

IX CHAPTER 39 - "Give Ye Them to Eat"

The random selection of chapter 39 results in an unnatural and arbitrary independence for a narrative that is actually introduced by chapter 38.

According to the editor's note, Ellen White's comments on "Give Ye Them to Eat" are based upon Matthew 14:13-21, Mark 6:32-44, Luke 9:10-17, and John 6:1-13. But the first verse of each of the synoptic gospels is included in those verses given as Bible references for the comments on chapter 38, "Come Rest Awhile." In her earliest treatment of this experience from the life of Christ Ellen White left the narrative intact as one story. The first three sentences of chapter XX of Spirit of Prophecy, Volume II, "The Loaves and Fishes," address the background and setting for the story of the feeding of the five thousand. These few remarks form the background to what is now chapter 38.

Similarly, at sentence 57 in the 2SP account Ellen White turns to the Johannine account, John 6:14ff, and discusses the attempt of the people, with the cooperation of the disciples, to make Jesus King of the Jews. This material as well as her comments on Jesus' departure into the mountain for solitary communion with His Father forms part of chapter 40 in the DA account. Thus what introduced and concluded the story of the feeding of the five thousand in the first treatment by Ellen White is used differently in the DA. The former serves as the substance of DA chapter 38 and the latter as the introduction of DA chapter 40, "A

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

Night on the Lake." Ellen White addressed this lake episode in 2SP, chapter XXI, under the caption of "Walking on the Water."

The rearrangement of the episodes in the various writings of Ellen White and the arbitrary divisions in her account, divisions which do not always match the narrative units of the gospel accounts, lead to unavoidable overlaps in the commentary. There is some difficulty in deciding which sentences actually belong to the commentary of a previous chapter or legitimately serve as the introduction or "bridge" to the new content to be discussed.

In our judgment the first few sentences of the 2SP account on "The Loaves and Fishes" really form the basis for DA, chapter 38, and so are omitted from consideration with chapter 39.

One other substantial commentary of Ellen White on the feeding of the five thousand from writings dating earlier than 1898, the date of the DA text, was the two-part series in The Signs of the Times. Under the dates of August 12 and 19 of 1897 there appeared an article entitled "Feeding the Five Thousand." Sentences from this account will be indicated by ST(97).

In the presentation of the textual evidence for the evaluations of chapter 39 we will refer to seven sources. The reader will readily recognize such references as Hanna, LC¹ and March, WHJ². We have also previously referred to

¹William Hanna, The Life of Christ, 1863. ²On next pg.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

Farrar, LC,¹ and to Pentecost, BS.² Cumming, SR-J refers to Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. John.³ A number of parallels will be listed as coming from a sermon by Francis Wayland on the topic of "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth." These sentences are identified by Wayland, SBC.⁴

Two final comments may prove helpful to the reader in evaluating the textual evidence. The Ellen White comments from 2SP are not limited to the episode of feeding the five thousand. Her emphasis on the healing of the sick and her comment on feeding the people lest they "faint by the way," come from the feeding of the four thousand as presented in Matthew 15:29-39 and Mark 8:1-9.⁵

Occasionally we include a quotation from a source without specifically identifying it as a parallel. There are times when the context, some verbal similarities, and general development of presentation suggest the probability of a parallel. At times we were influenced by the fact that Ellen White is known to have had the book in her private

²Daniel March, Walks and Homes of Jesus, 1866.

¹Frederic Farrar, The Life of Christ, 1874.

²George Pentecost, Bible Studies(88), 1888.

³John Cumming, Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. John (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co., 1856). Hereafter this series of commentaries will be referred to as Sabbath Readings--John.

⁴Francis Wayland, Salvation by Christ. A Series of Discourses on Some of the Most Important Doctrines of the Gospel (Boston: Gould and Lincoln, 1859). Future references to this work will carry the title Salvation by Christ.

⁵Cf. 2SP5,6/259 and 2SP36/261.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

library at the time of her death. Such readings have a value if only to illustrate the nature of the research task. In addition they provide evidence that the ideas being presented are not unique to Ellen White.

The following authors and their works have been quoted among the sources but the quotations do not carry an evaluation: John Cumming, p. 317.1 (listed as LLM);¹ Farrar, (LC), p. 304.4;² Hanna (LC), 25,30-32/278; John Hutchinson, p. 85.7 (listed as OLS);³ John R. Macduff, pp. 215.8, 215.9, and 216.1 (listed as BTS).⁴

We have consistently tried to limit the claim of source parallel to those sentences where verbatim words occur or where such verbal parallels appear in the immediate context of the source.

¹John Cumming, Foreshadows. Lectures on our Lord's Miracles (Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1854).

²Frederic Farrar, The Life of Christ (New York: Hurst & Company, 1874).

³John Hutchinson, Our Lord's Signs in St. John's Gospel (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1892).

⁴John R. Macduff, Brighter than the Sun; or Christ the Light of the World (New York: Robert Carter and Brothers, 1878).

DA1/364 CHRIST had retired to a secluded place with His disciples, but this rare season of peaceful quietude was soon broken. (I1)

DA2/364 The disciples thought they had retired where they would not be disturbed; but as soon as the multitude missed the divine Teacher, they inquired, "Where is He?" (I1)

DA3/364 Some among them had noticed the direction in which Christ and His disciples had gone. (I1)

ST(97)3 Some among them had noticed the direction in which Christ and his disciples had gone, and soon an immense crowd was looking for Christ. (I1)

DA4/364 Many went by land to meet them, while others followed in their boats across the water. [M/2b/99] (P2)

2SP4/259 The news spread from city to city that Jesus was crossing the sea; and many who were eager to see and hear him flocked to the place where it was thought that his boat would land, while others followed him over the water in boats. [M/2b/99] (I2)

DA5/364 The Passover was at hand, and, from far and near, bands of pilgrims on their way to Jerusalem gathered to see Jesus. [M/3/99] (P2)

DA6/364 Additions were made to their number, until there were assembled five thousand men besides women and children. (I1)

DA7/364 Before Christ reached the shore, a multitude were waiting for Him. (I1)

2SP5/259 So when Jesus and his disciples landed they found themselves in the midst of a multitude of people, pressing forward on all sides to meet them. [H/22/278] (P3)

2b/99 as they continued to gather on foot and in boats from all the neighboring towns, [March, WHJ]

3/99 The crowd of people was greatly increased by additions from the annual caravan of pilgrims on their way to Jerusalem to attend the great national feast of the Passover. [March, WHJ]

2SP6/259 Hundreds of the sick and maimed had been brought for Jesus to relieve, and were disposed upon the ground in positions favorable to arrest his attention. [H/22/278] (I2)

DA8/364 But He landed unobserved by them, and spent a little time apart with the disciples. (I1)

DA9/364 From the hillside He looked upon the moving multitude, and His heart was stirred with sympathy. (I1)

DA10/364 Interrupted as He was, and robbed of His rest, He was not impatient. (I1)

2SP8/259 The Saviour could not here find the rest he sought, for the waiting company commanded his attention; their needs enlisted his immediate sympathy and aid. [H/23/278] (P3)

DA11/364 He saw a greater necessity demanding His attention as He watched the people coming and still coming. [M/2/99] (I2)

2SP9/259 He could not steal away with his disciples to secure the coveted retirement, and disappoint this expectant people. [M/1/99] (I2)

DA12/364 He "was moved with compassion toward them, because they were as sheep not having a shepherd." [M/2/99] (B1)

DA13/364 Leaving His retreat, He found a convenient place where He could minister to them. (I1)

DA14/364+ They received no help from the priests and rulers; but the healing waters of life flowed from Christ as He taught the multitude the way of salvation. [P/8/3] (I2)

2SP14/259 He was so pressed upon by the multitude that he went a little apart upon a grassy eminence, where he could be seen and heard by all the people. [M/5/99+] (I2)

22/278 Another hour or so carries them to the spot at which Christ and his apostles land, where many, having outstripped the boat, are ready to receive them, and where more and more still come, bearing their sick along with them. [Hanna, LC]

23/278 It was somewhat of a trial to have the purpose of the voyage apparently thus baffled, the seclusion sought after thus violated; but if felt at all, it sat light upon a heart which, turning away from the thought of self, was filled with compassion for those who were "as sheep not having a shepherd." [Hanna, LC]

1/99 Not to be wholly deprived of the object for which he had withdrawn from Capernaum, Jesus endeavored to steal away from the crowd and secure a little retirement with his disciples. [March, WHJ]

