

XVII CHAPTER 84 - "Peace Be Unto You"

Chapter 84 is the final chapter of The Desire of Ages to be included in this source study. It is also the third chapter of the 15 which followed in consecutive sequence a DA chapter also surveyed in this investigation.¹ The topic of chapter 84, "Peace Be Unto You," continues the narrative of chapter 83 on "The Walk to Emmaus." The previous chapter covered Luke 24:13-33. This chapter treats Luke 24:33-48 and John 20:19-29. The story line opens with the two disciples returning to Jerusalem from Emmaus and focuses the reader's attention on the two appearances of Jesus before the disciples in the upper room in Jerusalem.

Our review of Ellen White's writings on the general content of this chapter turned up over 50 references in more than 25 books and articles. Many of these are limited to one aspect of the account, such as the warning and rebuke of Jesus to Thomas for his lack of faith. Following the 15 sentences dedicated to this episode in Spiritual Gifts, 1858, Ellen White draws a parallel between Thomas' failure to accept the message of Jesus' resurrection from the testimony of the other disciples to the rejection of the first and second angels' messages by those who had not gone through the earlier experiences.²

¹The three randomly selected consecutive chapter-sets we have reference to here are 13 and 14, 75 and 76, and 83 and 84.

²SG, I, chapter X, page 75.

"Peace Be Unto You"

The earliest record we have of Ellen White's writing a comprehensive commentary on the two upper-room experiences is found in The Spirit of Prophecy, III, chapter XVI, "In the Upper Chamber."¹ We shall have occasion to refer often to this early commentary of Ellen White on the life of Christ. Our references will be indicated by the symbol 3SP, followed by the sentence number and page of the text where the particular sentence appears.

In the previous chapter we included a large portion of an 1888 article from The Signs of the Times, "Know the Reason of Your Hope."² The last section of that composition, beginning with sentence 70, deals with the content of the chapter under discussion here. After 17 sentences, Ellen White turns from the Lukan account to draw some practical lessons for Christians facing trials and conflicts. Within the few sentences devoted to the experience of the disciples are to be found some interesting source parallels. These sentences are indicated by the sign ST(88) followed by the number of the sentence being quoted. The sentence numbers begin with the opening paragraph of the article.

In 1897 Ellen White prepared two manuscripts relating to the subject matter of chapter 84. Manuscript 113, discussed in the previous chapter, goes beyond the Emmaus experience. Sentences 112 to 148 have to do with the upper-

¹This material was also published in Signs, September 26, 1878, and as Redemption Leaflet No. 6, pp. 34-40, 1877.

²Signs, Vol. 14, No. 30 (January 20, 1888).

"Peace Be Unto You"

room appearance of Jesus which took place on the day of His resurrection. In the text presentation to follow we have marked these sentences as MS(113). Following this sign of identification we list the sentence number.

The second manuscript from 1897 used in the preparation of the DA text for chapter 84 carries the White Estate listing of Manuscript 149, 1897. This composition is entitled "The Remission of Sins" and was used in Ellen White's commentary on John 20:19-29. Sentences from this manuscript will carry the designation MS(149) before the sentence number. Manuscripts 113 and 149 carry the initials "M. H.," which stand for Margaret (Maggie) Hare. October 14 is the date given MS 113, and MS 149 is dated December 1. Neither typescript is signed or stamped with Ellen White's signature. No handwritten text was found for these two documents.

The only sources quoted in the text presentation are Hanna's Life of Christ and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. These are the same two works Ellen White used for chapter 83.

There are several sentences from these earlier writings which reflect the use of literary sources and treat content not found in the DA text. We have included these where they appear to fit the context of either the source or the other sentences taken from the same earlier text. These sentences which interrupt the context of the DA text will be marked

"Peace Be Unto You"

off by a short broken line in the left margin.

Most of the sentences from the earlier writings which duplicate the DA text or which do not differ in their degree of literary dependency have not been included in the text presentation. These sentences will be discussed further under the analysis below.

DA1/802 On reaching Jerusalem the two disciples enter at the eastern gate, which is open at night on festal occasions. [M/75/420] (P1)

3SP1/216 When the disciples arrived at Jerusalem they entered the eastern gate, which was open on festal occasions. [M/75/420] (P1)

DA2/802 The houses are dark and silent, but the travelers make their way through the narrow streets by the light of the rising moon. [M/76-78/420,421] (P1)

3SP2/216 The houses were dark and silent, but they made their way through the narrow streets by the light of the rising moon. [M/76-78/420,421] (P1)

DA3/802 They go to the upper chamber where Jesus spent the hours of the last evening before His death. [M/78/421] (P1)

DA4/802 Here they know that their brethren are to be found. [M/79/421] (P1)

3SP3/216 They knew that they would find their brethren in the memorable upper chamber where Jesus had spent the last night before his death. [M/78,79/421] (P1)

MS(113)112 Entering Jerusalem, they go to the upper chamber, where Christ spent the hours of the last evening before his death instructing his disciples. [M/75-78/421] (P1)

DA5/802 Late as it is, they know that the disciples will not sleep till they learn for a certainty what has become of the body of their Lord. [M/79,80/421] (P1)

MS(113)113 It is late, but they know that the disciples will not sleep till they know for a certainty what has become of the body of their Lord. [M/79,80/421] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

75/420 Reaching the walls of the city at a late hour, they probably passed around to one of the eastern gates, which was kept open all night during the great festivities of the Jewish people. [March, NS]

76/420 Having gained admission, they hurry along the narrow streets, guided now by the light of the risen moon. [March, NS]

77/420+ The doors are shut and the blank walls of the stone houses give no sign of life within. [March, NS]

78/421 They make their way first of all, we may suppose, to that one memorable house with the upper chamber where Jesus spent the last evening with his disciples before he suffered. [March, NS]

13/803 And where but in that same chamber can we imagine that their Sunday evening assembly gathered? [Hanna, LC]

79/421 Late as is the hour, they feel confident that the band will still be together. [March, NS]

80/421 The excitement of the day has been too great to let them think of sleep. [March, NS]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

3SP5/216 And now they had no disposition to sleep, for exciting events were being related among them.
[M/80/421] (P1)

DA6/802 They find the door of the chamber securely barred.
[M/81/421] (P1)

MS(113)114 They find the door of the chamber securely barred. [M/81/421] (P1)

DA7/802 They knock for admission, but no answer comes.
[M/82/421] (P1)

MS(113)115 They knock for admission, but no answer comes. [M/82/421] (P1)

DA8/802 All is still. [M/82/421] (P2)

MS(113)116 All is still. [M/82/421] (P2)

DA9/801 Then they give their names. [M/83a/421] (P1)

MS(113)117 Then they give their names. [M/83a/421] (P1)

DA10a/802 The door is carefully unbarred, they enter,
[M/83b/421] (P1)

3SP6a/216 Cautious hands unbarred the door to the repeated demand of the two travelers; they entered,
[M/83ab/421] (P1)

ST(88)71 All is silent within; but finally, to their continued knocking, they hear the slipping of the bolts. [M/82,83b/421] (P2)

DA10b/802 and Another, unseen, enters with them. (I1)

3SP6b/216 and with them also entered Jesus, who had been their unseen companion all the way. (I1)

81/421 When they reach the door, they find it barred from within and they cannot enter. [March, NS]

82/421 They knock, but none reply. [March, NS]

83a/421 They call aloud and announce their names, [March, NS]

83b and then they hear steps and voices within, and the swift and cautious hands of their brethren unbolting the door. [March, NS]

DA11/802 Then the door is again fastened, to keep out spies. [M/85a/421] [H/14a/803] (P2)

ST(88)72 The door is cautiously opened and carefully barred after them. [M/83,85a/421] (P1)

DA12/802 The travelers find all in surprised excitement. [H/15/803] [M/85a,80/421] (P1)

3SP/216 They found the disciples assembled, and in a state of excitement. [H/15/803] (P2)

3SP9a/216 The report of Mary Magdalene, and that of the other women, had been heard by all; [H/16a/803] (V2)

3SP9b/216 but some were too hopeless to believe their testimony. [H/16b/803] (I2)

3SP10/216+ The evidence of Peter concerning his interview with the risen Lord, was borne with great ardor and assurance, and had more weight with the brethren, and their faith began to revive. [H/17a/803] (P2)

DA13/802 The voices of those in the room break out into thanksgiving and praise, saying. "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [M/84b/421] (B1)

3SP11/217 When the disciples from Emmaus entered with their joyful tidings, they were met by the exclamation from many voices: "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [H/17b/803] [Cf. M/84b/421] (P2)

DA14/802 Then the two travelers, panting with the haste with which they have made their journey, tell the wondrous story of how Jesus had appeared to them. [M/85a,b/421] (P1)

MS(113)121 Then the travelers, panting with the haste with which they have made their journey, tell the wondrous story of how as they were journeying along full of discouragement and hopelessness, they were joined by a stranger. [M/85a,b/421] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

14a/803 The doors were closed against intruders, . . .
[Hanna, LC]

85a/421 And now, that all are within and the door is barred again, the excited and panting travelers take their turn and tell the wondrous story of the evening walk to Emmaus,
[March, NS]

15/803 In what an agitated, conflicting state of thought and feeling do they find those assembled there! [Hanna, LC]

16a/803 They had all heard the reports of the women and of Mary Magdalene; [Hanna, LC]

16b/803 but they say little or nothing about them; perhaps give them little credit. [Hanna, LC]

17a/803 But there is Peter, whom no one can well distrust, telling all the particulars of his interview, and carrying the conviction of so many, [Hanna, LC]

84b/421 before the voices of all within break out in the exclamation, "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [March, NS]

