XIII CHAPTER 72 - "In Remembrance of Me"

Ellen White divides the Passover celebration of Christ into two chapters. Chapter 71, "A Servant of Servants," has as its focus the feet-washing episode. Chapter 72 follows with a commentary on the Lord's Supper entitled "In Remembrance of Me." The content of the two chapters overlaps as the editors of the <u>DA</u> text indicate in the margin.¹

Some duplication is to be expected when the narrative treats two aspects of the same celebration in two separate accounts. Unfortunately for us, the random selection of chapters limits our coverage to the second part only.

In our search for possible literary parallels we put our emphasis on the communion service, the focus of chapter 72. The narrowing of the field may have led us to overlook some sources.

On the other hand we must remember that the Passion story has been the focus of the gospel proclamation since the cross of Jesus Christ. There are countless books, sermons and devotional works highlighting the closing scenes of our Lord's life on earth. The Lord's Supper forms the basis of weekly meditations as Christians meet to celebrate the communion service. There is no end to the materials which could be reviewed for possible literary parallels.

Our research was largely confined to the general works on the life of Christ which held the possibility for

¹Both chapters include comments from Luke 22:14-18.

"In Remembrance of Me"

parallels in Ellen White's treatment of other episodes covered in the gospels. We did not initiate a special search in the literature devoted specifically to the communion service. Occasionally we selected a text focusing on the Passion Week because our study includes five chapters on this period of Christ's sojourn on earth.

The reader will find sixteen writers represented in the source selections of the text presentation. The familiar works of William Hanna, John Harris, and Daniel March appear as well as the narrative lives of Christ by Frederic Farrar, Cunningham Geikie, George Jones, and Johann Lange. We have also included the Bible Studies by George Pentecost for both 1888 and 1889. In addition to these sources previously mentioned in our investigation, chapter 72 introduces us to eight other 19th century works: Edward Bickersteth, A Scripture Help (SH);¹ Robert Boyd, The World's Hope (WH);² Charles Deems, Who Was Jesus? (WWJ);³ Alfred Edersheim, The $(LTJM);^4$ Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah Ezekiel Hopkins, The Whole Works of Ezekiel Hopkins (W);⁵ Stephen Olin, The Works of Stephen Olin (W);⁶ and Charles Stanford, The Evening of Our Lord's Ministry (ELM).⁷ John Cumming is well known from his commentaries on the gospels. In this chapter we include an excerpt from the third series of his Minor Works.⁸

Charles F. Deems, Who Was Jesus? (New York: J. Howard

¹Edward Bickersteth, <u>A Scripture Help</u> (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publishers, 1843). ²Robert Boyd, <u>The World's Hope; or, The Rock of Ages</u> (Chicago: H. S. Goodspeed & Co., 1873).

Ellen White's earliest presentation of the celebration of the Passover festival by Jesus and the disciples appears in Spiritual Gifts, Volume 1, chapter VII, under the topic of "The Betrayal of Christ." No direct use of this material is to be found in the DA text of chapter 72. A sentence or two from the third volume of this early work of Ellen White may have found their way into the DA text.¹ In this context she is commenting on the celebration by the children of Israel of the first Passover in the land of Egypt.

It was customary for Ellen White to tie the feet-washing service to the communion service. Her articles usually cover both aspects of the upper-room meeting in a single presentation. For example, in The Spirit of Prophecy, III, chapter VI she writes on "The Passover The first 20 sentences cover Supper." the betrayal agreement of Judas with the Jewish religious leaders. Sentences 21-41 refer mainly to the feet-washing incident covered in chapter 71 of the DA text. The next 35 sentences treat the communion service. The same chapter on the

Brown, 1880). 4Alfred Edersheim, The Life and Times of Jesus the Messigh (New York: E. R. Herrick & Company, 1886). Ezekiel Hopkins, The Whole Works of Ezekiel Hopkins

(Edinburgh: A. & C. Black, 1841).

^bStephen Olin, <u>The Works of Stephen Olin.</u> <u>Volume I.</u> <u>Sermons and Sketches</u> (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854). Charles Stanford, The Evening of Our Lord's Ministry Being Preludes to 'Voices from Calvary.' (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1886). ⁸John Cumming, Cumming

⁸John Cumming, <u>Cumming's Minor Works</u>. Third Series (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1855).

Cf. Spiritual Gifts, III (1864), p. 225.7 with DA9/652 and p. 227.9 with DA14/653. The SG material on the Passover may also be found in Signs of the Times, March 25, 1880.

"In Remembrance of Me"

Passover continues to relate the words of Jesus to the disciples after the supper is ended and the small band makes its way to the garden of Gethsemane. A number of sentences from the center section of this chapter are found in chapter 72 of the DA text as our analysis will show.

We are not at all confident that we have located all the miscellaneous items that went into Marian Davis' scrapbook or compilation of earlier Ellen White articles on the content of chapter 72. We did locate the choice sentences of DA199-201/661 in <u>The Bible Echo</u> of September 15, 1892, under an article on "The Great Sacrifice."¹ The thoughts of these sentences, however, are not directly related to the Passover service. They speak to the cross of Jesus Christ and to the meaning of His death to which the communion service also points.

Three previous writings of Ellen White on the topic of this chapter are Manuscript 35, 1897, "The Ordinances of the Lord's House"; pages 4-6 of Manuscript 47, 1897, entitled "Judas," and the <u>RH</u> article of June 22, 1897, on "The Ordinances." These writings and their use in the <u>DA</u> text will be carefully reviewed in the analysis to follow. Ellen White published a series of articles in the <u>RH</u> issues for May 31, June 7, 14, 28, and July 5 of 1898. The May 31 and June 7 numbers offer the full text of Manuscript 35, 1897,

¹The Bible Echo and Signs of the Times was published in Australia by the church for the interest of church members and the general public as the full title of the journal indicates.

"In Remembrance of Me"

dated April 6, 1897. The 528 sentences of this five-part series do contain a good number of parallels with the sentences of chapter 72. We cannot be sure, however, that these articles were written before the composition of chapter 72. The publication date of the last article, July 5, is only 5 months earlier than the publication of the full text of <u>The Desire of Ages</u>. It is more likely the series of <u>RH</u> articles were developed from materials being prepared for the <u>DA</u> text. We do know the first two articles of the series were a verbatim presentation of a text Ellen White had written a year earlier.

The reader is invited to note carefully the presentation of the source parallels which follows. Even though portions of the <u>DA</u> sentences and the associated parallels may be underlined, not every possible parallel has been so evaluated. In a number of instances Ellen White has been given full credit for the origin of the sentence even when some similarities exist between her literary expression and that of the source parallel listed. The rating of Strict Independence for Ellen White in such cases of apparent parallel constructions is intentional on our part for reasons to be given below.

We open the textual presentation with a few sentences from $3\underline{SP}$ which pick up the story at any earlier stage than does the treatment in <u>DA</u> chapter 72. These sentences from $3\underline{SP}$ also clearly indicate Ellen White was using Hanna in 1878.

3SP22/83 At length, in a voice of touching sadness, he addressed them thus: "With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer." [H/1/613] (B1)

3SP23/83 He clearly foresaw the events which were to transpire in the near future. [H/2/613] (P1)

3SP27/83 This was virtually the last passover that was ever to be celebrated; for type was to meet antitype in the slaying of the Lamb of God for the sins of the world. [H/8/613] (P2)

3SP28/83+ Christ was soon to receive his full baptism of suffering; but the few quiet hours between him and Gethsemane were to be spent for the benefit of his disciples. [H/3/613] (P2)

3SP29/84 "And he said unto them, <u>With desire I have</u> desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer; for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God. [H/10a/613] (B1)

3SP30/84 And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves; for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine, until the kingdom of God shall come. [H/10b/613] (B1)

DA1/652 "THE Lord Jesus the same night in which He was betrayed took bread: and when He had given thanks, He brake it, and said, Take, eat: this is My body, which is broken for you: this do in remembrance of Me. (B2)

1/613 It was after the strife and the feet-washing, and coincident with the circulation of the first of these passover cups, that our Lord used the words recorded in the fifteenth, sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth verses of the twenty-second chapter of St. Luke: "And he said unto them, With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer." [Hanna, LC]

2/613 <u>Clear before the Saviour's eye were</u> all the scenes <u>of</u> the impending midnight hour in the garden, the next forenoon in the judgment-hall, the afternoon upon the cross. [Hanna, LC]

8/163 He knew that this was virtually the last Jewish passover: that with the offering up of himself in the great sacrifice of the following day that long line of passover celebrations that had run now through fifteen hundred years, was to be brought to its close. [Hanna, LC]

3/613 He stood touching the very edge of these great sufferings. The baptism that he had to be baptized with was now at hand--and how was he straitened till it was accomplished!--a few quiet hours lay between him and his entrance into the cloud. [Hanna, LC]

10a/613 "With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer: for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God. [Hanna, LC]

10b/613 And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves: for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine until the kingdom of God shall come. [Hanna, LC]

DA2/652 After the same manner also He took the cup, when He had supped, saying, This cup is the new testament in My blood: this do ye, as oft as ye drink it, in remembrance of Me. (B2)

DA3/652 For as often as ye eat this bread, and drink this cup, ye do show the Lord's death till He come." 1 Cor. 11:23-26. (B2)

DA4/652 Christ was standing at the point of transition between two economies and their two great festivals. (I1)

DA5/652 He, the spotless Lamb of God, was about to present Himself as a sin offering, that He would thus bring to an end the system of types and ceremonies that for four thousand years had pointed to His death. [M/3/307] (P2)

