel pictured the glory of His reign over an empire which should succeed all earthly kingdoms; and, said the prophet, "It shall stand forever." [Dan. 2:44] (I1)

DA64/34 While few understood the nature of Christ's mission, there was a widespread expectation of a mighty prince who should establish his kingdom in Israel, and who should come as a deliverer to the nations. (I1)

DA65/34 The fullness of the time had come. [H/1/49] (V2)

MS(24)5 When, in the fulness of time, Christ came to our world, it was darkened and marred by the curse of apostasy and spiritual wickedness. [H/1/49] (P2)

FE2/399 The pity and sympathy of God were exercised in behalf of man, fallen and bound to Satan's chariot-car; and when the fullness of time was come, He sent forth His Son.
[H/39,40b/230] [H/39/52+] (P3)

MS(24)1 It has been demonstrated that man by searching can not find out God. [H/2/49] (P2)

35b/52 that he should set judgment in the earth, and the isles should wait for his law; and the Gentiles should come to his light, and kings to the brightness of his rising. [Harris, GT]

[See above under 174.2 Kennedy, MP]

- 1/49 When, in the fulness of time, the eternal Son came forth from the bosom of the Father, he descended to a region of spiritual darkness. [Harris, GT]
- 39/52+ When the fulness of time was come, God sent forth His Son. [Harris, GT]
- 39/230 He beheld in it a scene of woe, which never failed to call forth his profound compassion. [Harris, GT]
- 40b/230 . . . captive world, chained to the wheels of the spoiler, and moving along, (most of them so beguiled, as to be actually pleased with the mock pomp of the gloomy procession, to endless death. [Harris, GT]
- 2/49 Ages of inquiry, conjecture, and effort, had only served to demonstrate the fact--that man, 'by searching cannot find out God.' [Harris, GT]

DA66/34 Humanity, becoming more degraded through ages of transgression, called for the coming of the Redeemer. (II)

[The following Ellen White quotes are not close enough in verbal similarities to indicate they were used in the composition of the DA text. We have included them here because they relfect the same content as the DA text and allow us to show Ellen White's use of the sources in her writings on the life of Christ.]

FE1/399 The deep necessity of man for a divine teacher was known in heaven. [H/41/52] (12)

BE(97)17 Man's terrible necessity demanded help without delay. [H/41/52] (12)

BE(97)21 Hear, O heavens, and be astonished, O earth; for the appointed Instructor of man was no less a personage than the Son of God!

[H/40/52] (V2)

FE3/400 The One appointed in the counsels of heaven came to the earth as an instructor.
[H/40/52] (P2)

FE4/400 He was no less a being than the Creator of the world, the Son of the Infinite God. [H/40/52] (P2)

BE(97)18 Who met this necessity?--An illustrious Teacher, the Son of God. [H/41/52]

The eternal Word came to our world to win the confidence of humanity. [H/41/52]

FE5/400 The rich benevolence of God gave Him to our world; and to meet the necessities of humanity, He took on Him human nature.

[H/41,44/52] (P2)

FE8/400 Mysteriously He allied Himself to human nature. [H/44/52] (V2)

FE9/400 "The Word was made flesh, and dwelt among us." [H/44/52] (B2)

40/52 Hear, O heavens; and be astonished, O earth! the appointed Instructor appears, and proves to be no less a being than the Son of God himself. [Harris, GT]

41/52 It is true, the deep necessities of man, the riches of the divine benevolence, and the glowing colors of prophecy, might have kindled and justified the expectation of a most illustrious teacher; but that he should have appeared in the person of the Eternal Word exceeds the highest flight of human hope; that he should have come from the bosom of the Father was an excess of goodness, one of those splendid surprises of grace, by which mercy delights to melt the obduracy, and to win the confidence of our guilty race. [Harris, GT]

44/52 The condescending object of his mission required that, for a time, he should hold the essential glories of his nature in abeyance: accordingly he mysteriously allied himself to our condition; 'the Word was made flesh.'

[Harris, GT]

benevolence, and love was a surprise to the world, of grace which could be realized, but not told. [H/41/52] (I2)

should grow in wisdom, and in favor with God and man, was not a matter of astonishment; for it was according to the laws of His divine appointment that His talents should develop, and His faculties strengthen by exercise.

[H/46a/52] (P2)

FE12/400 He sought neither the schools of the prophets nor the learning received from the rabbinical teachers; He needed not the education gained in these schools; for God was His instructor. [H/46b/52] (P3)

FE13/400 When in the presence of the teachers and rulers, His questions were instructive lessons, and He astonished the great men with His wisdom and deep penetration. [H/47/52] (P2)

rel5/400 The stores of wisdom and the scientific knowledge Christ displayed in the presence of the wise men, were a subject of surprise to His parents and brothers; for they knew He had never received from the great teachers instruction in human science.

[H/48/53+] (P2)

FE17/400 They could not comprehend Him; for they knew not that He had access to the tree of life, a source of knowledge of which they knew nothing. [H/49/54] (P2)

He ever possessed a peculiar dignity and individuality distinct from earthly pride or assumption; for He did not strive after greatness. [H/50/54] (I2)

- 46a/52 That he should have grown in wisdom as he arose to maturity, was only according to a law of our nature—an ordinance of his own divine appointment—since it is only by a gradual development that the faculties of man arrive at perfection; [Harris, GT]
- 46b/52 but the office he had come to assume, and the divine qualifications he brought to it, supposed him superior to human tuition; and accordingly he sought it not. [Harris, GT]
- 47/52 When in childhood, he mingled a moment with the doctors of the temple, 'they were astonished at his understanding;' his inquiries were more instructive and replete with wisdom than their replies. [Harris, GT]
- 48/53+ On an after occasion, their surprise at his stores of sacred science was augmented by their knowledge of the fact, that he had 'never learned,' never approached the schools of human instruction. [Harris, GT]
- 49/54 He had access to a tree of knowledge they knew not of. [Harris, GT]
- 50/54 As his dignity was of an order distinct from earthly pomp, incapable of being diminished by its absence, or of being embellished by its presence, he entirely dispensed with it. [Harris, GT]

- FE19/401

 After Christ had condescended to leave His high command, step down from an infinite height and assume humanity, He could have taken upon Him any condition of humanity He might choose. [H/51/54] (P2)
- to Him, and He selected the lowest and most humble walk of life. [H/51/54] (P2)
- FE21/401 The place of His birth was Beuhlehem, and on!one side His parentage was poor, but God, the Owner of the world, was His Father. [H/52/54] (I2)
- FE22/401 No trace of luxury, ease, selfish gratification, or indulgence was brought into his life, which was a continual round of self-denial and self-sacrifice. [H/52/54] (12)
- FE23/401 In accordance with His humble birth, he had apparently no greatness or riches, in order that the humblest believer need not say that Christ never knew the stress of pinching poverty. [H/53/54] (I2)
- ST(90)23 The Saviour of the world proposed that no attraction of an earthly character should call men to his side. [H/54/54] (P2)
- ST(90)24 The light and beauty of celestial truth alone should be the drawing power.

 [H/54/54] (P3)
- ST(90)25 The outward glory, the worldly honor, which attracts the attention of men, he would not assume. [H/54/54] (P3)

51/54 The various gradations of human condition were all open and free to his choice, but of these he selected the lowliest, and however astonishing the selection may appear to those who place distinction in opulence and rank, to him who had already stooped from an infinite height in becoming man, the varieties of earthly rank were as nothing, were only minute degrees of littleness. [Harris, GT]

52/54 The place of his birth, like a place constructed from the very wrecks of poverty, was entirely swept of every trace of luxury, every vestige of indulgence, and seemed sacred to humility alone. [Harris, GT]

53/54 And the lowliness of all his subsequent life strictly accorded with the humbleness of his birth. [Harris, GT]

54/54 Had he come in the pomp of outward state, the multitude would have been debarred from his presence, and the regards of men would have been divided between the attractions of his earthly rank, and the claims of celestial truth; but by choosing the low condition of the great majority, and declining the tinselled drapery which charms the eye, he graciously made himself accessible to all, while he seemed to put forward truth alone as the only object demanding their notice—to challenge their whole attention to the native worth, the intrinsic importance of the doctrines he announced. [Harris, GT]

FE24/401 Had he possessed the semblance of outward show, of riches, of grandeur, the poorest class of humanity would have shunned His society; therefore He chose the lowly condition of the far greater number of the people. [H/54/54] (P2)

FE25/401 The truth of heavenly origin was to be His theme: He was to sow the earth with truth; and He came in such a way as to be accessible to all, that the truth alone might make an impression upon human hearts.

[H/54/54] (P2)

ST(90)26 He made himself accessible to all, teaching the pure, exalted principle of truth as that which was only worthy of their notice.

[H/54/54] (P2)

ST(90)29 Wonders in the heavens above and signs in the earth beneath attested his power and majesty. [H/55/54] (12)

ST(90)30 At his baptism a voice from heaven fell upon the ears of men, declaring, "This is my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased."

