

VII CHAPTER 24 - "Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

The return of Jesus to the place of His childhood and youth is specifically treated in Luke 4:16-30 but parallels are to be found in Matthew 13:53-58 and Mark 6:1-6a where we read that Jesus returned to "His own country." The content of the narrative allows a commentator a variety of approaches to the text. The naming of the village as Nazareth leads one to reflect upon the childhood of Jesus. The Sabbath synagogue service and the reading of Scripture from the prophet Isaiah introduce the questions of Sabbath observance, the Jewish religion, Messianic expectations and Jesus' self-understanding as the Messiah. The rejection of Jesus by His people and His reaction to their rejection permit comment on the role of the Jewish nation in the purposes of God and how trust in God is rewarded with God's salvation.

Ellen White referred to this story in various contexts throughout her writing career. In her earliest use of this narrative she merely makes a general remark on the attempt of the crowd to throw Jesus over a precipice (1SG, p. 36). The first extended commentary on the Nazareth visit appears in Redemption Leaflet No. 1, 1877, as part of the material under "The Ministry of Christ," Chapter IV, pages 52-62. In The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, 1877, Chapter VII, Ellen White devotes the last fourth of the chapter on "The Marriage at Cana," pages 110-115, to this episode in the life of Christ. It is in these very similar accounts that

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

we notice the use of sources for the first time in connection with this story. But it is clear that some four years earlier Ellen White was reading Daniel March's account in Walks and Homes of Jesus.¹

In the February, 1873, issue of The Youth's Instructor Ellen White writes on Jesus as a youth in Nazareth. The article, entitled "The Life of Christ.--No. 3," forms part of the textual background for chapter 7 of The Desire of Ages, "As a Child." Since chapter 24 of the DA recalls the childhood of Jesus in the second paragraph and in sentences 8-18 of the Redemption Leaflet text, we introduce the DA text of this chapter with nine sentences from the Youth's Instructor article.

In addition to Walks and Homes of Jesus Ellen White used another work by March, Days of the Son of Man,² and Hanna's Life of Christ in her various writings on the rejection of Jesus at Nazareth.

In Diary Book 14, dated 1889-1890, we found five handwritten pages following the title, "Christ at Nazareth."³ The sentences quoted in the text presentation have been corrected in respect to punctuation and capitalization. These sentences are identified by Di(89). The full text of Ellen White's original writing on the

¹March, Daniel, Walks and Homes of Jesus (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, 1866).

²March, Daniel, Days of the Son of Man (Philadelphia: J. C. McCurdy & Co., 1882).

³We found no transcription of this handwritten document other than the copy made in 1982. The pages in the diary are numbered 73-77.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

Nazareth rejection as found in Diary Book 14 may be found in uncorrected typescript form in Appendix D under the materials for chapter 24.

We shall have reason later to mention other articles by Ellen White on the topic of our chapter but one final reference should be included here. An 1889 letter to Howard and Madison Miller, Letter M-4-1889, includes some comment on the Nazareth experience. We begin our sentence numbers on page eight of the typescript which does not identify the copyist. The full text of the letter indicates that the letter has been generalized to make it applicable to others in addition to these two named individuals. We have corrected the spelling and punctuation errors because we have no way of being sure if the error represents the original text or the work of the copyist. Excerpts from the letter may be recognized by Lt(4). The full text from sentence 1 on page 8 through sentence 26 on page 11 and two sentences from pages 12 and 13 have been reproduced in Appendix D.

According to the earlier drafts of chapter 24, the title at one time was "Rejected at Nazareth." The final form of the title is the same as given in the earliest draft known to have existed. When we have an occasion to mention the textual evidence from this bound volume containing the earlier drafts of some of the chapters of the DA text we use the reference DA(MS) where the (MS) stands for the DA manuscript form or working draft of the text as contrasted

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

to the published text. The editorial note at the bottom of page 236 of DA is slightly misleading, however. The chapter is not based only on Luke 4:16-30. The title is a quote from Matthew 13:55 or Mark 6:3, and some of the comments of chapter 24 as well refer to the Matthean or Markan tradition. Ellen White and/or her literary sources appear to weave into one story the two accounts even though they also speak of a return visit later in Christ's ministry.

PRE-DESIRE OF AGES WRITINGS OF ELLEN WHITE NOT UTILIZED IN
THE DA TEXT

The following page has been added to the text presentation even though it does not relate directly to the literary form of chapter 24 of the DA text. These sentences from The Youth's Instructor, as well as one sentence from Redemption Leaflets No. 1, cover the same content as the DA text, and show how Ellen White used sources in writing on the life of Christ. Such earlier writings as these formed the scrapbooks developed by Marian Davis to assist Ellen White in the production of The Desire of Ages.

YI(73)16 How great must be the humiliation of the Son of God, that he should live in the despised and wicked town of Nazareth. [M/33/51+] (V2)

YI(73)17 The most holy place upon earth would have been greatly honored by the presence of the world's Redeemer a single year. [M/34a/52] (P1)

YI(73)18 The palaces of kings would have been exalted to receive Christ as a guest. [M/34b/52] (P2)

YI(73)19 But the Redeemer of the world passed by the courts of royalty, and made his home in a humble mountain village, for thirty years, thus conferring distinction upon despised Nazareth. [M/39-41/52,53] (P1)

YI(73)20 The Redeemer of the world passed up and down the hills and mountains, from the great plain to the mountain valley. [M/46/54] (P1)

YI(73)21 He enjoyed nature's beautiful scenery. (I1)

YI(73)22 He was delighted with the fields glowing with the beautiful flowers, and in listening to the birds of the air, and uniting his voice with them in their happy songs of praise. [M/47,48/54] (P2)

YI(73)23 The groves and mountains were his places of retreat for prayer, and frequently whole nights were spent in communion with his Father. [M/50,51/54] (P2)

YI(73)24 From the lofty mountains of Nazareth he looked forth upon a land that had waited a thousand years for his coming, and now he was not received. [M/53/54+] (V2)

IRL19/53 The treatment Christ received from the chief priests, scribes, and Pharisees, as he commenced his public ministry, and as the attention of the people was called to him, was the exhibition of the worst passions of the human heart. [M/60/55] (P1)

33/51+ How significant and awful the humiliation of the Son of God, that he should consent to live for so many years unhonored, unknown, in this rude, despised and wicked town. [March, WHJ]

34a/52 It would have been infinite condescension in him to have lived, for a single year, in the holiest place on earth; [March, WHJ]

34b/52 or to have maintained the state of kings in the most gorgeous palace ever built by human hands; . . . [March, WHJ]

39-41/52-53 He lived thirty years of his life in this depraved and despised Nazareth, that he might pour silent contempt upon the world's pride of place, and fortune, and fame. He passed by the renowned seats of wisdom, and glory, and empire, and made his home in this humble, mountain village, that his followers might learn to make any post of duty honorable by their own greatness and fidelity. It will take all the centuries of time, and the ages of eternity to measure the distinction which the name of Jesus has conferred upon this despised Nazareth. [March, WHJ]

46/54 Through these narrow streets, along these winding field-paths, up and down these terraced hill-sides, up and down the steep and stony road, from the great plain to the mountain valley, he passed as peasants now pass to their morning toil and their evening rest. [March, WHJ]

47,48/54 He listened to the birds of the air, the lark, the linnet, the nightingale and the turtle dove, whose voices are now heard in this valley. He delighted himself with the wild flowers that still make the meadows glow with their beauty. [March, WHJ]

50,51/54 These everlasting hills offered him their solitudes for a sanctuary. These wild olive groves, beyond the cultivated fields, covered him with their shadows when he spent the night alone in communion with his Father. [March, WHJ]

53/54+ From these lofty heights he looked forth upon a land that waited a thousand years for his coming, and received him not when he came. [March, WHJ]

60/55 The treatment which our Lord received when he attempted to begin his public ministry at Nazareth, is a sad and fearful exhibition of the worst passions of the human heart. [March, WHJ]

DA1/236 ACROSS the bright days of Christ's ministry in Galilee, one shadow lay. (I1)

DA2/236 The people of Nazareth rejected Him. (I1)

DA3/236 "Is not this the carpenter's son?" they said. (B2)

DA4/236 During His childhood and youth, Jesus had worshiped among His brethren in the synagogue at Nazareth. (I1)

DA5/236 Since the opening of His ministry He had been absent from them, but they had not been ignorant of what had befallen Him. [M/65/56] (P3)

Di(89)4 Curiosity had been aroused concerning him.
[M/65/56] (P2)

DA6/236 As He again appeared among them, their interest and expectation were excited to the highest pitch. (I1)

DA7/236 Here were the familiar forms and faces of those whom He had known from infancy. (I1)

DA8/236 Here were His mother, His brothers and sisters, and all eyes were turned upon him as He entered the synagogue upon the Sabbath day, and took His place among the worshipers. (I1)

DA9/236 In the regular service for the day, the elder read from the prophets, and exhorted the people still to hope for the Coming One, who would bring in a glorious reign, and banish all oppression. [M/71,88/57,59] (P3)

[Cf. 1RL/25,26/54]

DA10/236 He sought to encourage his hearers by rehearsing the evidence that the Messiah's coming was near. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

65/56 His fame had gone before him and his return awakened curiosity in Nazareth itself. [March, WHJ]

71/57 The service of song and prayer and reading the scriptures and exhortation was administered by the chief elder in the usual form. [March, WHJ]

88/59 They were looking for a Messiah who should come with the state of a king and the glory of a conqueror. [March, WHJ]

DA11/236 He described the glory of his advent, keeping prominent the thought that He would appear at the head of armies to deliver Israel.¹ [M/88-90/59] (I2)

1RL28/54 He taught them that Messiah would appear at the head of armies, to conquer the heathen, and deliver Israel from every oppressive yoke, destroying in wrath his enemies. [M/89,90/59] (P1)

Lt(4)10 The Jews expected the Messiah to come with pomp and ceremony as a great king. [M/88/59] (P1)

Lt(4)11 They looked for him to appear as a conqueror, to deliver Isreal [sic] from the Roman yoke. [M/88,90/59] (P1)

DA12/236 When a rabbi was present at the synagogue, he was expected to deliver the sermon, and any Israelite might give the reading from the prophets. [H/40,42/168] (I2)

DA13/236 Upon this Sabbath Jesus was requested to take part in the service. [M/18/95] (P3)

1RL29/54 At the close of the service of the minister, Jesus stood up with dignity, and requested them to bring him the book of the prophet Esaias. [M/72/57] (P2)

DA14/236 He "stood up to read. (B2)

DA15/236 And there was delivered unto Him a roll of the prophet Isaiah." Luke 4:16, 17, R. V., margin. (B2)

¹The first "He" refers to the elder of the synagogue, not Jesus.