DA6/652 As He ate the Passover with His disciples, He instituted in its place the service that was to be the memorial of His great sacrifice. [M/3,4/307] (P1)

DA7/652 The national festival of the Jews was to pass away forever. [M/3,4/307] (P2)

DA8/652 The service which Christ established was to be observed by His followers in all lands and through all ages. [M/4/307] (P1)

DA9/652 The Passover was ordained as a commemoration of the deliverance of Israel from Egyptian bondage. [P/123.2] (P1)

DA10/652 God had directed that, year by year, as the children should ask the meaning of this ordinance, the history should be repeated. (I1)

DAll/652 Thus the wonderful deliverance was to be kept fresh in the minds of all. (II)

54.9 These words mark the line of transition from the old Passover to the new; from the remembrance feast of the Exodus to that which is to keep up an unutterably more sacred memory, and to signalize deliverance from what was beyond all conception a more awful bondage. One economy was about to close; another was about to open ... [Stanford, ELM]

3/307 Just <u>about to offer himself</u>, the pure and <u>spotless</u> Lamb of God, in the great and only efficacious <u>sacrifice</u> for sin, he finishes the sacrifices of four thousand years by eating the Passover with his disciples. [March, WHJ]

4/307 In place of the national festival which the Jewish people had observed from the days of Moses, he institutes a memorial service, to be kept by his followers of every nation to the end of time. [March, WHJ]

611.3 <u>The Passover was the feast commemorative of the</u> <u>deliverance of the nation from the Egyptian bondage.</u> [Deems, WWJ]

After the Passover feast proper was ended, the 123.2 Lord took some remnant of the unleavened bread, and the cup out of which they had all been drinking, and proceeded to institute a new ordinance; which in all time should prove a blessing to true disciples, and forever commemorate the sacrifice and blessings of the true Passover. The old old passover was a memorial of Israel's deliverance from an The sacrifice of the true Passover, and earthly bondage. the memorial supper symbolizing it, brought in a redemption from sin its dread consequences. [Pentecost, and all BS(88)]

DA12/652+ The ordinance of the Lord's Supper was given to commemorate the great deliverance wrought out as the result of the death of Christ. [P/123.2] (P3)

DA13/653 Till He shall come the second time in power and glory, this ordinance is to be celebrated. (I1)

DA14/653 It is the means by which His great work for us is to be kept fresh in our minds. (I1)

DA15/653 At the time of their deliverance from Egypt, the children of Israel ate the Passover supper standing, with their loins girded, and with their staves in their hands, ready for their journey. [L/126.7] [F/568.9] (P2)

DA16/653 The manner in which they celebrated this ordinance harmonized with their condition; for they were about to be thrust out of the land of Egypt, and were to begin a painful and difficult journey through the wilderness. (I1)

DA17/653 But in Christ's time the condition of things had changed. (I1)

DA18/653 They were not now about to be thrust out of a strange country, but were dwellers in their own land. (I1)

DA19/653 In harmony with the rest that had been given them, the people then partook of the Passover supper in a reclining position. [J/342.5] (P3)

DA20/653 Couches were placed about the table, and the guests lay upon them, resting upon the left arm, and having the right hand free for use in eating. [F/561.2] (P1)

DA21/653 In this position a guest could lay his head upon the breast of the one who sat next above him. [J/342.7] (P1) 568.9 The central custom of the feast was the hasty eating of the Paschal lamb, with unleavened bread and bitter herbs, in a standing attitude, with loins girt and shoes upon the feet, as they had eaten hastily on the night of their deliverance. [Farrar, LC]

126.7 The celebrants ate it originally in travelling costume, standing, their staves in their hands. [Lange, LOLJC]

342.5 the company assembled and took their places around the table, reclining on couches, (the posture of freemen), to show that they had got out of servitude into freedom. [Jones, LSFG]

561.2 The couches or cushions, each large enough to hold three persons were placed around three sides of one or more low tables of gayly painted wood, each scarcely higher than stools... Each guest reclined at full length, leaning on his left elbow, that his right hand might be free. [Farrar, LC]

342.7 They leaned on the left arm, a cushion or bolster under the shoulder assisting to ease the posture; . . As they reclined slantingly to the table, so as to bring each man's head before the chest of the one next behind him, if the former wished to speak to the latter, especially if it was anything secret, he leaned his head back on the bosom of the other. [Jones, LSFG]

492.7 We also know, that, as the Jewish Law directed, they reclined on pillows around a low table, each resting on his left hand, so as to leave right free. [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA22/653 And the feet, being at the outer edge of the couch, could be washed by one passing around the outside of the circle. (I1)

DA23/653 Christ is still at the table on which the paschal supper has been spread. (I1)

DA24/653 The unleavened cakes used at the Passover season are before Him. (I1)

DA25/653 The Passover wine, untouched by fermentation, is on the table. (II)

DA26/653 These emblems Christ employs to represent His own unblemished sacrifice. (II)

DA27/653 Nothing corrupted by fermentation, the symbol of sin and death, could represent the "Lamb without blemish and without spot." 1 Peter 1:19. (I1)

DA28/653 "And as they were eating, Jesus took bread, and blessed it, and brake it, and gave it to the disciples, and said, Take, eat; this is My body. (B2)

DA29/653 And He took the cup, and gave thanks, and gave it to them, saying, Drink ye all of it; for this is My blood of the new testament, which is shed for many for the remission of sins. (B2)

DA30/653 But I say unto you, I will not drink henceforth of this fruit of the vine, until that day when I drink it new with you in My Father's kingdom." (B2)

DA31/653 Judas the betrayer was present at the sacramental service. (I1)

DA32/653 He received from Jesus the emblems of His broken body and His spilled blood. (I1)

DA33/653 He heard the words, "This do in remembrance of Me." (I1)

DA34/653 And sitting there in the very presence of the Lamb of God, the betrayer brooded upon his own dark purposes, and cherished his sullen, revengeful thoughts. (I1)

DA35/653 At the feet washing, Christ had given convincing proof that He understood the character of Judas. (11)

DA36/653+ "Ye are not all clean" (John 13:11), He said. (B2)

DA37/654 These words convinced the false disciple that Christ read his secret purpose. (II)

DA38/654 Now Christ spoke out more plainly. (II)

DA39/654 As they were seated at the table He said, looking upon His disciples, "I speak not of you all: I know whom I have chosen: but that the scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with Me hath lifted up his heel against Me." (B2)

DA40/654 Even now the disciples did not suspect Judas. [H/33/615] (P2)

DA41/654 But they saw that Christ appeared greatly troubled. [H/16/614] (P2)

DA42/654 A cloud settled over them all, a premonition of some dreadful calamity, the nature of which they did not understand. [H/16/614] (I2)

DA43/654 As they ate in silence, Jesus said, "Verily I say unto you, that one of you shall betray Me." [H/19,20/614] (P2)

33/615 He had returned look for look, as they at first scanned each other; no face calmer or less confused; no one suspecting Judas. [Hanna, LC]

16/614 When the washing of the feet was over, and Jesus sat down, and the repast began, they all noticed that there was a cloud upon their Master's countenance, and the disciple who, sitting next to him could best read the expression of his face, saw that he "was troubled in spirit." [Hanna, LC]

712.8 The supper now began, but the spirit of Jesus was still clouded and troubled by the presence of the traitor. [Geikie, LC]

19,20/614 Christ breaks the silence into which, in the sadness of his spirit, he had fallen; he speaks in tone and manner quite different from those of his ordinary colloquial address. And he "testified and said, Verily, verily I say unto you, that one of you which eateth with me shall betray me!" [Hanna, LC]

DA44/654 At these words amazement and consternation seized them. (I1)

DA45/654 They could not comprehend how any one of them could deal treacherously with their divine Teacher. (I1)

DA46/654 For what cause could they betray Him? and to whom? [H/21,22/614] (P1)

DA47/654 Whose heart could give birth to such a design? (II)

1

DA48/654 Surely not one of the favored twelve, who had been privileged above all others to hear His teachings, who had shared his wonderful love, and for whom He had shown such great regard by bringing them into close communion with Himself1 [H/23/614] (P2)

DA49/654 As they realized the import of His words, and remembered how true His sayings were, fear and self-distrust seized them. [H/29/614] (I2)

DA50/654 They began to search their own hearts to see if one thought against their Master were harbored there. [P/121.9] (P2)

DA51/654 With the most painful emotion, one after another inquired, "Lord, is it I?" [G/713.1] (P2)

DA52/654 But Judas sat silent. (II)

DA53/654 John in deep distress at last inquired, "Lord, who is it?" (I1)

21,22,/614 <u>Betray him!</u> how? for what? to what? Betray such a Master at such a time! [Hanna, LC]

23/614 Bad enough for any common disciple to use the means and opportunities that acquaintance gave to effect his ruin; but for one of them, his own familiar friends, whom he has drawn so closely round his person, upon whom he has lavished such affection--for one of those admitted to this most sacred of meals, the holiest seal of the nearest earthly bond; for one of the twelve to betray him! [Hanna, LC]

29/614 there is none so bold and over-confident, not even Peter, as at once to think and say of himself that there was no possibililty it could be he, <u>but that all, not</u> without some secret wonder and <u>self-distrust</u>, put in turn the question, "Lord, is it I?" [Hanna, LC]

121.9 Overwhelmed with the shame of this thing which the Lord had spoken, and not knowing who it was of them, they each for himself began to question his own heart. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

713.1 One by one, they began to ask, "Lord, is it I?" "It is one," replied Jesus, "who dips with me into the dish. . . . Words thus general only increased the pain and emotion of all. [Geikie, LC]

DA54/654 And Jesus answered, "He that dippeth his hand with Me in the dish, the same shall betray Me. (B2)