17b/803 that they are joyfully exclaiming; "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [Hanna, LC]

85ab/421 And now, that all are within and the door is barred again, the excited and panting travelers take their turn and tell the wondrous story of the evening walk to Emmaus, the strange companion that joined them in the way,
[March, NS]

MS(113)122 With wonder and hope, they relate how he opened the Scriptures to them, and how they invited him to abide with them. [M/85a/421] (P3)

MS(113)123 They tell how, they prepared the evening meal, and when as their guest had extended his hands to bless the food, they recognized him. [M/85d,f/421] (P3)

MS(113)124 Their eyes were indeed opened. [M/85f/421] (P3)

MS(113)125 They saw the marks of the nails, and rose up to worship him, but he vanished out of their sight. [M/85e,g/421] (P2)

DA15/802 They have just ended, and some are saying that they cannot believe it, for it is too good to be true, when behold, another Person stands before them. [M/86/421] (P2)

MS(113)126 They have just finished their story and some are saying that they could not believe it for it is too good to be true, when behold, another person stands before them. [M/86/421] (P1)

3SP14/217 Some were inspired with new faith; others were incredulous. [H/17-19/803] (P2)

3SP15/217 Suddenly Jesus himself was in their midst. [H/21/803] (V2)

ST(88)73 Scarcely had they finished relating the marvelous story of the walk to Emmaus to the incredulous disciples, when they behold with amazement another in their midst. [M/86/421] (P1)

DA16/802 Every eye is fastened upon the Stranger. [M/88/422] (V2)

DA17/802 No one has knocked for entrance. [M/89/422] (P1)

ST(88)75 The bars and bolts have not been withdrawn. [M/90/422] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

85c/421 the burning words that he spoke as he climbed the hills and toiled along the steep stony path in their company, [March, NS]

85d/421 the blessing that he pronounced at the evening meal, [March, NS]

85e/421 the print of the nails that they plainly saw in his extended hands, [March, NS]

85f/421 the familiar looks of their beloved Lord shining out upon his face, [March, NS]

85g/421 and then his vanishing out of their sight. [March, NS]

86/421+ They have scarcely finished their story, amid the wonder and joy of the listening throng, when, behold! another stands in the midst of the room. [March, NS]

19/803 The two disciples tell their tale, but it falls on many an incredulous ear. [Hanna, LC]

21/803 They are trying all they can by a minute recital of how Jesus had been known of them, to remove the incredulity, when suddenly, coming as a spirit cometh, casting no shadow before him, the doors not being open to let him in, no sight nor sound giving token of his approach, Jesus himself is in the midst of them, and his "Peace be unto you" stills at once the conflicting conversation that had been going on. [Hanna, LC]

88/422 Every eye is fixed upon the stranger. [March, NS]

89/422 There has been no knocking without. [March, NS]

90/422 The door has not been unbarred. [March, NS]

DA18/802+ No footstep has been heard. [M/91/422] (V2)

DA19/802 The disciples are startled, and wonder what it means. [M/87,93/422] (P1)

ST(88)76 They have heard no footstep, and they are terrified. [M/87,91/422] (V2)

DA20/803 Then they hear a voice which is no other than the voice of their Master. [M/94/422] (P2)

DA21/803 Clear and distinct the words fall from His lips, "Peace be unto you." (I1)

DA22/803 "But they were terrified and affrighted, and supposed that they had seen a spirit." (B2)

DA23/803 "And He said unto them, Why are ye troubled? and why do thoughts arise in your hearts?" (B2)

DA24/803 "Behold My hands and My feet, that it is I Myself: handle Me, and see; for a spirit hath not flesh and bones, as ye see Me have." (B2)

DA25/803 "And when He had thus spoken, He showed them His hands and His feet." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

91/422 No sound of entering footsteps has been heard.
[March, NS]

87/422 They are startled and terrified at the sudden apparition, even as they were when they saw the bright form walking upon the Sea of Galilee. [March, NS]

93/422 What can it be? [March, NS]

94/422 In the hush of silence which pervades the breathless group they hear a voice speaking as only their Lord could speak, and saying "Peace be unto you." [March, NS]

DA26/803 They beheld the hands and feet marred by the cruel nails. [M/95/422] (P1)

DA27/803 They recognized His voice, like no other they had ever heard. [Cf. DA20 above.] [M/94/422] (P2)

DA28/803 "And while they yet believed not for joy, and wondered, He said unto them, Have ye here any meat?" (B2)

DA29/803 "And they gave Him a piece of a broiled fish, and of an honeycomb." (B2)

DA30/803 "And He took it, and did eat before them." (B2)

DA31/803 "Then were the disciples glad, when they saw the Lord." [M/99/422] (B1)

DA32/803 Faith and joy took the place of unbelief, and with feelings which no words could express they acknowledged their risen Saviour. [H/30/804] (I2)

DA33/803 At the birth of Jesus the angel announced, Peace on earth, and good will to men. [M/105/423] (I2)

3SP35/218 At the first advent of Jesus to the world, the angel announced: Peace on earth, and good will to men. [M/105/423] (I2)

DA34/803+ And now at His first appearance to the disciples after His resurrection, the Saviour addressed them with the blessed words, "Peace be unto you." [M/102,105/422,423] (P1)

3SP36/218 After his earthly life was completed, he came forth from the dead, and, appearing for the first time to his assembled disciples, addressed them with the blessed words, "Peace be unto you." [M/102,105,106/422,423] (V2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

95/422 Then he shows them his hands and his feet, and they lean forward with fear and wonder to look upon the print of the nails, the signs of sacrificial suffering which he wears even now upon the throne of heaven. [March, NS]

[See M/94/422 above.]

99/422 And now at last are they glad and satisfied that they see their Lord. [March, NS]

30/804 Doubt now gives place to conviction, fear to believing joy; a joy so fresh, so full, that it in turn begins to shake the new-born faith. [Hanna, LC]

105/423 His first appearance on earth was announced by angel voices with the same blessed word--peace. [March, NS]

102/422 And the first word which the risen Lord brings to the assembly of his disciples on this first night after his resurrection is "Peace." [March, NS]

106/423 And after he has completed his work and passed away from the world, he comes back from the grasp of death and the grave to bring the weary and the sorrowing the blessing of peace. [March, NS]

DA35/804 Jesus is ever ready to speak peace to souls that are burdened with doubts and fears. [M/110/423] (P2)

3SP37/219 Jesus is ever ready to speak peace to souls that are troubled with doubts and fears.
[M/110/423] (P2)

DA36/804 He waits for us to open the door of the heart to Him, and say, Abide with us. [M/113/423] (P2)

DA37/804 He says, "Behold, I stand at the door, and knock: if any man hear My voice, and open the door, I will come in to him, and will sup with him, and he with Me." Rev. 3:20. [M/114/423] (B1)

3SP40a/219 Our life is a continual strife;
[M/118/424] (V2)

3SP40b/219 we must war against principalities and powers, against spiritual wickedness, and foes that never sleep; [M/119/424] (P1)

3SP40c/219 we must resist temptations, and overcome as Christ overcame. [M/120/424] (I2)

3SP41/219 When the peace of Jesus enters our heart we are calm and patient under the severest trials.
[M/135/425] (P2)

DA38/804 The resurrection of Jesus was a type of the final resurrection of all who sleep in Him. [M/147/426] (P2)

DA39/804 The countenance of the risen Saviour, His manner, His speech, were all familiar to His disciples. [M/148/426] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

110/423 Peace to all troubled and restless and doubting and dissatisfied souls, for Jesus came to seek and to save the lost. [March, NS]

113/423 But he stands at the door of the heart and knocks and waits to be invited in. [March, NS]

114/423 He knocks and knocks again. [March, NS]

115/423 He waits and waits long. [March, NS]

116/423 And many never invite him in. [March, NS]

118/424 Our life on earth is a continual conflict. [March, NS]

119/424 We must fight against forces that never tire, and keep ourselves upon the watch against foes that never sleep. [March, NS]

120/424 We are beset by countless temptations, and we must resist and put them down, or be overcome and destroyed ourselves. [March, NS]

135/425 When the peace of Christ comes into the soul, it brings the calmness and serenity of heaven. [March, NS]

147/426 His resurrection is the pattern of our own. [March, NS]

149/426 His voice and look and manner of speech were all such as his friends and followers had known them to be in his former life. [March, NS]

DA40/804 As Jesus arose from the dead, so those who sleep in Him are to rise again. [M/152/426] (P1)

3SP44/219 In like manner will those who sleep in Jesus rise again. [M/152/426] (V2)

DA41/804 We shall know our friends, even as the disciples knew Jesus. [M/154/426] (P2)

DA42/804 They may have been deformed, diseased, or disfigured, in this mortal life, and they rise in perfect health and symmetry; yet in the glorified body their identity will be perfectly preserved. [M/158/427] (P2)

DA43/804 Then shall we know even as also we are known. 1 Cor. 13:12. [M/157/427] (P2)

DA44/804 In the face radiant with the light shining from the face of Jesus, we shall recognize the lineaments of those we love. [M/156/427] (I2)

DA45/804 When Jesus met with His disciples, He reminded them of the words He had spoken to them before His death, that all things must be fulfilled which were written in the law of Moses, and in the prophets, and in the Psalms concerning Him. (B2)

DA46/804+ "Then opened He their understanding, that they might understand the Scriptures, and said unto them, Thus it is written, and thus it behoved Christ to suffer, and to rise from the dead the third day: and that repentance and remission of sins should be preached in His name among all nations, beginning at Jerusalem." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

152/426 And in like manner shall our beloved who sleep in Jesus rise again. [March, NS]

154/426 They shall speak so that when we meet them and they call our names, as Jesus called the name of Mary in the garden of the sepulchre, it shall be all we need to know them. [March, NS]

158/427 And so the faces that we last saw on earth wrinkled with age or wasted in suffering, and void of all grace and comeliness, shall be the same when seen in the light of heaven, yet clothed with immortal beauty and fit for the companionship of angels. [March, NS]

157/427 The great artist has the skill to make a homely face beautiful in a picture, and yet everybody who knows the original will say it is a perfect likeness. [March, NS]

156/427 However plain they looked in this earthly life, they shall still be themselves and yet their faces shall be radiant with the soul's immortal beauty in the resurrection. [March, NS]

[March (NS) continues the resurrection theme for thirty-two additional sentences, 159-190.]