2/99 But he was moved with compassion for the multitude as they continued to gather, on foot and in boats, from all the neighboring towns, and they seemed to him as **sheep having no shepherd.** [March, WHJ]

8/3 The rulers and religious people of the day were selfish and proud, and habitually neglected the poor and common people, much as the rich and well-to-do people do to-day. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

5/99+ Taking his seat upon the grassy hill-side, where he could be seen and heard by the vast assemblage, he continued to speak and to heal the sick that were brought to him, until the sun began to sink low behind the hills of Galilee. [March, WHJ]

2SP15/259+ Here he taught them through the entire day, and healed all the sick and afflicted that were brought to him. [M/5/99+] (P2)

DA15/365 The people listened to the words of mercy flowing so freely from the lips of the Son of God. (11)

DA16/365 They heard the gracious words, so simple and so plain that they were as the balm of Gilead to their souls. (11)

DA17/365 The healing of His divine hand brought gladness and life to the dying, and ease and health to those suffering with disease. (11)

DA18/365 The day seemed to them like heaven upon earth, and they were utterly unconscious of how long it had been since they had eaten anything. (11)

DA19/365 At length the day was far spent. (11)

DA20/365 The sun was sinking in the west, and yet the people lingered. [F/303.1] (P1)

DA21/365 Jesus had labored all day without food or rest. (11)

DA22/365 He was pale from weariness and hunger, and the disciples besought Him to cease from His toil. (11)

DA23/365 But He could not withdraw Himself from the multitude that pressed upon Him. (11)

DA24/365 The disciples finally came to Him, urging that for their own sake the people should be sent away. (11)

DA25/365 Many had come from far, and had eaten nothing since morning. (11)

215.8 We may well believe how many gracious words would come out of His mouth. Never did hours pass more pleasantly. [Macduff, BTS]

303.1 The day wore on; already the sun was sinking towards the western hills, yet still the multitude lingered, charmed by that healing voice and by those holy words. [Farrar, LC]

25, 30-32/278 But now another kind of solicitude seizes on the disciples. . . . The day declined; the evening shadows lengthened; yet, as if never satisfied, that vast company still clung to Jesus, and made no movement to depart. The disciples grew anxious. They came at last to Jesus, and said, "This is a desert place, and the time is now past; **send** the multitude **away**, that they may go into the country round about and into the villages, and lodge, and buy bread for themselves, for they have **nothing to eat.**" [Hanna, LC]

DA26/365 In the surrounding towns and villages they might be able to buy food. [W/245.1] (P2)

DA27/365 But Jesus said, "Give ye them to eat," and then, turning to Philip, questioned, "Whence shall we buy bread, that these may eat?" (B2)

2SP36/261 He inquired of Philip concerning the probability of obtaining bread for so large a number, that they might not return to their homes unrefreshed nor faint by the way. (B2)

DA28/365 This He said to test the faith of the disciple. (I1)

DA29/365 Philip looked over the sea of heads, and thought how impossible it would be to provide food to satisfy the wants of such a crowd. [H/35/278] (P3)

DA30/365 He answered that two hundred pennyworth of bread would not be nearly enough to divide among them, so that each might have a little. [H/35/278] (B1)

DA31/365 Jesus inquired how much food could be found among the company. [H/36/278] (P1)

DA32/365 "There is a lad here," said Andrew, "which hath five barley loaves, and two small fishes: but what are they among so many?" (B2)

DA33/365 Jesus directed that these be brought to Him. [H/38,39/279] (B1)

DA34/365 Then He bade the disciples seat the people on the grass in parties of fifty or a hundred, to preserve order, and that all might witness what He was about to do. [H/40/279] (P1)

2SP46/262 This marshaling of five thousand people into companies, was at length satisfactorily accomplished, and they were all seated in the presence of the Saviour. [H/42,43/279] (P1)

245.1 To purchase food in the surrounding towns and villages would be difficult. . . [Wayland, SBC]

35/278 Philip runs his eye over the great assemblage, and making a rough estimate of what would be required, he answered, "Two hundred pennyworth of bread would not be sufficient for them, that every one might 'get a little;' shall we go and buy as much?" [Hanna, LC]

36/278 Jesus asked how much food they had among themselves, without needing to go to make any further purchase. [Hanna, LC]

37/278 Andrew, another native of Bethsaida, who had been scrutinizing the crowd, discovering some old acquaintances, said, "There is a lad here, who has five barley loaves and two small fishes; but what are they among so many? [Hanna, LC]

38/278 "Bring them to me," said Jesus. [Hanna, LC]

39/279 They brought them. [Hanna, LC]

40/279 "Make the men," he said, "sit down by fifties in a company"--an order indicative of our Lord's design that there might be no confusion and that the attention of all might be directed to what he was about to do. [Hanna, LC]

42/279 The marshalling of five thousand men, besides women and children, into such an orderly array, must have taken some time. [Hanna, LC]

43/279 The people, however, quietly consented to be so arranged, and company after company sat down, till the whole were seated in the presence of the Lord, who all the while has stood in silence watching the operation, with that scanty stock of provisions in his hand. [Hanna, LC]

DA35/365 When this was accomplished, Jesus took the food, "and looking up to heaven, He blessed, and brake, and gave the loaves to His disciples, and the disciples to the multitude." (B2)

DA36/365 "And they did all eat, and were filled. (B2)

DA37/365 And they took up twelve baskets full of the fragments, and of the fishes." (B2)

DA38/365 He who taught the people the way to secure peace and happiness was just as thoughtful of their temporal necessities as of their spiritual need. [P/9.5] (P2)

DA39/365 The people were weary and faint. (I1)

DA40/365 There were mothers with babes in their arms, and little children clinging to their skirts. (I1)

DA41/365 Many had been standing for hours. (I1)

DA42/365+ They had been so intensely interested in Christ's words that they had not once thought of sitting down, and the crowd was so great that there was danger of their trampling on one another. (I1)

DA43/366 Jesus would give them a chance to rest, and He bade them sit down. (I1)

DA44/366 There was much grass in the place, and all could rest in comfort. (B2)

DA45/366 Christ never worked a miracle except to supply a genuine necessity, and every miracle was of a character to lead the people to the tree of life, whose leaves are for the healing of the nations. [C/2,4a/89] (P1)

DA46/366+ The simple food passed round by the hands of the disciples contained a whole treasure of lessons. (I1)

9.5 Having healed their bodies, and doubtless taught them spiritual things, he will not withhold the lesser gift of temporary refreshment. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

215.9 The crowd are faint and weary. They have tasted nothing all day. [Macduff, BTS]

2,4a/89 Jesus never wrought a miracle unless at the bidding of a providential necessity. . . .And every miracle of Christ, too, was essentially redemptive; [Cumming SR-J]

DA47/367 It was humble fare that had been provided; the fishes and barley loaves were the daily food of the fisher folk about the Sea of Galilee. (11)

DA48/367 Christ could have spread before the people a rich repast, but food prepared merely for the gratification of appetite would have conveyed no lesson for their good. (11)

DA49/367 Christ taught them in this lesson that the natural provisions of God for man had been perverted. (11)

DA50/367 And never did people enjoy the luxurious feasts prepared for the gratification of perverted taste as this people enjoyed the rest and the simple food which Christ provided so far from human habitations. [F/303.3] (12)

DA51/367 If men today were simple in their habits, living in harmony with nature's laws, as did Adam and Eve in the beginning, there would be an abundant supply for the needs of the human family. (11)

DA52/367 There would be fewer imaginary wants, and more opportunities to work in God's ways. (11)

DA53/367 But selfishness and the indulgence of unnatural taste have brought sin and misery into the world, from excess on the one hand, and from want on the other. (11)

DA54/367 Jesus did not seek to attract the people to Him by gratifying the desire for luxury. (11)

DA55/367 To that great throng, weary and hungry after the long, exciting day, the simple fare was an assurance not only of His power, but of His tender care for them in the common needs of life. (11)

DA56/367 The Saviour has not promised His followers the luxuries of the world; their fare may be plain, and even scanty; their lot may be shut in by poverty; but His word is pledged that their need shall be supplied, and He has promised that which is far better than worldly good,--the abiding comfort of His own presence. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

304.4 It was a humble but a sufficient, and to hungry wayfarers a delicious meal. [Farrar, LC]

303.3 . . . would find themselves in the darkness, hungry and afar from every human habitation. [Farrar, LC]

DA57/367 In feeding the five thousand, Jesus lifts the veil from the world of nature, and reveals the power that is constantly exercised for our good. (11)

DA58/367 In the production of earth's harvest God is working a miracle every day. [C/5,6/89] (P1)