DA55/654 The Son of man goeth as it is written of Him: but woe unto that man by whom the Son of man is betrayed! it had been good for that man if he had not been born." (B2)

DA56/654 The disciples had searched one another's faces closely as they asked, "Lord, is it I?" [H/24/614] (P2)

DA57/654 And now the silence of Judas drew all eyes to him. (11)

DA58/654 Amid the confusion of questions and expressions of astonishment, Judas had not heard the words of Jesus in answer to John's question. (I1)

DA59/654 But now, to escape the scrutiny of the disciples, he asked as they had done, "Master, is it I?" (II)

DA60/654 Jesus solemnly replied, "Thou hast said." (B2)

DA61/654 In surprise and confusion at the exposure of his purpose, Judas rose hastily to leave the room. (II)

DA62/654 "Then said Jesus unto him, That thou doest, do quickly... (B2)

DA63/654 He then having received the sop went immediately out: and it was night" (B2)

DA64/654 Night it was to the traitor as he turned away from Christ into the outer darkness. [H/56/616] (P2)

DA65/654 Until this step was taken, Judas had not passed beyond the possibility of repentance. (II)

24/614 they...look "one on another, doubting of whom he spake"--fixing searching looks on all around, to see whether any countenance showed the confusion of felt guilt, etc. [Hanna, LC]

54,55,56/616 "That thou doest," said Jesus to him, "do quickly." He arose and went out immediately; and it was night. And into that night he went carrying a blacker night within his own dark breast. [Hanna, LC]

506

DA66/654+ But when he left the presence of his Lord and his fellow disciples, the final decision had been made. (II)

DA67/655 He had passed the boundary line. [P/155.9] (P1)

DA68/655 Wonderful had been the long-suffering of Jesus in His dealing with this tempted soul. (II)

DA69/655 Nothing that could be done to save Judas had been left undone. (I1)

 $\vec{s_{z}}$

DA70/655 After he had twice covenanted to betray his Lord, Jesus still gave him opportunity for repentance. [H/89/618] (12)

DA71/655 By reading the secret purpose of the traitor's heart, Christ gave to Judas the final, convincing evidence of His divinity. (I1)

DA72/655 This was to the false disciple the last call to repentance. [H/89/618] (P1)

DA73/655 No appeal that the divine-human heart of Christ could make had been spared. (I1)

DA74/655 The waves of mercy, beaten back by stubborn pride, returned in a stronger tide of subduing love. (I1)

DA75/655 But although surprised and alarmed at the discovery of his guilt, Judas became only the more determined. [H/90/618] (P3)

DA76/655 From the sacramental supper he went out to complete the work of betrayal. (I1)

DA77/655 In pronouncing the woe upon Judas, Christ also had a purpose of mercy toward His disciples. (II)

155.9 <u>Satan now entered into Judas' heart, and the case was</u> past redemption. [Pentecost, BS(89)]

89/618 That in dealing with him as he did in the guestchamber, he was giving him another and last opportunity of repentance I do most thoroughly believe. [Hanna, LC]

90/618 That a purpose of mercy lay embedded in our Lord's treatment of Judas is not disproved by the fact, that instead of working anything like repentance, it stirred up the malicious feelings to an intenser activity. [Hanna, LC]

507

.

DA78/655 He thus gave them the crowning evidence of His Messiahship. [H/64/616] (P1)

DA79/655 "I tell you before it come," He said, "that, when it is come to pass, ye may believe that I AM." [H/65/616] (I2)

DA80/655 Had Jesus remained silent, in apparent ignorance of what was to come upon Him, the disciples might have thought that their Master had not divine foresight, and had been surprised and betrayed into the hands of the murderous mob. [H/67/616+] (P1)

DA81/655 <u>A year before, Jesus had told the disciples that</u> <u>He had chosen twelve, and that one was a devil</u>. [H/71/617] (P1)

DA82/655 Now His words to Judas, showing that his treachery was fully known to his Master, would strengthen the faith of Christ's true followers during His humiliation. [H/71/617] (12)

DA83/655 And when Judas should have come to his dreadful end, they would remember the woe that Jesus had pronounced upon the betrayer. (I1)

3SP73/87 The withdrawal of Judas was a relief to all present. (I1)

3SP74/87 The Saviour's face lighted immediately, and the oppressive shadow was lifted from the disciples, as they saw the peace of Heaven return to the pale, worn countenance of their Lord. [M/8/308] (P2)

DA84/655 And the Saviour had still another purpose. (I1)

DA85/655 He had not withheld His ministry from him whom He knew to be a traitor. (I1)

64/616 We have Christ's own authority for saying that one of his reasons for acting as he did towards Judas was to afford to the other apostles an evidence of his Messiahship. [Hanna, LC]

65/616 "I speak not of you all," he had said; "I know whom I have chosen: but that the Scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with me hath lifted up his heel against me. Now I tell you before it come, that, when it is come to pass, ye may believe that I am he." [Hanna, LC]

67/616+ Had nothing been said beforehand by Jesus, had everything run the course it did, their Master remaining apparently in profound ignorance of how his arrest in the garden was to be brought about, then to the apostles' eyes this mystery would have hung around the whole procedure: that Jesus had been deceived, had suffered a traitor to enter unknown and undetected into the innermost circle of his friends; [Hanna, LC]

71/617 Yet when all is over, and they recall what their Master had said a year before his death, that one of them was a devil, and remember especially the sayings of the guest-chamber, how vividly would the conviction come home to the minds of the apostles, that they had to do with one from whom no secrets were hidden, before whose all-seeing eye every heart lay naked and bare! [Hanna, LC]

8/308 No sooner has the dark shadow of the traitor's presence left the room, than the troubled cloud passes from the face of Jesus and he turns to his remaining disciples with the light of heaven in his look. [March WHJ]

DA86/655 The disciples did not understand His words when He said at the feet washing, "Ye are not all clean," nor yet when at the table He declared, "He that eateth bread with Me hath lifted up his heel against Me." John 13:11, 18. (II)

DA87/655 But afterward, when His meaning was made plain, they had something to consider as to the patience and mercy of God toward the most grievously erring. (I1)

DA88/655 Though Jesus knew Judas from the beginning, He washed his feet. (I1)

DA89/655 And the betrayer was privileged to unite with Christ in partaking of the sacrament. (I1)

DA90/655 A long-suffering Saviour held out every inducement for the sinner to receive him, to repent, and to be cleansed from the defilement of sin. (I1)

DA91/655 This example is for us. (I1)

DA92/655 When we suppose one to be in error and sin, we are not to divorce ourselves from him. (I1)

DA93/655+ By no careless separation are we to leave him a prey to temptation, or drive him upon Satan's battleground. (I1)

DA94/656 This is not Christ's method. (I1)

DA95/656 It was because the disciples were erring and faulty that He washed their feet, and all but one of the twelve were thus brought to repentance. (I1)

DA96/656 Christ's example forbids exclusiveness at the Lord's Supper. (I1)

DA97/656 It is true that open sin excludes the guilty. (I1)

509

,

-

DA98/656 This the Holy Spirit plainly teaches. 1 Cor. 5:11. (II)

DA99/656 But beyond this none are to pass judgment. [C/35.4] (P1)

DA100/656 God has not left it with men to say who shall present themselves on these occasions. (I1)

DA101/656 For who can read the heart? (I1)

DA102/656 Who can distinguish the tares from the wheat? [C/35.4] (P1)

DA103/656 "Let a man examine himself, and so let him eat of that bread, and drink of that cup." (B2)

DA104/656 For "whosoever shall eat this bread, and drink this cup of the Lord, unworthily, shall be guilty of the body and blood of the Lord." (B2)

DA105/656 "He that eateth and drinketh unworthily, eateth and drinketh damnation to himself, not discerning the Lord's body." 1 Cor. 11:28, 27, 29. (B2)

DA106/656 When believers assemble to celebrate the ordinances, there are present messengers unseen by human eyes. (I1)

DA107/656 There may be a Judas in the company, and if so, messengers from the prince of darkness are there, for they attend all who refuse to be controlled by the holy Spirit. (I1)

DA108/656 Heavenly angels also are present. (I1)

DA109/656 These unseen visitants are present on every such occasion. (I1)

35.44 <u>Surely there is here a striking precedent for us to</u> <u>imitate;</u> and yet one that is most difficult to imitate. . <u>Our Lord has set us the example of judging men, not by our</u> <u>suspicions or our construction, but by their deeds;</u> . . Those at a communion table are just like those who stand at the baptismal font, or who make profession of the truths of the everlasting Gospel--a mixed body. The visible Church is not to be in this dispensation co-extensive with the spiritual and true Church. The tares and the wheat are so mingled together, that if men attempted to separate they are sure to do mischief; our Lord did not weed the first communion. [Cumming, MW(3)]

DAll0/656 There may come into the company persons who are not in heart servants of truth and holiness, but who may wish to take part in the service. (I1)

DA111/656 They should not be forbidden. (I1)

DA112/656 There are witnesses present who were present when Jesus washed the feet of the disciples and of Judas. (I1)

DA113/656 More than human eyes beheld the scene. (I1)

DAll4/656 Christ by the Holy Spirit is there to set the seal to His own ordinance. (II)

DA115/656 He is there to convict and soften the heart. (I1)

DA116/656 Not a look, not a thought of contrition, escapes His notice. (I1)

DA117/656 For the repentant, brokenhearted one He is waiting. (I1)

DA118/656 All things are ready for that soul's reception. (I1)

DA119/656 He who washed the feet of Judas longs to wash every heart from the stain of sin. (I1)

DA120/656 None should exclude themselves from the Communion because some who are unworthy may be present. (I1)

DA121/656 Every disciple is called upon to participate publicly, and thus bear witness that he accepts Christ as a personal Saviour. (I1)

DA122/656 It is at these, His own appointments, that Christ meets His people, and energizes them by His presence. (I1)

٠

.