[H/60/55+] (B1)

DA67/34 Satan had been working to make the gulf deep and impassable between earth and heaven. [H/6/145] (P2)

DA68/34+ By his falsehoods he had emboldened men in sin. (II)

DA69/35 It was his purpose to wear out the forbearance of God, and to extinguish his love for man, so that He would abandon the world to satanic jurisdiction. [H/6/145] (I2)

[See above]

55/54 But though, for the reasons assigned, he assumed the most bare and unpretending simplicity, as the hour for opening his divine commission drew nigh, the public mind was apprised of the event by 'wonders in heaven above, and signs in the earth beneath.' [Harris, GT]

60/55+ Having thus honored the ministry of his servant, and ratified and obeyed existing laws, he ascended from the waters, and prayed; and as he prayed, 'Lo, the heavens were opened unto him, and he saw the Spirit of God descending like a dove, and lighting upon him: and, lo, a voice from heaven, saying, This is my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased.' [Harris, GT]

6/145 Besides, by widening the breach which existed between earth and heaven, Satan might calculate on the possibility of at length realizing his own lie, of wearing out the goodness which only encountered abuse, of extinguishing the last spark of love in the breast of God, and of exasperating justice to doom and destroy the whole species. [Harris, GT]

DA(MS)4/54:2 Through his falsehoods he had emboldened men in transgression, seeking to wear out the forbearance of God, to extinguish in his heart all love for man, and so exasperate his justice that he would abandon the world to Satanic jurisdiction. [H/6/145] (I2)

[Likewise, the following quotes are not close enough in verbal similarities to indicate they were used in the composition of the DA text. We have included them here because they reflect the same content as the DA text and allow us to show Ellen White's use of the sources in her writings on the life of Christ.]

RH(95)1 Speaking of Satan, our Lord says that "he abode not in the truth." [H/12a/227] (V2)

RH(95)/2 He was once the covering cherub, glorious in beauty and holiness. [H/12b/227] (P3)

RH(95)6a He was envious of the position that was held by Christ and the Father, (II)

RH(95)6b and he turned from his allegiance to the Commander of heaven and lost his high and holy estate. [H/12c/227] (P1)

RH(95)7 Though the angels had a knowledge of God and of Jesus Christ, though they were happy in the glorious service which they did for the King of heaven, yet, through his crooked representations of Christ and the Father, the evil one deceived a great company of angels, drew them into sympathy with himself, and associated them with himself in rebellion. [H/13/227] (12)

RH(95)8 Satan and his sympathizers became the avowed antagonists of God, established their own infernal empire, and set up a standard of rebellion against the God of heaven.

[H/14/228] (P2)

[See above]

12a/227 Speaking of Satan, our Lord declares that 'he abode not in the truth;' [Harris, GT]

12b/227 once, he possessed a throne where all is radiant with holiness and joy, [Harris, GT]

12c/227 but he swerved from his allegiance to 'the blessed and only Potentate,' and thus lost his first estate.

[Harris, GT]

13/227 Together with an unknown multitude of associate rebels, he was driven from the presence of God, cut off from the loyal part of the creation, and doomed to be the prey of his own mighty depravity. [Harris, GT]

14/227 From that moment he became the avowed antagonist of God; established an infernal empire, and planted the standard of rebellion, around which all the principles and powers of evil might rally and combine. [Harris, GT]

RH(95)9 All the principalities and powers of evil rallied to the work of overthrowing the government of God. [H/14/227] (P2)

RH(95)10 Satan accomplished the fall of man, and since that time it has been his work to efface in man the image of God, and to stamp upon human hearts his own image. [H/15/227] (P2)

Lt(43)28 It is at Lucifer's throne that every evil work finds its starting point, and obtains its support. [H/19/228] (P2)

RH(95)11 Possessing supremacy in guilt, he claims supremacy for himself, and exercises over his subjects the power of royalty.

[H/20/228] (12)

RH(95)12 He cannot expel God from his throne, but through the system of idolatry, he plants his own throne between the heaven and the earth, between God and the human worshiper.

[H/21/228] (P1)

RH(95)13 He intercepts every ray of light that comes from God to man, and appropriates the worship that is due to God . . . [H/21/228] (I2)

DA70/35 Satan was seeking to shut out from men a knowledge of God, to turn their attention from the temple of God, and to establish his own kingdom. [H/25/229] (P2)

[See above]

15/227 Actuated by that universal law, by which each being and principle seeks to conform all things to its own nature, and stimulated by implacable hatred against God, he no sooner found our world created, than he came to efface from it the image of God and to stamp his own on its breast.

[Harris, GT]

19/228 His throne is the rallying point, to which all evil looks for reinforcement and support; the centre from which flows, and to which gravitates, all evil; the heart of the great system of guilt. [Harris, GT]

20/228 The domination which Satan has acquired on earth is called by Christ a kingdom; in which he possesses, by right of supremacy in quilt, the princely titles, and exercises the prerogatives of royalty. [Harris, GT]

21/228 Unable to expel God from his throne, and thus succeed to the homage of man; he had, by a universal system of idolatry, planted his throne between the human worshipper and the Divine Being, intercepting and appropriating the adoration which belonged to God alone. [Harris, GT]

25/229 At different times he seems to have put all the forces of his kingdom into motion to bear upon it: for to shut up the temple of God, to seduce the people to idolatry, to erect an idol in the holy place, was to sit on the only throne of God upon earth, was a triumph which could only be exceeded by ascending the throne of heaven. [Harris, GT]

Lt(43)29 Satan has charged injustice upon God, and at various times has set in motion all his supernatural agencies in order to shut off from man the knowledge of God, to turn their attention from the temple of God and his sanctuary, and to establish his own kingdom in the earth. [H/25/229] (P2)

DA71/35 His strife for supremacy had seemed to be almost wholly successful. [H/27/229] (P2)

DA72/35 It is true that in every generation God had His agencies. (I1)

DA73/35 Even among the heathen there were men through whom Christ was working to uplift the people from their sin and degradation. (I1)

DA74/35 But these men were despised and hated. (I1)

DA75/35 Many of them suffered a violent death. (I1)

DA76/35 The dark shadow that Satan had cast over the world grew deeper and deeper. (I1)

RH(95)33 It has seemed that the confederacy of idolatry has borne supreme sway, and that Satan had indeed become the god of this world. [H/31,33/229] (P3)

DA77/35 Through heathenism, Satan had for ages turned men away from God; but he won his great triumph in perverting the faith of Israel. (I1)

[See above]

27/229 His contest for earthly supremacy, so long disputed by heaven, seemed crowned with success. [Harris, GT]

31/229 Nor did Judea itself form an exception to this wide infernal sway; for (short of formal idolatry) it belonged to the universal confederacy, and formed one of the fairest and most faithful provinces of the satanic empire. [Harris, GT]

33/229 Satan had become 'the prince of this world.' [Harris, GT]

DA78/35 By contemplating and worshiping their own conceptions, the heathen had lost a knowledge of God, and had become more and more corrupt. (II)

DA79/35 So it was with Israel. (I1)

DA80/35+ The principle that man can save himself by his own works lay at the foundation of every heathen religion; it had now become the principle of the Jewish religion. (II)

DA81/36 Satan had implanted this principle. (I1)

DA82/36 Wherever it is held, men have no barrier against sin. (I1)

DA83/36 The message of salvation is communicated to men through human agencies. (I1)

DA84/36 But the Jews had sought to make a monopoly of the truth which is eternal life. [H/111.3] (12)

DA85/36 They had hoarded the living manna, and it had turned to corruption. (I1)

DA86/36 The religion which they tried to shut up to themselves became an offense. (I1)

DA87/36 They robbed God of His glory, and defrauded the world by a counterfeit of the gospel. (I1)

DA88/36 They had refused to surrender themselves to God for the salvation of the world, and they became agents of Satan for its destruction. (I1)

DA89/36 The people whom God had called to be the pillar and ground of the truth had become representatives of Satan. (I1)

111.3 Human selfishness would make a monopoly of eternal life. The Jewish christians [sic] would fain have made it a local and national benefit; till the unconfinable spirit came, and showed them that, like the air, it belonged to the world. [Harris, GT]

DA90/36 They were doing the work that he desired them to do, taking a course to misrepresent the character of God, and cause the world to look upon Him as a tyrant. (II)

DA91/36 The very priests who ministered in the temple had lost sight of the significance of the service they performed. (I1)

DA92/36 They had ceased to look beyond the symbol to the thing signified. (I1)

DA93/36 In presenting the sacrificial offerings they were as actors in a play. (I1)

DA94/36 The ordinances which God Himself had appointed were made the means of blinding the mind and hardening the heart. (I1)

DA95/36 God could do no more for man through these channels. (I1)

DA96/36 The whole system must be swept away. (II)

DA97/36 The deception of sin had reached its height. (I1)

DA98/36 All the agencies for depraving the souls of men had been put in operation. (I1)

DA99/36 The Son of God, looking upon the world, beheld suffering and misery. [H/39/230] (P3)

RH(95)34 But the only begotten Son of God has looked upon the scene, has beheld human suffering and misery. [H/39/230] (P3)

DA100/36 With pity He saw how men had become victims of satanic cruelty. [H/40a/230] (P2)

39/230 He beheld in it a scene of woe, which never failed to call forth his profound compassion. [Harris, GT]

40a/230 On all sides he beheld the blinded victims of satanic cruelty; [Harris, GT]

Lt(43)9 With pity he has seen how his human agencies have been blinded by the deceptions of the enemy, and have become victims of satanic cruelty. [H/40a/230] (P2)

DA101/36 He looked with compassion upon those who were being corrupted, murdered, and lost. [H/40b/230] (P3)