DA59/367 Through natural agencies the same work is accomplished that was wrought in the feeding of the multitude. [C/8/89] (P3)

ST(97)51 But it takes just as much power to prepare the harvest which men garner as to make a few barley loaves serve for so many thousands. [C/8/89] (P1)

DA60/367 Men prepare the soil and sow the seed, but it is the life from God that causes the seed to germinate. [C/6/89] (P2)

ST(97)45 The soil is cultivated, and the seed is put into the ground. [C/6/89] (P1)

DA61/367 It is God's rain and air and sunshine that cause it to put forth, "first the blade, then the ear, after that the full corn in the ear." Mark 4:28. [C/6,7/89] (I2)

ST(97)46 Then God, through his miracle-working power, sends the rain and sunshine, causing the seed to send forth, first the blade, then the ear, and then the corn in the ear. [C/6,7/89] (P2)

DA62/367 It is God who is every day feeding millions from earth's harvest fields. [C/7,8/89] (P2)

ST(97)48 In this way God feeds thousands, and ten times ten thousand, a multitude which can not be numbered. [C/6,8/89] (P2)

DA63/367 Men are called upon to co-operate with God in the care of the grain and the preparation of the loaf, and because of this they lose sight of the divine agency. (11)

317.1 In this miracle there is a grand apocalypse. He draws aside that all but impenetrable and mysterious mantle, which conceals the Creator from the creature in the mist of his creation; Cumming, LLM]

5/89 But we say such only are miracles; but the truth is, there is as great a miracle going on every day. [Cumming. SR-J]

6/89 The fact that you place a little seed into the soil, and that seed by the influence of the air, the rain, the sunshine, the ammonia and carbon in the soil, should grow up into a stalk, and produce golden fruits in autumn, and contribute to the feeding of ten times ten thousand, this is as great a miracle every bit. [Cumming, SR-J]

7/89 The contrast between the seed in the soil, and a loaf upon your table is as complete as between five loaves here and the feeding of as many thousand; but we are accustomed to the one, and we call it nature; we are not accustomed to the other, and we are constrained to admit that it is the Lord of nature. [Cumming, SR-J]

8/89 But the fact is, the former is just as miraculous as the latter; and it needs as much of Deity to translate spring into harvest, as it needed of Deity to transform a few barley loaves into food for so many thousands. [Cumming, SR-J]

9/89 The fact is, we are surrounded with miracles; but they are so common that we cease to see the hand that does them. [Cumming, SR-J; Cumming treats this idea also in LLOL, 183; LLM, 313; SR-M, 124.8+]

ST(97)47 Thus the materials are provided from which man, using his God-given faculties, prepares the loaf which is placed upon the table. [C/6,7/89] (P2)

ST(97)49 But men are accustomed to this process, and they drop God out of their thoughts, thinking that they themselves are doing the work. [C/7/89] [C/2/90] (P2)

DA64/367+ They do not give God the glory due unto His holy name. (I1)

DA65/368 The working of His power is ascribed to natural causes or to human instrumentality. [C/2/90] (P2)

ST(97)54 But God, full of mercy and compassion, constantly cares for us; and because there is no cessation of his goodness, because we are surrounded by his miracles, we cease to appreciate his continually increasing mercies. [C/1/90] (P2)

ST(97)55 Fixing our eyes upon human instrumentalities, we give the glory to men, and ascribe the miracles of God to natural causes. [C/2/90] (P2)

DA66/368 Man is glorified in place of God, and His gracious gifts are perverted to selfish uses, and made a curse instead of a blessing. (I1)

ST(97)56 Men allow the enemy of God to lead them to glorify men in the place of praising their Creator. (I1)

ST(97)57 They banish God from their thoughts, and act as did the inhabitants of the Noatic world, polluting the earth by their sins. [C/2/90] (I2)

DA67/368 God is seeking to change all this. (I1)

DA68/368 He desires that our dull senses shall be quickened to discern his merciful kindness and to glorify Him for the working of His power. (I1)

1/90 We get so many mercies that we cease to be thankful; we are so surrounded with miracles that we cease to see them. [Cumming, SR-J]

2/90 For our mercies we give thanks to the instrument; the miracles of God we attribute to the laws of nature; and in both we try, designedly or undesignedly, to banish God from the world, and work creation without him. [Cumming, SR-J]

DA69/368 He desires us to recognize Him in His gifts, that they may be, as He intended, a blessing to us. (11)

DA70/368 It was to accomplish this purpose that the miracles of Christ were performed. (11)

DA71/368 After the multitude had been fed, there was an abundance of food left. (11)

DA72/368 But He who had all the resources of infinite power at His command said, "Gather up the fragments that remain, that nothing be lost." [C/9,10/88] (B1)

DA73/368 These words meant more than putting the bread into the baskets. (11)

DA74/368 The lesson was twofold. (11)

DA75/368 Nothing is to be wasted. [C/10/88] (P2)

DA76/368 We are to let slip no temporal advantage. (11)

DA77/368 We should neglect nothing that will tend to benefit a human being. [C/11c/88] (P2)

DA78/368 Let everything be gathered up that will relieve the necessity of earth's hungry ones. [C/11c/88] (P2)

DA79/368 And there should be the same carefulness in spiritual things. (11)

DA80/368 When the baskets of fragments were collected, the people thought of their friends at home. (11)

DA81/368 They wanted them to share in the bread that Christ had blessed. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

9/88 There is something beautiful in the admonition, "Gather up the fragments." [Cumming, SR-J]

10/88 He who had all the resources of infinitude at his command, would not waste a fragment! [Cumming, SR-J]

11c/88 . . . the Lord of all plenty, the Maker, Creator, and Proprietor of all, would not allow one fragment to fall that would be useful to a single human being, or that could be gathered up and collected for the benefit of others that were not there. [Cumming, SR-J]

DA82/368 The contents of the baskets were distributed among the eager throng, and were carried away into all the region round about. (I1)

DA83/368 So those who were at the feast were to give to others the bread that comes down from heaven, to satisfy the hunger of the soul. (I1)

DA84/368 They were to repeat what they had learned of the wonderful things of God. (I1)

DA85/368 Nothing was to be lost. (I1)

DA86/368 Not one word that concerned their eternal salvation was to fall useless to the ground. (I1)

DA87/368 The miracle of the loaves teaches a lesson of dependence upon God. (I1)

ST(97)32 This miracle was evidence that Jesus is the world's Redeemer, that he possesses omnipotent power; and it is also a most precious lesson of his beneficence. [C/12/88]
(I2)

DA88/368 When Christ fed the five thousand, the food was not nigh at hand. (I1)

DA89/368 Apparently He had no means at His command. (I1)

DA90/368 Here He was, with five thousand men, besides women and children, in the wilderness. (I1)

DA91/368 He had not invited the large multitude to follow Him; they came without invitation or command; but He knew that after they had listened so long to His instruction, they would feel hungry and faint; for He was one with them in their need of food. (I1)

DA92/368 They were far from home, and the night was close at hand. (I1)

12/88 Now this miracle has two aspects,--first, the evidence of omnipotent power, and, secondly, what was in all the miracles of Jesus, the evidence of infinite benevolence.
[Cumming, SR-J]

DA93/368 Many of them were without means to purchase food. (I1)

DA94/368 He who for their sake had fasted forty days in the wilderness would not suffer them to return fasting to their homes. (I1)

DA95/368 The providence of God had placed Jesus where He was; and He depended on His heavenly Father for the means to relieve the necessity. [W/8/246] (P1)

DA96/369 And when we are brought into strait places, we are to depend on God. [W/9/246] (P3)

DA97/369 We are to exercise wisdom and judgment in every action of life, that we may not, by reckless movements, place ourselves in trial. (I1)

DA98/369 We are not to plunge into difficulties, neglecting the means God has provided, and misusing the faculties He has given us. [W/10/246] (V2)

DA99/369 Christ's workers are to obey His instructions implicitly. (I1)

DA100/369 The work is God's, and if we would bless others His plans must be followed. (I1)

DA101/369 Self cannot be made a center; self can receive no honor. (I1)

DA102/369 If we plan according to our own ideas, the Lord will leave us to our own mistakes. [W/10/246] (P2)

DA103/369 But when, after following His directions, we are brought into strait places, He will deliver us. [W/11/246] (P2)

216.1 Though He refused to change stones into bread for Himself when He was hungry, He always thought of others. He did not like the idea of that crowd having been there all these long hours in the burning sun of an April day, without tasting a morsel of food. [Macduff, BTS]