89/59 He must appear at the head of armies, and his legions must fly as the clouds. [March, WHJ]

90/59 He must tread down the heathen in his wrath, and deliver Israel from every yoke. [March WHJ]

40,42/168 . . .the time has come for the second reading--that of some portion of the prophets,--when Jesus steps forth and stands in the reader's place. . . It is not a right belonging exclusively to priest or Levite; any Jew of any tribe might exercise it. [Hanna, LC]

18/95 When it came to the lesson for the day, selected from the prophecies of Isaiah, the leader, who was at liberty to call upon whom he pleased, seeing Jesus in the house invited him to take the elevated stand in the midst of the congregation and read. [March DSM]

72/57 At the close of the service, when the attendant of the synagogue was carrying back the book of the prophet Isaiah, from the pulpit in the centre of the house, . . . Jesus stood up as he could do according to the usage of the service, and demanded that the scroll should be given him to read. [March, WHJ]

DA16/236+ The scripture which He read was one that was understood as referring to the Messiah: "The Spirit of the Lord is upon Me, Because He hath anointed Me to preach the gospel to the poor; He hath sent Me to heal the broken hearted, To preach deliverance to the captives, And recovering of sight to the blind, To set at liberty them that are bruised, To preach the acceptable year of the Lord." [H/51/169] (B1)

2SP162/111 The scripture which Jesus read was understood by all to refer to the coming Messiah and his work. [H/51/169] (V2)

DA17/237 "And He closed the roll, and gave it back to the attendant: . . . and the eyes of all in the synagogue were fastened on Him. . . . (B2)

1RL46/55 The eyes of the congregation were fastened upon him, as he stated that this prophecy was fulfilled in him. [M/83/59] (V2)

DA18/237 And all bare him witness, and wondered at the words of grace which proceeded out of His mouth." Luke 4:20-22, R. V., margin. (B2)

DA19/237 Jesus stood before the people as a living expositor of the prophecies concerning Himself. [M/73/57] (P2)

1RL50/55 Jesus stood himself the living and divine interpreter of the prophet's words in regard to himself. [M/73/57] (P1)

Lt(4)4 No man had before, ventured to assume as much, not the learned or noble of the earth, not even prophets or kings. [M/76/58] (P2)

DA20/237 Explaining the words He had read, He spoke of the Messiah as a reliever of the oppressed, a liberator of captives, a healer of the afflicted, restoring sight to the blind, and revealing to the world the light of truth. [H/55/169] (P3)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

51/169 It was a Scripture universally understood to be descriptive of the coming Messiah, his office, and his work.
[Hanna, LC]

83/59 The eyes of all in the synagouge were fastened upon Jesus when he claimed that this great Messianic prophecy was fulfilled in him. [March, WHJ]

73/57 Unrolling the parchment and standing there, himself the living and divine interpreter of the prophet's words, he read, "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me," etc. [March, WHJ]

76/58 None of the prophets or kings or judges in the whole line of Jewish history had ventured to assume that exalted and awful name the MESSIAH. [March, WHJ]

2SP163a/111 And when the Saviour explained the words he had read, and pointed out the sacred office of the Messiah,--a reliever of the oppressed, a liberator of the captives, a healer of the afflicted, restoring sight to the blind, and revealing to the world the light of truth, [H/55/169] (P3)

DA21/237 His impressive manner and the wonderful import of His words thrilled the hearers with a power they had never felt before. [M/41/98] (P3)

[Cf. 1RL48/55]

1RL52/56 The astonishment of the people was great.
[M/84/59] (V2)

2SP164/111 Jesus had not been educated in the school of the prophets, yet the most learned Rabbis could not speak with more confidence and authority than did this young Galilean. [H/57-58/169] (P2)

DA22/237 The tide of divine influence broke every barrier down; like Moses, they beheld the Invisible. (11)

DA23/237 As their hearts were moved upon by the Holy Spirit, they responded with fervent amens and praises to the Lord. (11)

2SP163b --the people were thrilled with the wisdom and power of his words and responded to them with fervent amens and praises to the Lord. [H/56/169] (P3)

Di(89)12 And the Spirit of the Lord was moving upon the hearts of the audience for they were impressed that these words were the words of God. (11)

Di(89)13 With thrilling power they struck upon every heart and brought forth fervent response. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

55/169 What followed, however, we may well believe to have been an exposition of the passage read, as containing an account of the true character, ends, and objects of his mission as the Christ of God; the telling who the poor were to whom he brought good tidings, who the bruised and the broken-hearted were whom he came to heal, who the bound were that he came to liberate, who the blind whose eyes he came to open, what the year was he came to usher in--the long year of grace which still runs on, in the course of which there is acceptance for all of us with God, through Christ. [Hanna, LC]

41/98 They sat in silence and in wonder as he spoke, for they had never heard such gracious words from human lips before. [March, DSM]

84/59 Their astonishment knew no bounds. [March WHJ]

56/169 As Jesus spake of these things--spake with such ease, such grace, such dignity--the first impression made upon the Nazarenes, his old familiar friends, was that of astonishment and admiration. [Hanna, LC]

57-58/169 He had got no other, no better education than that which the poorest of them had received. He had attended none of the higher schools in any of the larger towns, had sat at the feet of none of their chief rabbis to be instructed in the law; yet no rabbi of the schools could speak with greater fluency, greater authority, greater confidence. [Hanna, LC]

DA24/237 But when Jesus announced, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears," they were suddenly recalled to think of themselves, and of the claims of him who had been addressing them. [M/43,45/99] (P2)

2SP166/111 But when he announced: "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears," the minds of his hearers were brought back to consider what were this man's claims to the Messiahship--the highest position that man could occupy. [H/59a/170] (P2)

DA25/237 They, Israelites, children of Abraham, had been represented as in bondage. (I1)

DA26/237 They had been addressed as prisoners to be delivered from the power of evil; as in darkness, and needing the light of truth. [H/59b/170] (P3)

2SP167/111+ The interest of the congregation had been thoroughly awakened, and their hearts had been stirred with joy; but Satan was at hand to suggest doubts and unbelief, and they remembered who it was that addressed them as the blind, and the captives in bondage who needed special aid. [H/59a,b/170] (I2)

DA27/237 Their pride was offended, and their fears were roused. (I1)

DA28/237 The words of Jesus indicated that His work for them was to be altogether different from what they desired. (I1)

DA29/237 Their deeds might be investigated too closely. (I1)

DA30/237 Notwithstanding their exactness in outward ceremonies, they shrank from inspection by those clear, searching eyes. (I1)

DA31/237 Who is this Jesus? they questioned. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

43,45/99 . . . when he sat down and said, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears." . . . When they began to think who it was, and how great and awful was the mission which he had taken upon himself, their astonishment knew no bounds. [March, DSM]

59a/170 Soon, however, as from the mere manner, they began to turn their thoughts to the substance of this discourse, and began to realize what the position really was which Jesus was assuming--that it was nothing short of the very highest that ever any son of man was to reach; [Hanna, LC]

59b/170 that it was as the Lord's annointed Christ that he was speaking, and speaking to them as the poor, the blind, the captives, to whom he was to render such services--the admiration turns into envy. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA32/237 He who had claimed for Himself the glory of the Messiah was the son of a carpenter, and had worked at His trade with His father Joseph. [M/29/96] (P2)

1RL59/56 He was the son of a carpenter, working at the trade with his father Joseph. [M/29/96] (P1)

DA33/237 They had seen Him toiling up and down the hills, they were acquainted with His brothers and sisters, and knew His life and labors. [M/85-87/59] (P2)

1RL57/56 Many had seen Jesus in his humble, unpretending life. [M/85-86/59] (P1)

1RL58/56 His home was among the poor and lowly of the earth. [M/86,87/59] (P2)

1RL60/56 He had made no claims to distinction, or greatness. [M/87/59] (P2)

Lt(4)9 They did not expect Christ to come in this way [sic] his family connections were humble, pious people, but not distinguished for riches, learning, rank, or power. [M/86,87/59] (I2)

DA34/237 They had seen Him develop from childhood to youth, and from youth to manhood. (I1)

DA35/237 Although His life had been spotless, they would not believe that He was the promised One. (I1)

DA36/238 What a contrast between his teaching in regard to the new kingdom and that which they had heard from their elder! (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

29/96 And yet here was the Son of a carpenter, who had worked for days' wages at his trade in that town for many a year, putting himself forth before the assembly as that glorious and divine personage whose coming had been looked for with longing hearts four thousand years, and in whose kingdom all the nations of the earth should be blessed. [March, DSM]

85/59 They had seen Jesus a child in their streets. [March, WHJ]

86/59 His home was among the poor; he had pursued an humble and laborious occupation for years. [March, WHJ]

87/59 His family had never gained the distinction of learning, or riches, or rank, or power. [March, WHJ]

DA37/238 Jesus had said nothing of delivering them from the Romans. (11)

Di(89)22 They wanted a Mighty general a Military leader who with supernatural power should humiliate the Roman power and avenge their national wrongs and place the Jewish nation where they thought they deserved to be the exalted of the world. [M/56/100] (P3)

DA38/238 They had heard of His miracles, and had hoped that His power would be exercised for their advantage, but they had seen no indication of such purpose. (11)

2SP174/112 And they refused to believe him unless he gave them some marked sign. [H/64/170] (P2)

DA39/238 As they opened the door to doubt, their hearts became so much the harder for having been momentarily softened. [Cf. H/65,66/170] (11)

1SP175a/112 They opened their hearts to unbelief, and prejudice took possession of them, and blinded their judgment, (11)

DA40/238 Satan was determined that blind eyes should not that day be opened, nor souls bound in slavery be set at liberty. (11)

DA41/238 With intense energy he worked to fasten them in unbelief. (11)

DA42/238 They made no account of the sign already given, when they had been stirred by the conviction that it was their Redeemer who addressed them. (11)

1SP175b/112 so that they made no account of the evidence already given when their hearts had thrilled with the knowledge that it was their Redeemer who addressed them. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

56/100 He must put down the mighty from their seats, and exalt the men of low degree to the crowns of honor and the thrones of power. [March, DSM]

64/170 Before he asks us to believe any such thing of him, let him show us some sign from heaven; do some of those miracles that they say he has done elsewhere, particularly at Capernaum. [Hanna, LC]

65/170 If he wanted us, who have all known him so well from his childhood, to believe in him as a prophet, he should have come to us first, convinced us first, unfolded his credentials to us first, wrought his first miracles here in Nazareth. [Hanna, LC]

66/170 Jealousy heightens the offense that envy had created, and ere long the whole company in that synagogue is looking at him askance. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA43/238 But Jesus now gave them an evidence of his divinity by revealing their secret thoughts. [H/67/170] (I2)

2SP176/112 But Jesus now showed them a sign of his divine character by revealing the secrets of their minds. [H/67/170] (I2)

DA44/238 "He said unto them, Doubtless ye will say unto Me this parable, Physician, heal thyself: whatsoever we have heard done at Capernaum, do also here in Thine own country. [H/67/170] (B1)

[Cf. 2SP177/112]

DA45/238 And He said, Verily I say unto you, No prophet is acceptable in his own country. (B2)

DA46/238 But of a truth I say unto you, There were many widows in Israel in the days of Elijah, when the heaven was shut up three years and six months, when there came a great famine over all the land; and unto none of them was Elijah sent, but only to Zarephath, in the land of Sidon, unto a woman that was a widow. (B2)