DA102/36 They had chosen a ruler who chained them to his car as captives. [H/40c/230] (P3)

DA103/36 Bewildered and deceived, they were moving on in gloomy procession toward eternal ruin,—to death in which is no hope of life, toward night to which comes no morning. [H/40d/230] (I2)

RH(95)39 He looked with compassion upon men who were becoming corrupted, ruined, murdered, and lost, through choosing a ruler who chained them to his car as captives, and yet these slaves were so bewildered, so beguiled and deceived, that they were actually pleased with their slavery as they moved on in gloomy procession toward eternal ruin,—to death in which is no hope of life, toward night to which comes no morning. [H/40/230] (P2)

DA104/36 Satanic agencies were incorporated with men. [H/42/231] (P2)

DA105/36 The bodies of human beings, made for the dwelling place of God, had become the habitation of demons.
[H/42,43/231] (P2)

RH(95)40

He saw human beings possessed by devils, saw Satanic agencies incorporated with men, saw the bodies of men become the habitations for the degrading indwelling of demons. [H/42/231] (P1)

RH(95041 Man, made for the dwelling-place of God, became the habitation of dragons.
[H/43a/231] (P1)

- 40b/230 vast, crowded tracts of spiritual beings, immortal essences, wasted, ruined, murdered, lost; [Harris, GT]
- 40c/230 a captive world, chained to the wheels of the spoiler, [Harris, GT]
- 40d/230 and moving along, (most of them so beguiled, as to be actually pleased with the mock pomp of the gloomy procession, to endless death. [Harris, GT]

- 41/230+ While immediately beneath his eye, in the very land where he had taken humanity, he saw legions of fiends in actual, bodily possession of miserable man. [Harris, GT]
- 42/231 Not satisfied with the evil they could inflict by ordinary temptation, he beheld them consummating their cruelty by actually incorporating with men; turning their bodies into living tombs, engrossing and demonizing all their powers, merging the man in the fiend. [Harris, GT]
- 43a/231 Yes, man, who had been created in the image of God, became 'the habitation of dragons;' [Harris, GT]

- DA106/36 The senses, the nerves, the passions, the organs of men, were worked by supernatural agencies in the indulgence of the vilest lust. [H/43b/231] (P3)
- DA107/36 The very stamp of demons was impressed upon the countenances of men. [H/43c/231] (P3)
- DA108/36 Human faces reflected the expression of the legions of evil with which they were possessed. [H/43c/231]
- DA109/36 Such was the prospect upon which the world's Redeemer looked. [H/43d/231] (P3)
- DA110/36 What a spectacle for Infinite Purity to behold! (P2)
- DA111/37 Sin had become a science, and vice was consecrated as a part of religion. [H/34/229+] [H/102.9] (I2)

43b/23l his heart the fuel consumed by their passions; his senses and organs, the slaves of their rampant impiety; hell brought to him, and begun in him, upon earth; [Harris, GT]

43c/231 an incarnate demon, his fetures putting on the image of the legion within him; [Harris, GT]

43d/23l --what a sight for the Lover of souls! what a spectacle for infinite goodness to contemplate! [Harris. GT]

34/229 Wherever he looked the expanse was his own; the teeming population were his subjects; the invisible rulers were his selected agents; temptation in his hands had become a science, and sin was taught by rule; [Harris, GT]

We interrupt the presentation of the text here to remind the reader that for the final 19 sentences of the third chapter of DA we will be listing 23 consecutive sentences from Harris and $\frac{DA}{25}$ consecutive sentences from an article by EGW published in 1894¹². With the full text available the reader will be able to note the subtle and varied use of the source which almost defies all our efforts to categorize and to measure in terms of dependency. In addition, this format makes it easier for us to recognize the way in which earlier articles of EGW have been utilized in the composition of chapters developing a larger theme. The inclusion of major portions of the source text, though not often done because of space limitations, makes manifest the dependency of the EGW text on Harris for the development of the theme or narrative. Another tremendous advantage to presenting the full text of the source is that it permits a more accurate comparison. We are more easily able to notice where EGW omits, abbreviates, or expands on the coverage of a given theme by a source. It is this kind of data as well as the notation of similarities that makes possible the fairest evaluation of the EGW text.

^{12.} Ellen G. White, "God's Love Unmeasured," ST, Vol. 20, No. 14 (February 5, 1894)

- ST(94)1 The question has been asked, "Would not a lesser gift from God have been adequate for the redemption of lost man?" [H/6a/101] (P2)
- ST(94)2 "In this was manifested the love of God toward us, because that God sent his only-begotten Son into the world, that we might live through him. (B1)
- ST(94)3 Herein is love, not that we loved God, but that he loved us, and sent his Son to be the propitiation for our sins." (B1)
- ST(94)4 The question is unanswerable, and it is not profitable for us to spend our time in making conjectures. (II)
- ST(94)5 All our thoughts and imaginations will not alter in the least any part of the plan of redemption devised from all eternity. (I1)
- ST(94)6 God loved the world to such an extent that he gave full and complete evidence of the fact. [H/6b/101] (I2)
- ST(94)7 He did not leave any chance for the tempter to say that he did not love us, for he gave a gift whose value could not be estimated. [H6c/101] (I2)
- ST(94)8 Had he done less, Satan and his agencies would have sought to have inspired jealousy against God by intimating that he could have done more than he did. (I1)
- ST(94)9 God so loved the world that he determined to give a gift beyond all computation, and make manifest how immeasurable was his love. [H/6d/101] (P3)

6a/101 We will not presume to question whether a .gift of inferior value would have been adequate to relieve the world or not: [Harris, GT]

6b/101 but <u>God so loved us that he could not have realized</u>
his vast propensions of grace by giving us less; [Harris, GT]

6c/101 he so loved us, that he would not suffer it to remain possible to be said he could love us more; he knew that a donation of calculable value would only call forth an odious spirit of fierce and jealous monopoly, [Harris, GT]

6d/101 but he so loved us, that he resolved on a gift, defying all computation, [Harris, GT]

- ST(94)10 The gift of God would be a wonder to all worlds, to all created intellgences [sic], ever enlarging their ideas of what God's love was in its infinity and greatness. [H/6e/101] (12)
- ST(94)11 Contemplation of this love would uproot from the heart all selfishness, and so transform the soul that men would cherish generosity, practice self-denial, and imitate the example of God. [H/6e/101] (I2)
- ST(94)12 God so loved the world that he gave heaven's best gift, in order that the most guilty transgressor should not be deferred from coming to Christ, however great his sin, and be enabled to ask for pardon at a throne of mercy. [H/6f/101] (12)
- ST(94)13 Since God has given the greatest gift in his power, we are to render to him our whole heart. [H/6g/101] (I2)
- ST(94)14 He has poured out to the world the treasures of heaven, giving with such largeness that there is nothing more to bestow, no reserve grace or power or glory, and we are to respond to this love by rendering willing service to Jesus, who has died for us on Calvary's cross. [H/6g/101] (12)

6e/101 and the very mention of which should surcharge our minds with greatness, give us an idea of infinity, and impregnate our selfishness with a transforming sentiment of generous and diffusive benevolence; [Harris, GT]

6f/101+ he so loved us, that he would leave nothing for the most apprehensive guilt to fear, nor the most capacious wishes to desire; [Harris, GT]

6g/102 he laid claim to the whole of our affections, by pouring out the whole treasury of heaven, by giving us his all at once. [Harris, GT]

7/102 Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

8/102 'God sent not his Son into the world to condemn the world, but that the world through him might be saved.'
[Harris, GT]

DA112/37

Rebellion had struck its roots deep into the heart, and the hostility of man was most violent against heaven. [H/11,12/102] (P3)

ST(94)15

At the time when sin had become a science, when the hostility of man was most violent against heaven, when rebellion struck its roots deep into the human heart, when vice was consecrated as a part of religion, when Satan exulted in the idea that he had led men to such a state of evil that God would destroy the world, Jesus was sent into the world, not to condemn it, but, amazing grace! to save the world. [H/10-18/102+] (12)

DA113/37 It was demonstrated before the universe that, apart from God, humanity could not be uplifted. (I1)

- 9/102 In order to enhance our views of the divine compassion, the Savior in this language, reminds us of the terrible alternative which outraged Omnipotence might have adopted. [Harris, GT]
- 10/102 He carries back our thoughts to the time when God, after looking with centuries of patience and forbearance on the unparalleled spectacle of his holy law prostrate, and broken, and trampled under foot by a confederated race of rebellious creatures, came forth out of his place, and punished the inhabitants of the earth for their iniquity; swept them away with a flood as with a besom of destruction. [Harris, GT]
- 11/102 But man, insensible to the lessons of chastisement, was no sooner permitted to repeople the earth, than he resumed his weapons, renewed his hostility to heaven under circumstances of aggravation unknown before, and transmitted to his posterity, as if it has been a sacred obligation, the art and spirit of the unnatural war. [Harris, GT]
- 12/102 So deep had this infernal enmity to God struck its roots in the human heart, and so wide were its ramifications throughout the entire mass of humanity, that even a solitary indication of returning friendship towards him was denounced as treachery to a common cause; the first relaxation of this impious strife, the first relenting sigh, was instantly detected by a wakeful impiety, quickened by hatred to an instinctive vigilance; and was summarily dealt with as an enemy in the camp. [Harris, GT]
- 13/102+ Man had naturalized the principle of sin; had consecrated vice in all its forms; had opened to it all the recesses of his nature; cherished and established its dominion by every species of submission and indulgence; and boasted of his new allegiance in the face of heaven. [Harris, GT]