8/246 The providence of God had, however, placed him in his present circumstances, and he might therefore properly look to PROVIDENCE for deliverance. [Wayland, SBC]

9/246 This event, then, furnishes the rule by which we are to be governed. [Wayland, SBC]

10/246 When we plunge ourselves into difficulty, by a neglect of the means or by a misuse of the faculties which God has bestowed upon us, it is to be expected that he will leave us to our own devices. [Wayland, SBC]

11/246 But when, in the honest discharge of our duties, we find ourselves in circumstances beyond the reach of human aid, we then may confidently look up to God for deliverance. [Wayland, SBC]

DA104/369 We are not to give up in discouragement, but in every emergency we are to seek help from Him who has infinite resources at his command. (I1)

DA105/369 Often we shall be surrounded with trying circumstances, and then, in the fullest confidence, we must depend upon God. [W/11/246] (P2)

DA106/369 He will keep every soul that is brought into perplexity through trying to keep the way of the Lord. [W/12/246] (P2)

ST(97)102 The path of duty, tho it may not always be pleasant to the natural feelings, is the only path of safety. [W/14/246] (P1)

ST(97)103 When the Lord tests us with trials, he does not leave us to the will of the enemy. [W/13/246] (P1)

ST(97)104 He has appointed a way of escape for us; but our faith in his pledged word must be exercised. [W/13/246] (I2)

DA107/369 Christ has bidden us, through the prophet, "Deal thy bread to the hungry," and "satisfy the afflicted soul;" "when thou seest the naked, that thou cover him," and "bring the poor that are cast out to thy house." Isa. 58:7-10. (B2)

DA108/369 He has bidden us, "Go ye into all the world, and preach the gospel to every creature." Mark 16:15. (B2)

DA109/369 But how often our hearts sink, and faith fails us, as we see how great is the need, and how small the means in our hands. (I1)

DA110/369 Like Andrew looking upon the five barley loaves and the two little fishes, we exclaim, "What are they among so many?" (I1)

DA111/369 Often we hesitate, unwilling to give all that we have, fearing to spend and to be spent for others. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

12/246 He will always take care of us while we are in the spot where he has placed us. [Wayland, SBC]

13/246 When he appoints for us trials, he also appoints for us the means of escape. [Wayland, SBC]

14/246 The path of duty, though it may seem arduous, is ever the path of safety. [Wayland, SBC]

DA112/369 But Jesus has bidden us, "Give ye them to eat."
(11)

DA113/369 His command is a promise; and behind it is the same power that fed the multitude beside the sea. (11)

DA114/369 In Christ's act of supplying the temporal necessities of a hungry multitude is wrapped up a deep spiritual lesson for all His workers. (11)

DA115/369 Christ received from the Father; He imparted to the disciples; they imparted to the multitude; and the people to one another. (11)

DA116/369 So all who are united to Christ will receive from Him the bread of life, the heavenly food, and impart it to others. (11)

DA117/369 In full reliance upon God, Jesus took the small store of loaves; and although there was but a small portion for His own family of disciples, He did not invite them to eat, but began to distribute to them, bidding them serve the people. [W/17/246] (12)

DA118/369+ The food multiplied in His hands; and the hands of the disciples, reaching out to Christ, Himself the Bread of Life, were never empty. (11)

DA119/370 The little store was sufficient for all. (11)

DA120/370 After the wants of the people had been supplied, the fragments were gathered up, and Christ and His disciples ate together of the precious, Heaven-supplied food. (11)

DA121/370 The disciples were the channel of communication between Christ and the people. (11)

DA122/370 This should be a great encouragement to His disciples today. (11)

17/246 Though his whole store was barely sufficient to supply the wants of his immediate family, he began to share it with the thousands who surrounded him. [Wayland, SBC]

85.7 The disciples are represented by the other evangelists as the chosen means of communication between our Lord and the people; [Hutchinson, OLS]

DA123/370 Christ is the great center, the source of all strength. (I1)

DA124/370 His disciples are to receive their supplies from Him. (I1)

DA125/370 The most intelligent, the most spiritually minded, can bestow only as they receive. (I1)

DA126/370 Of themselves they can supply nothing for the needs of the soul. (I1)

DA127/370 We can impart only that which we receive from Christ; and we can receive only as we impart to others. (I1)

DA128/370 As we continue imparting, we continue to receive; and the more we impart, the more we shall receive. (I1)

DA129/370 Thus we may be constantly believing, trusting, receiving, and imparting. (I1)

DA130/370 The work of building up the kingdom of Christ will go forward, though to all appearance it moves slowly and impossibilities seem to testify against advance. (I1)

DA131/370 The work is of God, and He will furnish means, and will send helpers, true, earnest disciples, whose hands also will be filled with food for the starving multitude.
[W/22/247] (I2)

DA132/370 God is not unmindful of those who labor in love to give the word of life to perishing souls, who in their turn reach forth their hands for food for other hungry souls. (I1)

DA133/370 In our work for God there is danger of relying too largely upon what man with his talents and ability can do. [W/33/247] (P2)

22/247 If the work be of God, he will furnish us with helpers as fast as they are needed. [Wayland, SBC]

16/246 We can more easily maintain ourselves in the most difficult position, God being our helper, than in apparent security relying on our own strength. [Wayland, SBC]

33/247 If I mistake not, it suggests to us that in works of benevolence we are accustomed to rely too much on human and too little on divine aid. [Wayland, SBC]

DA134/370 Thus we lose sight of the one Master Worker. (11)

DA135/370 Too often the worker for Christ fails to realize his personal responsibility. (11)

DA136/370 He is in danger of shifting his burden upon organizations, instead of relying upon Him who is the source of all strength. [W/248.2] (P2)

DA137/370 It is a great mistake to trust in human wisdom or numbers in the work of God. (11)

DA138/370 Successful work for Christ depends not so much on numbers or talent as upon pureness of purpose, the true simplicity of earnest, dependent faith. (11)

DA139/370 Personal responsibilities must be borne, personal duties must be taken up, personal efforts must be made for those who do not know Christ. (11)

DA140/370 In the place of shifting your responsibility upon someone whom you think more richly endowed than you are, work according to your ability. (11)

DA141/370 When the question comes home to your heart, "Whence shall we buy bread, that these may eat?" let not your answer be the response of unbelief. (11)

DA142/370 When the disciples heard the Saviour's direction, "Give ye them to eat," all the difficulties arose in their minds. (11)

DA143/370+ They questioned, Shall we go away into the villages to buy food? (11)

DA144/371 So now, when the people are destitute of the bread of life, the Lord's children question, Shall we send for someone from afar, to come and feed them? (11)

248.2 Every one is apt thus to forget his own personal duty, and rely upon the labor of others, and it is well if he does not put his organization in the place of God himself. [Wayland, SBC]

DA145/371 But what said Christ? (I1)

DA146/371 "Make the men sit down," and He fed them there. (I1)

DA147/371 Commune with Him. (I1)

DA148/371 Bring your barley loaves to Jesus. (I1)

DA149/371 The means in our possession may not seem to be sufficient for the work; but if we will move forward in faith, believing in the all-sufficient power of God, He Himself will provide the means for its accomplishment. (I1)

DA150/371 If the work be of God, He Himself will provide the means for its accomplishment. [W/22/247] (P2)

DA151/371 He will reward honest, simple reliance upon Him. [W/23/247] (P1)

DA152/371 The little that is wisely and economically used in the service of the Lord of heaven will increase in the very act of imparting. (I1)

DA153/371 In the hand of Christ the small supply of food remained undiminished until the famished multitude were satisfied. [W/18/247] (P2)

DA154/371 If we go to the Source of all strength, with our hands of faith outstretched to receive, we shall be sustained in our work, even under the most forbidding circumstances, and shall be enabled to give to others the bread of life. (I1)

DA155/371 The Lord says, "Give, and it shall be given unto you." (B2)

DA156/371 "He that soweth sparingly shall reap also sparingly; and he that soweth with blessings shall reap also with blessings. . . . (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

22/247 If the work be of God, he will furnish us with helpers as fast as they are needed. [Wayland, SBC]

23/247 In all ages, God has rewarded abundantly simple trust in him, and has bestowed upon it the highest honor. [Wayland, SBC]

18/247 Small as was his provision at the commencement, it remained unconsumed until the deed of mercy was done, and the wants of the famishing host were supplied. [Wayland, SBC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA157/371 And God is able to make all grace abound unto you; that ye, having always all sufficiency in everything, may abound unto every good work: as it is written,--"He hath scattered abroad, he hath given to the poor: His righteousness abideth forever. (B2)

DA158/371 "And He that supplieth seed to the sower and bread for food, shall supply and multiply your seed for sowing, and increase the fruits of your righteousness: ye being enriched in everything unto all liberality, which worketh through us thanksgiving to God." Luke 6:38; 2 Cor. 9:6-11, R. V., margin. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

Analysis

Our analysis of chapter 39 is the seventh in the series of 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages to be evaluated for literary dependency. Thus far, each chapter has had its own special literary character. This chapter is no exception.