DA47/238 And there were many lepers in Israel in the time of Elisha the prophet; and none of them was cleansed, but only Naaman, the Syrian." Luke 4:23-27, R. V. (B2)

DA48/238 By this relation of events in the lives of the prophets, Jesus met the questionings of his hearers. [H/67/170] (I2)

2SP181/113 Jesus read the inmost thoughts of those who were before him, and met their questioning with this relation of events in the lives of the prophets. [H/67/170] (I2)

DA49/238 The servants whom God had chosen for a special work were not allowed to labor for a hardhearted and unbelieving people. (I1)

DA50/238 But those who had hearts to feel and faith to believe were especially favored with evidences of his power through the prophets. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

67/170 Jesus sees this, and turning from his former subject of discourse, tells them that he sees and knows it, lays open their hearts to them, puts the very words into their lips that they were ready to utter, and proceeds to vindicate himself for not showing any special sign to his fellow-townsmen, by quoting two instances in which Elijah and Elisha, the two great workers of miracles among the prophets, passed over all their fellow countrymen to show favor to the Sidonian widow and the Syrian officer. [Hanna, LC]

DA51/238 In the days of Elijah, Israel had departed from God. (11)

DA52/238 They clung to their sins, and rejected the warnings of the Spirit through the Lord's messengers. (11)

DA53/238 Thus they cut themselves off from the channel by which God's blessing could come to them. (11)

DA54/238 The Lord passed by the homes of Israel, and found a refuge for His servant in a heathen land, with a woman who did not belong to the chosen people. (11)

DA55/238 But this woman was favored because she had followed the light she had received, and her heart was open to the greater light that God sent her through His prophet. (11)

DA56/239 It was for the same reason that in Elisha's time the lepers of Israel were passed by. (11)

DA57/239 But Naaman, a heathen nobleman, had been faithful to his convictions of right, and had felt his great need of help. (11)

DA58/239 He was in a condition to receive the gifts of God's grace. (11)

DA59/239 He was not only cleansed from his leprosy, but blessed with a knowledge of the true God. (11)

DA60/239 Our standing before God depends, not upon the amount of light we have received, but upon the use we make of what we have. (11)

DA61/239 Thus even the heathen who choose the right as far as they can distinguish it are in a more favorable condition than are those who have had great light, and profess to serve God, but who disregard the light, and by their daily life contradict their profession. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA62/239 The words of Jesus to His hearers in the synagogue struck at the root of their self-righteousness, pressing home upon them the bitter truth that they had departed from God and forfeited their claim to be His people. (11)

2SP190/114 Thus Jesus stood before the Jews, calmly revealing their secret thoughts, and pressing home upon them the bitter truth of their unrighteousness. (11)

DA63/239 Every word cut like a knife as their real condition was set before them. (11)

DA64/239 They now scorned the faith with which Jesus had at first inspired them. (11)

DA65/239 They would not admit that He who had sprung from poverty and lowliness was other than a common man. (11)

DA66/239 Their unbelief bred malice. (11)

[Cf. 1RL73/57]

DA67/239 Satan controlled them, and in wrath they cried out against the Saviour. [M/101/61] (12)

1RL74/57 Satan controlled their minds, and they cried out against him with wrath and hatred.
[M/101/61] (12)

DA68/239+ They had turned from Him whose mission it was to heal and restore; now they manifested the attributes of the destroyer. (11)

DA69/240 When Jesus referred to the blessings given to the Gentiles, the fierce national pride of his hearers was aroused, and his words were drowned in a tumult of voices. (11)

DA70/240 These people had prided themselves on keeping the law; but now that their prejudices were offended, they were ready to commit murder. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

101/61 And so they cried out against him with wrath and cursing. [March, WHJ] .PA

DA71/240 The assembly broke up, and laying hands upon Jesus, they thrust Him from the synagogue, and out of the city. [M/102,104a,b/61] (P2)

1RL75/57 Their assembly broke up, and they laid hands upon Jesus, and thrust his out of the synagogue, out of their city, and would have rid the world of his presence, had they had power so to do. [M/102,104a,b/61] (P2)

DA72/240 All seemed eager for his destruction. [M/104c/61] (P1)

1RL76/57 All seemed eager to act a part in destroying him. [M/104c/61] (V2)

DA73/240 They hurried him to the brow of a precipice, intending to cast him down headlong. [M/104d/61] (V2)

1RL77/57 They hurried him to the brow of a steep precipice, intending to cast him headlong. [M/104d/61] (V2)

DA74/240 Shouts and maledictions filled the air. (I1)

DA75/240 Some were casting stones at Him, when suddenly He disappeared from among them. [M/105,106/61] (I2)

1RL80/57 Some were casting stones and dirt at him; but suddenly he disappeared out of their midst, they knew not how, or when. [M/105,106/61] (I2)

DA76/240 The heavenly messengers who had been by His side in the synagogue were with him in the midst of that maddened throng. (I1)

[Cf. 2SP201/114]

Di(89)37 Angels of heaven preserved his life and provided [?] a way out of the throng and he went on his way. (I1)

DA77/240 They shut Him in from His enemies, and conducted Him to a place of safety. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

102/61 Out of the synagogue, out of their city, out of the world would they cast him whose only offense was the meekness and plainness with which he had spoken the truth. [March WHJ]

104a/61 With one consent, and with deafening cries, they break up the assembly; [March, WHJ]

104b/61 they surround him; they lay hands upon him, [March, WHJ]

104c/61 every one eager to bear a part in destroying him; [March, WHJ]

104d/61 they hurry him forth to the brow of a precipice, near by the synagogue, that they may cast him down headlong. [March, WHJ]

105/61 But suddenly when they looked for him, he was not there. [March. WHJ]

106/61 He had passed through the midst of them and was gone. [March WHJ]

DA78/240 So angels protected Lot, and led him out safely from the midst of Sodom. (I1)

DA79/240 So they protected Elisha in the little mountain city. (I1)

DA80/240 When the encircling hills were filled with the horses and chariots of the king of Syria, and the great host of his armed men, Elisha beheld the nearer hill slopes covered with the armies of God,--horses and chariots of fire round about the servant of the Lord. (I1)

DA81/240 So, in all ages, angels have been near to Christ's faithful followers. (I1)

DA82/240 The vast confederacy of evil is arrayed against all who would overcome; but Christ would have us look to the things which are not seen, to the armies of heaven encamped about all who love God, to deliver them. (I1)

DA83/240 From what dangers, seen and unseen, we have been preserved through the interposition of the angels, we shall never know, until in the light of eternity we see the providences of God. (I1)

DA84/240 Then we shall know that the whole family of heaven was interested in the family here below, and that messengers from the throne of God attended our steps from day to day. (I1)

DA85/240 When Jesus in the synagogue read from the prophecy, He stopped short of the final specification concerning the Messiah's work. [H/106/173] (P2)

DA86/240 Having read the words, "To proclaim the acceptable year of the Lord," He omitted the phrase, "and the day of vengeance of our God." Isa. 61:2. [H/107/173] (B1)

DA87/240 This was just as much truth as was the first of the prophecy, and by His silence Jesus did not deny the truth. [H/108,109/173] (P3)

106/173 . . . instead of reading the number of verses ordinarily recited, he stopped where he did in his quotation from Isaiah. [Hanna, LC]

107/173 Had he gone on, he should have said, "to proclaim the acceptable year of the Lord, and the day of vengeance of our God." [Hanna, LC]

108-109/173 Why not go on, why pause thus in the middle of the sentence? Not assuredly that he meant either to deny or hide the truth, that the day of vengeance would follow upon the acceptable year, if the opportunities of that year were abused and lost . . . [Hanna, LC]

DA88/240 But this last expression was that upon which His hearers delighted to dwell, and which they were desirous of fulfilling. (11)

DA89/240+ They denounced judgments against the heathen, not discerning that their own guilt was even greater than that of others. (11)

DA90/241 They themselves were in deepest need of the mercy they were so ready to deny to the heathen. [H/109/173] (I2)

DA91/241 That day in the synagogue, when Jesus stood among them, was their opportunity to accept the call of Heaven. [H/109/173] (P2)

[Cf. 1RL86/57]

DA92/241 He who "delighteth in mercy" (Micah 7:18) would fain have saved them from the ruin which their sins were inviting. [H/109/173] (I2)

DA93/241 Not without one more call to repentance could He give them up. [M/109/62] (I2)

[Cf. 1RL89/58]

DA94/241 Toward the close of his ministry in Galilee, He again visited the home of His childhood. [M/109/62] (P2)

1RL88/58 At a later period he came to Nazareth for the last time. [M/109/62] (P1)

DA95/241 Since His rejection there, the fame of His preaching and His miracles had filled the land. [M/110/62] (P2)

1RL90/58 The fame of his miracles, and wisdom, and power, had spread everywhere, and many of the people of Nazareth had been witnesses of his wonderful miracles. [M/110/162] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

109/173 . . . but that then and now, it is his chosen and most grateful office to throw wide open the arms of the heavenly mercy, and invite all to throw themselves into them and be saved. [Hanna, LC]

109/62 In the course of the following winter, he came once more, and for the last time, to this secluded vale of Nazareth, after the people had had time to reflect and to repent of their madness. [March, WHJ]

110/62 He came when the fame of his mighty works had filled the whole land. . . . [March, WHJ]

Lt(4)21 After his fame had spread through the country to every region, after they had had time for their prejudice to subside, and reason to take control of their minds, he came again to test them, that they might redeem their past rejection of him.
[M/109,110/62] (I2)

DA96/241 None could now deny that he possessed more than human power. [M/115/62] (I2)

1RL92/58 These evidences had been witnessed by thousands. [M/115/62] (V2)

DA97/241 The people of Nazareth knew that He went about doing good, and healing all that were oppressed by Satan. (I1)

DA98/241 About them were whole villages where there was not a moan of sickness in any house; for He had passed through them, and healed all their sick. (I1)

1RL91/58 He had silenced and cast out demons, healed the sick, given sight to the blind, restored hearing to the deaf, and raised the dead to life.
[M/113,114/62] (P2)

DA99/241 The mercy revealed in every act of his life testified to his divine anointing. (I1)

DA100/241 Again as they listened to His words the Nazarenes were moved by the Divine Spirit. (I1)

DA101/241 But even now they would not admit that this Man, who had been brought up among them, was other or greater than themselves. [M/117/62] (P3)

Lt(4)24 With such tokens of his truth before them, would these blind, fanatical men see in Jesus nothing more than the carpenter of Nazareth, the son of Mary?
[M/117/62] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

[See above.]