[Hanna (LC) uses three sentences in a paraphrase of the texts referred to here by EGW, 32-35/804.]

DA47/805 "And ye are witnesses of these things." (B2)

DA48/805 The disciples now began to realize the nature and extent of their commission. [H/36/804] (P1)

3SP31/218 The disciples now began to realize the nature and extent of their commission. [H/36/804] (P1)

DA49/805 They were to proclaim to the world the wonderful truths which Christ had entrusted to them. [H/36/804] (P1)

DA50/805 The events of His life, His death and resurrection, the prophecies that pointed to these events, the sacredness of the law of God, the mysteries of the plan of salvation, the power of Jesus for the remission of sins,--to all these things they were witnesses, and they were to make them known to the world. [H/36/804] (P1)

DA51/805 They were to proclaim the gospel of peace and salvation through repentance and the power of the Saviour. [H/36,46c/804,806] (P1)

MS(149)28 They were to preach and teach the gospel in Christ's name. [H/47/806] (P2)

DA52/805 "And when He had said this, He breathed on them, and saith unto them, Receive ye the Holy Ghost: Whosoever sins ye remit, they are remitted unto them; and whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained." [H/48/806] (B1)

MS(149)29 The instruction given them had the vital, spiritual breath that is in Jesus. [H/49/806] (I2)

36/804+ Now that the needful work of suffering and death were over; now that the wonderful exhibition at once of the sacredness of the Divine law, the holiness of the Divine character, the deep unutterable love of God, had been given; now, wide over all the world, were repentance and remission of sin to be proclaimed in his name; and they, the men to whom Jesus was then speaking, were to be the witnesses, the heralds, the preachers of this large and all-embracing gospel of peace on earth, and good-will on God's part towards all the children of men: the first and earliest hint this of the nature and the extent of their great commission; a hint which they did not then understand, which they did not understand even under the enlightening and quickening influence of the day of Pentecost. [Hanna, LC]

46c/806 that of publishing everywhere the gospel of this peace; preaching peace by me to them that are afar off, and to them that are nigh; "For as my Father sent me, even so now send I you." [Hanna, LC]

47/806 I send you forth in my name, and I will qualify you by my Spirit. [Hanna, LC]

48/806 And having said so, he breathed on them, and said, "Receive ye the Holy Ghost"--an outward and expressive symbol; of the twofold truth, that dead, motionless, useless for all the common work of this earthly existence, as lay that dust which the hand of the Creator moulded into human form till he breathed into it the breath of his natural life, so dead, motionless, useless for the work of our Christian calling do we all lie, till the breath of true spiritual life be breathed into us by the Holy Ghost. [Hanna, LC]

49/806 And as it was from the lips of the risen Saviour that the breath proceeded, which spread out upon the little company at Jerusalem, so is it from the risen, exalted Saviour that the Spirit comes, whose life-giving influences spread over the whole church of the first-born. [Hanna, LC]

DA53/805 The Holy Spirit was not yet fully manifested; for Christ had not yet been glorified. [H/53/806] (V2)

MS(149)36 But the Holy Spirit was not yet fully manifested, because Christ had not yet been glorified. [H/53/806] (V2)

DA54/805 The more abundant impartation of the Spirit did not take place till after Christ's ascension. [H/54/806] (P1)

DA55/805 Not until this was received could the disciples fulfill the commission to preach the gospel to the world. [H/50/806] (P2)

DA56/805 But the Spirit was now given for a special purpose. [H/50/806] (P2)

DA57/805 Before the disciples could fulfill their official duties in connection with the church, Christ breathed His Spirit upon them. [H/50/806] (I2)

MS(149)35 Thus they were to fulfil the official duties connected with the church. [H/50/806] (I2)

DA58/805 He was committing to them a most sacred trust, and He desired to impress them with the fact that without the Holy Spirit this work could not be accomplished. [H/51/806] (I2)

MS(149)34 Without this qualification, their work could not be accomplished. [H/51/806] (P1)

DA59/805 The Holy Spirit is the breath of spiritual life in the soul. [H/48,56/806] (P2)

MS(149)38 The Holy Spirit is the breath of life in the soul. [H/56/806] (P2)

MS(149)39 The breathing of Christ upon his disciples was the breath of true spiritual life. [H/48,50/806] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

53/806 The Holy Ghost was not yet in his fulness given, because that Jesus was not yet glorified. [Hanna, LC]

54/806 The more plentiful effusion of this gift was reserved for the day of Pentecost. [Hanna, LC]

50/806 But specially upon this occasion was the breathing of Jesus upon the disciples, and the gift which accompanied that breathing, meant to indicate that the mission on which Jesus was sending these disciples out--that of being witnesses for him--was one that could alone be discharged by those who, through him, had received more or less of that heavenly gift. [Hanna, LC]

51/806 It was this impartation of the Spirit, which was to form the one, indispensable qualification for the work; without which it could not be done. [Hanna, LC]

56/806+ This was but an earnest of better things to come--a few sprinkled drops of that fuller baptism wherewith they were afterwards to be baptized; but yet enough to teach that it was by Spirit-taught, Spirit-moved men--by men in whose breasts the heaven-kindled fire of the true spiritual life had begun to burn--that the commission Jesus had been giving could alone be executed. [Hanna, LC]

DA60/805 The impartation of the Spirit is the impartation of the life of Christ. [H/51/806] (I2)

MS(149)33 The impartation of the Spirit was the impartation of the very life of Christ, which was to qualify the disciples for their mission. [H/50,51/806] (I2)

DA61/805 It imbues the receiver with the attributes of Christ. (I1)

MS(149)40 The disciples were to interpret this as imbuing them with the attributes of Christ, that in purity, faith, and obedience, they might exalt the law and make it honorable. (I1)

MS(149)47 The Holy Spirit will convince of sin, righteousness, and of judgment. [H/55/806] (B1)

DA62/805 Only those who are thus taught of God, those who possess the inward working of the Spirit, and in whose life the Christ-life is manifested, are to stand as representative men, to minister in behalf of the church. [H/57/807] (I2)

MS(149)48 The lesson given to the disciples means that wise men, truly taught of God, possessing the inward working of the Holy Spirit, are to be representative men, samples of the whole body of believers. [H/57/807] (I2)

DA63/805 "Whosoever sins ye remit," said Christ, "they are remitted; . . . and whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained." [Jn. 20:23] [H/58/807] (B1)

DA64/805 Christ here gives no liberty for any man to pass judgment upon others. [H/60/807] (P3)

[See above Hanna 50,51/806]

[Hanna emphasizes the work of the Holy Spirit to convince mankind of sin and opening their minds to understand the Scriptures.]

55/806 That Spirit, who was to convince of sin, and to lead into all truth, began even then, indeed, his gracious work in the minds and hearts of these disciples, by convincing them of their unbelief and hardness of heart, and by opening their minds to understand the Scriptures. [Hanna, LC]

57/807 And let not those to whom Jesus is now speaking, speaking as the heads and representatives of the whole body of his true followers upon earth; let them not think, weak as they are, powerless as they appear, that, in going forth to proclaim in his name, to every penitent transgressor, the free, full, instant, gracious pardon of all his sins, they are embarking in an ideal, unreal work--a work of which they shall never know whether they are succeeding in it or not. [Hanna, LC]

58/807 'No,' says the Saviour; 'Partake of the peace I now impart, accept the commission I now bestow; go forth in my name; receive ye the Holy Ghost to guide you; announce the news of God to sinners; proclaim the remission of sins, and, verily I say, whosoever sins ye thus remit, they are remitted; whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained.' [Hanna, LC]

60/807 It were to misinterpret the incidents of that evening meeting, it were to mistake the simple, immediate, and precise object which, in using them, our Lord had in view, to explain these words, as if they were intended to clothe the eleven apostles, and after them, their successors, or representatives--to clothe any class of officials in the church, exclusively, with a power of remitting and retaining sins. [Hanna, LC]

DA65/804 In the Sermon on the Mount He forbade this.
[H/69a/808] (I2)

MS(149)45 The warnings in the seventh chapter of Matthew forbid men from pronouncing judgment on their fellow-men. [H/69a/808] (I2)

DA66/805 It is the prerogative of God. [H/88/809] (P2)

MS(149)46 The remission of sins is to be understood as the prerogative of God alone. [H/88/809] (P2)

MS(149)51 Moreover if thy brother shall trespass against thee, go and tell him his fault between thee and him alone; if he shall hear thee, thou hast gained thy brother. [H/69b/808] (B1)

MS(149)52 But if he will not hear thee, then take with thee one or two more, that in the mouth of two or three witnesses every word may be established.
[H/70/808] (B1)

MS(149)53 And if he shall neglect to hear them, tell it unto the church: but if he neglect to hear the church, let him be unto thee as an heathen man and a publican. [H/71/808] (B1)

MS(149)54 Verily I say unto you, whatsoever ye shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven, and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven." [H/72/808] (B1)

DA67/805 But on the church in its organized capacity He places a responsibility for the individual members.
[H/76/808] (P2)

MS(149)59 Remitting sins or restraining¹ sins applied to the church in her organized capacity.
[H/76/808] (P1)

¹RH June 13, 1899, reprinted MS 149, 1897, and sentence 59 appears with "retaining" in place of "restraining." With only the typewritten secretarial copy of the manuscript we have no way of checking for copy error. We have evaluated the sentence according to the published text.