.

.

.

~

~

DA123/656 Hearts and hands that are unworthy may even administer the ordinance, yet Christ is there to minister to His children. (I1)

DA124/656 All who come with their faith fixed upon him will be greatly blessed. (II)

DA125/656 All who neglect these seasons of divine privilege will suffer loss. (II)

DA126/656 Of them it may appropriately be said, "Ye are not all clean." (II)

DA127/656+ In partaking with His disciples of the bread and wine, Christ pledged Himself to them as their Redeemer. (I1)

DA128/659 He committed to them the new covenant, by which all who receive Him become children of God, and joint heirs with Christ. (I1)

DA129/659 By this covenant every blessing that heaven could bestow for this life and the life to come was theirs. (Il)

DA130/659 This covenant deed was to be ratified with the blood of Christ. (II)

DA131/659 And the administration of the Sacrament was to keep before the disciples the infinite sacrifice made for each of them individually as a part of the great whole of fallen humanity. (II)

DA132/659 But the Communion service was not to be a season of sorrowing. (I1)

DA133/659 This was not its purpose. (I1)

DA134/659 As the Lord's disciples gather about His table, they are not to remember and lament their shortcomings. [B/565.1] (P2)

ĸ

.

RH(97)65 We do not come to the ordinances of the Lord's house merely as a form. [B/565.1] (P2)

RH(97)66 We do not make it our business, as we gather around the table of our Lord, to ponder about and mourn over our shortcomings. [B/565.1] (P1)

DA135/659 They are not to dwell upon their past religious experience, whether that experience has been elevating or depressing. [B/565.1] (P2)

RH(97)69					e wi				
diverted	to	Où.	r pa	st	experi	ienc	e i	n t	the
religious	1i1	fe,	whet	her	that	exp	erie	nce	is
elevating	ord	lepr	essin	g. [B/565	.1]	(P1)	

DA136/659 They are not to recall the differences between them and their brethren. [B/565.1] (I2)

RH(97)70	Wě do not co	me to revive in our	
		e have received at	
the hands o	of our brethren.	[B/565.1] (12)	-

DA137/659 The preparatory service has embraced all this. (I1)

DA138/659 The self-examination, the confession of sin, the reconciling of differences, has all been done. (I1)

DA139/659 Now they come to meet with Christ. [B/565.1] (P2)

> RH(97)72 We have assembled now to meet with Jesus Christ, to commune with him. [B/565.1] (P1)

> RH(97)73 Every heart is to be open to the bright beams of the Son of Righteousness. [B/565.1] (I2)

RH(97)74	<u>Our minds</u>	and hearts	are to be	fixed
on Christ	t as the	great cent	er on whom	our
hopes of a	eternal li	fe depend.	[B/565.1]	(12)

565.1 We do not come there to perform a church ceremony. We do not come to dwell upon our own feelings, emotions and shortcomings, for that would be to remember ourselves rather than Jesus. We do not come to think over our past experiences of religion, however good these may have been, for that would be to remember only our past remembrances of Jesus. We come not to think of the faults of our brethren, for there every heart should be brimming over with love. We are to meet with Jesus in the midst, upon whom all hearts are to be fixed, [Boyd, WH] DA140/659 They are not to stand in the shadow of the cross, but in its saving light. (I1)

DA141/659 They are to open the soul to the bright beams of the Sun of Righteousness. (I1)

DA142/659 With hearts cleansed by Christ's most precious blood, in full consciousness of His presence, although unseen, they are to hear His words, "Peace I leave with you, My peace I give unto you: not as the world giveth, give I unto you." John 14:27. (II)

DA143/659 Our Lord says, Under conviction of sin, remember that I died for you. [B/566.2] (P1)

DA144/659 When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for My sake and the gospel's, remember My love, so great that for you I gave My life. [B/566.2] (P2)

> RH(97)92 When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for my sake and the gospel's, remember that my love was so great that I gave my life for you. [B/566.2] (P2)

DA145/659 When your duties appear stern and severe, and your burdens too heavy to bear, remember that for your sake I endured the cross, despising the shame. [B/566.2] (P1)

DA146/659 When your heart shrinks from the trying ordeal, remember that your Redeemer liveth to make intercession for you. [B/566.2] (12)

DA147/659 The Communion service points to Christ's second coming. (I1)

DA148/659 It was designed to keep this hope vivid in the minds of the disciples. (I1)

DA149/659 Whenever they met together to commemorate His death, they recounted how "He took the cup, and gave thanks, and gave it to them, saying, Drink ye all of it; for this is My blood of the new testament, which is shed for many for the remission of sins. (B2)

566.2 ... he has instituted outward tokens of his love, ... saying "Remember me. Under a consciousness of guilt, remember I died for you. In the furnace of affliction, remember I am with you. When under the sifting power of Satan's temptations, remember I am praying for you. When duties stern and severe are laid upon you, and you are ready to shrink from the cross, remember that for you I endured the Cross and despised the shame." And when death comes to clasp you in his skeleton arms, and when heart and flesh fail, and nature shrinks back in dismay, remember that your Redeemer liveth. [Boyd, WH]

DA150/659 But I say unto you, I will not drink henceforth of this fruit of the vine, until that day when I drink it new with you in My Father's kingdom." (B2)

DA151/659 In their tribulation they found comfort in the hope of their Lord's return. (II)

DA152/659 Unspeakably precious to them was the thought, "As often as ye eat this bread, and drink this cup, ye do show the Lord's death till He come." 1 Cor. 11:26. (B2)

DA153/660 These are the things we are never to forget. (I1)

DA154/660 The love of Jesus, with its constraining power, is to be kept fresh in our memory. (I1)

DA155/660 Christ has instituted this service that it may speak to our senses of the love of God that has been expressed in our behalf. (I1)

DA156/660 There can be no union between our souls and God except through Christ. (I1)

DA157/660 The union and love between brother and brother must be cemented and rendered eternal by the love of Jesus. (I1)

DA158/660 And nothing less than the death of Christ could make His love efficacious for us. (II)

DA159/660 It is only because of His death that we can look with joy to His second coming. (I1)

· · · · · · · · · · · ·

133.6 In condescension to human weakness, our Savior was pleased to ordain in his Church a perpetual institution that should set forth to the senses of men the one great event on which, and on their right apprehension and use of it, their salvation should depend. [Olin, W]

134.8 <u>Addressed to the senses</u>, and appealing strongly to the imagination and the heart, this impressive rite, etc. [Olin, W]

140.7 With similar vivacity and impressiveness does it symbolize the intimacy of the believer's union with Christ. [Olin, W]

141.3 This act of communion inculcates, with no less emphasis, the intimate union of Christians with each other. They are together brought into contact with their common Savior. [Olin, W]

the second

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA160/660 His sacrifice is the center of our hope. (I1)

DA161/660 Upon this we must fix our faith. (I1)

DA162/660 The ordinances that point to our Lord's humiliation and suffering are regarded too much as a form. (I1)

DA163/660 They were instituted for a purpose. (I1)

DA164/660 Our senses need to be quickened to lay hold of the mystery of godliness. (I1)

DA165/660 It is the privilege of all to comprehend, far more than we do, the explatory sufferings of Christ. (II)

DA166/660 "As Moses lifted up the serpent in the wilderness," even so has the Son of man been lifted up, "that whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have eternal life." John 3:14, 15. (B2)

DA167/660 To the cross of Calvary, bearing a dying Saviour, we must look. (II)

DA168/660 Our eternal interests demand that we show faith in Christ. (II)

DA169/660 Our Lord has said, "Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of man, and drink His blood, ye have no life in you. . . (B2)

DA170/660 For My flesh is meat indeed, and My blood is drink indeed." John 6:53-55. (B2)

DA171/660 This is true of our physical nature. (I1)

DA172/660 To the death of Christ we owe even this earthly life. (I1)

.

.

• .

.

· · · · ·

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA173/660 The bread we eat is the purchase of His broken body. (II)

DA174/660 The water we drink is bought by His spilled blood. (I1)

DA175/660 Never one, saint or sinner, eats his daily food, but he is nourished by the body and the blood of Christ. (I1)

DA175/660 The cross of Calvary is stamped on every loaf. (11)

DA176/660 It is reflected in every water spring. (II)

DA177/660 All this Christ has taught in appointing the emblems of His great sacrifice. (Il)

DA178/660 The light shining from that Communion service in the upper chamber makes sacred the provisions for our daily life. (II)

DA179/660 The family board becomes as the table of the Lord, and every meal a sacrament. (I1)

DA180/660 And how much more are Christ's words true of our spiritual nature. (II)

DA181/660 He declares, "Whoso eateth My flesh, and drinketh My blood, hath eternal life." (B2)

DA182/660 It is by receiving the life for us poured out on Calvary's cross, that we can live the life of holiness. (I1)

DA183/660 And this life we receive by receiving His word, by doing those things which He has commanded. (II)

DA184/660 Thus we become one with Him. (I1)

440.75 His people are to turn every act into devotion; to make every meal sacramental, a token and pledge of infinite love. [Harris, GT]

111.9+ He eats his flesh and drinks his blood, believing on an incarnate Saviour, he makes his atoning sacrifice the food of his soul: resorting to that as the support of his hope, as he does to daily food for the support of his body. He enjoys the communion of his body and of his blood, when he receives the Lord's supper. . . Believers are thus one with Christ, and with each other, as the bread, though distributed, is part of one loaf. [Bickersteth, SH] The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA185/660 "He that eateth My flesh," He says, "and drinketh My blood, dwelleth in Me, and I in him. (B2)