115/62 And these evidences of his divine power had been witnessed by thousands. [March, WHJ]

113,114/62 He had given sight to the blind, and hearing to the deaf, and speech to the dumb. At Capernaum and at the neighboring hill-town of Nain, he had raised the dead to life. [March, WHJ]

117/62 But still the blinded and fanatical Nazarenes could see nothing but a carpenter in the son of Mary. [March, WHJ]

DA102/241 Still there rankled the bitter memory that while He had claimed for Himself to be the Promised One, He had really denied them a place with Israel; for He had shown them to be less worthy of God's favor than a heathen man and woman. (11)

DA103/241 Hence though they questioned, "Whence hath this Man this wisdom, and these mighty works?" they would not receive Him as the Christ of God. (11)

DA104/241 Because of their unbelief, the Saviour could not work many miracles among them. (11)

DA105/241 Only a few hearts were open to His blessing, and reluctantly He departed, never to return. (11)

DA106/241 Unbelief, having once been cherished, continued to control the men of Nazareth. (11)

DA107/241 So it controlled the Sanhedrin and the nation. (11)

DA108/241 With priests and people, the first rejection of the demonstration of the Holy Spirit's power was the beginning of the end. (11)

DA109/241 In order to prove that their first resistance was right, they continued ever after to cavil at the words of Christ. (11)

1RL95/58 They had committed themselves at the first to reject and insult him, and they retained their prejudices, and would not receive evidence, and be convinced that he was the Coming One, the Redeemer of Israel; for if they should then acknowledge him, they would condemn themselves. [M/118/62] (12)

Lt(4)25 At the begining [sic] of his ministry, they had taken their first steps in the rejection of Christ, they had committed themselves to the work and the will of Satan, and their pride was so strong, their prejudices so great, that at his second call, they would not acknowledge him as the Messiah although they had the most convincing proff [sic] of his divinity. [M/118/62] (12)

118/62 Having once committed themselves to the rejection of Jesus, it was still too much for their pride to recognise in him the promised Redeemer of Israel, the Saviour of the world. [March, WHJ]

DA110/241 Their rejection of the Spirit culminated in the cross of Calvary, in the destruction of their city, in the scattering of the nation to the winds of heaven. (11)

DA111/241 Oh, how Christ longed to open to Israel the precious treasures of the truth! (11)

DA112/241+ But such was their spiritual blindness that it was impossible to reveal to them the truths relating to His kingdom. (11)

DA113/242 They clung to their creed and their useless ceremonies when the truth of Heaven awaited their acceptance. (11)

DA114/242 They spent their money for chaff and husks, when the bread of life was within their reach. (11)

DA115/242 Why did they not go to the word of God, and search diligently to know whether they were in error? (11)

DA116/242 The Old Testament Scriptures stated plainly every detail of Christ's ministry, and again and again He quoted from the prophets, and declared, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears." (11)

DA117/242 If they had honestly searched the Scriptures, bringing their theories to the test of God's word, Jesus need not have wept over their impenitence. (11)

DA118/242 He need not have declared, "Behold, your house is left unto you desolate." Luke 13:35. (B2)

DA119/242 They might have been acquainted with the evidence of his Messiahship, and the calamity that laid their proud city in ruins might have been averted. (11)

DA120/242 But the minds of the Jews had become narrowed by their unreasoning bigotry. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA121/242 The lessons of Christ revealed their deficiencies of character, and demanded repentance. (11)

DA122/242 If they accepted His teachings, their practices must be changed, and their cherished hopes relinquished. (11)

DA123/242 In order to be honored by Heaven, they must sacrifice the honor of men. (11)

DA124/242 If they obeyed the words of this new rabbi, they must go contrary to the opinions of the great thinkers and teachers of the time. (11)

DA125/242 Truth was unpopular in Christ's day. (11)

DA126/242 It is unpopular in our day. (11)

DA127/242 It has been unpopular ever since Satan first gave man a disrelish for it by presenting fables that lead to self-exaltation. (11)

DA128/242 Do we not today meet theories and doctrines that have no foundation in the word of God? (11)

DA129/242 Men cling as tenaciously to them as did the Jews to their traditions. (11)

DA130/242 The Jewish leaders were filled with spiritual pride. (11)

DA131/242 Their desire for the glorification of self manifested itself even in the service of the sanctuary. (11)

DA132/242 They loved the highest seats in the synagogue. (11)

DA133/242 They loved greetings in the market places, and were gratified with the sound of their titles on the lips of men. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA134/242 As real piety declined, they became more jealous for their traditions and ceremonies. (11)

DA135/242 Because their understanding was darkened by selfish prejudice, they could not harmonize the power of Christ's convicting words with the humility of His life. (11)

DA136/242 They did not appreciate the fact that real greatness can dispense with outward show. (11)

DA137/242 This Man's poverty seemed wholly inconsistent with His claim to be the Messiah. (11)

DA138/242 They questioned, If He was what He claimed to be, why was He so unpretending? (11)

DA139/242+ If He was satisfied to be without the force of arms, what would become of their nation? (11)

DA140/243 How could the power and glory so long anticipated bring the nations as subjects to the city of the Jews? (11)

DA141/243 Had not the priests taught that Israel was to bear rule over all the earth? and could it be possible that the great religious teachers were in error? (11)

DA142/243 But it was not simply the absence of outward glory in His life that led the Jews to reject Jesus. (11)

DA143/243 He was the embodiment of purity, and they were impure. (11)

DA144/243 He dwelt among men an example of spotless integrity. (11)

DA145/243 His blameless life flashed upon their hearts. (11)

DA146/243 His sincerity revealed their insincerity. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA147/243 It made manifest the hollowness of their pretentious piety, and discovered iniquity to them in its odious character. (11)

DA148/243 Such a light was unwelcome. (11)

DA149/243 If Christ had called attention to the Pharisees, and had extolled their learning and piety, they would have hailed Him with joy. (11)

DA150/243 But when He spoke of the kingdom of heaven as a dispensation of mercy for all mankind, He was presenting a phase of religion they would not tolerate. (11)

DA151/243 Their own example and teaching had never been such as to make the service of God seem desirable. (11)

DA152/243 When they saw Jesus giving attention to the very ones they hated and repulsed, it stirred up the worst passions of their proud hearts. (11)

DA153/243 Notwithstanding their boast that under the "lion of the tribe of Judah" (Rev. 5:5), Israel should be exalted to pre-eminence over all nations, they could have borne the disappointment of their ambitious hopes better than they could bear Christ's reproof of their sins, and the reproach they felt even from the presence of His purity. (11)

Lt(4)43a It is indeed human to err, and the wisest often make mistakes, [M/127/64] (V2)

Lt(4)43b but it is noble to confess orrer [sic], and not enclose the heart in prejudice, to make yourselves and others believe you have pursued a righteous [word unclear] (11)

Lt(4)44 You reject Christ by rejecting the message he sends; in so doing, you place yourselves under the control of the prince of darkness. [M/134/64] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

127/64 It is indeed human to err, and the wisest often mistake. [March, WHJ]

128,134/64 But all other mistakes are as nothing compared with the one of rejecting Christ. . . . To reject Christ is to say, "Prison of despair be my habitation; Prince of darkness, reign over me forever." [March, WHJ]

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

Analysis

There is no way that all the evidence reviewed in connection with the textual study of even one chapter can be presented for the reader's appreciation. Time and staff limitations also force us to curtail our natural and legitimate desires to search for more information down many different avenues of interest opened to our attention by this study.

One very provocative challenge introduced to us forcefully by the study of this chapter is that of an internal source critical (analytical) study of Ellen White's writing on a given topic. Let us explain.

The reader no doubt has already noted how often we have had occasion to list the references to Ellen White's earlier writings on the topic of Christ's rejection at Nazareth. We have referred to an article in The Youth's Instructor, to Redemption Leaflet, No. 1, to Vol. II of The Spirit of Prophecy, to a letter written in 1889, and to some diary material. These writings exhibit the use of literary sources and apart from the YI article also appear to have been a part of that storehouse of writings from which the text of chapter 24 was generated.

In addition to these items, there is Manuscript 12b, 1896, entitled "Higher Education," where on pages 2 and 3 Ellen White comments on the Nazareth visit. Some of the sentences are very close to if not identical to the DA text. Others are similar in thought but not as close in verbal

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

expression.

Another text of interest is Manuscript 40, 1887. The earliest form of the writing consists of a 19-page handwritten copy which most likely is to be dated sometime in 1887. The only typed copy we have found of this manuscript is an unedited White Estate copy by Martha Montgomery Odom dated April 18, 1965. Excerpts from MS 40 appear as part of the general article by Ellen White in the ST, June 23, 1887. The material has been edited, given the caption, "No Cloak for Their Sin," and listed as originating in Basel, Switzerland. About four pages from the same manuscript were edited and shaped into another ST article. This second part of the manuscript was published under the title of "Jesus Rejected at Nazareth," and appeared under the date of June 16, 1887.

A final reference takes us to The Review and Herald, February 7, 1888, where Ellen White refers to the Nazareth experience in her remarks on "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth." The 97 sentences of the RH article and the ST item of 55 sentences on the visit to Nazareth have been photocopied and placed in Appendix D. In respect to the ST article we have also included the relevant sections of MS 40, 1887. The RH selection may be compared to the DA text.

What intrigues us is the way in which Ellen White takes a short and rather concise story and using literary sources as well as her own creative abilities develops several different applications. We would like to know, which parts

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

remain basically stable and which parts undergo modification? How does the force or emphasis change according to the general thrust of the various article and book presentations? Does the story always play the same role in each composition? To what degree do the sentences change and what does this tell us about verbal inspiration and the proper way to interpret the Ellen G. White writings?

Obviously, these concerns lie beyond the scope of our investigation. What we have done is to provide a comparative listing of the parallel sentences between six earlier accounts and the DA text. In the following extended table, Table A, on pages 289 through 293 one can trace the use of a particular sentence from its earliest presentation in Redemption Leaflet, No. 1, to its final resting place in the DA text. We have not extended our search beyond 1898 but it is conceivable Ellen White could have continued the process until the time of her death in 1915. At any rate, the reader can use the various texts we have listed in our comparative study and those provided in Appendix D to extend our source critical evaluations beyond what we were able to do for this particular study.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Our tabulations as shown in Table 1, page 294, indicate that out of the 153 sentences of chapter 24 the evaluation of Strict Independence was applied to 112. Bible quotations totaled 9, leaving 32 as being in some degree dependent on a