DA114/37 A new element of life and power must be imparted by Him who made the world. (I1)

DA115/37 With intense interest the unfallen worlds had watched to see Jehovah arise, and sweep away the inhabitants of the earth. [H/10,17,18/102,103] (12)

ST(94)16a The unfallen worlds watched with intense interest to see Jehovah arise and sweep away the inhabitants of the earth, and Satan boasted that if God did do this, [H/10,18/102,103] (I2)

14/103 The only law which kept mankind united, the only sympathy which held the unnumbered parts and interests of the world in affinity, seemed to be an all-pervading principle of aversion to God; and this was sufficient to bind them fast for ages, in one great and unbroken work of prodigious guilt. [Harris, GT]

15/103 The destruction of the world, therefore, so far from being an infraction of justice, was only what justice required; would only have been the natural course of things, flowing in the unobstructed order of cause and effect. [Harris, GT]

16/103. A crisis had arrived in the government of God on earth, in which something great and decisive must be done; prolong the delay--and the character of God will be compromised and gone; the voices of the souls beneath the altar were wearied with crying for retribution; the armory of heaven was open; all its hosts and equipments ready; justice had only to speak the word, and in a moment's flight, the panic earth would have beheld its firmament filled with the careering fires and terrific forms of desending [sic] wrath. [Harris, GT]

17/103 The Son of God had only to pour out the vial of incensed wrath, and there had been voices, and thunderings, and lightnings, and earthquakes, and universal desolation; and all the holy intelligences, as they stood afar off, on the sea of glass, beholding the tremendous catastrophe, would have said, 'Thou art righteous, O Lord, because thou hast judged thus.' [Harris, GT]

18a/103 But at that crisis of the world, when every movement in the government of God was to be watched with breathless apprehension, when, had justice made the slightest move, every thing that had feeling would have veiled its eyes in fear, then mercy prevailed to unfold the scheme of love, [Harris, GT]

DAll6/37 And if God should do this, Satan was ready to carry out his plan for securing to himself the allegiance of heavenly beings. (II)

ST(94)16b he would complete his plans and secure for himself the allegiance of unfallen worlds. (I1)

DA117/37 He had declared that the principles of God's government make forgiveness impossible. (I1)

DA118/37 Had the world been destroyed, he would have claimed that his accusations were proved true. (I1)

DA119/37 He was ready to cast blame upon God, and to spread his rebellion to the worlds above. (II)

DA120/37 But instead of destroying the world, God sent His Son to save it. [H/18b/103] (P3)

DA121/37 Though corruption and defiance might be seen in every part of the alien province, a way for its recovery was provided. (I1)

DA122/37

At the very crisis, when Satan seemed about to triumph, the Son of God came with the embassage of divine grace. [H/16-18/103] (I2)

ST(94)17 He had arguments ready by which to cast blame upon God, and to spread his rebellion to the worlds above; but at this crisis, instead of destroying the world, God sent his Son to save it. [H/18b/103] (12)

DA123/37 Through every age, through every hour, the love of God had been exercised toward the fallen race. [H/3/101] (P2)

DA124/37 Notwithstanding the perversity of men, the signals of mercy had been continually exhibited. [H/2/101] (P3)

18b/103 and it became the office of justice to wonder and attend; then, when God might have sent his Son to condemn the world, he was sent—amazing grace!—to save it.
[Harris, GT]

- 1/101 'God so loved the world that he gave his only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life.' [Harris, GT]
- 2/101 Though sin had for ages disturbed the equable flow of the divine benevolence to man, that benevolence had never, for a moment, ceased to accumulate, or lost its earthward direction. [Harris, GT]
- 3/101 Through every hour, of every age, it had continued to increase; and was only restrained till a suitable channel was ready, and the world prepared to receive it. [Harris, GT]

ST(94)18 The apostle caught a glimpse of the plan, and he kindled into inspiration upon the great theme. [H/20/103+] (I2)

ST(94)19 <u>Language</u> cannot express his conception, but ever falls below the reality.
[H/21/104] (I2)

ST(94)20 John exclaims: "Behold, what manner of love the Father hath bestowed upon us, that we should be called the sons of God; therefore the world knoweth us not, because it knew him not." (B1)

ST(94)21 Before the coming of Christ to the world evidences abundant had been given that God loved the human race. [H/22/104] (P3)

ST(94)22 But in the gift of Christ to a race so undeserving was demonstrated the love of God beyond all dispute. [H/22/104] (P3)

DA125/37 And when the fullness of the time had come, the Deity was glorified by pouring upon the world a flood of healing grace that was never to be obstructed or withdrawn till the plan of salvation should be fulfilled. [H/4/101]

ST(94)23 This gift outweighed all else, showed that his love could not be measured.
[H/22.23/104] (P3)

ST(94)24 We have no line to measure it, no plummet by which to sound its depths, no chain by which to encompass it, no standard with which to compare it. [H/23/104] (P2)

19/103 Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

20/103+ The apostles never touched it, but they instantly kindled at the inspiration of the theme. [Harris, GT]

21/104) Conscious that their language fell far below their conceptions, and their conception below their subject, they could only exclaim, in the impotence of overwhelming admiration, Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

22/104 The universe is crowded with proofs of his benevolence; but here is a proof which outweighs them all! [Harris, GT]

4/101 And now, when the fulness of time was come, the windows of heaven, the heart of Deity itself, was opened, and poured forth on the world a healing flood of heavenly grace. [Harris, GT]

5/101 Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

23a/104 How much he loved us we can never compute; we have no line with which to fathom, no standard with which to compare it; [Harris, GT]

ST(94)25 All we can say is that "God so loved the world, that he gave his only-begotten Son, that whosever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life." (B1)

DA126/37 Satan was exulting that he had succeeded in debasing the image of God in humanity. (I1)

DA127/37+ Then Jesus came to restore in man the image of his Maker. (I1)

DA128/38 None but Christ can fashion anew the character that has been ruined by sin. (I1)

DA129/38 He came to expel the demons that had controlled the will. (II)

DA130/38 He came to lift us up from the dust, to reshape the marred character after the pattern of His divine character, and to make it beautiful with His own glory. (I1)

23b/104 but he so loved us that he gave his only begotten Son, that through him he might confer on us eternal life. [Harris, GT]

Analysis

In the preceding 28 double-pages we have presented the full text of DA, chapter 3, which we divided into 130 sentence units for comparison purposes. In addition, we have included 100 sentences from Ellen White's earlier writings as well as the text of the sources apparently used in the literary composition of the EGW materials. In this section of our report we will attempt an analysis of our comparative study, including both similarities and dissimilarities, in respect to the aspects of verbal expression (source analysis) and thematic arrangement (redaction). Our emphasis will be on source analysis of the DA text though some consideration will be given to redaction where it applies. The pre-DA text will be presented in a supporting role for reasons which have been earlier given.

Source Analysis - The Desire of Ages

In Table 1 on page 34 the evaluations of the <u>DA</u> sentence units have been tabulated according to the nine categories, seven of which are considered to indicate literary dependency according to the criteria as presented in the introduction to this study. The individual evaluation of each sentence of chapter three and the literary source involved appears in Appendix A.

Out of the 130 sentence units 67 appear to be original with the <u>DA</u> text from a literary point of view and therefore are evaluated as non-dependent. Four units were credited to

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 3

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	. 6	7	ઇ	9	
TEXT	≤ Strict Verbatim	S Verbatim	ਨੂੰ Strict Paraphrase	უ Simple Paraphrase	ద్ద Loose Paraphrase	四 Source Bible	א Partial Independence	H Strict Independence	W Bible	TOTAL
01. DA	00	01	00	09	20	0 5	24	67	04	130
02. ST(90) 03. MS(24)[91]	00	00	00	02 05	04	04	04			14
04. ST(94)	00	00	00	02	04	04	12	(04)		26
05. Lt(43)[95]	00	00	00	.03	00	00	00			03
06. RH(95)	00	01	04	05	03	00	03	(01)		17
07. FE(96) (MS 9)	00	01	00	11	02	00	06		(01)	21
08. BE(97)	00	01	02	01	00,	00	01			05
09. ST(98)	00	01	00	00	02	00	00			03
10. DA(MS)[97/98]	00	00	00	00	00	00	01			01
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	04	06	29	19	08	28	(05)	(01)	100

the Bible as the literary source selected by the writer or as common to Bible commentators treating the topic. These sentences are also excluded from our study of literary dependency. The remaining 59 sentences were found to exhibit literary dependency in four categories: 1 Verbatim; 9 Simple paraphrase; 20 Loose Paraphrase; 5 Source Bible; and 24 Partial Independence. No examples of Strict Verbatim or Strict Paraphrase were found.