DA186/660+ As the living Father hath sent Me, and I live by the Father: so he that eateth Me, even he shall live by Me." John 6:54, 56, 57. (B2)

DA187/661 To the holy Communion this scripture in a special sense applies. (II)

DA188/661 As faith contemplates our Lord's great sacrifice, the soul assimilates the spiritual <u>life of Christ</u>. (II)

DA189/661 That soul will receive spiritual strength from every Communion. (II)

DA190/661 The service forms a living connection by which the believer is bound up with Christ and thus bound up with the Father. (I1)

DA191/661 In a special sense it forms a connection between dependent human beings and God. (I1)

DA192/661 As we receive the bread and wine symbolizing Christ's broken body and spilled blood, we in imagination join in the scene of Communion in the upper chamber. (I1)

DA193/661 We seem to be passing through the garden consecrated by the agony of Him who bore the sins of the world. (I1)

DA194/661 <u>We witness the struggle by which our</u> reconciliation with God was obtained. (I1)

DA195/661 Christ is set forth crucified among us. (I1)

123.6 We eat the flesh of the Son of Man, and drink his blood; <u>assimilate his life</u> and righteousness, even as we eat the bread of corn, and assimilate it for our life and strength by the natural process of alimentation. [Pentecost, BS(88)

149a.8 If we can but exercise faith in this great ordinance, these things will be really present to us. There we shall see Christ crucified before our eyes; yea, and crucified as truly and really to our faith, as ever he was to the sense of others. Our faith can carry us into the garden, and make us watch with him in his agony, and observe every drop of blood that the sense of his Father's wrath strained through him. [Ezekiel Hopkins, WW] The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA196/661 Looking upon the crucified Redeemer, we more fully comprehend the magnitude and meaning of the sacrifice made by the Majesty of heaven. (I1)

DA197/661 The plan of salvation is glorified before us, and the thought of Calvary awakens living and sacred emotions in our hearts. (I1)

DA198/661 Praise to God and the Lamb will be in our hearts and on our lips; for pride and self-worship cannot flourish in the soul that keeps fresh in memory the scenes of Calvary. (I1)

DA199/661 He who beholds the Saviour's matchless love will be elevated in thought, purified in heart, transformed in character. (I1)

DA200/661 He will go forth to be a light to the world, to reflect in some degree this mysterious love. (I1)

DA201/661 The more we contemplate the cross of Christ, the more fully shall we adopt the language of the apostle when he said, "God forbid that I should glory, save in the cross of our Lord Jesus Christ, by whom the world is crucified unto me, and I unto the world." Gal. 6:14. (11)

4

519

`.

· .

Analysis

The analysis of chapter 72 has proven to be more difficult than any of the preceding chapters. The complications have arisen from two factors. On the one hand there is the special nature of the content and on the other we have the way in which Ellen White has handled the material.

In terms of the former, the story of the Last Supper is part of the Passion Week. This part of the gospel story is the most important section. All four evangelists report the events of this special week in which Christ was crucified. So many of the other incidents in the life of Jesus point forward to the cross event. In the words and actions of Jesus during the last week of His life and ministry leading to the cross are to be found the very essence of the gospel story. The themes of this special week in the life of Jesus have been at the center of countless sermons, devotions, and books. And in the series of events which transpired from Palm Sunday till the death of Christ on Good Friday, none captures the imagination or speaks to the meaning of the cross event as does this last supper, the inauguration of what all Christians since the cross refer to as the Lord's Communion.

This particular incident in the week of special events is not like the birth or death of Christ celebrated in the liturgy of the church once a year. The communion celebration is repeated in the Christian church daily,

weekly, and in some churches only slightly less frequently. homilies, spiritual lessons, practical Countless devotional meditations have exhortations, and been developed, repeated, recorded, and published on the meaning of this Christian worship service and experience. It is the one Christian devotional experience where the senses of taste and smell are added to those of sight, hearing, and touch, thus affording the opportunity for full participation of the mind, body, and soul in the worship of the Lord.

The countless repetitions, the accumulated memories, the familiar hymns, and the multiple experiences in every Christian's life have combined to produce such a common stock of phrases and of interpretations that it becomes hardly possible to isolate any words or expressions in terms of originality or dependence.

Apart from the lives of Christ Ellen White had read, each one covering this topic as part of the complete story, we have no idea of the devotional works which would have caught her eye through the years. But we must also bear in mind the many communion services she would have attended and the messages she would have heard on the topic of our chapter.

We did not include many devotional books in our survey of possible sources and neither did we survey Adventist writers for articles on this or any other topic covered in the 15 chapters of our study. The content of this particular chapter would make a likely subject for comparing

the remarks of Ellen White with Adventist writers in a search for literary parallels.¹ But this provocative possibility lies too far beyond the limits of the investigation for us to explore for this report.

The veritable plethora of texts on a topic so well known to Christians and particularly to so devotional a Christian as Ellen White did not only raise problems for evaluation of Ellen White's literary dependency; it also raised havoc in identifying the source of the dependency. We found so much duplication of literary expression among the writers we were not always sure as to the one source she was using, if indeed she was borrowing in an instance of a given parallel. The writers exhibiting such parallels among themselves did not always identify their sources.

Once again we are driven to raise the fundamental question that lies at the base of this study, though not directly addressed in this research. What were the literary conventions followed by Seventh-day Adventists and other Christian writers of the nineteenth century in their use of religious literary sources, particularly in the area of devotional comment? It would appear that a comparison of devotional works on the subject of the communion service might be useful in establishing a nineteenth century model

¹Ellen White admitted to the use of other SDA writers in the introduction to the 1911 edition of <u>The Great</u> <u>Controversy</u>. This dependency of Ellen White on Adventist writers has been demonstrated by Don McAdams, Ron Graybill, and Walter Rea. See Introduction, Part I, above for details.

for what is permitted by common consent and what would be unacceptable and understood as plagiarism.

In addition to these problems relating to the content of this chapter, the evaluation process had to struggle with Ellen White's treatment of the subject matter.

To the best of our knowledge, apart from a few isolated comments, her previous writings on the Lord's Supper may be found in four texts. We have provided in Table A, pages 524-526, a list of the sentences in these documents which parallel the DA text. We do not claim that we have listed all the possible parallels. There are at times three variations of a given sentence. Some sentences while on the same thought are so different in expression we could not be sure we had a parallel. In other cases there appeared to be duplication of a given thought and/or expression in the same article. We do feel, nevertheless, that we have listed most of the more obvious parallels. In the table the numbers on left merely indicate the entry number(s) in the far identify a These numbers can be used to sequence. particular parallel since not every DA sentence has a separate entry. Some sentences are combined. The table has five major columns, the earliest being the list of sentences from The Spirit of Prophecy, III, dated 1878. Manuscript 35, dated April 6, 1897, follows in the second column, and the relevant portion of Manuscript 47, 1897, is represented in column three. Column four lists the sentences for The Review and Herald article under date of June 22, 1897, and

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 72

(EXCLUDES ISOLATED SENTENCES)

	3SP	MS 35/1897	<u>MS 47/97</u>	RH 6/22/97	DA 72
001		1-10 Lk 22			
002		11	<u></u>	1	<u></u>
003			- <u></u>	• <u>.</u>	1-3 1Cor.11
004		13		3	1 0 1001011
005		14		4	(4)*
006				·	5
007		12		2	(6)
008		15		5	(7,8)
009	225.7			·	(9)
010		First and La	st Passovers	Compared	10-23
011		Non-Fermenta			24-27
012		16 Lk 22	······	6	(28) Mt.26
013		17 Lk 22	- <u>-</u>	7	(29) Mt.26
014		18 Lk 22		8	
015		19 Lk 22		9	
016		20 Jn 13		10	
017			<u></u>		30 Mt. 26
018		21		11	(31, 32)
019		Judas and Ch	rist's Predi	ction of His	33-40
		Betrayal			
020	42				(41)
021	43				42
022	44		······································		43
023	45			• _ 	(44)
024	46				45
025	47			·	46
026	48				47
027	49				(48)
028	50				(49)
029	51		<u>-</u>		(50)
030	52 53				$\frac{(51)}{52}$
031 032	<u> </u>				(53)
032	<u> </u>				54
034	55	······································		•	55
035					56
036	56		<u></u>		(57)
037	57	ب بندین هود می کندان و _کر بر بن		· <u></u>	(58)
038 "	58				(59)
039	59			····	(60)
040	60			•	$\overline{(61)}$
-					<u> </u>

*The parentheses indicate some modification of the text over the previous text form(s).

TABLE A - CHAPTER 72 (Continued)

.....