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

Redemption Leaflet No 1, Chapter IV, "The Ministry of Christ"
 The Spirit of Prophecy, II, Chapter VII, "The Marriage at Cana"
 The Signs of the Times, June 16, 1887, "Jesus Rejected at Nazareth"
 (See also MS 40, 1887)
 EGW Diary, Book 14, "Christ at Nazareth"
 The Review and Herald, February 7, 1888, "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth"
 Letter 4, 1889, Letter to Howard and Madison Miller
 The Desire of Ages, Chapter 24, "Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
001.	- 1RL 1-7					
002.	- 8-18,20-22					
003.	-				Lt (4) 1	
004.	- 1RL 19-M			Di(89)38	Lt (4) 2	DA 1-3
005.	- 1RL 23	2SP 150		Di(89)1		DA 4
006.	- 1RL 24	2SP 151	ST (87) 2	Di(89)2		
007.	-			Di(89)4		DA 5
008.	-					DA 6
009.	-					DA 7
010.	-			Di(89)5,6		DA 8
011.	- 1RL 25-M	2SP 152				DA 9
012.	- 1RL 26-M	2SP 153				DA10,11a
013.	- 1RL 27	2SP 154				
014.	- 1RL 28-M	2SP 155			Lt(4)10,12	DA 11b
015.	-					DA 12-H
016.	- 1RL 29-M	2SP 156		Di(89)3		DA 13
017.	- 1RL 30				Lt (4) 5	DA 14
018.	- 1RL 31			Di(89)7		DA 15
019.	-	2SP162-H	ST (87) 5			DA 16a
020.	- 1RL 32	2SP 157	ST (87) 3		Lt (4) 3	DA 16b
021.	- 1RL 33	2SP 158				DA 17a
022.	- 1RL 34	2SP 159	ST (87) 4			DA 17b
023.	- 1RL 35	2SP 160	ST (87) 4			
024.	-			Di(89)8		
025.	- 1RL 36	2SP 161	ST (87) 6	Di(89)14		DA 18
026.	-			Di(89)15		
027.	- 1RL 37					
028.	- 1RL 43					
029.	- 1RL 44					
030.	- 1RL 45					
031.	- 1RL 46-M					
032.	- 1RL 47					
033.	- 1RL 50-M	2SP 165b		Di(89)9	Lt (4) 4	DA 19
034.	-	2SP163a-H	ST (87) 6	Di(89)19a		DA 20
035.	- 1RL 48-M	2SP 165a	ST (87) 7	Di(89)11		DA 21

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
036.	- 1RL 51	2SP 164-H				
037.	- 1RL 52					
038.	- 1RL 53			Di(89)12		DA 22
039.	- 1RL 54	2SP 163b	ST (87) 7	Di(89)13		DA 23
040.	-	2SP 166-H		Di(89)10		DA24 M/H
041.	-					DA 25
042.	-	2SP 167-H	11, 13			DA 26
043.	-					DA 27
044.	-			Di(89)19b		DA 28
045.	-			Di(89)20		DA 29
046.	-			20, 21		DA 30
047.	-			Di(89)26	Lt (4) 8	DA 31
048.	- 1RL 59-M	2SP 168	ST (87)13	Di(89)27	Lt (4) 4	DA 32
049.	- 57,58,60-M	2SP 169	ST (87)13	Di(89)28	Lt(4)13,14	DA 33
050.	-			Di(89)29		
051.	-					DA 34
052.	-					DA 35
053.	- 1RL 62	2SP 170	ST (87)13			DA 36
054.	- 1RL 61	2SP 171	ST (87)14	Di(89)22	Lt (4) 12	DA 37
055.	- 1RL 62	2SP 172	ST (87)15			
056.	- 1RL 63	2SP 173	ST (87)14			
057.	- 1RL 64,65			Di(89)23		DA 38
058.	-	2SP 174-H	ST (87)16			
059.	-	2SP 175a	ST (87)17	Di(89)25		DA 39
060.	-			Di(89)16		DA 40
061.	- 1RL 55,56			17, 18		DA 41
062.	-	2SP 175b	ST (87) 8	Di(89)24		DA 42
063.	- 1RL 66	2SP 176-H	ST (87)18	Di(89)30		DA 43
064.	- 1RL 38	2SP 177-H	ST (87)18	Di(89)31		DA 44
065.	- 1RL 39	2SP 178	ST (87)19	Di(89)32		DA 45
066.	- 1RL 40,41	2SP 179	ST (87)20			DA 46
067.	- 1RL 42	2SP 180	ST (87)21			DA 47
068.	-	2SP 181b				DA 48
069.	-	2SP 181a				
070.	- 1RL 67	2SP 182	ST (87)23			DA 49
071.	- 1RL 68	2SP 183				DA 50
072.	- 1RL 69	2SP 184				DA 51
073.	-					DA 52
074.	-					DA 53
075.	-	2SP 185				DA 54,55
076.	-	2SP 186	ST (87)34			DA 56
077.	-	2SP 187	ST (87)35			DA 57-59
078.	-					DA 60
079.	-	2SP 189	ST (87)36			DA 61
080.	-	2SP 190	ST (87)37			DA 62

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
081.	-	2SP 191	ST (87)38			DA 63
082.	- <u>1RL 70,71</u>	2SP 192	ST (87)41			DA 64,65
083.	- <u>1RL 72</u>	2SP 193	ST (87)43			
084.	- <u>1RL 73</u>	2SP 194	ST (87)42			DA 66
085.	- <u>1RL 74-M</u>	2SP 195	ST (87)44			DA 67
086.	-					DA 68
087.	-			Di(89)33		DA 69
088.	-			Di(89)39		DA 70
089.	-			Di(89)40		
090.	-			Di(89)41		
091.	- <u>1RL 75-M</u>	2SP 196		Di(89)35		DA 71
092.	-			Di(89)36		
093.	- <u>1RL 76-M</u>	2SP 197				DA 72
094.	- <u>1RL 77-M</u>	2SP 198	ST (87)46			DA 73
095.	- <u>1RL 78</u>					
096.	- <u>1RL 79</u>	2SP 199	ST (87) 9	Di(89)34		DA 74
097.	- <u>1RL 80-M</u>	2SP 200	ST (87)47			DA 75
098.	- <u>1RL 81</u>	2SP 201-H	ST (87)48			DA 76
099.	- <u>1RL 82</u>	2SP 202				
100.	- <u>1RL 83</u>	2SP 203		Di(89)37		DA 77
101.	-					DA 78
102.	-					DA 79
103.	-					DA 80
104.	-					DA 81
105.	-					DA 82
106.	-					DA 83
107.	-					DA 84
108.	- <u>1RL 84</u>					
109.	- <u>1RL 85</u>					
110.	-					DA 85-H
111.	-					DA 86-H
112.	-					DA 87-H
113.	-					DA 88
114.	-					DA 89
115.	-					DA 90-H
116.	- <u>1RL 86</u>					DA 91-H
117.	- <u>1RL 87</u>					
118.	-					DA 92-H
119.	- <u>1RL 89-M</u>				Lt (4) 20	DA 93
120.	- <u>1RL 88</u>					DA 94
121.	- <u>1RL 90-M</u>				Lt(4)21-M	DA 95
122.	- <u>1RL 92-M</u>					DA 96
123.	-				Lt (4) 22	DA 97
124.	- <u>1RL 91-M</u>					DA 98
125.	-					DA 99

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>IRL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
126.	-				Lt(4)23	
127.	- <u>IRL 93</u>					DA 100
128.	- <u>IRL 94</u>				Lt(4)24-M	DA 101
129.	-					DA 102
130.	-					DA 103
131.	-					DA 104
132.	-					DA 105
133.	-					DA 106
134.	-					DA 107
135.	-					DA 108
136.	- <u>IRL 95-M</u>				Lt(4)25-M	DA 109
137.	- <u>IRL 96</u>					
138.	- <u>IRL 97</u>					
139.	- <u>IRL 98</u>					
140.	- <u>IRL 98</u>					
141.	- <u>IRL 99</u>					
142.	- <u>IRL 100</u>					
143.	- <u>IRL 101</u>					
144.	-					DA 110
145.	-					DA 111
146.	-					DA 112
147.	-					DA 113
148.	-			RH 57		DA 114
149.	-			RH 58		DA 115
150.	-			RH 59		
151.	-			RH 60		
152.	-			RH 47		DA 116
153.	-			RH 48		
154.	-			RH 49		DA 117
155.	-			RH 50		DA 118
156.	-			RH 51		DA 119
157.	-			RH 52		DA 120
158.	-			RH 53		DA 121
159.	-			RH 54		DA 122
160.	-			RH 55		DA 123
161.	-			RH 55		DA 124
162.	-			RH 56		
163.	-			RH 61		DA 125
164.	-			RH 62		DA 126
165.	-			RH 63		DA 127
166.	-			RH 64		DA 128
167.	-			RH 65		DA 129
168.	-			RH 66		
169.	-			RH 67		DA 130
170.	-			RH 68		DA 131
				RH 69		DA 132

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
171. -				RH 70		DA 133
172. -				RH 71		DA 134
173. -				RH 72		
174. -				RH 73		
175. -				RH 74		
176. -				RH 75		DA 135
177. -				RH 76		DA 136
178. -	<u>1RL 102</u>			RH 77		DA 137
179. -	<u>1RL 103</u>			RH 78		
180. -				RH 79		DA 138
181. -				RH 80		DA 139
182. -				RH 81		DA 140
183. -				RH 82		DA 141
184. -				RH 83		
185. -						DA 142
186. -						DA 153
187. -					43 a-M	
188. -					43 b-M	
189. -					<u>Lt(4)44-M</u>	
190. -	<u>1RL 104</u>					
191. -	<u>1RL 158</u>					
192. -						
193. -						
194. -						
195. -						
196. -						
197. -						
198. -						
199. -						
200. -						

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 24

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
	Strict Verbatim V1	Verbatim V2	Strict Paraphrase P1	Simple Paraphrase P2	Loose Paraphrase P3	Source Bible B1	Partial Independence I2	Strict Independence I1	Bible B2	
01. DA	00	01	01	10	08	03	09	112	09	153
02. YI (1873)	00	02	03	03	00	00	00	01	00	09
03. 1RL (1877)	00	05	06	05	01	00	04	00	00	21
04. 2SP (1877)	00	01	00	03	02	00	03	(03)	00	12
05. Di (89)	00	00	00	01	01	00	00	(03)	00	05
06. Lt (4) [89]	00	01	02	02	00	00	04	(01)	00	10
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	09	11	14	04	00	11	(08)	(00)	57

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

literary source. The list of evaluations for all 153 sentences is located in Appendix A.

The evaluations of these 32 dependent sentences were divided quite evenly among three categories. Partial Independence registered nine, Loose Paraphrase, eight, and ten rated as Simple Paraphrase. Of the remaining five sentences, three were labeled Source Bible, one Strict Paraphrase, and one Verbatim.

The dependency average for the entire chapter according to our rating scale is 0.63. The rate for the chapter figuring only those sentences indicating some dependency is 2.8. As Table 2 on page 296 shows, these 32 dependent sentences can be traced to three books by two authors. Nearly all of the parallels, however, appear to have originated with the earlier writings. Whenever we came upon a source parallel in the DA text we could be pretty sure we could find the same sentence, or virtually so, in an earlier Ellen White text. This dependency of Ellen White upon an earlier Ellen White source does not only show up in the text presentation but also in Table A above. Often the use of March by the RL text is repeated in the comparative sentence found in the SP text or the later DA material. Likewise the Hanna parallels reflected in the SP text are usually also picked up in the DA. Exceptions to this general pattern are sentences 12, 85, 86, 87, 90 and 92. Ellen White apparently also returned directly to Hanna's Life of Christ when she was working on this chapter.