69a/808 Jesus had once before used words of nearly the same import with those that are now before us, and he had addressed them to the disciples at large: [Hanna, LC]

88/809 And if, in executing that simple but most honorable office of proclaiming unto all men that there is remission of sins through the name of Jesus, she teaches that it is alone through her channels--through channels that priestly or ordained and consecrated hands can alone open--the pardon cometh, she trenches upon the rights and prerogatives of Him whom she represents, and turns that eye upon herself that should be turned alone on him. [Hanna, LC]

69b/808 "Moreover, if thy brother shall trespass against thee, go and tell him his fault between thee and him alone; if he shall hear thee, thou hast gained thy brother. [Hanna, LC]

70/808 "But if he will not hear thee, then take with thee one or two more, that in the mouth of two or three witnesses every work may be established. [Hanna, LC]

71/808 "And if he shall neglect to hear them, tell it unto the church; but if he neglect to hear the church, let him be unto thee as a heathen man and a publican. [Hanna, LC]

72/808 "Verily I say unto you, Whatsoever ye shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven; and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven." [Hanna, LC]

76/808 We are not in the least disposed to doubt, that while Christ speaks of the remitting and the retaining of sins as pertaining to the church at large, his words cover the acts of the church in her organized capacity, the inflicting and removing of ecclesiastical censures through her office-bearers in the exercise of discipline. [Hanna, LC]

MS(149)61 Censure is to be given. [H/76/808] (P1)

MS(149)62 This censure is to be removed when the one
in error confesses and repents of his sin.
[H/76/808] (I2)

DA68/805 Toward those who fall into sin, the church has a
duty, to warn, to instruct, and if possible to restore.
(I1)

DA69/805 "Reprove, rebuke, exhort," the Lord says, "with
all long-suffering and doctrine." 2 Tim. 4:2. (B2)

DA70/805+ Deal faithfully with wrongdoing. (I1)

DA71/806 Warn every soul that is in danger. (I1)

DA72/806 Leave none to deceive themselves. (I1)

DA73/806 Call sin by its right name. (I1)

DA74/806 Declare what God has said in regard to lying,
Sabbathbreaking, stealing, idolatry, and every other evil.
(I1)

DA75/806 "They which do such things shall not inherit the
kingdom of God." Gal. 5:21. (B2)

DA76/806 If they persist in sin, the judgment you have
declared from God's word is pronounced upon them in heaven.
(I1)

DA77/806 In choosing to sin, they disown Christ; the church
must show that she does not sanction their deeds, or she
herself dishonors her Lord. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA78/806 She must say about sin what God says about it.
[H/77/808] (P2)

DA79/806 She must deal with it as God directs, and her action is ratified in heaven. [H/59/807] (P2)

DA80/806 He who despises the authority of the church despises the authority of Christ Himself. [H/77/808] (I2)

DA81/806 But there is a brighter side to the picture. (I1)

DA82/806 "Whosoever sins ye remit, they are remitted."
[John 20:23a] (B2)

DA83/806 Let this thought be kept uppermost. (I1)

DA84/806 In labor for the erring, let every eye be directed to Christ. [H/88/809] (I2)

DA85/806 Let the shepherds have a tender care for the flock of the Lord's pasture. [H/93/810] (P2)

DA86/806 Let them speak to the erring of the forgiving mercy of the Saviour. [H/90/810] (P2)

DA87/806 Let them encourage the sinner to repent, and believe in Him who can pardon. [H/89,90/809] (P2)

DA88/806 Let them declare, on the authority of God's word, "If we confess our sins, He is faithful and just to forgive us our sins, and to cleanse us from all unrighteousness." 1 John 1:9. (B2)

DA89/806 All who repent have the assurance, "He will have compassion upon us; He will subdue our iniquities; and Thou wilt cast all their sins into the depths of the sea." Micah 7:19. [H/89/809] (B1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

59/807 Such I take to be the real spirit and objects of these last words of Jesus, as spoken by him to his disciples at this time; words spoken to animate them in their after work by the assurance that they should not labor in vain; that what they should do on earth should be owned and ratified in heaven. [Hanna, LC]

77/808 Here, however, we have two remarks to make: First, that it is only so far as these acts are done by spiritual men, seeking and following the guidance of the Spirit, only so far as they are in accordance with Christ's own expressed will, that they are of any avail, or can plead any heavenly ratification; and, secondly, that all the force they carry is nothing more or less than an authoritative and official declaration of what that will of the Lord is. [Hanna, LC]

[See H/88/809 below]

93/810 Assuming that it lay with the church to extend her forgiveness to that offender, desiring to do nothing upon his own individual authority, claiming no exclusive power of priestly absolution, Paul invites the Corinthian believers to deal tenderly, forgivingly with that man, and to receive him back into their communion, telling them that he was quite prepared to go along with them in such treatment of the penitent. [Hanna, LC]

90/809 Wherever the gospel of the grace of God is preached, not generally, but pointedly, to an individual man, and he is entreated and encouraged to take hold of peace, to accept of pardon, to trust in the mercy of Jesus, to believe in the forgiving love of God--then is that office of remitting sins in the name of Jesus undertaken and discharged. [Hanna, LC]

89/809 But it is the gracious office of the church, of every individual member thereof, of every distinct community thereof, in the sense here indicated, to absolve the sinner, to assure him of the divine forgiveness, to help him to believe in that forgiveness. [Hanna, CC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA90/806 Let the repentance of the sinner be accepted by the church with grateful hearts. (I1)

DA91/806 Let the repenting one be led out from the darkness of unbelief into the light of faith and righteousness. (I1)

DA92/806 Let his trembling hand be placed in the loving hand of Jesus. (I1)

DA93/806 Such a remission is ratified in heaven.
[H/59,77/807,808] (P2) [See DA79/806 above.]

DA94/806 Only in this sense has the church power to absolve the sinner. [H/87,78/809,808] (P2)

DA95/806 Remission of sins can be obtained only through the merits of Christ. [H/88/809] (P2)

MS(149)55 There is no power given to any of God's delegated servants to cast down or destroy.
[H/83/809] (I2)

DA96/806 To no man, to no body of men, is given power to free the soul from guilt. [H/78/808] (P2)

MS(149)86 On no man, priest, or pope, but on God alone rests the forgiveness of sins. [H/78-80/808]
(P2)

DA97/806 Christ charged his disciples to preach the remission of sins in His name among all nations; but they themselves were not empowered to remove one stain of sin.
[H/83,85/809] (P2)

[See above.]

87/809 The church's function is as strictly limited to the announcing of a pardon which it is for the grace of the heavenly Forgiver alone to bestow. [Hanna, LC]

88/809 And if, in executing that simple but most honorable office of proclaiming unto all men that there is remission of sins through the name of Jesus, she teaches that it is alone through her channels--through channels that priestly or ordained and consecrated hands can alone open--the pardon cometh, she trenches upon the rights and prerogatives of Him whom she represents, and turns that eye upon herself that should be turned alone on him. [Hanna, LC]

83/809 Here, in terms not less distinct than those in which Christ gives his disciples power over the sins of men, to remit or to retain, God gives to the two prophets power over the nations to cast down and to destroy. [Hanna, LC]

78/808 Neither in any man, in any pope or any priest, in any community, or in any ecclesiastical court, lies the absolute, the independent, the arbitrary power to absolve the sinner from his sins. [Hanna, LC]

79/808 But did not he, we are asked, with whom alone it is acknowledged that that power rests, appoint the eleven as his earthly delegates, and in the commission here given them, convey into their hands as such, that power? [Hanna, LC]

80/808 Just as little as in two other commissions given to two of the old prophets, he handed over to them that power over the kingdoms and nations of the earth which we rightly believe and affirm resides alone in the hands of the Almighty. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

MS(149)56 The apostles were unable to remove the guilt from any soul. [H/85/809] (V2)

DA98/806 The name of Jesus is the only "name under heaven given among men, whereby we must be saved." Acts 4:12. (I1)

DA99/806 When Jesus first met the disciples in the upper chamber, Thomas was not with them. [H/1/811] (P1)

3SP49/219 He was not present in the upper chamber when Jesus appeared to his disciples. [H/1/811] (P1)

3SP47/219 The death of Jesus had left Thomas in blank despair. [H/6/811] (P1)

DA100/806 He heard the reports of others, and received abundant proof that Jesus had risen; but gloom and unbelief filled his heart. [H/7/811] (P2)

DA101/806 As he heard the disciples tell of the wonderful manifestations of the risen Saviour, it only plunged him in deeper despair. [H/7,8/811,812] (P3)

85/809 In the exercise of any power, inherent or delegated, natural or acquired, Jeremiah and Ezekiel were altogether impotent of themselves to overturn a nation; in the exercise of any power, original or conferred, personal or official, the apostles were just as impotent to remove any sinner's guilt. [Hanna, LC]

1/811 Was it his fault, or his misfortune simply, that Thomas was not present at that first meeting on the evening of the day of the resurrection? [Hanna, LC]

6/811 It may, therefore, have been Thomas' extreme incredulity as to the fact of the resurrection, the utter and blank despair into which the death of his Master had cast him, which indisposed him to join the rest. [Hanna, LC]