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>MS 35/1897</u>	<u>MS 47/97</u>	RH 6/22/97	DA 72
041	60	-			(62)
042		22		12	(02)
043		24		$\frac{12}{14}$	······································
044		25		15	•
045				<u>_</u>	63
046		·		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	64
047		26		16	(65)
048		27		17	(66,67)
049	61	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(68)
050				. 	69
051	62	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· ····································	(70)
052	63	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			$\frac{(70)}{(71)}$
053. – -	63			· ····································	$\frac{(1)}{(72)}$
054		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		· ····································	73
055		· ····		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	74
056	64,65			· ····································	$\frac{7}{(75)}$
057	66	23		13	$\frac{(75)}{(76)}$
058. – 1	67			. <u></u>	(77)
059	67	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· ····································	(78)
060	68	· ····			(10)
061	69	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			79
062	70	•		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(80)
063	71a	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			81
064	71b	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		***************************************	(82)
065	72	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •			83
066. – -	73-76	. <u> </u>	······································		
067	<u></u>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			84-87
068. – 1		65,66	24		88
069. – -		·	25		(89)
070. – -		Christ's Met	hod our Exam	ple	90-95
071		42	(26a)	(21)	(96)
072. – -		Open Sin Exc	ludes Partic		97-99
073		70			(100)
074. – [68	(26b)	38	(101)
075. – -		67	(27)		(102)
076		143	1 Cor. 11:20	8, 27, 29	103-105
077. – 🗍		·	28		(106)
078. – 🗍			29	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(107)
079. –]		· · ··································	30	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(108)
080. – [31,32	<u> </u>		
081. –]		33			(109)
082. –]		64	34		(110)
083. –]		64	35		(111)
084. – –			36		(112)
085. –]			37		113
086. – _		72		42	(114)

TABLE A - CHAPTER 72 (Continued)

•

.

	<u>3SP</u>	MS 35/1897	MS 47/97	RH 6/22/97	DA 72
087		73		43	115
088				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	116-119
089		69		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	120
090		43		(22)	$\frac{120}{(121)}$
091		79		(49)	$\frac{1}{(122)}$
092		80	······	(50)	(123)
093				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(124)
094					125,126
095		28		(18a)	(127)
096		28		(18b)	(128)
097		28		(18c)	(129)
098		29		(19)	(130)
099		<u>30-40 - Heb.</u>	10:1-12		
100		41			131,132,133
101		$\frac{113}{116}$		(66)	(134)
102		110		(69)	(135)
103		<u> </u>		(70) 67	$\frac{(136)}{(137)}$
105	<u> </u>	45-53 Jn 13		07	(137)
106		54-55 Feet Wa	shing		
107		56-60 Jn 13			
108					138
109		61-63 Lessons	From Feet	Washing	
110		119		(72)	(139)
111				75	(140)
112		120		(73)	(141)
113		121		(74)	
114		123		(76)	(142)
115				91	(143)
116				92	(144)
117		159		94	(145)
118	······································			95	(146)
119		Service Point	ts to 2na Ad		147-152
120		135			(153)
122		135		82	$\frac{(154)}{(155)}$
123		126			$\frac{(155)}{(156)}$
124		127			$\frac{(150)}{(157)}$
125					158-160
126		146			$\frac{100}{(161)}$
127		76	·	(46)	$\frac{(162)}{(162)}$
128		169			$\frac{1}{(163)}$
129		The Suffering	s of Christ		164-167
	"Eat the	Flesh" and "I	rink the Blo	"	168-182
131				99	(183)
		e With Christ		ner	184-192
133. – <u>Co</u>	ntemplati	ng the Cross c	ot Christ		193-201

ć

the last column against the right margin holds the sentences from the DA text.

At times the <u>DA</u> text will be identical with Manuscript 35. In certain instances it will agree with the <u>Review</u> article. Sometimes all three of these texts will agree and at other times the <u>DA</u> text will stand alone.

The reader will note that in no instance do we have a parallel among all five texts. The <u>3SP</u> text usually stands alone with the DA text as does also Manuscript 47.

It does seem clear that for a good number of parallels the Review text and that of DA were derived from the earlier Manuscript 35.1 When we also take into consideration that Manuscript 35, 1897, was virtually reproduced in published form as parts I and II of the six-part series on "The Lord's Supper and the Ordinance of Feet-Washing," in RH of May 31 and June 7, 1898, we have three differing published versions of the same manuscript content. As we have argued earlier, it should be obvious from this evidence that neither Ellen White nor her literary assistants believed in verbal inspiration. We have provided the full text of the four documents compared in Table A and of the two Review articles where Manuscript 35 appears in published form in Appendix D. The reader may check our parallels as listed by comparing the numbered sentences of the texts given in Appendix D with the DA sentences as listed above in the text presentation for this chapter.

¹From our research and that of the White Estate office

There are two additional characteristics of Ellen White's commentary which we should mention before turning to source analysis.

Thus far in our study we have found Ellen White to exhibit greater literary independence in her discursive material than where she is being descriptive. The content of this chapter lends itself more readily to discursive comments. More than 50 percent of the textual presentation of the Lord's Supper in Matthew, Mark, and Luke and about 40 percent of John's account consists of sayings of Jesus. And Jesus is talking about the meaning of this occasion. We can therefore expect a good deal of Ellen White's devotional, spiritual, and theological commentary in this chapter. The nature of the content agrees with the genre of literature Ellen White most often composed.

Finally, we had difficulty in isolating Ellen White's comments on the Lord's Supper, which is the subject of chapter 72, from her remarks on the feet-washing service, the topic of chapter 71 of the <u>DA</u> text. The <u>SP</u> text covers both incidents in the chapter entitled "The Passover." Manuscript 35 and the <u>RH</u> article of June 22, 1897, also treat both ordinances. The six-part series in the <u>RH</u> of 1898, which we are viewing as post-<u>DA</u> articles, also addresses both services.

feet-washing and communion services may account for some of the duplication evident in this chapter. Compare "to be kept fresh in the minds of all" in DAll/652 with "to be kept fresh in our minds" of DAl4/652 and "to be kept fresh in our memory" of DAl54/660. Another incidence of duplication occurs between DA31-32/653 and DA89/655.

It was natural for Ellen White to handle the two incidents together since as an Adventist she celebrated both ordinances each time she participated in the communion. And although the feet-washing is not recorded in the gospels as being associated with the bread and wine, both are related to the Passover supper. Even though Ellen White separates the two events in her <u>DA</u> commentary, within each chapter she speaks of "ordinance" in the plural and refers to both services in her remarks.

We have endeavored to distinguish between the services where necessary for evaluation and for listing the appropriate parallels in Table A above. It is possible, however, that we have missed some source parallels by our limitation of the major research to writings on the communion experience independent of the feet-washing service.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Literary dependency is exhibited in 40 of the 201 sentences of chapter 72. The Bible was quoted in 25 sentences in addition to quotations incorporated into Ellen

White's own commentary.¹ Table 1, page 531, lists 14 of the 40 parallels as being Strict Paraphrase, 16 Simple Paraphrase, and the remaining 10 as Loose Paraphrase or Partial Independence. The average dependency for the full chapter of 201 sentences is .75. If we figure only the dependent sentences, excluding the Scriptural quotations, the average rate is 3.75.

Nine writers are represented in the text of chapter 72 with Hanna furnishing the most parallels. Evidently Ellen White returned to Hanna for the DA text even when she had earlier borrowed from Hanna in writing 3SP. Outside of the 17 sentences dependent on Hanna's life of Christ, we found some dependency on March, Cumming, Jones, Lange, Farrar, Geikie, and Pentecost. The summary of these evaluation details on these parallels is shown in Table 2, page 532. The individual sentence evaluations and the correlation of the sources and the DA sentences may be found in Appendix In addition to these writers, all of whom have A.² furnished parallels in the chapters already reviewed, a new source is introduced in the comparison of this chapter. Robert Boyd's work on The World's Hope, or The Rock of Ages provided eight parallels and was listed as part of Ellen White's office library at the time of her death in 1915.

Throughout the text presentation the reader will notice

¹When Ellen White's comments are more than just a brief introduction to the Bible text we usually evaluate the sentence as her work even though Scripture is included.

²The full description of these works has been presented as part of the introduction to this chapter.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 72

`}

Ellen White Text

.

TOTALS PRE-DA	03. RH(97)	02.3SP(83)		01 - DA	TEXT	
8	8	8	8	3	≤ Strict Verbatim	t
8	8	8	ę	3	S Verbatim	2
2	ပ္မ	0]	1	14	🖞 Strict Paraphrase	ω
05	02	03	Ť	7	🎖 Simple Paraphrase	4
8	8	8	5	3	🞖 Loose Paraphrase	σ
03	8	C3	8	3	置 Source Bible	6
03	03	8		3	R Partial Independence	7
(01) ()	8	01	1 V	3,5	☐ Strict Independence	œ
Ĵ	8	8	Ľ	ېر	费 Bible	9
16	30	80	107	301	TOTAL	

)

53I

.

.

.

)

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 72

<u>Desire of Ages</u> Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8.	9.	
	í Strict Verbatim	5 Verbatim	Ztrict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	J Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	j Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	Pl	P2	P3	BJ	12	11	B2	TOTAL
Ol. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	25	25
02. Cumming MW	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	00	02
03. Hanna I.C	00	00	04	07	01	00	05	00	00	17
04. March WHJ	00	00	02	02	00	00	00	00	00	04
05. Jones LSFG	00	00	01	00	01	00	00	00	00	02
06. Lange LOLJC	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
07. Boyd WH	00	00	02	04	00	00	02	00	00	08
08. Farrar LC	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
09. Geikie, LC	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
10. Pentecost BS	00	00	02	01	01	00	00	00	00	04
TOTALS DA Text	00	00	14	16	03	00	07		(25)	65

that at times parallels have been suggested as possible sources even when Ellen White is given full credit for the composition of the <u>DA</u> text. The reasons for our listing these sources vary in details but generally follow the same line of argumentation.