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 24

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	--	09	09
02. Hanna LC	00	00	00	02	03	03	05	00	00	13
03. March DSM	00	00	00	02	02	00	00	00	00	04
04. March WHJ	00	01	01	06	03	00	04	00	00	15
TOTALS DA Text	00	01	01	10	08	03	09	--	(09)	41

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

The DA text has slightly more parallels from March's two works than from Hanna's Life of Christ and the degree of dependency is greater for March as well. Most of the March parallels, 15 according to our count, came from Walks and Homes of Jesus.¹

We found some difficulty in comparing the length of the DA chapter with the earlier treatments of this Nazareth episode. The first full account of the story in 1RL contained 158 sentences, five more sentences than the DA text. Sentences 112-158 however, were more general in nature in keeping with the chapter's title, "The Ministry of Christ." Yet the same can be said for DA sentences 125-153. The RH article, "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth," which has many parallels with this DA chapter,² also stresses the more general negative response to the life and work of Jesus by the Jewish nation.

We must also recognize that Ellen White used sources in the earlier 1RL and 2SP accounts, and 73% of the sentences of chapter 24 were evaluated as Strict Independence. Even if one were to conclude that the later DA coverage of the Nazareth story was longer it is another matter to argue that the longer treatment is to be accounted for by extended borrowing from literary sources, as some have done. The evidence from her independent sentences and the multiple and varied earlier works that were to some degree utilized in

¹See Table 2, page 296.

²See Table A, pages 292-293. Note particularly how RH sentences 57-82 appear to supply the text for DA 113-141.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

the composition of this chapter do not support such claims.

In our comparison of the DA text with the earlier Ellen White as well as non-Allen White sources we are usually impressed by the amount of duplication in content between the various Ellen White accounts. Her earlier and later accounts are often identical in thought and word. There is also great similarity between the thought of Ellen White and that of the literary sources even when we cannot show literary or verbal dependency. This latter agreement between Ellen White and her sources is so surprising to some that disagreements between the two accounts are not noticed. A fair evaluation requires us to register differences between the Ellen White writings as well as between her writings and the literary sources she used. Source criticism enables us to make such distinctions in literary expression. It is another step to ask for the same type of distinctions in content.

Since our major concern is with the source criticism of the DA text when compared with other writers, there is no opportunity to take seriously the question of source criticism within the Ellen White writings or content criticism between her writings and those she used. When we come across examples of such difference we are tempted to include their mention in passing if for no other reason than to stimulate further interest in such research.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

Two examples of such difference were noted in our study of this chapter.¹ According to 1RL29/54, 2SP156/110, Jesus "requested them to bring him" the Scripture to read. Yet according to Di(89)3 and DA13 "he was requested to take part in the service to read a passage." In the story as presented in ST(87), we are told he stood to read and the book was handed to him. There is no mention of a request on the part of either Jesus or the leaders of the synagogue. The apparent inconsistency is not limited to Ellen White. In Walks and Homes, 72/57, Jesus "demanded" that the book be given him but in Days of the Son of Man, 18/95, Jesus was "invited" to read the Isaiah selection.

Ellen White differs from her source in DA43 and 2SP176. Here she claims Jesus gave the people of Nazareth the sign they asked for even if they did not recognize it. Hanna on the other hand speaks of Jesus who "proceeds to vindicate himself for not showing any special sign."² A close reading of Ellen White and the sources will reveal many such instances where she departs from the source even where she is dependent on it.

Two final comments appear to be in order as we close this section on source analysis. There are times when the sources are so similar that definite identity is difficult

¹One difference noted may be due to an omission for brevity's sake or for the stated objective of leaving out of the DA account all non-biblical items. The comment in Di(89)36 that the mob debated for a while over the fate of Jesus was not in March or Hanna nor in any of Ellen White's other accounts of the episode.

²See under Hanna 67/170.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

to isolate. Take for example DA24/237. Here the DA text seems to echo March but the earlier parallel sentence from SP, 2SP166/111, appears closer to Hanna. One is not sure if the few words which throw the DA parallel to March are fortuitous and Ellen White is really using the SP text which in this chapter usually follows Hanna.

The confusion over the true literary source in such cases of nearly identical sentences from different sources introduces us to a special source analytical problem. The study of the New Testament synoptic gospels has faced a similar problem. How do we account for the parallels between Matthew, Mark, and Luke? Did Matthew copy from Mark or Mark from Matthew and when is Luke copying from Matthew and when from Mark? When Matthew and Luke agree with each other, who is copying from whom or are both copying a common source?

In our efforts to study Ellen White's use of sources we must also raise the question with reference to the sources themselves. Has Ellen White's source copied from an earlier writer? The concern over charges of plagiarism against Ellen White must push the question further back in source tradition study. Literary conventions are established by practice and not by external legal or ethical norms. The historical, literary, and cultural context of these 19th century lives of Christ needs to be explored before we can settle the issue of plagiarism for a given 19th century religious writer. More than once in this source critical

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

study we have faced the problem of sorting out the true source from among a number of similar sentence parallels.

We must also bear in mind that "Strict Independence" has to do with literary expression and not content. Both DA98 and DA109 have been evaluated as I1 but given the context and parallels from 1RL91 and 1RL95 it is obvious the content is echoing Walks and Homes of Jesus by March.

We have not traced the origins in Ellen White's earlier writings of the Strict Independence sentences. We have noted, however, that these too undergo modification. A few sentences from Diary Book 14, numbers 20, 21, for example, appear to have been picked up by the DA text.¹

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

Our analysis of the DA text revealed that the source dependency for chapter 24 is largely due to the multiple earlier Ellen White parallels found in the previous writings used to compose the DA text. We have listed the parallels from these earlier texts but we cannot evaluate their dependency. The duplications in the Ellen White texts introduce duplicate parallels. We can, however, note the number of parallels found in the various earlier texts insofar as the content of these texts matched the DA content. We can also note the degree of dependency found between each given sentence and its source parallel and compare that dependency with the DA text even when the same

¹Cf. DA29,30.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

source sentence lies behind both texts.

Table 3 on page 303 makes it very clear the Walks and Homes of Jesus by March was credited as the source behind 37 of the 49 sentences showing dependency. Hanna's Life of Christ was used in nine dependent sentences. And though there are exceptions, generally the earlier text manifested the closer dependency.¹ A few examples have been listed in Table 4 on page 304.

We also may note the greater dependency of the earlier texts by noting the type of evaluations of these sentences even when the same sources are involved. According to Table 1, the DA text contained only one Verbatim and one Strict Paraphrase out of 32 sentences. The same table shows that in 49 sentences from the previous writings there were 9 Verbatim and 11 Strict Paraphrase.

In several sentences the differences between Ellen White's text and the source was clear enough to us to register Partial Independence even though verbal similarities would otherwise have led us to indicate greater dependency.²

Since the pre-DA texts contain so much material which later shows up in the DA text we need not repeat our

¹The full list of sentence evaluations and sources behind the 58 quotes from the earlier writings are provided in Appendices B and C. The "M" references for sources in Appendix C with sentences numbered 96 and above refer to The Days of the Son of Man by March.

²See DA11; Lt(4)9 under DA33; DA67; Lt(4)21 under DA95; 1RL95 and Lt(4)25 under DA109; Lt(4)43a and Lt(4)44 under DA153.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 24

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
V1 Strict Verbatim										
V2 Verbatim										
P1 Strict Paraphrase										
P2 Simple Paraphrase										
P3 Loose Paraphrase										
B1 Source Bible										
I2 Partial Independence										
I1 Strict Independence										
B2 Bible										
01. EGM								08		08
02. Hanna LC	00	01	00	03	02	00	03	00	00	09
03. March DSM	00	00	01	01	01	00	00	00	00	03
04. March WAJ	00	08	10	10	01	00	08	00	00	37
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	09	11	14	04	00	11	08	(00)	57

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 24

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No.	<u>DA</u> Text	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt.	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u>	Eval.
01.	<u>DA 11/236</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>1RL 28/84</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
02.	<u>DA 16/236</u>	<u>B1</u>	<u>2SP162/111</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
03.	<u>DA 19/237</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 50/55</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
04.	<u>DA 32/237</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 59/56</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
05.	<u>DA 72/240</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>1RL 76/57</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>

Same Thought - Modified Construction

01.	<u>DA 5/236</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>Di (89) 4</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
02.	<u>DA 94/241</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 88/58</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
03.	<u>DA 96/241</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 92/58</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
04.	<u>DA 98/241</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>1RL 91/58</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
05.	<u>DA 101/241</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>Lt (4) 24</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
06.	<u>DA 109/241</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>Lt (4) 25</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>1RL95/58</u>	<u>I2</u>

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

analysis of those texts again. These earlier writings have a value, however, independent of their use as sources for chapter 24.

The letter of Ellen White to Howard and Madison Miller, Lt M-4-1889, shows that she was still returning to March twelve years after using March for 1RL.¹ We have included the sentences from this letter in Appendix D so that the reader may locate those portions appearing in our text presentation in their original context. The typed copy has been reproduced exactly as it appears in the original from the White Estate, but whose copyist was unidentified. We are not sure if the spelling errors which have been left uncorrected are those of the copyist or belong to the hand of Ellen White. Apart from Manuscript Release 906 we know of no published form of this material on Jesus' visit to Nazareth. The handwritten original on this text is no longer extant.

The only text on chapter 24 for which we have any handwritten pages from Ellen White is a portion of Diary Book 14, pages 73-77. A few sentences appear in our presentation of the DA text but it is not all that certain that Ellen White has made direct use of any source apart from her own earlier writings.

Twenty sentences from this diary have been included under Appendix D for chapter 24. We have provided some capitalization and have regularized the punctuation. The

¹Cf. Lt(4)9, 43, 44 for example.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

reader may note in this material that Ellen White had no serious trouble expressing herself in what is for the most part proper English. She also seems capable of adding still more comment on the Nazareth experience even though she has covered the same ground a number of times before. We have not located this diary material in any later published form.

We bring to a close the source criticism section of this analysis with a few particular notations relating to both the DA and the pre-DA text. DA44 is a Bible quotation from the narrative. But that the use of this particular text should appear just at this juncture in the commentary appears to us to be due to the influence of the source. On this basis we gave it a B1 rating. Once the Bible is introduced the other texts would naturally follow and therefore they were evaluated as B2. The fact that Ellen White goes off in an independent direction from the source just used once the quotations from the Bible end also lends support to our rating of B2.

DA48 does not contain any words used by Hanna but when comparing the sentence with 2SP181 and the parallels from Hanna clearly evident in the SP context, we gave the sentence the I2 rating.

When DA67 and 1RL74 are compared with M/101/61 the earlier text clearly shows closer dependency. Yet because Ellen White departs from the source in both sentences to add the thought of Satan's control over the minds of the people, we felt a fair evaluation must also indicate Ellen White's

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

independence in both sentences. On this basis we evaluated both as Partial Independence (I2). We met the same situation when comparing 1RL90 and Lt(4)21 with M/109,110/62.¹

A somewhat similar situation was faced in evaluating DA71 and 1RL75. 1RL75 has more words in common with the source but it is longer than the DA sentence. We took the comparative sentence length into consideration and on this basis gave both sentences the same evaluation.