If we assign the value of 0 to category (I1), Strict Independence; the value of 1.0 to category (I2), Partial Independence; 2.0 to category (B1), Source Bible; 3.0 to category (P3), Loose Paraphrase; 4.0 to (P2), Simple Paraphrase; 5.0 to (P1), Strict Paraphrase; 6.0 to (V2), Verbatim, and 7.0 to (V1), Strict Verbatim, the average literary dependency for the 130 sentences of the chapter is 1.079 or 1.08. If we exclude those categories which do not indicate dependency and limit our evaluation to the categories of dependency, giving the lowest value of 1.0 to the lowest level of dependency, i.e., Partial Independence (I1), our average dependency for chapter 3 is 2.3.1

Table 2 presented on page 36 shows the distribution of sources used in chapter 3. Of the 59 sentences involving some degree of dependency, six reflected the use of Thayer, five were influenced by Kennedy and four appear to have

¹This figure has been derived from adding the totals of 1×24 , 2×5 , 3×20 , 4×9 , 5×0 , 6×1 and 7×0 (24 + 10 + 60 + 36 + 0 + 6 + 0 = 136), and dividing by the total

TABLE 2
DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 3

Desire of Ages Text

TOTALS DA Text	06. GT/MP	05. MP/SLJ	04. Thayer SLJ	03. Kennedy MP	02. Harris GT	Ol. Bible	TKAT		
00	8	8	8	8	8	8	\$	Strict Verbatim	1
2	8	8	8	8	2	8	స	Verbatim	2
8	8	8	8	8	8	8	Ţď	Strict Paraphrase	ω
09	8	8	೭	8	8	8	₽2	Simple Paraphrase	4
20	8	8	ន	2	17	8	₽3	Loose Paraphrase	ហ
2	8	8	8	2	ಜ	8	В	Source Bible	6
25	2	ಜ	ಜ	ಜ	15	8	12	Partial Independence	7
I	1	1	1	1		1	Ľ	Strict Independence	œ
(04)	1	1	1	ı	1	2	B 2	Bible	9
63	β	ಜ	8	G	4.	2	TOTAL		

depended on various combinations of Thayer, Kennedy and Harris. Harris was the main literary source, being used in 44 sentences. The Bible was used for 4 sentences.

For chapter three the majority of literary borrowing occurs in clearly defined sections of the source. There is very little skipping around in the source with an isolated use here and there.

The use of Thayer is largely limited to the second chapter of Sketches from the Life of Jesus which covers the subject of "Reasons for the Delay of the Advent." The content is very similar to what Ellen White is dealing with in this chapter and Thayer introduces his chapter with the quotation from Galatians 4:4, "But when the fullness of time was come . . .," the words Ellen White chose for the title of her chapter.

The parallels from Kennedy are found in his introduction on page 174. On page 173 he also uses the phrase, "the fulness of time was come." In his table of contents Kennedy outlines the content of this section of his "Introduction" as having to do with "Antecedents" and "Probable time of the Advent." Kennedy's work was listed in the inventory of Ellen White's office library at the time of her death.

The Harris material is largely taken from three sections of The Great Teacher. The first essay of Harris'

number of sentences which is 59. Dividing 136 by 59 results in 2.3.

work is entitled, "On the Authority of our Lord's Teaching."
We found definite correspondence between pages 49-53 (the first five pages of this essay) and 19 sentences of chapter 3 beginning with #27 and running through until sentence #65.
A second section of Harris, his second essay entitled, "On the Originality of our Lord's Teaching," pages 101 to 103, is reflected in sentences 111 to 125 of our chapter. The third major use of Harris in this chapter of DA, sentences 99-110, focuses on a subsection of this same essay on our Lord's originality entitled "On Satanic Agency."

The non-dependent literary work of Ellen White in this chapter also seems to come in sections. Apart from a few independent sentences at the beginning and ending of chapter 3 the majority of her independent expression occurs in sentences 72 to 98 where she is describing the failure of Israel to represent God aright in their religious beliefs and practices. This is not to say that the ideas coming to expression in these independent sentences are unique to Ellen White. A comparison with sentences before #72 and after #98 which show dependency upon Harris, reveals that Ellen White is dealing with the same subject and expressing often the same ideas as is Harris. The difference is to be found in their literary styles and theme development.

The purpose of this study does not include a comparison of the content of Ellen White's work with that of the sources being used. We are limiting our concern to the literary parallels. It would appear, however, that content

does not play an important role in terms of which sentences reflect literary borrowing and those which do not. Literary dependence as well as independence seems to apply across the board whether the writing concerns history, theology, biblical narrative, background descriptions, or personal devotion.

in our analysis we have centered our far discussion on the DA text which we know was a compilation of earlier Ellen G. White writings and materials specifically written for this publishing venture on the life of Christ. A serious study of the sources must include, therefore, an evaluation of those earlier writings which formed the text base for this compilation. Such a review of these earlier writings becomes all the more appropriate and necessary when we recognize that the one compiling and arranging the new publication is not Ellen White but her "bookmaker," Marian Davis. Apart from those materials specifically prepared for this larger work on the life of Christ the actual hand of Ellen White in the use of literary sources would more likely be revealed through a study of these earlier articles and manuscripts which had a life on their own independent of compilation and arrangement for republication in DA.

Source Analysis - Pre-Desire of Ages

In our attempt to reconstruct the text resources Marian Davis would most likely have had at her disposal in the compilation of materials for \overline{DA} , we found eight different

writings which can be dated prior to the publication of <u>DA</u> in 1898, including one sentence from a working manuscript of <u>DA</u>. Most of these materials had been published in some form prior to 1898. Manuscript 24 of 1891 has not been published in full as of this date. The selections from the EGW letter to John Harvey Kellogg, Letter 43, 1895, were published as part of the article quoted quite extensively in the pre-<u>DA</u> materials for this chapter under <u>RH</u>(95).

Even though chapter 3 was one of the later chapters of DA to be written, apart from MS 24, 1891, we found no handwritten texts in support of the finished chapter or of any of the articles which were apparently used in the development of the chapter. The particular eight documents reviewed as background material for this chapter yielded 100 sentences reflecting literary dependency. These sentences which bear on the content of chapter 3 have been evaluated for each Ellen White document and the totals are listed in Table 1 above. The list for the individual evaluations of each individual sentence is provided in Appendix B. distribution table on page 41, Table 3, we show that all 100 sentences reflect the use of The Great Teacher by Harris. Were we to assess the evaluation scores for these writings as we did the DA text, omitting the six verses which do not show dependency (categories 8 & 9), our average level of dependency would be 2.89, somewhat higher than we found for Such a comparative evaluation would be however, for several reasons. We have not included any

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 3

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

Ot. Harris, Gr	1 .	·	
8	<u> </u>	Strict Verbatim	<u> </u>
ţ	V2	Verbatim	2
8	Ţq.	Strict Paraphrase	3
23	P2	Simple Paraphrase	4
Į.	23	Loose Paraphrase	5
ြ	四四	Source Bible	6
28	12	Partial Independence	7
S	I1	Strict Independence	œ
E	2 8	Bible	9
100	TOTAL		

sentences from these writings where the Ellen White text stands alone nor have we included those sentences which show dependence but which treat a content beyond that of chapter 3. We have also found that some of these earlier writings were not independently written but appear to have been in part dependent upon still earlier writings. Finally, such an evaluation would be invalid because we have not evaluated every sentence in the Ellen White article or manuscript as we did for the entire chapter in DA.

We have included sentences which have no comparable \underline{DA} sentence in chapter 3 when such sentences appear in a context where comparable chapter 3 sentences may be found. 3 These additional parallels provide further evidence of the literary borrowing which would not be so obvious were we to

¹The RH article of October 22, 1895, which is quoted in part as a supporting text for this chapter is continued in the October 29 RH. In part two of the article we have more quotes from Harris and at least one from Melvill. We did not use this second part of the article, however, because it dealt with material to be found in chapters 4, 5, 7, etc. of DA.

²A case in point is the use of Ellen White's letter to John H. Kellogg (Lt 43, 1995) as the basis for the two-part article in the RH, October 22, 29, 1895, both of which appear to have been used in the construction of chapter 3. At times it is difficult to tell if one writing is dependent upon another, both are the result of repeated use of the same source, or if we have an instance of separate uses of the source combined with the use of earlier writings.

STWO examples of this use of earlier materials as supporting evidence for literary borrowing for this chapter are the inclusion of the sentences from Fundamentals of Christian Education (MS 9, 1896) and from $\underline{ST}(94)$ which also have sentences not comparable to the content of chapter 3. FE2/399 though placed elsewhere in the text sequence clearly relates to DA101-103 as well as to $\underline{RH}(95)$. FE3/400, located after DA66, is very similar to DA35. FE25/401 clearly echoes $\underline{ST}(90)$ 26 and $\underline{ST}(90)$ has many parallels with

limit our selection to those sentences which have been taken over for use in writing chapter 3.

Even though we are not able to evaluate the 100 sentences selected from the various texts used in the composition of this chapter, a careful study of the textual evidence provided will show that often the earlier work is closer to the literary source, i.e., shows greater dependency, than does the later <u>DA</u> text. This dependency is often too subtle and too varied to classify in separate categories but that it does exist is quite apparent. Some of the more obvious instances of this higher level of dependency for the earlier documents can be noted from Table 4 on page 44.

We must not leave the question of closer dependency for the earlier writings without noting the exceptions. We have in this chapter some evidence that Ellen White does show greater dependency in the later writings. If it is fair to make a difference between something written in 1890 and another article using the same source being written in 1897, then it is clear from Table 1 that the categories one, two and three, which exhibit the greatest dependency, do not apply to the earlier Ellen White writings used in this chapter until 1895.