DA4 has verbal similarities with a quotation from Charles Stanford.¹ The ideas are also parallel. But with only two verbatim words and no other use of this writer we felt the evidence was too weak for a claim of dependency. The ideas and terms did not appear as "special" in the light of the voluminous writings on this topic. The quotation does merit our interest, however, and suggests that further consideration of this writer as a possible literary source is warranted.²

The problem of whether to accept the quote from <u>Who Was</u> <u>Jesus</u>? by Charles Deems is likewise over the question of an isolated quotation. In this instance the sentence of Deems is very close to being a verbatim copy. It is clearly a closer parallel than is the quote from Pentecost which was selected because the <u>Bible Studies</u> by George Pentecost shows up elsewhere in the <u>DA</u> text, including this chapter. The quotations from Deems and Pentecost also demonstrate the point made earlier. The sources at times bear such striking similarity with each other that we are at a loss to know

¹Consult the introduction to this chapter for bibliographical data on these sources. ²Similarly DA155-157 and <u>The Works</u> of Stephen Olin, as

[&]quot;Similarly DA155-157 and <u>The Works</u> of Stephen Olin, as well as DA181-184 and <u>Sabbath Hours</u> by Bickersteth.

which source is being used. Perhaps Ellen White at times is merely placing her feet in the same stream in which many others are wading.

For DA15 we listed the parallel as Lange rather than Farrar, which we also quote, because of the reference to "standing" and the plural form of the following phrase, neither of which is in the text of Exodus 12:11. The Farrar quote, while including the reference to standing, does not otherwise move beyond the Exodus text.

We cannot be sure if this type of analysis is adequate for distinguishing between very similar comments. But in the case of having multiple parallels, such as we also have with DA20 and DA41,42, some method of discrimination has to be employed if we want to limit the sentence to having one source. Obviously the evaluations of sentences of this nature are as problematic as the sentences themselves.

A final reference on the specific evaluations of chapter 72 brings us to DA79. The location of the Bible quotation right where Hanna places it and between sentences 78 and 80 when Ellen White appears to use Hanna would ordinarily lead us to rate the sentence as (B1) Source Bible. But a careful scrutiny of the verse of Scripture clearly shows Ellen White is also making a special use of the text for her purpose. She omits the final personal pronoun, "He," and leaves the resulting "I am" in upper case for emphasis. The King James Version of John 13:19 has the "he" in italics to indicate the pronoun is not in the Greek

text. The Bible does not have the "I am" expression in upper case. Ellen White's construction makes the Bible quote serve her interest in emphasizing that Jesus is pointing out His messiahship. In view of Ellen White's departure from both Hanna's use of the text and the text a form in Scripture, we have marked the sentence as Partial Independence.

Since the earlier writings of Ellen White on the subject of chapter 72 were incorporated into the <u>DA</u> text we have the same sources in both the earlier and later writings. Table 3 on page 536 identifies the sources used and the types of dependent sentences found in these earlier texts. The individual sentence evaluations and the sources involved are given in Appendices B and C. Apart from her comments in <u>3SP</u> Ellen White apparently worked on the <u>DA</u> text at about the same time she wrote Manuscript 35. We are probably safe in conjecturing that Manuscripts 35 and 47 were specifically written for the life of Christ project. The <u>DA</u> text no doubt represents the editorial work of Marian Davis working with these manuscripts, the earlier text of <u>3SP</u>, and the edited <u>RH</u> article of June 22, 1897, which also originated from Manuscript 35.

The sources used by Ellen White in commenting upon the communion service have been accounted for in the texts utilized in composing the <u>DA</u> text. We found no earlier writing exhibiting source parallels which was not also used in the <u>DA</u> text. Since these sources have already been

	TABLE
I	ω

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 72

)

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TOTALS Pre-DA	04. Boyd WH	03. March WHJ	02. Hanna LC	01. EGW	TEXT		
8	8	8	8	8	1V	Strict Verbatim	
8	8	8	8	8	V2	Verbatim	N
04	03	8	01	8	P1	Strict Paraphrase	ω
05	02	20	02	8	P2	Simple Paraphrase	4.
8	8	8	8	8	P3	Loose Paraphrase	ர
03	8	8	ပ္သ	8	뚼	Source Bible	σ
03	ဌ	8	8	8	12	Partial Independence	7
01	8	8	8	10	11	Strict Independence	œ
(00)	8	8	8	8	ß	Bible	ç
16	8	10	06	10	TOTAL		

536

)

`

.

)

.

.

mentioned under the <u>DA</u> text there is no need for further analysis of the pre-DA documents.

In view of the rather limited use of a good number of different sources there is no one source with enough parallels to have influenced the arrangement of chapter 72. The list of source parallels as given in Appendix A points up the lack of dominance by any one source for the total chapter. The redaction of chapter 72 will have to be credited to Marian Davis and/or Ellen White. In a given section of the chapter, sentences 134-146, it would appear that Boyd's structure apparently exercised some influence.

Summary

The study of chapter 72 has challenged us to further research among the religious writers of the nineteenth century. The location of undocumented literary parallels among the writers on the Passover meal leads us to ask about literary conventions of the day. Evidently Ellen White is not the only writer using the works of others without admission and without giving source credits.

The lack of heavy dependence upon sources in the discursive materials encourages us to extend the search for parallels beyond the lives of Christ. And for this particular topic upon which much has been written, we will include in our search the Adventist writers Ellen White no doubt read and even listened to as she regularly celebrated "the ordinances of the Lord's house" from time to time.

Thus far, however, it appears that we can make the following points on the basis of the evidence of this chapter.

1. There are no handwritten documents to support the text of chapter 72 or the text of the previously written materials. The closest we may come to primary materials appears to be the two manuscripts in the form of type-copies. Manuscript 35 carries the date of April 6, 1897, and is 12 pages (174 sentences) long. Manuscript 45 is undated apart from its index number of MS 45, 1897. The copy we worked from indicated that it was "recopied November 24, 1963." Pages 4-6 covered the topic of this chapter. The previous pages relate to chapter 76 to be discussed later in this report.

2. In terms of the length of chapter 72 when compared to the combined length of the earlier materials we have a reduction in length of exposition. The 35 (generally longer) sentences of 3SP and the 174 sentences of manuscript 35 together total 209 or eight more than the 201 sentences of the <u>DA</u> text. But when we note the duplication in content between these two texts and consider the length of Ellen White's individual treatment, the text of the <u>DA</u> account with 201 sentences is slightly longer than the 174 sentences of Manuscript 35 and nearly twice as long as the 108 sentences of the <u>RH</u> article of June 22, 1897. The <u>DA</u> gives more attention to the background, less attention to the feet-washing by comparison with chapter 72, and much more

emphasis to the spiritual lessons to be drawn from the communion service, sentences 164-192. There is also the new material on comparing the first and last passovers and contemplating the cross of Christ, sentences 193-201.

The content of the DA text generally duplicated the 3. content of the earlier text where it was treating the same The differences are found first in the material. feet-washing commentary that in the earlier writings was combined with the account of the communion service. This material on the service of humility is separated to form a chapter, "A Servant of Servants," or chapter 71. new Additional differences have been noted under (2) above.

4. We found no significant differences in the content when the texts were treating the same topic. So much of the previous texts were taken up into the <u>DA</u> account that we have extensive duplication in content.

5. Chapter 72 contains 40 sentences in which literary dependency is evident to some extent. When rated against the total of 201 sentences the rate of dependency for the chapter is 20 percent.

6. Literary independence has been indicated for 136 of the 201 sentences or 68 percent of the chapter. Biblical quotes accounted for 25 sentences or 12 percent of the chapter.

7. The rate of dependency for the 40 dependent sentences is 3.75. The degree of dependency for the entire chapter is .75.

8. The major source used in chapter 72 was William Hanna. Seventeen of the 40 parallels have been attributed to his Life of Christ.

9. <u>The World's Hope or The Rock of Ages</u> by Robert Boyd furnished eight parallels; <u>Walks and Homes</u> by Daniel March and <u>Bible Studies</u> by George Pentecost were responsible for four parallels apiece and the works of Cumming, Jones, Lange, Farrar, and Geikie accounted for the other seven. Apart from Boyd we have encountered these minor sources in our study of the earlier DA chapters.

Seven other writers appear in the presentation of the source parallels for this chapter but no claim is made here for Ellen White's usage of their works.

10. The same sources appear in the pre-<u>DA</u> materials of Ellen White on the topic of this chapter. This duplication of sources is to be expected in view of the duplication of text between the <u>DA</u> and the earlier writings. Boyd's work is reflected in eight sentences in these previously written texts, Hanna provided six parallels, and March's influence is clearly to be seen in one sentence.

11. Ellen White expanded her commentary in the <u>DA</u> text over what she had written before. She evidently returned to March's and Hanna's works from her earlier use of these writers when composing the <u>3SP</u> text. But since apart from the 1878 <u>SP</u> text her previous writings all date from 1897 and were largely incorporated into the <u>DA</u> text, it is to be expected that the parallels from the <u>DA</u> text are very

similar to the earlier parallels. The same sources are represented in both the earlier texts and the <u>DA</u>. We will need to raise this question again if we find sources for some of the new material appearing in the DA text.

12. The majority of the parallels appear in the recounting of the Passover story and in the description of the scene. Apart from the parallels from Boyd's work Ellen White is generally on her own when commenting on the spiritual lessons to be drawn and on the theological interpretation of the event. Unless other sources are found, it would appear that Ellen White is more often on her own in this chapter when it comes to the discursive commentary.

13. The redaction of chapter 72 is the work of Ellen White and/or Marian Davis. The parallels are too few and too scattered to have seriously influenced the structure of the chapter. Obviously the gospel account would provide a basic order to her narrative. In one or two of the smaller units the text of the source evidently provided some influence on the thought development. In other portions, even though parallels were present, Ellen White is in control of the arrangement of her material.