A final note concerns DA96. The earlier text of 1RL92 is taken completely from March (M/115/62). We were tempted to rate this sentence as Strict Verbatim. But in view of the fact that a few words from the source were left out, we felt Verbatim (V2) to be a more accurate rating.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The order of presentation as found in chapter 24 is that of Ellen White and/or Marian Davis. We offer the following evidence for this claim.

The earlier draft of this chapter opened with the quote from Luke's gospel² which no longer appears in the DA text. The next draft opened with what was the second sentence and is now the fourth. Finally on a page insert dated December 20, 1897, three new sentences were added which become the opening paragraph of the published text.³ The rearrangement

¹See after DA95.

²Luke 4:16.

³Bound drafts, DA manuscript, pages 310a, -b, -c.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

of the text and introduction were no doubt due to Marian Davis' desire to present a more dramatic opening. In a letter to W. C. White¹ she described her intentions in this regard.

A comparison of the text of the rough draft of the DA text and the published text edition also shows further modifications to the text.

Table A as presented above shows how the various earlier accounts of Ellen White were utilized in the structuring of this chapter. Both 1RL and 2SP provided the basic form of the thematic development but these compositions were modified through transposition of sentences and the addition of new material. Ellen White added some paragraphs from the 1888 RH article as well as some new independent comments.

It is quite evident that March's order of presentation had some influence on the structure of chapter 24. March is approaching the narrative of the life of Jesus from a geographical perspective in Walks and Homes of Jesus. He relates the synoptic accounts of Jesus in Nazareth or his "own country" as two accounts and they may well be.² As two separate visits he puts one some time later than the other

¹Quoted above in the chapter 14 analysis, page 253f.

²Many students of the synoptic gospels interpret the textual evidence as two separate accounts of a single rejection. Other examples of this type of interpretation would be the two differing reports on the temptation of Jesus, the sermon on the mount, and the feeding of the five thousand.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

but covers both in the same chapter.

Ellen White, on the other hand, is presenting a chronological narrative. She does not cover the John the Baptist material in one chapter but in at least four different contexts. She has other chapters covering the ministry of Jesus where the second story could have been included. Nevertheless at sentence 94 she begins to tell of the visit of Jesus to Nazareth which took place "(t)oward the close of His ministry."

Perhaps a closer study of each chapter would uncover evidence that Ellen White is not consistent in her chronological scheme of presentation. But the evidence of this chapter does seem to speak for some redactional influence of March. We hasten to add, however, that over all the chapter is the work of Ellen White and Marian Davis. The grand purpose of witnessing for Christ and the gospel comes through time and again in Ellen White's personal materials and in her appeals. She is speaking of the Jews but one somehow can never overcome the impression that in this chapter she is also addressing the pietists and religious leaders of her times.

Redaction Analysis - the Pre-DA Text

The rather heavy use of earlier materials in the composition of the DA text for chapter 24 makes it impractical to insist on a clear separation of our analysis into the two categories of DA and pre-DA text. For this

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

reason we have included extensive comment on the pre-DA text under the DA text discussion.

Perhaps we are justified in separating out one of the earlier texts as further evidence of the influence of March even though this dependency is not apparent in the DA text which is built so strongly upon 1RL and 2SP.¹

In Letter M-4-1889 there is a section on the Nazareth visits. The comments are condensed yet both visits are included. The account opens with one sentence which is in a general way comparable to the opening section of the DA narrative though we could find no direct parallel in the previous materials as Table A clearly indicates. Ellen White writes: "The King of glory appeared in the form of a servant, clothed in the garb of humanity."²

The second and third sentences of March's chapter on Nazareth read as follows:

The Son of God has appeared upon the great mission of redemption, announced as King and Messiah by a multitude of the heavenly host, and yet he must be hidden from the world thirty years before he makes himself known. For so long a time he must live by toil, in dependence and obscurity, as if he were the least of the sons of men.³

Ellen White's short sentence has made the point of these two longer sentences. Her next sentence parallels that of 1RL19 which we have included in our text presentation just ahead of the DA text. It is clear from 1RL19 that March is

¹Hanna's work appears to provide filler material for basically a March arrangement as modified by Ellen White through combination of later writings.

²Letter M-4-1889, sentence 1, page 8.7.

³Daniel March, Walks and Homes of Jesus, page 45.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

being quoted even though Ellen White is now to sentence 60 in March's account. This second sentence of her letter to the Millers reads:

When he began his public ministry in Nazereth [sic], there was a sad and terrible exhibition of what human nature can and will be when Satan works on the heart.¹

The textual data for this chapter clearly shows that this letter contains March parallels. The quotes above were presented to show that Ellen White is beginning her use of March at the opening of his coverage of the Nazareth visit. What is not obvious from our textual evidence is the fact that sentences 43 and 44 of the Miller letter not only close Ellen White's account of the Nazareth story, but these two sentences parallel two sentences at the close of the March chapter on Nazareth. Sentence 44 of Letter 4, which we have located at the end of the DA text after sentence 153, is parallel to sentence M/134/64, the last sentence in the chapter.

Ellen White is able to move directly from the Nazareth story into her specific council for the Millers. Furthermore, she is able with slight modification to make this specific letter applicable for general use. We quote here the very next three sentences following sentence 44. The words in parentheses were added to the typed copy in what appears to us to be Ellen White's own handwriting.

Your spiritual discernment [sic] has been blunted.
God has sent messages of light to you (his people)

¹Letter M-4-1889, sentence 2, page 8.8.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

which would have been as healing balm had you (they) received them; but you (with others) did not do this. Like the men of Nazareth, you set yourselves to refuse the light, you exalted your own opinion and judgment as more valuable than the judgment of those whom God has made channels of light.¹

It would appear that Ellen White at times not only used the literary expressions of sources available to her but she also followed their order of presentation. At the same time she felt at liberty to add, omit, or rearrange the material to suit her own purposes. In the present example, the material from March, its beginning, ending, and some choice selections between, serve her larger purpose. She is looking for a suitable Bible story to help her drive home a point. March's treatment of the Nazareth story assists in telling the story. But Ellen White moves beyond March in the application of the story in her prophetic ministry to her church and to Christians in general.

Summary

The analysis of chapter 24 points up the need for further research in a number of areas. A fair evaluation of Ellen White's use of sources in reference to charges of plagiarism requires an investigation into the literary practices of her 19th century contemporaries. The close similarities between the sources raises the strong possibility that Ellen White was not alone in using the literary work of others.

¹Letter M-4-1889, page 13.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

We also noted the repeated use of Christ's rejection in articles of varying themes. A form critical study of these various accounts would bring to light the changes, if any, which take place in the telling of the story to different readers and for emphasizing diverse themes.

An analysis of the modifications in the textual tradition from the original handwritten text of Ellen White or the first copy through the history of its various published formulations during Ellen White's lifetime would shed light on the work of her literary assistants. But more importantly, it would provide implicit information as to Ellen White's understanding of the process of inspiration. The insights from such a study would also assist us who live after her death to interpret her writings in harmony with her own intentions.

In respect to the fourteen questions we are addressing to each of the fifteen chapters of our research project, the following information was supplied by chapter 24.

1. The only primary text to be found on the subject of Christ's rejection at Nazareth was a five-page section from Diary Book 14, 1889, 1890, pages 73-77. We have included five sentences in our list of Ellen White sentences but we cannot be sure as to what part this diary material played in the final composition of the DA text. The content of these pages is very similar to the earlier comments of Ellen White. A few sentences do not appear anywhere else as far

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

as we know.¹ There are also a few sentences that have undergone some change but appear to be the earlier form of some independent comments of Ellen White in the DA text.² Because of these affinities with the earlier writings we hesitate to claim independent source parallels for this diary material although we have done so in a few instances.

Letter M-4-1889 is not strictly speaking a primary text since it exists in typed not handwritten form. The errors in spelling and punctuation and Ellen White's added interlineations do, however, give it considerable value as a very early form of an Ellen White text. The source parallels to be found in this letter add to its value for our study.

2. There is no strong evidence for an expansion of Ellen White's treatment of the Nazareth visits of Jesus over the earlier accounts. The first extended coverage of 1RL had 158 sentences against the DA account of 153. We grant that the Redemption Leaflet narrative included a good number of sentences relating to the general ministry of Jesus, but so does the later DA account add a number of independent comments on the Jewish religious leaders.

When we add to this evidence the material from 2SP, Diary Book 14 sentences and the RH article of 1888 we should probably speak of a reduction in the DA with respect to Ellen White's overall writings on the topic. We should not,

¹Cf. sentences 8, 36.

²Compare Di(89)1 with DA4, Di(89)2,5,6 with DA8, Di(89)20,21 with DA29,30.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

however, overlook the influence of added material from a rereading of March¹ and the addition of Hanna parallels in the 2SP text on the later DA coverage. The rewriting of the earlier text often forces us to rate the sentence as independent when a source parallel in fact lies behind it. Until a thorough content analysis is completed we would argue that Ellen White's own comments account for as much enlargement over the previous writings as do her use of sources.

3. The content of the Nazareth account is basically the same in each of the texts insofar as our limited survey revealed. The difference between the various reports was the function of the story for Ellen White's direct purpose. Not all accounts mentioned both visits and some presentations were quite concise. The multiple uses of the Nazareth visit provides a good case study for a form and tradition study in the Ellen White writings. We should be able to trace the function of the story and its related form changes as it is applied to different audience or reader purposes.

4. We found no major differences between the DA text and the earlier writings. The one interesting variation had to do with whether Jesus requested or was asked to read the Scripture from the prophet Isaiah. The multiple accounts of the Nazareth visits were remarkably similar.

¹See comments on Lt(4)1889 under "Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text" above.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

5. Chapter 24 contains 153 sentences of which 32 or 21% show some dependency.

6. Out of the total sentences, 112 or 73% were rated for Strict Independence. Nine sentences containing quotations from the Bible were not evaluated.

7. When the dependency rating scale is applied to the entire chapter the average dependency is 0.63. If we count only those sentences which register some degree of dependency, the average is 2.8.

8. Two sources accounted for most of the parallels of chapter 24. The Walks and Homes of Jesus by Daniel March was credited with supplying 15 parallels. This work was part of Ellen White's office library at the time of her death. The familiar Life of Christ by William Hanna accounted for 13 parallels.

9. Some of the text of March's work on the Walks and Homes of Jesus is very similar to his comments appearing in a second work, The Days of the Son of Man. We were able to distinguish at least four sentences which show dependency on this latter source.

10. These same sources were used by Ellen White in writing her earlier comments on the Nazareth visits. The dominant source is Walks and Homes by March. We found 37 parallels from this work. Most of these were in the Redemption Leaflet material though some parallels were found in Letter M-4-1889. The Hanna parallels in the pre-DA text were largely limited to Ellen White's commentary in Spirit

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

of Prophecy, Vol. II, where we found nine parallels.

11. Though the limitations of our evaluation criteria did not also allow for fine discrimination in our evaluations, generally the earlier parallels typically showed a higher degree of dependency.

12. We found no appreciable difference in the sentence content between the parallel and non-parallel sentences. The parallels included the early life of Jesus, historical background, attitudes of the Jewish people, and to a limited degree practical application. Ellen White often extended the comment beyond that of the source.