DA chapter 3. A number of sentences from ST(94) do not exhibit verbal similarities with DA chapter 3 but the content for the most part is clearly very similar. When we find such sentences as ST(94)15 related to DA112 and ST(94)16a so similar to DA115, it would seem reasonable to include these sentences in our text base.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 3

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No	DA Text	Eval.	Pre-DA Txt.	Eval.	Pre-DA	Eval.
01	DA28/32	12	MS(24)21	P2	ST (90)7	12
02	DA33/32	Bl	ST(98)3	<u>V2</u>	-	
03	DA35/33	Р3	ST(90)8	Р3		
04	DA50/34	Р3	BE(97)10	P1	***************************************	
05	DA103/36	<u> 12</u>	RH (95)39	P2		
06	DA105/36	P2	RH (95)40	<u>P1</u>	RH (95)41	_P1_
07	DA115/37	12	ST(94)16a	12		

A final reason for an extended use of these earlier materials beyond their specific reference to material found in chapter 3 of <u>DA</u> has to do with the evidence they present for studying the question of Ellen White's use of sources in the arrangement of her materials.

Redaction Analysis - The Desire of Ages

Ellen White's first treatment of the life of Christ in Spiritual Gifts began with the birth of Jesus as did many of the 19th century lives of Christ. In the second connected account of the life of Jesus, Spirit of Prophecy, volumes two and three, pages 10-16 of chapter 1, "The First Advent," describe the religious beliefs and practices of the Jewish people at the time of the first advent. In DA this presentation of the background to the appearance of Christ in our world is given three chapters, chapter 3 being the last. Harris' work on The Great Teacher covered many of the same points made by Ellen White but not in a single chapter. Since there is no narrative structure to chapter 3 there are any number of ways the various thematic elements of the chapter could have been put together. It is reasonable to hold that Marian Davis selected from the various earlier writings of Ellen White those sentences and paragraphs that related to the general topic, arranged them in some order, and edited them, with Ellen White adding those portions which are not represented by her earlier articles. The arrangement of this chapter then has to be credited to Ellen

White and not to Harris whose work she used.

It is not enough to say that Ellen White is on her own in the literary design of this chapter. Though she uses the editorial assistance of Marian Davis, and the parallels from The Great Teacher by Harris clearly predominate in both the DA and the pre-DA material, Ellen White's involvement in the literary construction of this chapter needs to recognized. While we have clear evidence that Ellen White is using the earlier materials gathered by Marian Davis, it is not necessary to preclude her returning to the use of these sources, in this case Harris, at the time of her working on the text of DA. It would appear that she was referring to Thayer's work at the time this chapter was composed, for the date of publication for the Thayer source is 1891. Time and time again we will have occasion to note parallels in the DA text which are not in the earlier texts or are closer to the literary form of the source text than what is found in the earlier materials. We refer the reader to DA sentences 67 and 69 as two examples of this late use of the source in this chapter. We have found no evidence to support the claim that at any time Marian Davis or others were making such selections from the sources rather than Ellen White herself.

The comments evaluated as independent of literary borrowing in this chapter are not all that independent in terms of their content. The basic ideas to be found in chapter 3 can also be found in the sources, particularly

Harris. A survey of those sentences where Ellen White enlarged on an idea or otherwise independently expressed herself reveals that she had a great interest in commenting on God's character, God's plan of salvation, and the revelation of Satan's attempt to thwart the purposes of God. The great controversy theme may be found in the sources she used but not as detailed or elaborated to the extent we find in the DA.

A review of the sentence evaluations of the <u>DA</u> text (Appendix A) shows that generally Ellen White has grouped the materials into blocks. The chapter begins with Thayer, Kennedy, and a few of her comments mixed in. After this we find the text put together in blocks of material which for the most part appear to be governed by the earlier articles and their use of Harris or her own blocks of added material which elaborate on what was carried over from the earlier articles or serve to tie the various parts together. The reader will note how Harris material occurs in groupings, pages 49-52; 145, 229-231; 102-103; and 101. In addition, within each section of pages, the sentences in both <u>DA</u> and Harris are rather consistently found to occur in the same sequence.

We may conclude from this survey of the chapter arrangement that while Ellen White arranged the blocks of material for this chapter according to her own scheme, assisted by Marian Davis, within the sections she largely developed the thought in parallel to that of her literary

source. And while we have noted some modification of the earlier material in its accommodation to the chapter presentation, generally the order of sentence sequence of the earlier writing is carried over "intact" into the arrangement of this chapter. It would appear that a kind of "paste and scissors" act was involved here.

Redaction Analysis - Pre-Desire of Ages

It is not within the purposes of our study to establish the degree of dependency between the earlier articles and the sources used in their composition. We only wish to further illustrate what appears to have been, at least with respect to this chapter, the literary method of Ellen White in the development of a theme.

The reader is invited to review the <u>DA</u> text as presented or to turn to Appendix C and note how the <u>Fundamentals of Christian Education</u> sentences following DA66 have parallels in Harris' <u>GT</u>, pp. 52-54. The <u>Review and Herald</u> sentences from 1895 which appear after DA69 reflect Harris <u>GT</u>, pp. 227-231. And finally, the 25 consecutive sentences from the <u>Signs</u>, 1894, which interlock with the <u>DA</u> text after sentence 111, may be seen as closely corresponding with the 23 sentences taken from Harris' <u>GT</u>, pp. 101-104.

This evidence clearly shows that in chapter 3 Ellen White follows the thought development of her literary source

in the composition of the subunits of the chapter. In the face of this rather consistent literary pattern, it would appear reasonable to hold Ellen White and not Marian Davis responsible for arranging the material in correspondence to that of the source. The fact that we find the same phenomenon in the individual articles and even in the personal letter to John H. Kellogg argues for this dependency to be that of Ellen White. It remains to be seen if such a pattern occurs in the other chapters of <u>DA</u> to be surveyed and in articles written at a time when Marian Davis was involved.

Our analysis does show, therefore, that Ellen White in this chapter is dependent upon her source(s) for the redaction of her material but only in a limited application. Such dependency is to be found in her subthemes or literary units within the chapter but not with respect to the arrangement of the chapter as a whole.

As we complete our analysis of chapter three it may be of interest to the reader to note a few of the complications involved in establishing and evaluating literary parallels in terms of dependency.

In sentence 103 of <u>DA</u> we have a shortened version of RH(95)39. The condensed form is balanced between the use of the source and Ellen White's modification of the sentence. In order to give credit to both aspects we evaluated the verse as Partial Independence, stressing the role of Ellen White over that of the source. The earlier <u>RH</u> sentence is

longer and the bold type clearly shows more words to have been taken from the source. The earlier sentence is obviously more like the source in literary expression even though some of Ellen White's modification is still apparent. In this instance we registered the sentence as having greater dependence.

Another interesting example of the problems faced in this kind of literary analysis is to be found in a closer look at sentence 105 of the text which combines in a shorter form two sentences from the earlier article, RH(95)40,41. The resulting combined sentence is given a rating of P2 even though each of the component sentences was rated as being P1. The very act of combining the two earlier sentences results in a looser paraphrase of the source even though the real dependency has not changed. Since it is the verbal similarity to the source that is being measured and not the content or idea, the dependency is given a lower rating.

It must be apparent to the reader by now and no doubt will become more obvious as the remainder of the DA text is certain amount of subjectivity that reviewed a necessarily involved in making these evaluations. At the same time there is also a certain arbitrariness involved in deciding the degree of dependency. For these reasons, even though great care was taken to be as consistent as possible, the evaluations should be taken with some degree of caution and used only as pointers to the dependency. The reader is not only invited but encouraged to compare the source text

"The Fullness of the Time" with the Ellen White parallel for him-/herself.

This leads us to a final comment on the difficulty of indicating dependency by some consistent measuring scale.

Near the end of the text of chapter 3 the study presents 23 sentences in full and in sequence from The Great Teacher by John Harris. Some of these sentences were not used by Ellen White and others only partly used. As one follows the development of the theme and the apparent use of certain expressions, at times paraphrase and at times verbatim, dependency is easily recognized. The borrowing, however, often involves the partial use of sentences. The problem is how to measure the amount of dependency and be fair in registering the degree to which the source is being used while at the same time to give proper credit to the writer who is using the old "stones" and "mortar" to create a new edifice. We can only claim that we attempted a fair evaluation. Once again we invite the reader to make the final judgment.

Summary

This summary follows the form as indicated in the introduction to this research report. We will present the evidence of our study of chapter 3 in the form of a series of statements. These statements will be very similar to those which will appear in the summary of our research on each of the 14 following chapters. It is our hope that by using a consistent form of presentation the reader will be

able to follow the chain of evidence as it leads from the analysis of each chapter into that chapter's summary and from the separate 15 summaries to the final summary and conclusion of the research document. These statements will together constitute the answers to the questions which were raised in the introduction to this study and which will be presented once again in the final summary. We have numbered the statements to correspond with the number of the question for which the statement provides the answer, whether for an individual chapter or for the final summary. Where a given chapter does not furnish information for answering a specific question a simple statement of "No information" will follow the statement number.