7/811+ If it were so; if he kept aloof from his brethren as believing that no good could come from their assembling; that it was all over with the hopes as to their Master which they had been cherishing; that they were mere idle tales which had been circulating about his having risen from the dead; then for his neglect of all that Jesus had predicted about his death and resurrection, and for his treatment of the testimony of Peter and the other early visitors of the sepulchre, he was amply punished, in losing that sight of the risen Jesus given to the others, and in his being left, for the seven days that followed, to the wretchedness of uncertainty and doubt--an uncertainty and doubt which would be all the bitterer, as contrasted with the unclouded convictions and new-born joy of his brother disciples. [Hanna, LC]

8/812 While they, lifted from the depths of their despair, were congratulating one another on the great triumph over death and the grave which their Master had achieved, were strengthening each other's faith, and heightening each other's joy, he, alone and disconsolate, was scraping together the scanty food on which his incredulity might nourish itself. [Hanna, LC]

DA102/806+ If Jesus had really risen from the dead there could be no further hope of a literal earthly kingdom.
[H/7,22/811,812] (P2)

DA103/807 And it wounded his vanity to think that his Master should reveal Himself to all the disciples except him. [H/71/816] (P2)

DA104/807 He was determined not to believe, and for a whole week he brooded over his wretchedness, which seemed all the darker in contrast with the hope and faith of his brethren. [H/7/811] (P1)

DA105/807 During this time he repeatedly declared, "Except I shall see in His hands the print of the nails, and put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into His side, I will not believe." [H/13/812] (B1)

DA106/807 He would not see through the eyes of his brethren, or exercise faith which was dependent upon their testimony. [H/56/815] (P2)

DA107/807 He ardently loved his Lord, but he had allowed jealousy and unbelief to take possession of his mind and heart. (I1)

DA108/807 A number of the disciples now made the familiar upper chamber their temporary home, and at evening all except Thomas gathered here. (I1)

DA109/807 One evening Thomas determined to meet with the others. (I1)

DA110/807 Notwithstanding his unbelief, he had a faint hope that the good news was true. [H/81,87/816] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

22/813 It was not the character of the event, it was the nature of their precedent faith in, and their precedent expectations about, their Master and his kingdom, which generated the difficulty which was felt by them as to believing in the resurrection. [Hanna, LC]

71/816 'And is it even thus,' we feel disposed to make answer, 'that thy hurt vanity hopes to redeem itself from the fancied oversight; is it thus that placed, as thou thinkest, below thy brethren, by not having got the same proof given them, thou thinkest to set thyself right by putting thyself above them, and declaring that that proof may have been enough for them, but is not enough for thee?' [Hanna, LC]

[See Hanna, LC 7/811 above.]

13/812 All that is told is, that he took and kept resolutely to that position behind which he had entrenched himself, as he said, "Except I shall see in his hands the print of the nails, and put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into his side, I will not believe." Jn. 20:25 [Hanna, LC]

56/815 He did not like, he did not choose to be indebted to others for the grounds of his believing. [Hanna, LC]

81/816 He had taken up a position which it behooved him to defend; but I am much mistaken, if a strong desire, an expectation, nay, something of a faith, that it was even as his brethren had told him, was not working latently, yet strongly in his breast. [Hanna, LC]

DA111/807 While the disciples were taking their evening meal, they talked of the evidences which Christ had given them in the prophecies. (I1)

DA112/807 "Then came Jesus, the doors being shut, and stood in the midst, and said, Peace be unto you." (B2)

DA113/807 Turning to Thomas He said, "Reach hither thy finger, and behold My hands; and reach hither thy hand, and thrust it into My side: and be not faithless, but believing." [H/89/817] (B1)

DA114/807 These words showed that He was acquainted with the thoughts and words of Thomas. [H/91,93/817] (I2)

DA115/807 The doubting disciple knew that none of his companions had seen Jesus for a week. [H/91a/817] (V2)

DA116/807 They could not have told the Master of his unbelief. [H/91b/817] (P1)

DA117/807 He recognized the One before him as his Lord. [H/93/817] (P2)

DA118/807 He had no desire for further proof. [H/98/817] (P2)

DA119/807 His heart leaped for joy, and he cast himself at the feet of Jesus crying, "My Lord and my God." [H/100/817] (P2)

3SP63/221 He cast himself at the feet of his Master in deep affection and devotion, crying, "My Lord and my God." [Jn. 20:28] [H/100/817] (P1)

DA120/807 Jesus accepted his acknowledgment, but gently reproved his unbelief; "Thomas, because thou hast seen Me, thou hast believed: blessed are they that have not seen, and yet have believed." [H/110-112/818] (P2)

3SP64/221 Jesus accepted his acknowledgment, but mildly rebuked him for his unbelief: "Thomas, because thou hast seen me, thou hast believed; [H/110-112/818] (P1)

89/817 The general salutation over, and before another word was spoken, he turns to Thomas and says, "Reach hither thy finger, and behold my hands; and reach hither thy hand, and thrust it into my side: and be not faithless, but believing." Jn. 20:17 [Hanna, LC]

91a/87 Thomas knew that for seven days none of the disciples had seen the Lord; [Hanna, LC]

91b/817 none of them could have reported to Him the words that he used. [Hanna, LC]

93/817 It is the omniscient Jesus; it is his own well-beloved Master who stands before him! [Hanna, LC]

98/817 That sight, those words of Jesus, are sufficient to rebuke and to remove his unbelief. [Hanna, LC]

100/817 Adoring, believing, loving, the fervent, affectionate Thomas casts himself at his Master's feet, exclaiming, "My Lord and my God!" [Hanna, LC]

110a/818 But though he refuses not the tendered homage, he passes no such approving judgment on him who presents it, [Hanna, LC]

111/818 Instead of this, Christ administers now a mild but effective rebuke: "Thomas, because thou hast seen me, thou hast believed. Jn. 20:29 [Hanna, LC]

DA121/807 The faith of Thomas would have been more pleasing to Christ if he had been willing to believe upon the testimony of his brethren. [H/115/818] (I2)

3SP65/221 Jesus here showed Thomas that his faith would have been more acceptable to him if he had believed the evidence of his brethren, and had not refused to believe until he had seen Jesus with his own eyes. [H/115/818] (I2)

DA122/807 Should the world now follow the example of Thomas, no one would believe unto salvation; for all who receive Christ must do so through the testimony of others. [H/117/818] (I1)

DA123/807 Many who are given to doubt excuse themselves by saying that if they had the evidence which Thomas had from his companions, they would believe. [H/118/818] (P2)

DA124/807+ They do not realize that they have not only that evidence, but much more. [H/119/818] (I2)

DA125/808 Many who, like Thomas, wait for all cause of doubt to be removed, will never realize their desire. (I1)

DA126/808 They gradually become confirmed in unbelief. (I1)

DA127/808 Those who educate themselves to look on the dark side, and murmur and complain, know not what they do. (I1)

DA128/808 They are sowing seeds of doubt, and they will have a harvest of doubt to reap. (I1)

DA129/808 At a time when faith and confidence are most essential, many will thus find themselves powerless to hope and believe. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

112/818 "Blessed are they who have not seen, and yet have believed." Jn. 20:29 [Hanna, LC]

115/818 It was, in fact, as addressed to Thomas, a distinct enough yet delicate intimation that his faith had been all the more acceptable to his Master if it had not been delayed so long. [Hanna, LC]

117/818 The spirit of Thomas still lives among us. [Hanna, LC]

118/818 Have we not often detected ourselves, thinking at least, if not saying, that, had we lived in the days of Jesus Christ, had we seen what those disciples saw, we would not have doubted as they did; that, give us but the evidence that they had, and our doubts would disappear? [Hanna, LC]

119/818 We practise thus a strange deception upon ourselves. [Hanna, LC]

DA130/808 In his treatment of Thomas, Jesus gave a lesson for His followers. [H/132/819] (P2)

DA131/808 His example shows how we should treat those whose faith is weak, and who make their doubts prominent. [H/132/819] (I2)

3SP72/222 Jesus in his treatment of Thomas gave his followers a lesson regarding the manner in which they should treat those who have doubts upon religious truth, and who make those doubts prominent. [H/132/819] (I2)

DA132/808 Jesus did not overwhelm Thomas with Reproach, nor did He enter into controversy with him. [H/133,136/819] (P2)

DA133/808 He revealed Himself to the doubting one. [H/137/819] (P1)

3SP73/222 He did not overwhelm Thomas with words of reproach, nor did he enter into a controversy with him; but, with marked condescension and tenderness, he revealed himself unto the doubting one. [H/133,136,137/819] (P1)

DA134/808 Thomas had been most unreasonable in dictating the conditions of his faith, but Jesus, by His generous love and consideration, broke down all the barriers. [H/135,137/819] (P1)

3SP74/222 Thomas had taken a most unreasonable position, in dictating the only conditions of his faith; but Jesus, by his generous love and consideration, broke down all the barriers he had raised. [H/135,137/819] (P1)

DA135/808 Unbelief is seldom overcome by controversy. (I1)

DA136/808 It is rather put upon self-defense, and finds new support and excuse. (I1)

DA137/808 But let Jesus, in His love and mercy, be revealed as the crucified Saviour, and from many once unwilling lips will be heard the acknowledgment of Thomas, "My Lord and my God." [H/138/819] (I2)

132/819 Second; Let us take this instance of our Lord's treatment of Thomas, as a guide and example to us how to treat those who have doubts and difficulties about the great facts and truths of religion. [Hanna, LC]

133/819 There was surely a singular toleration, a singular tenderness, a singular condescension in the manner of the Saviour's conduct here towards the doubting, unbelieving apostle. [Hanna, LC]

136/819 What abundant materials for controversy, for condemnation did his case supply! [Hanna, LC]

135/819 It was not only an unreasonable, it was a proud, a presumptuous position he took up, in dictating the conditions upon which alone he would believe. [Hanna, LC]

137/819 Yet not by these does Jesus work upon him, but by love--by simply showing himself, by stooping even to comply with the conditions so unreasonably and presumptuously prescribed. [Hanna, LC]

138/819 And if, in kindred cases--when the spirit of religious incredulity is busy in any human breast, doing there its unhappy work in blasting the inward peace--waiving all controversy we could but present the Saviour as he is, and get the eye to rest upon him, and the heart to take in a right impression of the depth and the tenderness and the condescension of his love, might not many a vexed spirit be led to throw itself down before such a Saviour, saying "Lord I believe; help thou mine unbelief". [Hanna, LC]

Analysis

It should be very clear by now that much of Ellen White's commentary extends beyond what may be found in Scripture. She not only treats matters not covered in Scripture but also enlarges on topics only briefly alluded to in the Bible. At times her remarks are her own and at other times she uses material taken from other writers. Since this study is not primarily concerned with content analysis we have not made a serious attempt to compare her themes with those of Scripture or her sources.¹

We have, however, looked at the arrangement of the content for possible source dependency. In order to make this type of comparison it is necessary to note the order of the biblical narrative which is common to both Ellen White and her sources.