We did note one instance of Ellen White's opposing the source even while using it and a number of instances where she added to the source parallel certain comments not found in the source. Once again the evidence seems to clearly suggest that while Ellen White's writings are to a degree derivative they also have their original aspects.

13. The basic structure of chapter 24 appears to come from March through the earlier 1RL text. Like March she combines the two accounts of Jesus' visiting Nazareth or His "own country" into one narrative even when the DA text is generally chronological in its approach. March would be expected to mention both visits because he is writing a geographical account. Nevertheless the chapter as a completed work is to be credited to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis who modified the basic structural pattern through the introduction of additional March material, Hanna

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

parallels, and independent comments drawn from various later published and unpublished articles and miscellaneous writings.

14. The pre-DA accounts do show Ellen White is indebted to the structural pattern of March in most instances because of her basic use of the earlier Redemption Leaflet text. This was especially noticed in the Miller letter of 1889. But Ellen White does not merely relate the story of Jesus' visit to Nazareth, and in some cases she does not treat both visits as does March. She is using the Nazareth rejection to illustrate the lessons she intends to impress upon the mind of the reader. Her articles are, therefore, more than a commentary on the Nazareth experience. She is writing for purposes of counsel and evangelical appeal. When the total Ellen White article is being considered we must insist its arrangement is not indebted to March. We should also remember that behind March is the basic biblical story to which March is also indebted.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 24

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.		I1	051.		I1
002.		I1	052.		I1
003.	Bible	B2	053.		I1
004.		I1	054.		I1
005.	March WHJ/65/56	P3	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.		I1	057.		I1
008.		I1	058.		I1
009.	M/WHJ/71,88/57,59	P3	059.		I1
010.		I1	060.		I1
011.	M/WHJ/88-90/59	I2	061.		I1
012.	Hanna LC/40,42/168	I2	062.		I1
013.	M/DSM/18/95	P3	063.		I1
014.	Bible	B2	064.		I1
015.	Bible	B2	065.		I1
016.	Hanna LC/51/169	B1	066.		I1
017.	Bible	B2	067.	M/WHJ/101/61	I2
018.	Bible	B2	068.		I1
019.	M/WHJ/73/57	P2	069.		I1
020.	Hanna LC/55/169	P3	070.		I1
021.	M/DSM/41/98	P3	071.	M/WHJ/102,104a,b/61	P2
022.		I1	072.	M/WHJ/104c	P1
023.		I1	073.	M/WHJ/104d/61	V2
024.	M/DSM/43,45/99	P2	074.		I1
025.		I1	075.	M/WHJ/105,106/61	I2
026.	Hanna LC/59a/170	P3	076.		I1
027.		I1	077.		I1
028.		I1	078.		I1
029.		I1	079.		I1
030.		I1	080.		I1
031.		I1	081.		I1
032.	M/DSM/29/96	P2	082.		I1
033.	M/WHJ/88-87/59	P2	083.		I1
034.		I1	084.		I1
035.		I1	085.	Hanna LC/106/173	P2
036.		I1	086.	Hanna LC/107/173	B1
037.		I1	087.	H/LC/108,109/173	P3
038.		I1	088.		I1
039.		I1	089.		I1
040.		I1	090.	Hanna LC/109/173	I2
041.		I1	091.	Hanna LC/109/173	P2
042.		I1	092.	Hanna LC/109/173	I2
043.	Hanna LC/67/170	I2	093.	M/WHJ/109/62	I2
044.	Hanna LC/67/170	B1	094.	M/WHJ/109/62	P2
045.	Bible	B2	095.	M/WHJ/110/62	P2
046.	Bible	B2	096.	M/WHJ/115/62	P2
047.	Bible	B2	097.		I1
048.	Hanna LC/67/170	I2	098.		I1
049.		I1	099.		I1
050.		I1	100.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 24

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.	M/WBJ/117/62	P3	151.		I1
102.		I1	152.		I1
103.		I1	153.		I1
104.		I1	154.		
105.		I1	155.		
106.		I1	156.		
107.		I1	157.		
108.		I1	158.		
109.		I1	159.		
110.		I1	160.		
111.		I1	161.		
112.		I1	162.		
113.		I1	163.		
114.		I1	164.		
115.		I1	165.		
116.		I1	166.		
117.		I1	167.		
118.	Bible	R2	168.		
119.		I1	169.		
120.		I1	170.		
121.		I1	171.		
122.		I1	172.		
123.		I1	173.		
124.		I1	174.		
125.		I1	175.		
126.		I1	176.		
127.		I1	177.		
128.		I1	178.		
129.		I1	179.		
130.		I1	180.		
131.		I1	181.		
132.		I1	182.		
133.		I1	183.		
134.		I1	184.		
135.		I1	185.		
136.		I1	186.		
137.		I1	187.		
138.		I1	188.		
139.		I1	189.		
140.		I1	190.		
141.		I1	191.		
142.		I1	192.		
143.		I1	193.		
144.		I1	194.		
145.		I1	195.		
146.		I1	196.		
147.		I1	197.		
148.		I1	198.		
149.		I1	199.		
150.		I1	200.		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 24

No.	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	YI (73) 16	V2		051.	1RL 91/58	P2	98
002.	YI (73) 17	P1		052.	Lt (4) 24	P2	101
003.	YI (73) 18	P2		053.	1RL 95/58	I2	109
004.	YI (73) 19	P1		054.	Lt (4) 25	I2	109
005.	YI (73) 20	P1		055.	Lt (4) 43a	V2	153
006.	YI (73) 21	I1		056.	Lt (4) 43b	I1	153
007.	YI (73) 22	P2		057.	Lt (4) 44	I2	153
008.	YI (73) 23	P2		058.			
009.	YI (73) 24	V2		059.			
010.	1RL 19/53	P1		060.			
011.	Di (89) 4	P2	5	061.			
012.	1RL 25/26/54	P3	9	062.			
013.	1 RL 28/54	P1	11	063.			
014.	Lt (4) 10	P1	11	064.			
015.	Lt (4) 11	P1	11	065.			
016.	1RL 29/54	P2	13	066.			
017.	2SP 162/111	V2	16	067.			
018.	1RL 46/55	V2	17	068.			
019.	1RL 50/55	P1	19	069.			
020.	Lt (4) 4	P2	19	070.			
021.	2SP 163a/111	P3	20	071.			
022.	1RL/52/56	V2	21	073.			
023.	2SP 163b/111	P3	21	074.			
024.	2SP 164/111	P2	21	075.			
025.	Di (89) 12	I1	23	076.			
026.	Di (89) 13	I1	23	077.			
027.	2SP 166/111	P2	24	078.			
028.	2SP 167/111	I2	26	079.			
029.	1RL 59/56	P1	32	080.			
030.	1RL 57/56	P1	33	081.			
031.	1RL 58/56	P2	33	082.			
032.	1RL 60/56	P2	33	083.			
033.	Lt (4) 9	I2	33	084.			
034.	Di (89) 22	P3	37	085.			
035.	2SP 174/112	P2	38	086.			
036.	2SP 175a/112	I1	39	087.			
037.	2SP 175b/112	I1	42	088.			
038.	2SP 176/112	I2	43	089.			
039.	2SP 181/112	I2	48	090.			
040.	2SP 190/114	I1	62	091.			
041.	1RL 74/57	I2	67	092.			
042.	1RL 75/57	P2	71	093.			
043.	1RL 76/57	V2	72	094.			
044.	1RL 77/57	V2	73	095.			
045.	1RL 80/57	I2	75	096.			
046.	Di (89) 37	I1	76	097.			
047.	1RL 88/58	P1	94	098.			
048.	1RL 90/58	I2	95	099.			
049.	Lt (4) 21	I2	95	100.			
050.	1RL 92/58	V2	96	100.			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 24

No.	Text	Sources	No.	Text	Sources
001.	- YI (73) 16	M/33/51+	051.	- 1RL 91/58	M/113,114/62
002.	- YI (73) 17	M/34a/52	052.	- Lt (4) 24	M/117/62
003.	- YI (73) 18	M/34b/52	053.	- 1RL 95/58	M/118/62
004.	- YI (73) 19	M/39-41/52,53	054.	- Lt (4) 25	M/118/62
005.	- YI (73) 20	M/46/54	055.	- Lt (4) 43a	M/127/64
006.	- YI (73) 21		056.	- Lt (4) 43b	
007.	- YI (73) 22	M/47,48/54	057.	- Lt (4) 44	M/134/64
008.	- YI (73) 23	M/50,51/54	058.	-	
009.	- YI (73) 24	M/53/54+	059.	-	
010.	- 1RL 19/53	M/60/55	060.	-	
011.	- Di (89) 4	M/WHJ/65/56	061.	-	
012.	- 1RL 25,26/54	M/71,88/57,59	062.	-	
013.	- 1RL 28/54	M/89,90/59	063.	-	
014.	- Lt (4) 10	M/88/59	064.	-	
015.	- Lt (4) 11	M/88,90/59	065.	-	
016.	- 1RL 28/54	M/72/57	066.	-	
017.	- 2SP 162/111	H/51/169	067.	-	
018.	- 1RL 46/55	M/83/59	068.	-	
019.	- 1RL 50/55	M/73/57	069.	-	
020.	- Lt (4) 4	M/76/58	070.	-	
021.	- 2SP/163a/111	H/55/169	071.	-	
022.	- 1RL/52/56	M/84/59	072.	-	
023.	- 2SP 163b/111	H/56/169	073.	-	
024.	- 2SP 164/111	H/57,58/169	074.	-	
025.	- Di (89) 12		075.	-	
026.	- Di (89) 13		076.	-	
027.	- 2SP 166/111	H/59a/170	077.	-	
028.	- 2SP 167/111	H/59a,b/170	078.	-	
029.	- 1RL 59/56	M/29/96	079.	-	
030.	- 1RL 57/56	M/85,86/59	080.	-	
031.	- 1RL 58/56	M/86,87/59	081.	-	
032.	- 1RL 60/56	M/87/59	082.	-	
033.	- Lt (4) 9	M/86,87/59	083.	-	
034.	- Di (89) 22	M/56/100	084.	-	
035.	- 2SP 174/112	H/64/170	085.	-	
036.	- 2SP 175a/112		086.	-	
037.	- 2SP 175b/112		087.	-	
038.	- 2SP 176/112	H/67/170	088.	-	
039.	- 2SP 181/113	H/67/170	089.	-	
040.	- 2SP 190/114		090.	-	
041.	- 1RL 74/57	M/101/61	091.	-	
042.	- 1RL 75/57	M/102,104a,b/61	092.	-	
043.	- 1RL 76/57	M/104c/61	093.	-	
044.	- 1RL 77/57	M/104d/61	094.	-	
045.	- 1RL 80/57	M/105/61	095.	-	
046.	- Di (89) 37		096.	-	
047.	- 1RL 88/58	M/109/62	097.	-	
048.	- 1RL 90/58	M/110/62	098.	-	
049.	- Lt (4) 21	M/109,110/62	099.	-	
050.	- 1 RL 92/58	M/115/62	100.	-	