- 1. There are no extant handwritten manuscripts of the text of chapter 3. Neither do we possess any typescript manuscript of this chapter in the early stages of its development. Evidently Ellen White added to the earliest form of the compilation of previous writings on the topic but we have no handwritten text of this first writing. The handwritten material is limited to the sentences from Manuscript 24, 1891. We do have the typed and corrected form of the Kellogg letter and Manuscript 9, 1896 (or the sentences from Fundamentals of Education, pages 399-401). The other texts exist only in their published form.
- 2. In addition to what Ellen White had written in Spirit of Prophecy, II, chapter 1, we found references to eight previously written Ellen White texts dating from 1890

to 1898. The SP text contains around 15 sentences matching the content of DA, chapter 3. The remaining 75 sentences on the background to the first advent of Christ correspond to material found in chapters 2 and 3 of the DA text. These two DA chapters contain 212 sentences (82 + 130). Since the content of chapters 2 and 3 overlap in DA, even as in the earlier SP chapter, we can say that there is a general increase in Ellen White's coverage of the topic from 90 sentences to 212, or 122 sentences. On the other hand, chapter 3 alone gives evidence of a condensation of her coverage of the subject, if we take into consideration the text of DA and that of the eight sources of earlier Ellen White writings which went into the composition of chapter 3. We made no attempt to present the text of these earlier writings apart from their evidence on Ellen White's use of sources. A survey of these earlier articles will show that they contain some 315 sentences by conservative count treating the content of chapter 3. The total number of sentences found in these eight articles is much higher of course. Evidently Ellen White was doing much of her writing on this topic in the general interest of ministering to the church through her letters and articles in the church papers as well as in her writing for the general public through the columns of the Signs of the Times. This material was largely reduced for presentation in DA. We must remember that the sentences marked as independent in our evaluation do not necessarily indicate new material from Ellen White.

The evaluation only refers to non-dependency upon outside literary sources. It has no bearing on Ellen White's use of her own previous work.

- 3. The content of chapter 3 is rather broad in nature. It includes Jewish history and theology. It treats the great controversy theme which was a favorite motif with Ellen White. Similar ideas can be found in Patriarchs and Prophets (1890), The Great Controversy (1884, 1888) and various testimonies. It is evident from the materials used in the composition of this chapter that duplication of content often occurred between personal letters, articles, manuscript text, and book publication. This multiple use of Ellen White's writings should be taken into account in estimating Ellen White's total literary production.
- 4. There is significant development of the great controversy theme and other aspects of the incarnation from what was treated in <u>Spirit of Prophecy</u> but there are no important developments beyond that already covered by Ellen White in her earlier articles. We must bear in mind that the previously written texts were written within a decade of the writing of The Desire of Ages.
- 5. The <u>Desire of Ages</u> text of chapter 3 shows some degree of literary dependency in 59 of its 130 sentences or about 45 percent of the total text.
- 6. Chapter 3 shows literary independence in 67 of its sentences or 52 percent of the text. Four sentences or three percent were credited to biblical usage and excluded

from the evaluation.

- 7. Using the dependency rating scale as indicated in the introduction and in this first chapter of our study, the degree of dependency for the 59 dependent sentences is 2.3. The degree of dependency for the entire chapter of 130 sentences is 1.08.
- 8. The Great Teacher by John Harris was the one main source behind this chapter and behind the earlier writings used in the composition of this chapter. It was used for 44 out of the 59 sentences which showed literary dependency. A copy of this work bearing Ellen White's personal signature was found in her office library at the time of her death and is part of the White Estate library collection at the present time.
- 9. The chapter appears to have made minor use of two sources, an 1860 work by William S. Kennedy, Messianic Prophecy, and the life of Christ, and Sketches from the Life of Jesus, Historical and Doctrinal by E. W. Thayer. The latter book was published in 1891 by Fleming H. Revell, a religious publishing concern which also published a 12-chapter edition of Steps to Christ by Ellen White in 1892. Thayer does not appear in the inventory list of Ellen White's library collection at the time of her death.
- 10. The Great Teacher by Harris was also the only source found to have been used in the composition of the previous writings on the topic of chapter 3.
 - 11. Where the earlier texts are treating the same

content as chapter 3 of <u>DA</u> the usage is quite similar but somewhat closer in dependency. The more concise coverage of the <u>DA</u> text involves greater editing and in the combining of separate sentences of earlier documents many of the earlier verbal similarities are lost.

- Ellen White made use of literary sources in the writing of chapter 3 regardless of the subject matter. Literary dependency was found in comments on the great controversy between the forces of heaven and those of Satan, on the Jewish background to the advent, on the role of Christ, on the plight of the human race, and on God's great love for this world in rebellion. Parallels were found in devotional, theological, historical, descriptive, biblical content areas. What Ellen White did not take from the literary sources for this chapter were their lengthy comments on a given point, the harsh and extreme expressions which occasionally appeared in the source, and vocabulary which gave the impression of being more in the interest of literary embellishment than conveying meaning.
- 13. Ellen White and/or Marian Davis arranged the chapter content independent of the arrangement found in Harris or in any of the other sources located for this chapter, though it must be admitted that our special concern was with the verbal similarities to be found. The editing of chapter 3 is to be credited to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis. The literary subunits within chapter 3, however, insofar as source parallels allow us to conclude, do appear

to follow the literary arrangement of the source, particularly Harris.

The articles collected by Marian Davis for the composition of chapter 3 show that Ellen White selected her sources according to their treatment of a major theme or topic. There is no indication that the selection represents a choice of a "gem" quotation from this page and another choice quotation from another page. It is rather a series of parallels from blocks of material covering anywhere from one to six pages. The thematic development of these earlier writings of Ellen White do indicate close similarities to the thematic arrangement of the sources evidently used. Since we did not study the earlier texts as complete literary documents we cannot speak to the question of their redaction apart from a few of the literary subunits where we noted literary dependency. Our research indicates, however, that a careful investigation of these earlier documents in their entirety should be undertaken to ascertain what degree, if any, the sources used by Ellen White influenced the structure of her shorter writings such as articles, letters, etc.

Before concluding our summary of chapter 3 one important point should be registered. Two documents surveyed in connection with this chapter provide very strong evidence that Ellen White personally borrowed from her literary sources. Manuscript 24, 1891, written in America exists in handscript and the letter to John Harvey Kellogg

written from Australia in 1895 is available in typescript as it came from the copyists. The evidence of literary dependency in documents at this early pre-publication stage, and in so personal a form, leads us to conclude that the paraphrasing from a source was the work of Ellen White and not one of her literary assistants.

The foregoing analysis and summary contains more detailed description of the evaluation process than will occur in the following chapters. Our intention was to demonstrate in this first chapter the process described in the introductory chapters insofar as the text of chapter 3 and its parallels permit. The repetition of discussion on the procedures used in the evaluation process was intended to assist the reader in his/her efforts to weigh critically the evidence presented and to follow the argumentation of the analysis. In some sense this chapter also serves as a sample for the general structure of the introduction, analysis, and summary of the following chapters.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 3

No	Source	Dependency	No.	-	Source	Dependency
001	Bible	в2	051	-		11
002		P3	052	_		<u> </u>
003		11	053			ĪÌ
004	•	II	054			
005	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Il	055			Il Il
006	·	11	056			11
007	Kennedy MP/174.	2 12	057	Harri	s GT/31/52	
008	Kennedy MP/174		058		s GT/31/5	
009		- î î		- Warri	s GT/35a/5	2 <u>Bl</u> 52 <u>Bl</u>
010		Il	060		s GT/35b/5	
011	Thayer SLJ/22.1	12	061		edy MP/174	
012		Il	062	veillie	:UY MP/1/4,	
013	Bible	B2	063			<u> </u>
014		Il	064			
015	Bible		065.	77.000.0	- CT /1 /40	<u>I1</u> <u>V2</u>
016		B2 12	066	_narri	s GT/1/49	
017		<u> 12</u>	067	. Manud	- Cm/6 /1 As	11 P2
018	Bible	B2	068	- <u>narri</u>	s GT/6/145	
019	DIDIE	<u> </u>	069.	770 6	- cm /c /1 /E	11
020	Thayer SLJ/21.6		070		s GT/6/145	
021					s GT/25/22	
022	111dyer 310/21.0		071	Harri	s GT/27/22	
023		<u>Il</u>	072			11
024	MP/174.7 SLJ/14		073			
025	MP/174.7 SLJ/14	$\frac{12}{75}$ $\frac{12}{12}$	074			<u> </u>
026	MP/174.8 SLJ/16		075			<u> </u>
027	Harris GT/4/49	<u>.5</u> <u>12</u> P3	076			<u> </u>
028	Harris GT/19/50		077			
029	Harris GT/8/49+	<u></u>	078			<u> </u>
030	Hall18 G1/0/49+	<u> </u>	079			11
031	Harris GT/8,17/		080			<u> </u>
032	Hall 18 G1/0,1//	<u> </u>	081 082			<u></u>
033	Harris GT/21b/5		083			<u> </u>
034	Harris GT/21b/5				- CT (311 3	<u> </u>
035		- 12 P3	084		s GT/111.3	
036	Harris GT/18,19		085 086	<u> </u>		
037	Hall 15 G1/10/17	730 11	087			<u> </u>
038	Harris GT/20/51		087			Il Il Il Il Il Il Il Il
039	1142112 01/20/31	<u>P3</u>	089			
040	Harris GT/22/51	<u> 11</u>	090			
041	1141113 41/22/31		090			<u>II</u>
042		<u>Il</u>		·		II
043	GT/24/51 MP/174	.8 I2	092 093	-		
044	Kennedy MP/174.	9 12	094			<u>Il</u>
045	Kennedy MP/174.		094		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	
046	Harris GT/25,26	/51 P3	096			<u><u>Il</u></u>
047	GT/25-29/51,52	<u>I2</u>	090			<u></u>
048	Harris GT/23,25	/51 P3	097	-		<u>Il</u>
049		<u> </u>	099	. Uarri	s GT/39/23	<u> </u>
050	Harris GT/37/52	— <u>11</u>	100			
			100. –		s GT/40a/2	30 P2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 3