One of the first peculiarities to strike our interest was the tension between the Spirit of Prophecy text and the DA account as well as within the DA itself in respect to Jesus' taking some rest with His disciples. A second question of discord was raised when we compared the 2SP text with the Scripture accounts. A third problem to be faced concerned the dependency between the DA text published in December of 1898 and the ST articles dated in August of 1897. These are only three out of a number of intriguing features challenging the source critical analysis of this chapter.

The theme of chapter 39 has to do with the feeding of the 5,000. This is the only miracle from the public ministry of Christ to be found in all four gospels. The similarities and differences between the four accounts have been the subject of source critical studies on the synoptic gospels. Two of the synoptic accounts, those of Matthew and Mark, also include a story of Jesus feeding 4,000.¹ Part of the tension to be found in Ellen White's comments may be due to the difficulties involved in trying to create some kind

¹Cf. Matthew 15:32-39 and Mark 8:1-10.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

of harmony among these varying reports.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

In this chapter of 158 sentences Ellen White exhibits a large degree of independence. We credited 107 sentences to her Strict Independence. Aside from 12 direct references to Scripture on her own initiative we found parallels to six sources in the remaining 39 sentences. These dependent sentences have been broken down in Table 1, page 386, into the various categories of dependency.

The majority of parallels, 20 out of 37, were classified as Simple Paraphrase. Partial Independence and Strict Paraphrase registered six and five respectively with Loose Paraphrase and Source Bible accounting for seven more source parallels, three for the former and four for the latter. One parallel rated in the Verbatim class. According to the evaluation scale the entire chapter shows an average of .92 dependency where all sentences other than independent Bible quotations are included. When only the dependent sentences are rated the average dependency jumps to 3.43.

The source furnishing the most source parallels for the DA text was a discourse or sermon by Francis Wayland, "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth." Wayland's series of sermons is not listed in the compilation furnished by the White Estate office.¹ John Cumming's commentary on the

¹Warren H. Johns, Tim Poirier and Ron Graybill, A

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 39

Ellen White Text

		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9									
TEXT	V1	Strict Verbatim	V2	Verbatim	P1	Strict Paraphrase	P2	Simple Paraphrase	P3	Loose Paraphrase	B1	Source Bible	I2	Partial Independence	I1	Strict Independence	B2	Bible	TOTAL
01. DA	00		01	05	20	03	04	06	107	12									158
02. 2SP (77)	00		00	01	01	02	00	05	00	00									09
03. St (97)	00		00	04	06	00	00	03	02	00									15
TOTALS PRE-DA	00		00	05	07	02	00	08	(02)	(00)									24

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

gospel of John was used in 11 sentences. The 13 remaining readings are spread through the writings of familiar authors as Table 2, page 388, indicates.

According to the library list compiled from the inventory made at the time of her death,¹ Cumming was a favorite author of Ellen White. She had at this time three of his works, including the one used in this chapter, in her private library. Four other books by Cumming were in the office library.

John Cumming was not only a prolific writer, he also repeated himself in his works. His comments on the content of this chapter were so similar in several works that we had difficulty deciding which source furnished the parallel.²

We had the same type of problem when using the works of Daniel March. The story of this miraculous feeding appears in Walks and Homes of Jesus, published in 1866, under the heading of "Capernaum," chapter III. In a later work, Days of the Son of Man, published in 1882, virtually the same material is presented under the topic of "The Synagogue." Unless persuaded by the peculiarities of the text itself we have favored the earlier work as the source used by Ellen

Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries (E. G. White Estate, April, 1982), hereafter to be referred to as EGW Bibliography.

¹Ibid.

²Cf. Cumming, SR-J 5/8 with The Life and Lessons of our Lord, Unfolded and Illustrated (London: John F. Shaw & Co., 1870), p. 183; Foreshadows, Lectures on Our Lord's Miracles (Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1854), p. 313 and Sabbath Evening Readings in the New Testament. St. Matthew (Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett, Proctor, and Worthington, 1855), page 124.8.

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 39

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	12	12
02. Cumming SR-J	00	00	02	06	01	01	01	00	00	11
03. Farrar LC	00	00	01	00	00	00	01	00	00	02
04. Hanna LC	00	00	00	02	01	02	00	00	00	05
05. March WBJ	00	00	00	02	00	01	01	00	00	04
06. Pentecost BS	00	00	00	01	00	00	01	00	00	02
07. Wayland SBC	00	01	02	09	01	00	02	00	00	15
TOTALS DA Text	00	01	05	20	03	04	06	—	(12)	51

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

White. We know she had a copy of Walks and Homes of Jesus in her personal library in 1915.

Our survey of the previous writings of Ellen White on the subject of this chapter uncovered two earlier accounts on which Marian Davis obviously drew in the composition of chapter 39. Most of the 51 sentences of chapter XX of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, and the 184 sentences of two-part article in The Signs of the Times on "Feeding the Five Thousand"¹ appear in identical or modified form in this chapter. The ST material is also indebted to the earlier 2SP presentation. We have listed the parallel sentences between 2SP, chapter XX, the ST articles of 1897, and the DA text in Table A on pages 390 through 392.

Since our major concern lies with Ellen White's use of literary sources other than her own we are assuming that the DA text of 1898 was written after the ST article of 1897.²

¹ST, August 12, 19, 1897. With the exception of sentences 6-29, the material from 2SP may also be found in The Signs of the Times, May 10, 1883, "Power and Humility of Jesus." Chapter XX of Spirit of Prophecy II, plus a portion of what now appears in DA, chapter 40, may be found in La Vie de Christ, chapter XXVII, "Multiplication des Pains."

²We cannot be absolutely sure that the DA text is dependent on the ST(97) text because we have no date for the original composition of either text. Usually the publication of a journal article followed closely after its production. Ellen White was often under the pressure of time in preparing her material for the various church journals. At the same time, she would have prepared her manuscripts for the DA months before its publication date of December, 1898. She is very likely to have been working on both tasks at the same time during her Australian years.

In a letter to Dr. Kellogg dated October 25, 1894 she wrote: "All articles that appear under my signature are fresh, new writings from my pen." [Letter 41, 1895] If this comment applies to the ST article we still are faced with the question of dependency. The ST article could have

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 39

	<u>Sent.</u> <u>No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST(97)</u>	<u>DA</u>		<u>Sent.</u> <u>No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST(97)</u>	<u>DA</u>
001.	1	1			031.	31	37		(28)
002.	2	2			032.	32	39		(29)
003.	3		1	1	033.	33	40	(17)	30
004.	4		2	(2) ¹	034.	34	41	(18)	31
005.	5	3	(3)	[3]	035.	35	42	(19)	32
006.	6	4		(4)	036.	36	43		
007.	7			5	037.	37	44		(33)
008.	8	7	(4)	[6]	038.	38	14(45)	(20)	[34]
009.	9	5		(7)	039.	39		21	
010.	10	6			040.	40	46		
011.	11			8	041.	41	47	(22)	35
012.	12		5	(9)	042.	42	48-50		
013.	13	8	(6)	10	043.	43	51a	(23)	36
014.	14	9	(7)	11	044.	44	51b	24	37
015.	15	10-12			045.	45	52-56		
016.	16	13	(8)	12	046.	46		25	38
017.	17	14	(9)	[13]	047.	47		26	
018.	18		10	14	048.	48		27	39
019.	19		11	15	049.	49			40
020.	20		12	16	050.	50		28	41
021.	21		13	17	051.	51		29	(42)
022.	22	15	(14)	[18]	052.	52		30	43
023.	23	16-20			053.	53		31	(44)
024.	24	21a	15	(19)	054.	54		32	
025.	25	21b		(20)	055.	55		33	
026.	26			21-24	056.	56		34	(45)
027.	27	22		(25)	057.	57		35	(46)
028.	28	23-25			058.	58			47
029.	29			26	059.	59		36,37	(48)
030.	30	36	(16)	27	060.	60		38	49

¹Parentheses and brackets have been used to indicate when the later version of the parallel sentence has been modified. For example, on line 5 sentence 3 of ST(97) exhibits some changes over sentence 3 of 2SP and sentence 3 of the DA text contains some differences from sentence 3 of ST(97). The changes are evaluated on the basis of the first edition of the sentence involved, and modifications are indicated by the alternation of parentheses and brackets. Where the sentence number is given without parentheses or brackets the sentence may be considered to be a duplicate (or very nearly so) of a previous form of the sentence. Usually such a sentence duplicates the last form of the sentence though this is not always the case.