In chapter 84 there are some interesting differences between Ellen White's comments and the Scripture narrative which go beyond the general thematic structure. In the interest of placing the biblical material as background to the entire analysis we will first review the story line of Scripture and then move to the specific treatment of source and redactional dependency for both the DA and pre-DA texts.

The footnote at the bottom of the title page to chapter 84 of the DA text indicates that Ellen White's comments

¹For example we did not mention in the previous chapter how much of her discussion of resurrection day, the Emmaus journey, the meal, or the return trip to Jerusalem was extrabiblical as well as original and/or source dependent.

"Peace Be Unto You"

were "based on Luke 24:33-48; John 20:19-29."¹ Luke records that the two disciples return to Jerusalem and meet with the eleven and others with them at some undisclosed location. The eleven testify that Jesus was alive and had been seen by Simon. The report makes brief reference to "what things were done in the way" and that they recognized Jesus in the breaking of the bread. Suddenly Jesus appears before them and they are afraid. Jesus calms them and invites them to look at the wounds of His hands and feet. To clinch the question of His reality, He asks for food and eats before them. He then appeals to Scripture and shows them how His sufferings, death, and resurrection fulfilled the prophecies found in the Old Testament. Luke then changes the words of "Jesus" to third person and presents Jesus as talking about the preaching of "Christ" to all nations, offering repentance and remission of sins "in His name." They as witnesses were to wait in Jerusalem until they were "endued with power" before beginning their work.²

This single meeting as detailed by Luke is not mentioned in Matthew who mentions only the one appearance of Jesus to the women leaving the tomb and Jesus' later meeting with the disciples in Galilee.³ Mark's gospel speaks of the

¹DA, page 802. The earlier DA working manuscript shows that these Bible references were given for each chapter by either Ellen White or Marian Davis. We are assuming this plan was followed for the entire text. These same entries appear in the first edition of DA.

²The quotations and paraphrase are taken from the King James Version.

³Matthew 28:8-17.

"Peace Be Unto You"

encounter of Jesus and Mary, the appearance "in another form" to the two who "went into the country," and of one appearance before the "eleven as they sat at meat . . ." ¹

A careful comparison of these synoptic gospels reveals several differences. Matthew says nothing of the Jerusalem meeting and actually has Jesus telling the women to instruct the disciples that He will see them in Galilee (28:10). Mark and Luke refer to a mealtime appearance of Jesus with the eleven where, according to Mark, Jesus "upbraided them" (16:14) for their lack of faith. It is possible to view Jesus' remarks and arguments of His physical reality as "upbraiding." (Luke 24:38-43). There also may be some question over the time of this mealtime appearance. Luke clearly places this interview with Jesus on resurrection day. Mark uses the adverb "afterward" or "later," which could refer to some days later. But in view of his use of the expression "appeared first" (v. 14), it would seem that Mark is still referring to the events of resurrection day. He does not otherwise refer to Jesus' activities such as the Galilee visit mentioned by Matthew, and in this respect also his account matches Luke's record which leads the reader to conclude that Jesus ascends to heaven on resurrection day. ²

¹Mark 16:9-16. Since the Markan account is not a major element in our chapter we will not discuss the question over the authenticity of these verses. See SDA BC V, pp. 658-659.

²Luke also places the ascension in Bethany, whereas Matthew points to a mountain in Galilee but does not specifically describe the ascension. Cf. Luke 24:50, 51 and Matthew 28:16-20.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Where Luke and Mark basically agree on the one appearance of Jesus before the eleven, and that on the day of resurrection, Matthew records no such encounter and John has two. John's gospel also reports that Thomas was absent from the first gathering on the evening of the resurrection day, making it possible for only ten of the disciples to have witnessed this first appearance of Jesus.¹ Against Luke's report of Jesus' telling the disciples to remain in Jerusalem until they be given the power to witness, John speaks of giving them the Holy Spirit on the first occasion. John also describes the second appearance of Jesus before the disciples and Thomas' doubts as well as his confession of faith. John tells us nothing of the Emmaus experience and has no ascension of Jesus. His final chapter does include some comment on the Galilee appearances of Jesus as mentioned by Matthew.

In uniting the accounts of Luke and John as does Ellen White in chapter 84 we would anticipate three main points of interest for the chapter. These would be the first appearance of Jesus before His disciples, the giving of the Holy Spirit to all the remaining disciples but Thomas, and the second appearance before the disciples when doubting Thomas becomes a believer again.

We now turn to our analysis of Ellen White's writings on these topics. With this background on the agreements and disagreements of Scripture we will be in a better position

¹John 20:19-31.

"Peace Be Unto You"

to evaluate her reconstruction of the story and her commentary on these two encounters of Jesus with His disciples.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Chapter 84 contains 137 sentences or 138 evaluation units.¹ As Table 1, page 821 indicates, 5 of the sentences were evaluated as Verbatim, 25 as Strict Paraphrase, 39 as Simple Paraphrase, and 2 as Loose Paraphrase. Ellen White's independent commentary took 28 sentences, 17 showed Partial Independence, and 7 reflected some dependency in the use of quotations from the Bible. We counted 15 independent Bible quotations.

Most of the literary parallels came from Hanna's Life of Christ as Table 2 on page 822 shows. Hanna influenced 61 sentences and 34 parallels came from Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. If we count the sentences of Partial Dependence on the side of dependence, we have 95 of the 138 sentence units, or 69 percent of the chapter, indicating some dependence. Ellen White's independent commentary of 28 sentences accounts for 20 percent of the chapter. The 15 Bible quotations take up 11 percent of the chapter's comments.

According to our evaluation scale the 123 sentences, or 89% of the text of commentary, measures a dependency rate of 2.83 or nearly that of Loose Paraphrase on the average. If

¹DA10 is divided into 10a and 10b.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 84

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01. DA	00	05	25	39	02	07	17	28	15	138
	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
02. 3SP (78)	00	05	13	06	00	00	05	01	00	30
03. ST (88)	00	01	03	01	00	00	00	00	00	05
04. MS113 (97)	00	01	05	03	03	00	00	00	00	12
05. MS149 (97)	00	02	05	03	00	05	07	01	00	23
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	09	26	13	03	05	12	(02)	(00)	70

TABLE 2
DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 84

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	(15)	15
02. Hanna LC	00	02	10	27	02	05	15	00	00	61
03. March NS	00	03	15	12	00	02	02	00	00	34
TOTALS DA Text	00	05	25	39	02	07	17	00	(15)	110
	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	

"Peace Be Unto You"

we omit the independent sentences as well as the Bible quotations, the 95 dependent sentences average 3.66, about midpoint between Loose and Simple Paraphrase. A complete list of the DA sentences, their literary source parallels, and evaluations may be found in Appendix A.

In our efforts to discover how much of chapter 84 was written independently of the earlier writings we compared the sentences of the DA text with the sentences of the earlier texts. This comparative study is found in Table A, beginning on page 825. Only those sentences listed in column 5 to the extreme right and having no corresponding parallel with an earlier text can be taken as possibly original with the DA text.¹ Only DA sentences 43, 56, 68, 70, 72, 73, 75-81, 83, 90-94, 127, 128, and 129 have no previous text parallel. Of these 22 sentences 14 are Ellen White's independent comment, 6 relate to Hanna's life of Christ, 1 from March, and 1 from the Bible.

We do not mean to suggest that these 22 sentences, or approximately 16% of the chapter, represent new content.² While some of the material is new because of Ellen White's

¹It is possible we have missed some of Ellen White's earlier remarks on these topics. We have largely confined our review to the larger narrative commentary of Ellen White. We have not checked with the E. G. White indices to see if devotional or doctrinal texts previously written included such remarks.

²The sentences listed in column 5 do not exactly match the evaluation units of our study. In order to show the corresponding sentence content between sentences which have been rewritten and rearranged we have had to designate the sections of some sentences by a letter of the alphabet. We list 141 sentence units in column 5 but our text presentation lists 138.

"Peace Be Unto You"

enlargement of her independent material or her return to the sources for additional parallels,¹ these sentences also include thoughts found earlier in her comments but presented in the DA text in such a form as to be literarily independent from the previously written texts. Our major purpose in bringing up this comparative study is to emphasize the 84% of the chapter which is dependent on earlier compositions. The high percentage of dependency on the earlier materials provides clear evidence that the DA text is a composite work.