No.	-	Source	Dependency	No.	-	Source	Dependency
101.	_	Harris GT/40b/	230 P3	151.	_		
102.	-	Harris GT/40c/	230 P3	152.			
103	_	Harris GT/40d/					
104.				153.		·	
				154.			
105.		Harris GT/42/2		155.			
		Harris GT/43b/		156.			
		Harris GT/43c/		157.			
108.	-	Harris GT/43c/	231 P3	158.	-		
		Harris GT/43d/		159.	_		
		Harris GT/43d/		160.	_		
111.	-	GT/34/229;102.	9 12	161.	_		
112.	-	GT/11,12/102	P3	162.			
113.			Il	163.			
114.				164.			
-		GT/10,17,18/10		165.			
116.				_			
117.				166.			
118				167.			
			Il	168.			
119.			<u> 11</u>	169.			
120.		Harris GT/18b/	103 P3	170.			
121.			<u>Il</u>	171.	-		
122.		GT/16-18/103	12	172.	_		
123.		Harris GT/3/10]		173.	-		
124.		Harris GT/2/10]		174.	-		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
125.	-	Harris GT/4/10]	I2	175.	-		
126.	_		Il	176.			
127.	-		Ī1	177.			
128.			<u> </u>	178.			
129.			— ÎÎ	179.			
130.			<u> </u>	180.			
131.				181.			
132.							
133.				182.		- 	
				183.			
134.				184.			
135.				185.		-	
136.				186.			
137.				187.			
138.				188.	-	_	
139.				189.	-		
140.				190.	_		
141.				191.	-	- 	
142.	_			192.			
143.	_			193.			The state of the s
144.	_			194.			
145.				195.			
146.				196.			
147.							
148.				197.			
149.				198.			
150.	_			199.			
400.	_			200.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 3

No.	- Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001	- MS(24)2	P2	23	051.	_	ST (90) 26	P2	66
	- MS (24) 3		23	052.		ST (90) 29	12	66
003	- ST(90)1		 27	053.		ST (90) 30	B1	$-\frac{66}{66}$
	- ST (90)2		27	054.		DA (MS) 4/54:2	12	$-\frac{60}{69}$
	- ST(90)5		27	055.	_	RH (95)1	<u>V2</u>	69
006	MS (24)4		27	056.		RH (95) 2	P3	$\frac{-69}{69}$
007	MS(24)20		28	057.		RH (95)6a	11	69
	MS (24) 21		28	058.	_	RH (95) 6b	<u>P1</u>	69
	ST(90)7	12	28	059.	-	RH (95)7	12	69
	ST (90) 3	I2	32	060.	_ `	RH (95)8	P2	69
	MS (24) 16	P3	32	061.	_ `	RH(95)9	P2	$-\frac{69}{69}$
	MS (24) 17		32	062.	- '	RH (95) 10	P2	69
013	ST (98) 3	V2	33	063.		Lt(43)28	P2	69
-	MS(24)14		34	064.		RH (95) 11	12	69
-	ST (98) 4	P3	34	065.	- '		Pl	- 69
016			34	066.	_ `		12	69
017			35	067.	_ `		P2	$-\frac{70}{70}$
018			50	068.	_ `		P2	$\frac{1}{71}$
019			58	069.	-		P3	76
020	ST(90)11		58	070.	-	RH (95) 34	P3	99
021	MS (24)5		55	071.		Lt(43)9	P2	100
022	FE2/399		55	072.		,	P2	103
023	MS(24)1		55	073.	-]	RH (95) 40	Pl	105
024	FE1/399		6	074.	-]	<u> </u>	Pl	105
025	BE(97)17		6	075.	- [P2	111
026	BE(97)21		56	076.	- :		Bl	111
027 028			6	077.		ST (94)3	Bl	111
020	FE4/400 BE(97)18		6	078.		D-10-7-	<u> 11</u>	111
030			6	079.		ST (94)5	<u> 11</u>	111
030			56	080.		ST (94) 6		111
032			6	081.		ST (94) 7		111
	FE9/400		6	082.		ST(94)8	<u> </u>	111
034			6	083. 084.		ST (94)9	<u>P3</u>	111
035			6	085.		ST (94) 10	12	111
036	FE12/400		6	086.		ST (94)11 ST (94)12	<u> 12</u>	111
037			6			كالمستحدث والمتراث أرارا	<u>I2</u>	111
038	FE15/400		6	000		40.00	12	$\frac{111}{111}$
039	FE17/400		6	~~~		ST(94)15	12 12	111
040	FE18/400+		6	~~~		ST(94)16a	12	115
041	FE19/401		6	_		ST (94) 16b	11	116
042	FE20/401		6			ST(94)17	12	122
043	FE21/401		6			ST(94)18	12 .	122 124
		_I2 6	6			ST (94) 19	12	124
	FE23/401	<u>12</u> 6	6	095.		ST(94)20	Bl	124
_	ST (90) 23		6	096.		ST (94)21	P3	124
	ST (90) 24		6	097.		ST (94)22	P3	124
	ST(90)25		6	098.		ST (94) 23	P3	125
	FE24/401		6	099.	_	ST (94)24		125
050	FE25/401	P2 6	6	100.		ST (94) 25	B1	125

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 3

No	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
	MS (24) 2	*H/3/49	051.		ST (90) 26	H/54/54
002	MS (24)3	H/3/49	052.		ST (90) 29	H/55/54
003	ST (90)1	H/7/49	053.		ST (90) 30	
004	ST (90)2	H/4-7/49			DA (MS) 4/54:2	
005	ST (90)5	H/5,6/49			RH(95)1	H/12a/227
	MS (24)4	H/6,9/49+			RH (95) 2	H/12b/227
007	MS (24) 20	H/19/50+	057.		RH (95) 6a	11/120/221
	MS (24) 21	H/19/50+			RH (95) 6b	H/12c/227
009	ST (90)7	H/19/50+	059	_ =	RH (95) 7	H/13/227
	ST(90)3	H/9/50	060 -		RH (95)8	H/14/228
	MS (24)16	H/10/50	061	_ =	RH (95) 9	H/14/227
	MS (24)17	H/10/50	062.		RH (95)10	
	ST(98)3	H/21b/51			Lt (43) 28	H/15/227
	MS (24)14	H/15/50	064.			H/19/228
	ST (98) 4	H/14,15/51	065		RH (95)11	H/20/228
	ST (98) 5	H/15/50	065.		RH (95)12	H/21/228
017	ST (90)8	H/17,18/50	000.		RH (95) 13	H/21/228
018	BE(97)10	H/37/52	067		Lt (43) 29	H/25/229
019	ST(90)10	H/31/52			阳 (95) 31	H/27/229
010	ST (90) 11		069.		KH (95) 33	H/31,33/229
	MS(24)5	H/32/52	070		RH (95) 34	H/39/230
		H/1/49			Lt(43)9	
022	FE2/399	H/39+/230			स (95) 39	H/40/230
022	wa/24\2	H/39/52+		- 1	denotes Har	ris GT
	MS (24)1	H/2/49	0/3.	1	祖 (95) 40	H/42/231
	FE1/399	H/41/53	074.	- <u>I</u>	阳(95)41	H/43a/231
025	BE (97)17	H/41/53			ST(94)1	H/6a/101
	BE (97)21	H/40/52			ST (94)2	Bible
	FE3/400		077		ST (94)3	Bible
	FE4/400	H/40/52	078		ST (94)4	
	BE(97)18		079		ST (94) 5	
	BE(97)19		080, -	ے -	ST (94)6	H/6b/101
	FE5/400		081		ST (94)7	H/6c/101
	FE8/400	H/44/52			T (94)8	
	FE9/400	H/44/52	083		ST (94)9	H/6d/101
034	FE10/400	H/41/52	084		ST(94)10	H/6e/101
035	FE11/400	H/46a/52	085, -		T(94)11	H/6e/101
030	FE12/400	H/46b/52	086	5	ST (94) 12	H/6f/101
03/	FE13/400	H/47/52	087		ST (94)13	H/6g/101
038	FE15/400	H/48/53+			ST (94) 14	H/6g/101
039		H/49/54			ST (94) 15	H/10-18/102+
	FE18/400+	H/50/54			T(94)16a	H/10-18/102+
041	FE19/401	H/51/54	091		T(94)16b	
	FE20/401	H/51/54			ST (94)17	H/18b/103
	FE21/401	H/52/54			T(94)18	H/20/103+
	FE22/401	H/52/54			T (94) 19	H/21/104
	FE23/401	H/53/54			T(94)20	Bible
	ST(90)23	H/54/54	096		T(94)21	H/22/104
	ST(90)24	H/54/54	097		T(94)22	H/22/104
	ST (90) 25	H/54/54	098		T (94) 23	H/22,23/104
	FE24/401	H/54/54	099		T(94)24	H/23/104
050	FE25/401	H/54/54	100		T(94)25	H/23/104
					-	