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 39

<u>Sent. No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST (97)</u>	<u>DA</u>	<u>Sent. No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST (97)</u>	<u>DA</u>
061.	61	39	50	106.	106	38	(94)
062.	62	40	51	107.	107	93	(95)
063.	63	41	52	108.	108	94	96
064.	64	42	53	109.	109	95	97
065.	65	43		110.	110	96	98
066.	66		54	111.	111		99-101
067.	67		55	112.	112	97	(102)
068.	68		56	113.	113	98	(103)
069.	69		57	114.	114	99	(104)
070.	70	44		115.	115	100	(105)
071.	71		58	116.	116	101	106
072.	72	51	59	117.	117	102-104	
073.	73	45	60	118.	118		107-113
074.	74	46	61	119.	119	137	(114)
075.	75	48	62	120.	120	138	115
076.	76	47,49	(63)	121.	121	139	(116)
077.	77	50	64	122.	122	140	
078.	78	51		123.	123	141	(117)
079.	79	52	(65)	124.	124	142	118
080.	80	53-55		125.	125	143	(119)
081.	81		66	126.	126	144	
082.	82	56-60		127.	127	145	
083.	83		67-70	128.	128		120
084.	84	61	71	129.	129	146	(121)
085.	85	62	72	130.	130	147	(122)
086.	86	73	73	131.	131	148	123
087.	87	63	74	132.	132	149	124
088.	88	64	75	133.	133	150-152	
089.	89	65	76	134.	134	153	125
090.	90	66	77	135.	135	154	(126)
091.	91	67	78	136.	136	155	(127)
092.	92		79-82	137.	137	156	128
093.	93	68	(83)	138.	138	157	129
094.	94	69	84	139.	139	107	(130)
095.	95	70	85	140.	140	108	(131)
096.	96	71	86	141.	141	109	132
097.	97	72-81		142.	142	110-112	
098.	98	82-86		143.	143	113	133
099.	99	87,88	(87)	144.	144	114	134
100.	100	89	88	145.	145	115	(135)
101.	101	90	89	146.	146	116	(136)
102.	102	91	90	147.	147	117	(137)
103.	103	92	(91)	148.	148	118	(138)
104.	104		92	149.	149	123	139
105.	105		93	150.	150	119	(140)

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 39

<u>Sent.</u> <u>No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST (97)</u>	<u>DA</u>	<u>Sent.</u> <u>No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST (97)</u>	<u>DA</u>
151.	<u>151</u>		<u>120-128</u>	196.			
152.	<u>152</u>			197.			
153.	<u>153</u>		<u>141-148</u>	198.			
154.	<u>154</u>		<u>129-136</u>	199.			
155.	<u>155</u>		<u>158-177</u>	200.			
156.	<u>156</u>		<u>178</u>	201.			
157.	<u>157</u>		<u>(149)</u>	202.			
158.	<u>158</u>		<u>179</u>	203.			
159.	<u>159</u>		<u>180</u>	204.			
160.	<u>160</u>		<u>151</u>	205.			
161.	<u>161</u>		<u>152</u>	206.			
162.	<u>162</u>		<u>153</u>	207.			
163.	<u>163</u>	<u>57-111</u>		208.			
164.				209.			
165.				210.			
166.				211.			
167.				212.			
168.				213.			
169.				214.			
170.				215.			
171.				216.			
172.				217.			
173.				218.			
174.				219.			
175.				220.			
176.				221.			
177.				222.			
178.				223.			
179.				224.			
180.				225.			
181.				226.			
182.				227.			
183.				228.			
184.				229.			
185.				230.			
186.				231.			
187.				232.			
188.				233.			
189.				234.			
190.				235.			
191.				236.			
192.				237.			
193.				238.			
194.				239.			
195.				240.			

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

The sources used in the composition of the earlier 2SP and ST material were the same major ones as used for the DA text. We would expect this duplication in the use of the same sources since there are so many text parallels between the DA sentences and Ellen White's previous writings. The distribution of source parallels in the earlier texts is provided in Table 3 on page 394.

been developed from the DA chapter with special additions and omissions, particularly the former, for application to the ST readership. According to this hypothesis, Ellen White would have added 26 sentences when under pressure to prepare the manuscript for the DA text. Why would she not have just lifted the entire chapter from the DA manuscript and published it as a two-part article. After all, both publications had the same readership, the general public.

It seems more reasonable to conclude that Ellen White wrote the material as part of her material on the life of Christ. It was then published in the ST. The two-part article was later edited, shortened, and revised for the DA text. This hypothesis would account for the condensing and for the addition of more descriptive material. W. C. White appealed to Marian Davis to eliminate the discursive in favor of more description. Marian Davis wrote W. C. White August 9, 1897, saying:

Your references to "descriptive" and "discursive" chapters seems [sic] to indicate that you wish the latter were wholly or in part removed from the book. Every bit of descriptive matter has been used so far as possible. As to the "discursive," probably not one-twentieth that was in the L. C. MS has been used in the book. The chapters have been accepted by yourself and Sister White. To throw them out now would involve greater responsibility than I dare to take. . . . The only person with whom I am at liberty to consult is Elder Haskell. . . . I cannot get his consent to the omission of even one [chapter]. If it seems necessary to throw out some of these chapters, could you not select them, or find someone to do so. . . .

Postscript: The work of revising and condensing has, I hope, made most of the "discursive" chapters somewhat more compact and direct. Perhaps they will not be found to be quite so objectionable as before.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 39

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
V1 Strict Verbatim	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	02	01	03
V2 Verbatim	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00
P1 Strict Paraphrase	00	00	02	06	00	00	02	00	00	10
P2 Simple Paraphrase	00	00	01	00	02	00	01	00	00	04
P3 Loose Paraphrase	00	00	00	01	00	00	03	00	00	04
B1 Source Bible	00	00	02	00	00	00	01	00	00	03
I2 Partial Independence	00	00	05	07	02	00	07	02	(01)	24
I1 Strict Independence	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00
B2 Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	00	05	07	02	00	07	02	(01)	24

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

If we compare the degree of dependency between the DA text and the two previous accounts of the miracle of feeding the five thousand, the earlier texts usually show greater dependency.¹

Before taking up the matter of redaction analysis we should at least clarify the earlier comment which had to do with differences of content between the various accounts.

In the 2SP record Ellen White presents Jesus and His disciples as unable to make their retreat as planned. When they arrive at the landing the crowd was already there and pressing the Lord for healing. He is so engulfed in the throng that finally Jesus resorts to teaching them from a boat. Peter, who earlier had been with Jesus on land, is now asked to bring his boat to shore to accommodate Jesus. We read nothing about Jesus leaving the boat but soon the feeding miracle takes place, evidently on the grassy mound where Ellen White had earlier located Jesus.²

According to three gospel accounts Jesus does reach His retreat before the multitude find Him. He leaves His retirement to minister to the people. There is a suggestion in Mark 6:33 that a number of people arrived at the landing site before Jesus reached the shore. The ST account agrees with the majority witness of the gospels. The opening

¹Cf. DA59 [P3] with ST(97)51 [P1], DA60 [P2] with ST(97)45 [P1], and DA61 [I2] with ST(97)46 [P2]. Occasionally we find an exception as in DA4 when compared to the earlier text of 2SP.

²2SP, XX, sentences 1-51, pages 258-262.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

sentence of the text of ST and DA locates Jesus in "a secluded place with His disciples. . ." The DA text, however, goes on to say that a crowd had gathered before Jesus reached the shore yet He is able to land "unobserved by them, and spent a little time apart with the disciples."¹ This tension in the DA text may be an effort to utilize the 2SP account and yet be true to the gospel records. For whatever reason, the ST commentary, though obviously using the earlier 2SP material, makes no mention of the crowd meeting Jesus at the shore. We may also explain the apparent contradiction as Ellen White's attempt to harmonize all four accounts. March also seems to contradict himself in his attempt to bring some unity into the conflicting reports. Hanna accomplishes the harmony by omitting any reference to Jesus' actually finding the solitude He desired.²

Ellen White's introduction of Peter and his boat is evidently lifted from the earlier experience when Jesus teaches the multitude in parables as He sits in a boat near the shore.³ We did not find a similar combination of these two episodes in the sources Ellen White has evidently used in developing her commentary on this miracle feeding.