14. We did not study the entire chapter of the $3\underline{SP}$ text and therefore cannot speak to its redaction. The text of Manuscript 35 and the <u>RH</u> article of June 22, 1897, exhibit too much independent material of Ellen White's to allow us to credit their structural arrangement to someone

else's work. As we have indicated before, these two texts cover both ordinances and appear to follow the basic order of traditional Christianity. Ellen White just interrupts the flow of the narrative as she moves through the accounts to draw her spiritual lessons and add her theological commentary.

,Ъ

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 72

No Source Dep	endency	No	Source	Dependency
001 Bible	B2	051 0	eikie LC/713.1	D D
002 Bible	B2	052	CIVIC 10/11311	<u> </u>
003 Bible	B2	053		<u> </u>
004	II	054	Bible	
005 March WHJ/3/307	P2	055	Bible	<u>B2</u>
006 March WHJ/3,4/307	Pl		lanna LC/24/614	<u>B2</u>
007 March WHJ/3,4/307	P2	057		P2
008 March WHJ/4/307	Pl	058		
009 Pentecost(85)/123.2	 P1	059		$-\frac{11}{11}$
010	<u> </u>	060 1	Bible	
011	<u> </u>	061	BIDIE	<u> </u>
012 Pentecost(88)/123.2	<u>P3</u>	062 7	Bible	
013	11	063 ~	Bible	<u>B2</u>
014	<u> </u>		lanna LC/56/616	<u></u> <u>B2</u>
015 Lange LOLJC/126.7	P2	065	anna 12/30/010	<u>P2</u>
016	Il	066		
017	<u> </u>	_ **	entecost(89)/155	
018	<u> </u>	$067 \frac{1}{2}$	entecost(69//155	
019 Jones LSFG/342.5	- <u>11</u> P3	069		
020 Farrar LC/561.2	Pl		anna LC/89/618	
021 Jones LSFG/342.7	Pl	070	antia 16/09/010	<u> </u>
022	· II		lanna LC/89/618	
023	Ī	073	antia 12/09/010	Pl T
024	11	074		
025	- <u>11</u>		anna LC/90/618	<u></u> <u>P3</u>
026	11	075		
027	- <u>II</u>	077 7		
028 Bible	B2		anna LC/64/616	
029 Bible	 B2		anna LC/65/616	$-\frac{p_1}{r_2}$
030 Bible	B2		anna LC/67/616	<u> </u>
031	Īl		anna LC/71/617	$-\frac{P1}{P1}$
032. –	11		anna LC/71/617	$-\frac{P1}{12}$
033	11	083		$-\frac{12}{11}$
034	11	084		
035	11	085		
036 Bible	 B2	086		
037. –	Il	087		
038	Il	088		<u> </u>
039 Bible	B2	089		<u> </u>
040 Hanna LC/33/615	P2	090		<u> </u>
041 Hanna LC/16/614	P2	091		
042 Hanna LC/19/614	12	092		Ī
043 Hanna LC/19,20/614	P2	093		
044	P2 I1	094		
045	Il	095		
046 Hanna LC/21,22/614	Pl	096		
047	īl	097		
048 Hanna LC/23/614	P2	098		- <u>- 11</u>
049 Hanna LC/29/614	12		unming MW(3)/35.	
050 Pentecost(88)121.9	P2	100		11
	ميرو خير اختلاكي			

.....

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 72

No	Source	Dependency	No.	-	Source	Dependency
101		<u>11</u>	151.	_		т1
-	Cumming MW(3)/3	5.4 Pl	152.		Bible	<u> I1</u>
103	Bible	B2	153.		DTOTE	<u> </u>
104	Bible	<u>B2</u>	154.			B2 Il
105	Bible	<u>D2</u>	155.			
106	DIDIE		155.			
107		$ \begin{array}{c} \underline{B2}\\ \underline{11}\\ \underline{11}\\$				
107		<u> </u>	157.			<u> Il</u>
108		<u></u>	158.			<u> Il</u>
			159.			<u>11</u>
110		$ \begin{array}{c} \hline 11\\ \hline 11$	160.	-		I1
111		<u></u>	161.			Il
112		<u>11</u>	162.			Il
113		<u></u>	163.			Il
114		<u>11</u>	164.	-		<u>11</u>
115		11	165.			
116		11	166.		Bible	
117]		Il	167.			
118		II	168.		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
119		Īl	169.		Bible	<u> </u>
120		I1	170.		Bible	$ \begin{array}{c} 11 \\ B2 \\ 11 \\ B2 \\ B2 \\ B2 \\ B2 \\ 11 \\ B1 \\ 11 \\ $
121		Īl	171.			<u></u>
122		<u> </u>	172.			<u> </u>
123			173.			<u> </u>
124		<u> </u>	174.			
125			175.			<u> </u>
126			176.			<u> </u>
127			177.			<u> </u>
128			178.			<u> </u>
129 "			179.			<u> </u>
130						
131			180.		- /1.1	<u> </u>
132			181.		Bible	$ \begin{array}{c} \underline{B2}\\ \underline{11}\\ \underline{11}\\ \underline{11} \end{array} $
_	-	<u>11</u>	182.			<u> I1</u>
133	(ECE - 1	<u> </u>	183.			<u> I1</u>
	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	184.			<u>11</u>
	Boyd WH/565.1	<u>P2</u>	185.		Bible	<u>B2</u>
	Boyd WH/565.1	<u> </u>	186.		Bible	B2
137		<u> </u>	187.			I1
138		P2 I2 I1 I1 P2 I1 P2 I1 P2 I1 P2 I1 P2	188.			I1
139. – <u>B</u>	Boyd WH/565.1	<u>P2</u>	189.			<u> </u>
140		<u>11</u>	190.		•	Il
141		<u> </u>	191.			<u></u>
142		11	192.			
	Koyd WH/566.2	P1	193.	-		Il
_	Boyd WH/566.2	P2	194.	-		<u> </u>
145. – E	Boyd WH/566.2	P1	195.			Il
	Boyd WH/566.2	$ \begin{array}{c} P1 \\ I2 \\ I1 \\ I1 \\ B2 \\ B2 \end{array} $	196.			
147		<u> </u>	197.			
148]		Il	198.			
149 [Bible	B2	199.			<u>-</u>
150	Bible	B2	200.			
_			201.		······································	
						······································

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 72

.

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	- 35	P 22/83	H/1/613	051.			
		P 23/83	H/2/613	052.			
		P 27/83	H/8/613	053.			
		P 28/83	H/3/613	054.			
		P 29/84	H/10a/613	055.			·····
		P 30/84	H/10b/613	056.			
		P 73/87	<u> </u>	057.		<u></u>	
		P 74/87	M/8/308	058.			
	- RH	the second s	BoydWH/565.1	059.		······	
	- RH		BoydWH/565.1	060.		·····	
	- RH		Boyd/565.1	061.		·····	
	- RH		Boyd/565.1	062.			
	- 88		Boyd/565.1	063.			···
		i (97) 73	Boyd/565.1	064.		······································	····
		1 (97) 74	Boyd/565.1	065.			**************************************
		<u>(97) 92</u>	Boyd/566.2	065.			
017.		(97) 92	BOY0/ 500.2	067.			
018.				068.			
019.							
				069.			
020.				070.			
021.				071.		·····	
022.				072.			·····
023.			·	073.			
024.				0 74. 0 75.		<u></u>	
025.				075.		······································	
020.				077.			
028.				078.			
029.				078.			
030.				080.			
031.			·····	081.		·····	·····
032.		·····	·····	082.			·····
033.				083.			·····
034.		·····		084.	_		
035.		·····	····	085.			
036.			·····	086.			
037.			·····	087.			
038.				088.			······································
039.		·····		089.			
040.				090.			
041.				090.		·····	
042.				092.			
043.				093.			
044.				094.			
045.				095.			
046.				096.		<u> </u>	
047.				097.			
048			······	098.		·····	
049.		·····	·····	099.			
050.	_			100.			······································
		<u> </u>					

PIE-Desile OI	Ages Eilen wn	ite Text Eva	luations for	Chapter 12
No Text	Eval. DA	No	Text	Eval. DA
001 3SP 22/83	BL	051		
002 3SP 23/83	- <u>- Pl</u>			
003 3SP 27/83	 P2			
004 3SP 28/83	- <u>-</u>	054		
005 3SP 29/84	Bl	<u> </u>		
$006 \frac{352}{35P} \frac{23}{30/84}$		056		
007 3SP 73/87		057	······	
008 3SP 74/87	$-\frac{11}{P2}$ $\frac{33}{83}$			
009 RH (97) 65	$-\frac{F2}{P2}$ $\frac{83}{134}$			
010 RH (97) 66	$-\frac{P_2}{Pl}$ $\frac{134}{134}$			
010 RH (97) 69	$-\frac{P1}{P1}$ $\frac{134}{135}$	061		
012 RH (97) 70	$-\frac{1}{12}$ $\frac{135}{136}$	060		
012 RH (97) 70 013 RH (97) 72	$-\frac{12}{Pl}$ $\frac{130}{139}$	063		
013 RH (97) 72 014 RH (97) 73	$-\frac{P1}{12}$ $\frac{139}{139}$			<u></u>
014 RH (97) 73 015 RH (97) 74		0/7		
	12 139	065		
016. $-$ RH (97) 92	<u>P2 144</u>			
017		067		
018		068		
019		069		
020		070		
021		071	<u> </u>	
V22 • -		072		
023		073		
024		074		
025		075		
026		076. –		
027		077		
028	<u></u>	078		
029		079		
030		080		
031		081		
032		082		
033		083		
034		084		
035		085		
036. –		086		
037. –	مرور و مرون و مرون	087		
038. –		088		
039. –		089		
040. –		090		
041		091		
042		092		
043		093		
044		094		
045		095		
046		096		
047		097		
048		098		
049		099		
050		100		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 72