Another approach in support of the same claim is to note how many sentences under the DA column, or fifth column counting from the left, are not presented in parentheses or brackets. When the earliest form of the text, the 3SP form, is to a major degree changed in a later text or manuscript the change is indicated by parentheses. If a second change occurs the sentence is bracketed. If a third change takes place we return to the parenthesis sign. If no parentheses or brackets appear the sentence is actually or virtually identical to an earlier form of the same sentence. Out of the 141 sentences or sentence units given in column 5 of Table A, 92 indicate no change. If we subtract the 22 sentences which are new for the DA text we are left with 70

¹We shall have more to say about Ellen White's return to the sources under the analysis of the pre-DA text below. Even though 7 of the 22 new sentences reflect parallels from Hanna and March not previously quoted in the earlier writings there is also evidence in support of this claim to be found in studying the modifications made to the earlier texts.

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 84

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
001.	1				(1)
002.	2	(70a)			2
003.	3b	(70b)	[112]		(3)
004.	3a				(4)
005.	4				
006.	5		(113)		5
007.			114		6
008.	6a		(115)		7
009.			116		8
010.			117		9
011.	6a	(71)	[118a]		10a
012.	6b				(10b)
013.		72	(118b)		11
014.	7		(119)		12
015.	8				
016.	9				
017.	10				
018.	11		(120)		13
019.			121		(14)
020.	12		122-125		
021.	13				
022.				21a	
023.	14	(73a)	[126a]		15a
024.	15	(73b)	[126b]		15b
025.		74	(127)		16
026.			128		17
027.		75			
028.		76a	129		18
029.		76b	130		19
030.			131		20
031.	16	(77a)	[132]	21b	21
032.	17				22
033.			140	(23)	
034.	18	77b			23
035.	19	78	141		24
036.	20		142	22	25
037.	21a				26
038.	21b				27
039.	22	79	143		28
040.	23	80	144		29
041.	24	81	145		30
042.			133	24	31
043.	25				32
044.	35				(33)

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
045. -	36				(34)
046. -	37				35
047. -	38				36
048. -	39				37
049. -	40a				
050. -	40b				
051. -	40c				
052. -	41				
053. -	42				38
054. -	43				(39)
055. -	44				(40)
056. -	45				41
057. -	46a				(42)
058. -					43
059. -	46b				44
060. -	26				(45a)
061. -	27		146		(45b)
062. -	28, 29		147		46.
063. -	30		148		47
064. -	31			(27)	[48]
065. -	32				49
066. -	33				(50)
067. -	34	(86)		[28]	51
068. -			134	25	
069. -			135, 136	26	52
070. -				29	
071. -				30	
072. -				31	
073. -				32	
074. -			131	36	53
075. -				37	54
076. -			137	(63a)	[55]
077. -					56
078. -			138	(35, 67)	[57]
079. -			139	(33b, 34)	[58]
080. -				38, 39	(59)
081. -				33a	(60)
082. -				40a, 66b	61
083. -				40b	
084. -				47	
085. -				41	
086. -				42	
087. -				43	
088. -				66a, 63b, 48	(62)
089. -				64	
090. -				65	

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
091. -				68	
092. -				44	(63)
093. -				45b	(64)
094. -				45a	(65)
095. -				46	(66)
096. -				49	
097. -				50	
098. -				51	
099. -				52	
100. -				53	
101. -				54	
102. -				(59)	67
103. -				61	
104. -				62	
105. -					68
106. -				60	(69)
107. -					70
108. -				84	71
109. -					72
110. -					73
111. -				58	(74)
112. -					75
113. -					76
114. -					77
115. -					78
116. -					79
117. -					80
118. -					81
119. -				78	(82)
120. -					83
121. -				71	(84)
122. -				72a, 75	(85)
123. -				72b	(86)
124. -				73	
125. -				74	(87)
126. -				69, 96	(88)
127. -				70	
128. -				76	
129. -				77	
130. -				78	(89)
131. -				79	
132. -				80	
133. -				81	
134. -				82	
135. -				83	
136. -					90

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MSL13/97</u>	<u>MSL49/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
137.	-				91
138.	-				92
139.	-				93
140.	-				94
141.	-			85	95
142.	-			55	
143.	-			86	(96)
144.	-			56	(97)
145.	-			57	
146.	-				98
147.	-			87	
148.	-			88	
149.	-			89	
150.	-			90	
151.	-			91	
152.	-			92	
153.	-			93	
154.	-			94	
155.	-			95	
156.	-			96	
157.	-			97	
158.	-			98	
159.	-	49			(99)
160.	-	47			
161.	-	48			
162.	-	50			(100)
163.	-	51a			101
164.	-	51b			102
165.	-	52a			103
166.	-	52b			104
167.	-	53			(105)
168.	-	54			166
169.	-	55			107
170.	-	56			(108)
171.	-	57a			(109)
172.	-	57b			(110)
173.	-	58a			111
174.	-	58b			112
175.	-	59			(113)
176.	-	60			114
177.	-	61a			115
178.	-	61b			116
179.	-	62a			117
180.	-	62b			118
181.	-	62c			119a
182.	-	63			119b

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
183. -	64				120
184. -	65				(121)
185. -	66				122
186. -	67				(123)
187. -	68				(124)
188. -	69a				125
189. -	69b				(126)
190. -					127
191. -					128
192. -	69c				
193. -	70				
194. -	71				
195. -					129
196. -	72a				130
197. -	72b				(131)
198. -	73a				132
199. -	73b				(133)
200. -	74				134
201. -	75a				(135)
202. -	75b				136
203. -	76				137

"Peace Be Unto You"

sentence units which are virtually if not entirely identical each to an earlier sentence. This means that over one-half of the DA text represents a verbatim duplication of previously written sentences. Under our examination of these earlier written documents we shall on occasion speak of the degree to which each of the four texts contributed to the DA text.

Chapter 84 presents some of the same problems we have met in our study of the other chapters in relating the DA text to the sources. There is the question of which source is being used. In several instances we list two sources but in Appendix A we give the first source mentioned after the DA sentence. The evaluation also represents the dependency applied to the sentence when compared to the first source given.¹ Another question involves the evaluation. Often there is a great degree of dependency in a sentence that also has much of Ellen White's independent comment. We have only one category for partial independency though the sentences vary in degree of independence or dependence. Such evaluations are only approximate.

We also face a complicated issue in the matter of repetition or duplication of expressions and thoughts. This occurs not only in Ellen White's text but in the sources as well. How is one to be sure as to which sentences are in parallel?² We have usually depended upon verbal

¹See DA11,12/802. Of course we must also consider the possibility that the DA text is combining two similar source sentences.

²Cf. DA59,60/805; DA79/806, and DA93/806. See below

"Peace Be Unto You"

similarities of special constructions and parallel contextual thematic development as clues to establishing dependency.

Ellen White's independent comments were of several kinds in chapter 84. We found no large blocks of original material but in several sections she stressed a special point of view. In sentences 68-77 she emphasized the church's responsibility in the matter of "retaining" sins. She evidently interpreted this phrase to mean giving censure and clear warning in instances of wrong doing. Two shorter independent sections, sentences 107-112 and 125-129, treated the problem of Thomas' doubting spirit and the dangers in store for Christians who follow the example of Thomas.

In several sentences Ellen White took a different tact than did her literary source. On one occasion where the sources presented a problematic situation Ellen White took a decided position.¹ When March takes over 30 sentences to elaborate on the resurrection of the saints, which Jesus illuminates through His resurrection, Ellen White covers the topic in only four. Hanna only reminds us that he had said all he had to say in the previous chapter when he discussed

under the analysis of the pre-DA text for additional illustrations of this problem.

¹In the absence of any clear evidence from Scripture March suggests that "we may suppose" the meeting place of the disciples was the same "upper room" where Jesus spent Thursday evening with the disciples before His death (M/78/421). Ellen White has no such hesitancy (DA3/802). Hanna puts the issue in the form of a rhetorical question, "Where but in that same chamber can we imagine that this Sunday evening assembly gathered?" (H/13/803)

"Peace Be Unto You"

the form of Jesus' post-resurrection "body." He prefers to leave it as a "mystery" (p. 804). When Hanna interprets the giving of the Spirit to the disciples as providing them with the power to convince mankind of sin, Ellen White stresses the power of the Spirit to impart the "life of Christ," including the attributes of His character.¹

These examples of Ellen White's independence from her literary sources and other instances of lesser significance in terms of content clearly indicate that Ellen White is in control of her material. She appears to have been as free to accommodate the writings of others to her purposes as she is to use them on their own merits.

We have already argued that chapter 84 is heavily dependent on previous writings. It may even be argued that Manuscripts 113 and 149 of 1897 were specifically written DA texts and should be so analyzed here. In view of the fact that these manuscripts also undergo revision and change comparable to earlier manuscripts and even the SP text, we have chosen to consider all manuscripts of these types as pre-DA texts. Were we to locate a DA chapter in manuscript form such a text would be treated as DA text. In harmony with our pattern of analysis we now turn to the pre-DA materials. Unavoidably we shall have more to say about the DA text in our comparative study of these earlier writings.

¹Compare DA60,61/805 with Hanna LC55-80/806-807.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

Before publishing the DA text Ellen White had covered the Jerusalem appearances of Jesus before the eleven disciples in four separately written documents. We shall review each of them separately before drawing general conclusions on the four as a group.