One further illustration of this conflict in the accounts is found in the Spirit of Prophecy text. In

¹DA, page 364, sentences 7 and 8.

²Cf. March, Days of the Son of Man, p. 183, and Hanna, Life of Christ, p. 278.

³Cf. Matt. 13:1,2, Mark 4:1,2, and especially Luke 5:1-3.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

2SP36/261 Jesus is credited with asking Philip for information on where food could be obtained for the multitude so that the people may not "faint in the way." The conversation with Philip as presented in John 6:5 does not include this explanation for His request. These remarks of Jesus are recorded in Scripture as referring to the feeding of the four thousand and are qualified as being addressed to all the disciples.¹ March makes use of this same comment of Jesus in connection with the feeding of the five thousand but he does not limit the conversation to Jesus and Philip.²

Many interpreters of the New Testament argue that all six accounts of a feeding miracle refer to one episode rather than two miracle feedings. It is doubtful that Ellen White would have held this viewpoint. It is interesting to note, nevertheless, that neither Ellen White nor Hanna gives serious attention to the miracle of feeding the four thousand.³

Finally, the content of the source parallels shows a variation according to the author but not strictly between what is dependent and what may be attributed to Ellen White. March was used largely for descriptive material as was also Hanna. But Hanna supplied practical and spiritual comment as did also the parallels from Wayland and Cumming. Ellen

¹Matt. 15:32 and Mark 8:1-3.

²March, op. cit., p. 184.

³Ellen White in DA 403,404 makes a passing reference to the miracle in one paragraph. We found no heading in Hanna's life of Christ treating this event.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

White's independent material covered all content areas. If there was any unique element in Ellen White's treatment it was her personal application and appeal to the reader.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

We found several brief references to the feeding of the five thousand in a number of manuscripts and articles. Since the only major coverage of this miracle to appear in writings earlier than the DA text have already been discussed under source analysis of the DA text, we may move into redaction analysis.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The arrangement of chapter 39 follows the general narrative development of the gospel accounts. There are sections where Ellen White seems to be also influenced by Hanna,¹ Wayland, and Cumming. The presence of so much independent literary material and the combination of various sources, however, lead us to credit Ellen White and Marian Davis with the compositional form of the chapter. Perhaps a content analysis would show more parallels to Hanna than does our source analysis based upon literary parallels.

¹DA32 reflects the account as given in John's gospel. DA33 speaks to a command of Jesus not found in this gospel nor in the gospel of Mark which is probably reflected in DA31. The comment of Jesus is only found in Matt. 14:18. Both Hanna and Ellen White move directly from John's gospel in LC37 and DA32 to the command of Christ given in Matthew, LC38 and DA33. This is only one example of where Ellen White apparently was influenced by a source even though she is also using Scripture.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The structure of The Spirit of Prophecy text behind this chapter is clearly that of Ellen White. Her incorporation of elements foreign to the gospel narratives is different from that of the sources on which she is partially dependent. The two-part article from ST is so similar in structure to the DA text we are forced to credit its editorial arrangement to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis as well.

Our study of chapter 39 has underscored the need for further content analysis. We need to check the similarities of theme presentations between Ellen White's writings and that of her sources. In addition, and this is of special importance, we should note the special contribution of Ellen White's commentary. What does she add or omit? What is the distinctive contribution of her commentary on this miracle story?

We may also conclude from this review of her comments on biblical passages that Ellen White does not write as an exegete. She does not attempt to illuminate the meaning of the text. Rather, she approaches the passage from a dynamic point of view. She allows the text to have various emphases.

For example, the first 56 sentences of the DA text cover the entire episode including some practical and spiritual lessons. With sentence 57 Ellen White begins to draw lessons which relate the natural and supernatural

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

worlds. At sentence 71 a third approach is taken. Here she builds on the values of thrift and unselfishness. Sentence 87 moves us back to the beginning of the event to stress dependence upon God. The great spiritual truth of union with God and Christ is introduced with sentence 114. The final application of the miracle is taken up with sentence 130. In this last section of the account Ellen White speaks of the missionary lessons to be drawn from the experience of Jesus and His disciples. The chapter closes with four Scripture quotations in support of this final theme.

The basic story is presented in 56 sentences. The additional commentary takes nearly twice as much text, 102 sentences. The reader is not allowed merely to catch a glimpse of what happened 1900 years ago. One is caught up into the various meanings which transcend that moment in past time and invited to enter into similar experiences with the same resurrected Christ as His power energizes the believing Christian living in the present.

Summary

Ellen White's three major treatments of the one public miracle of Christ to be mentioned in all four gospels challenge us to further study. There is the need for a careful and thorough comparison of her content with that of her sources. This is not the only chapter to have triggered the desire for content analysis. Secondly, we have been exposed to what appears to have been an independent and

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

rather dynamic use of Scripture. We are led to ask three questions. Is this usage, as presented in chapter 39, typical of Ellen White? If so, what may we legitimately conclude as to her method of interpreting Scripture? And thirdly, how does our understanding of her interpretive method inform our method for interpreting her writings and the Scriptures?

We turn now from the special concerns raised by chapter 39 to the common questions being addressed to all 15 chapters.

1. No primary sources remain today for the DA text on chapter 39 or for the two earlier writings utilized in the composition of this chapter. A few comments on the feeding of the five thousand appear in Letter B-47-91 and Manuscript 47, 1894. They do not appear to have influenced the literary form of the text of DA though the thoughts are similar.

2. The DA text represents a reduction of the commentary from the various earlier writings of Ellen White. We counted 56 sentences from 2SP, XX, and 184 sentences from a two-part series in ST(97). The DA text totals 158 sentences. The DA text omits some of the Bible references used earlier as well as some duplicated material.

3. Since the pre-DA texts were largely used in the composition of the DA text we would not expect significant differences between the DA text and Ellen White's earlier

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

materials. The DA text as well as the ST(97) text omitted the references to Jesus teaching from a boat which appear in the 2SP account.

4. Two differences were noted in the DA text over against the earlier accounts' concern. There is the attempt in chapter 39 of harmonizing the 2SP record of Jesus' not taking a retreat with His disciples, reflecting the Markan difference, with the ST(97) treatment which states (along with Matthew, Luke, and John) that Jesus did retire with His disciples to a place of solitude. Secondly, the DA text (as does ST(97)) omits the references in 2SP to Jesus teaching the multitude from a boat anchored just off shore.

5. The text of chapter 39 has 158 sentences, of which 40, or 25 percent, were seen to exhibit some degree of literary dependence.

6. Out of the 158 sentences, 106, or 67 percent, registered Strict Independence. Twelve other sentences consisted of Bible quotations and were omitted from the evaluation.

7. According to our dependency scale the dependency rate for the 40 sentences measured 3.5. The degree of dependency for all sentences (less the Bible quotations) was .97.

8. Francis Wayland's discourse on "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth" was used in 15 parallels. A second major source for this chapter was John Cumming's Sabbath Evening Readings. St. John. This book was listed in the

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

inventory of Ellen White's private library in 1915 and contributed 12 parallels.

9. Four sources to which references have been made earlier were also used to some degree in the writing of this chapter. These are Hanna (Life of Christ), March (Walks and Homes of Jesus), Farrar (Life of Christ) and Pentecost (Bible Studies (88)). We listed without evaluation one possible parallel from Hutchinson, Our Lord's Signs in St. John's Gospel.

10. Since the pre-DA materials treating and fully covering the miracle of the feeding were used in composing the DA text, the sources for the earlier writings also serve as sources for this chapter and are indicated under (8) and (9) above.

11. The same library sources were used in composing the pre-DA and the DA texts. The literary parallels included narrative background, description, theology, and practical spiritual lessons.

12. We found no significant difference between the dependent and independent sentences of chapter 39 in respect to type of content. Ellen White developed the practical spiritual lessons to a greater degree than did her sources.

13. The arrangement of the chapter follows the story outline as found in Scripture. Once the episode has been treated Ellen White begins to draw out several interpretations, some of which are briefly elaborated in Hanna. The final structure of the chapter, however, differs

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

from Hanna's and must be credited to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis, her editorial assistant.

The literary subunits follow the literary source being used in that section of the chapter. Within each of these thematic elements, however, Ellen White adds her own comment. The finished chapter exhibits a skeleton form reflecting the influence of the Bible and the sources; yet the modifications and additions of Ellen White, particularly in the post-narrative comment, mark the work as her own.

14. The pre-DA accounts differ in their structural arrangement and content. In 2SP, chapter XX, Ellen White includes material from another episode when Jesus teaches from a boat. She also extends the chapter to include the attempt of the people to make Christ king and Jesus' departure to spend the night in prayer.

The two-part article in ST appears to be directed more specifically to church workers. To support the object lessons extrapolated from the miracle story, Ellen White refers to the experience of the early church and the counsels of the apostle Paul.

The DA account selects narrative elements and practical lessons from the two earlier writings and combines them with additional comment to form this chapter. The completed work appears well suited to the purposes set forth for this publication. The DA is not a revision of Ellen White's earlier treatment of the life of Christ. It is a new work for a special audience. It is indeed derivative, both in

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

regard to her previous writings and the literary works of others. At the same time it is a new and original production that merits its own special place in the literature on the life of Christ.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 39

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.		I1	051.		I1
002.		I1	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.	<u>March DSM 2b/183</u>	P2	054.		I1
005.	<u>March DSM 3/183</u>	P2	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.		I1	057.		I1
008.		I1	058.	<u>Cumming SR-J 5,6/89</u>	P1
009.		I1	059.	<u>Cumming SR-J 8/89</u>	P3
010.		I1	060.	<u>Cumming SR-J 6/89</u>	P2
011.	<u>March WHJ 1/99</u>	I2	061.	<u>Cumming SR-J 6,7/89</u>	I2
012.	<u>March WHJ 2/99</u>	B1	062.	<u>Cumming SR-J 7,8/89</u>	P2
013.		I1	063.		I1
014.	<u>Pentecost BS 8/3</u>	I2	064.		I1
015.		I1	065.	<u>Cumming SR-J 2/90</u>	P2
016.		I1	066.		I1
017.		I1	067.		I1
018.		I1	068.		I1
019.		I1	069.		I1
020.	<u>Farrar LC 303.1</u>	P1	070.		I1
021.		I1	071.		I1
022.		I1	072.	<u>Cumming SR-J9,10/88</u>	B1
023.		I1	073.		I1
024.		I1	074.		I1
025.		I1	075.	<u>Cumming SR-J 10/88</u>	P2
026.	<u>Wayland SBC 245.1</u>	P2	076.		I1
027.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	077.	<u>Cumming SR-J 11c/88</u>	P2
028.		I1	078.	<u>Cumming SR-J 11c/88</u>	P2
029.	<u>Hanna LC 35/278</u>	P3	079.		I1
030.	<u>Hanna LC 35/278</u>	B1	080.		I1
031.	<u>Hanna LC 36/278</u>	P1	081.		I1
032.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	082.		I1
033.	<u>Hanna LC 38,39/279</u>	B1	083.		I1
034.	<u>Hanna LC 40/279</u>	P2	084.		I1
035.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	085.		I1
036.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	086.		I1
037.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	087.		I1
038.	<u>Pentecost BS 9.5</u>	P2	088.		I1
039.		I1	089.		I1
040.		I1	090.		I1
041.		I1	091.		I1
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.		I1	093.		I1
044.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	094.		I1
045.	<u>Cumming SR-J2,4a/89</u>	P1	095.	<u>Wayland SBC 8/246</u>	P1
046.		I1	096.	<u>Wayland SBC 9/246</u>	P3
047.		I1	097.		I1
048.		I1	098.	<u>Wayland SBC 10/246</u>	V2
049.		I1	099.		I1
050.	<u>Farrar LC 303.3</u>	I2	100.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 39

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.		I1	151.	Wayland SBC 23/247	P1
102.	Wayland SBC 10/246	P2	152.		I1
103.	Wayland SBC 11/246	P2	153.	Wayland SBC 18/247	P2
104.		I1	154.		I1
105.	Wayland SBC 11/246	P2	155.	Bible	B2
106.	Wayland SBC 12/246	P2	156.	Bible	B2
107.	Bible	B2	157.	Bible	B2
108.	Bible	B2	158.	Bible	B2
109.		I1	159.		
110.		I1	160.		
111.		I1	161.		
112.		I1	162.		
113.		I1	163.		
114.		I1	164.		
115.		I1	165.		
116.		I1	166.		
117.	Wayland SBC 17/246	I2	167.		
118.		I1	168.		
119.		I1	169.		
120.		I1	170.		
121.		I1	171.		
122.		I1	172.		
123.		I1	173.		
124.		I1	174.		
125.		I1	175.		
126.		I1	176.		
127.		I1	177.		
128.		I1	178.		
129.		I1	179.		
130.		I1	180.		
131.	Wayland SBC 22/247	I2	181.		
132.		I1	182.		
133.	Wayland SBC 33/247	P2	183.		
134.		I1	184.		
135.		I1	185.		
136.	Wayland SBC 248.2	P2	186.		
137.		I1	187.		
138.		I1	188.		
139.		I1	189.		
140.		I1	190.		
141.		I1	191.		
142.		I1	192.		
143.		I1	193.		
144.		I1	194.		
145.		I1	195.		
146.		I1	196.		
147.		I1	197.		
148.		I1	198.		
149.		I1	199.		
150.	Wayland SBC 22/247	P2	200.		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 39

No.	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	ST (97) 3	I1	3	051.			
002.	2SP 4/259	I2	4	052.			
003.	2SP 5/259	P3	7	053.			
004.	2SP 6/259	I2	7	054.			
005.	2SP 8/259	P3	10	055.			
006.	2SP 9/259	I2	11	056.			
007.	2SP 14/259	I2	14	057.			
008.	2SP 15/259	P2	14	058.			
009.	2SP 36/261	B2	27	059.			
010.	2SP 46/262	P1	34	060.			
011.	ST (97) 51	P1	59	061.			
012.	ST (97) 45	P1	60	062.			
013.	ST (97) 46	P2	61	063.			
014.	ST (97) 48	P2	62	064.			
015.	ST (97) 47	P2	63	065.			
016.	ST (97) 49	P2	63	066.			
017.	ST (97) 54	P2	65	067.			
018.	ST (97) 55	P2	65	068.			
019.	ST (97) 56	I1	66	069.			
020.	ST (97) 57	I2	66	070.			
021.	ST (97) 75	I2	86	071.			
022.	ST (97) 102	P1	106	072.			
023.	ST (97) 103	P1	106	073.			
024.	ST (97) 104	I2	106	074.			
025.				075.			
026.				076.			
027.				077.			
028.				078.			
029.				079.			
030.				080.			
031.				081.			
032.				082.			
033.				083.			
034.				084.			
035.				085.			
036.				086.			
037.				087.			
038.				088.			
039.				089.			
040.				090.			
041.				091.			
042.				092.			
043.				093.			
044.				094.			
045.				095.			
046.				096.			
047.				097.			
048.				098.			
049.				099.			
050.				100.			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 39

No.	Text	Sources	No.	Text	Sources
001.	ST (97) 3		051.		
002.	2SP 4/259	M/2b/99	052.		
003.	2SP 5/259	H/22/278	053.		
004.	2SP 6/259	H/22/278	054.		
005.	2SP 8/259	H/23/278	055.		
006.	2SP 9/259	M/1/99	056.		
007.	2SP 14/259	M/5/99+	057.		
008.	2SP 15/259	M/5/99+	058.		
009.	2SP 36/261	Bible	059.		
010.	2SP 46/262	H/42,43/279	060.		
011.	ST (97) 51	C/8/89	061.		
012.	ST (97) 45	C/6/89	062.		
013.	ST (97) 46	C/6,7/89	063.		
014.	ST (97) 48	C/6,8/89	064.		
015.	ST (97) 47	C/6,7/89	065.		
016.	ST (97) 49	C/7/89	066.		
		C/2/90	067.		
017.	ST (97) 54	C/1/90	068.		
018.	ST (97) 55	C/2/90	069.		
019.	ST (97) 56		070.		
020.	ST (97) 57	C/2/90	071.		
021.	ST (97) 75	C/12/88	072.		
022.	ST (97) 102	W/14/246	073.		
023.	ST (97) 103	W/13/246	074.		
024.	ST (97) 104	W/13/246	075.		
025.			076.		
026.			077.		
027.			078.		
028.			079.		
029.			080.		
030.			081.		
031.			082.		
032.			083.		
033.			084.		
034.			085.		
035.			086.		
036.			087.		
037.			088.		
038.			089.		
039.			090.		
040.			091.		
041.			092.		
042.			093.		
043.			094.		
044.			095.		
045.			096.		
046.			097.		
047.			098.		
048.			099.		
049.			100.		
050.					