Chapter XVI of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III, devotes 76 sentences to discuss the meeting of the two Emmaus disciples and the other disciples in the upper room, the appearances of Jesus in their midst, the teachings of Jesus to the disciples, what this fellowship with Jesus and His resurrection may mean to Christian believers today, the absence of Thomas, how Jesus restores the faith of Thomas in a second meeting a week later, and lessons to be learned from the experience of Jesus and Thomas. Only 12 of the 76 sentences treating the appearances of Jesus "in the upper chamber" are not found in the DA text. Of the 64 reflected in the DA about 17 come by way of MS 113 to be discussed below and some via the Signs article of 1888. According to our analysis 43 sentences came to the DA text directly and about half of these without any major modification of the text.¹

¹The 43 sentences have the net effect of furnishing 54 DA sentences. Several of the longer SP sentences were edited to form shorter DA sentences. For example, the 3SP sentences 21, 51, 52, 57, 58, 61, 62, 69, 72, 73, and 75, a total of 11 sentences, appear in the DA text as 22 sentences. Occasionally the editing does have the opposite effect. The 3SP sentences 28 and 29 are combined into one DA sentence, DA46.

"Peace Be Unto You"

The extent of duplication between the SP text and our chapter in the DA made it impractical to present both texts and list the evaluation for both texts. We included only enough sentences from 3SP to illustrate this dependency of the DA text on 3SP and to indicate where the source dependency is the greatest if some difference in the use of the source was readily apparent. The full evaluation of the source dependency of these earlier writings is beyond the scope of the study. In some of the earlier chapters of the study when there was less duplication between the DA text and the previously written materials the evaluation of the earlier texts provided a stronger comparative model. That is no longer the case as Table A clearly shows.

Ellen White used Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March and William Hanna's Life of Christ when composing the 3SP text. These are the only two sources used in any of the early texts according to our study. Since we did not make a thorough study of the SP text we have nothing to report on the content of the dependent material when compared with Ellen White's independent comment in this chapter. The general comparison of the content of 3SP with the DA text will be presented under the redaction analysis below.

In sentences 70-86 of the Signs article of 1888¹ Ellen White presents a brief overview of the upper room appearance of Jesus on the day of His resurrection. She builds upon the text of 3SP but also adds some material from March²

¹Signs, January 20, 1888.
²ST(88)72, 74, 76.

"Peace Be Unto You"

which is not found in 3SP. The DA text reflects most of this March material through the influence of Manuscript 113, 1897, to which we now turn.¹

Manuscript 113, 1897, was introduced in our study of chapter 83. This document, entitled "The Walk to Emmaus," carries Ellen White's comments on the experience of the two disciples on the road to Emmaus, their return to Jerusalem, and encounter with Jesus in the upper room where the other disciples were gathered as well. The 37 sentences of the manuscript on the topic of chapter 84, from sentence 112 to the close at sentence 148, is obviously dependent on 3SP and the Signs article. If our analysis as indicated in Table A is correct, MS 113 supplied 14 complete sentences for the DA text in addition to influencing the construction of 3 sentences, and passing on the verbal form of 8 others.² Insofar as Manuscript 113 treats the content of chapter 84 it is the major influence behind the construction of the DA text. Rather than an earlier writing, MS 113 should be considered as the rough draft for the first major segment of the DA chapter. Judging from Appendix C which lists the sources reflected in the sentences presented from MS 113, March's Night Scenes is the dominant literary influence

¹ST(88)75 apparently was not picked up by MS 113 and is also not in the DA text. It would appear that no further reference was made to the Signs article after MS 113 was composed.

²DA sentences 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 17, 20, 25, and 31 are identical (or almost so) to their corresponding sentences in MS 113; DA3, 10, and 14 while undergoing modifications show the influence of MS 113; DA18, 19, 24, 28, 29, 30, 46, and 47, are in the latter class.

"Peace Be Unto You"

behind its composition.

Evidently Ellen White returned to March's volume when working on Manuscript 113. She repeats material from the Emmaus journey as does March.¹ There are also DA sentences from MS 113 which reflect March but are not found in the earlier writings.²

A second 1897 manuscript with the title of "The Remission of Sins," was also copied by Margaret (Maggie) Hare. Manuscript 149 carries the date of December 1, 1897. Like MS 113 there is no handwritten text of the manuscript and the typed copy does not contain either the handwritten or stamped signature of Ellen G. White. William Hanna's Life of Christ is definitely the major influence behind the text of MS 149 as a review of Appendix C would clearly reveal.

Ellen White may have produced MS 149 at the behest of Marian Davis. In MS 113 Ellen White quotes John 20:20b-23 where the Gospel recounts the giving of the Holy Spirit to the disciples and the authority to "remit" and "retain" sins.³ These few verses are John's contribution to the record of what took place at that first evening meeting of Jesus and the disciples. In view of a second account of the giving of the Holy Spirit in Acts and the theological difficulties raised by these verses in respect to the

¹Note the paraphrase of March, NS85c-g/421 in MS(113)122-125 located in the text presentation following DA14/802.

²Cf. DA17/802 and MS(113)128.

³See MS(113)133-136.

"Peace Be Unto You"

ecclesiastical authority of religious leaders, these verses are not to be lightly passed over. They are not included in the commentary of 3SP and in MS 113 receive only a brief remark by Ellen White.¹ Marian Davis may have noticed this rather slight treatment and suggested that further comment might be helpful.

Robert W. Olson in his pamphlet, "How the Desire of Ages Was Written," summarizes part of Marain Davis' role as follows:

In organizing the material into chapters, Marian noted areas on which she had nothing from Ellen White's pen. Apparently the two women had such a close working relationship that Marian felt free to make suggestions to Mrs. White as to what she thought might be lacking from the book.²

It is also very possible that in reviewing the text of 3SP it was noticed that the second appearance in the upper room involved John's Gospel since he is the only one to report it. He alone of the four gospel writers mentions the two appearances a week apart, Thomas' absence from the first occasion, and the giving of the Holy Spirit. It would be difficult to introduce John's record of the second appearance and not his description of the first appearance and the Holy Spirit experience.

At any rate MS 149 contains 98 sentences, the first 20 of which set the stage by comparing the teachings of Jesus

¹See MS(113)137-139.

²Cited from "An Introductory Statement to the Document, 'Exhibits Relating to the Writing of The Desire of Ages,'" compiled by Ron Graybill and Robert W. Olson, Ellen G. White Estate, Washington, D. C., May 23, 1979, page 3.

"Peace Be Unto You"

with the misleading influences of religious teachers of the day. Sentence 21 picks up the story as Jesus meets the disciples in the upper room on the day of His resurrection. The remaining sentences of MS 149 have to do with the breathing of the Holy Spirit upon the disciples and the accompanying charges of Jesus. While the 78 sentences could not be taken over into the composition of chapter 84, 21 complete sentences¹ and parts of several others were.

We should not overlook a more subtle kind of dependency between these earlier Ellen White texts and the DA text. We identify parallels largely according to verbal similarities. In Table A we show that sentence 55 of MS 149 was not used in the DA text. We also indicate that MS(149)86 was used in the construction of DA96. Perhaps we should have also listed MS(149)55 as contributing to DA96.

Regardless of the degree to which MS 149, 1897, has influenced chapter 84, it does seem reasonable to conclude that MS 149 played a major role in providing many sentences for this chapter. We shall have more to say under redaction below as to the contribution of this document.

The complete text of 3SP, chapter XVI, the Signs article of January 29, 1888, Manuscript 113, 1897, and Manuscript 149, 1897, are included in Appendix D. Sentence numbers have been added to aid the reader in checking the analysis and the comparative listing given in Table A above. We suggest that these texts be given careful scrutiny,

¹MS(149) 36, 37, 38, 39, 44, 45, 46, 56, 59, 60, 84, 58, 66, 78, 71, 72, 74, 78, 85, 86, 96.

"Peace Be Unto You"

particularly in areas where the content is so similar we may not have listed the best sentence parallels. Sentences 30, 33, and 34 of MS 149, for example, are making the same basic point.

The evaluation of each sentence presented from these earlier texts may be found in Appendix B. Our findings for MS 149 show that Hanna's Life of Christ was the dominant source behind Ellen White's comments on the giving of the Holy Spirit and the associated statements of Christ relative to the authority of the apostles.

The four documents providing the major portion of chapter 84 have not been fully evaluated for reasons given above. We selected 68 sentences for their value in showing source dependency of the Ellen White text. At times this literary dependency was apparent in the earlier text and not in the DA text. In other cases the dependency was clearer, or to a greater degree, in one of these supporting texts than in the DA text. These 68 sentences include 38 parallels from Hanna's Life of Christ and 30 from Night Scenes in the Bible by March. We show in Table 3, page 840, that these two sources provided in these 68 sentences 9 Verbatim sentences, 26 Strict Paraphrase, 13 Simple Paraphrase, 3 Loose Paraphrase, and 5 instances where the Bible has been quoted through the influence of a source. We credited Ellen White with 12 sentences of Partial Independence. In addition to the 68 sentences showing literary dependency we listed in Appendices B and C two

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 84

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9									
TEXT	V1	Strict Verbatim	V2	Verbatim	P1	Strict Paraphrase	P2	Simple Paraphrase	P3	Loose Paraphrase	B1	Source Bible	I2	Partial Independence	I1	Strict Independence	B2	Bible	TOTAL
01. Hanna IC	00	04	12	07	00	05	10	00	00	00	38								
02. March NS	00	05	14	06	03	00	02	00	00	00	30								
TOTALS Pre-DA.	00	09	26	13	03	05	12	00	00	(00)	68								

"Peace Be Unto You"

additional sentences where Ellen White's remarks are independent.

These 70 sentences when evaluated according to the dependency scale show an average dependency of 3.81. The 68 dependent sentences measure out at 3.93 or close to Simple Paraphrase.

This list of source parallels from the earlier documents is far from complete due to the amount of overlap with the DA text which we did not want to repeat. The pattern of source usage nevertheless holds true when comparing the sentence dependency of the early texts against the later DA text. Granting that exceptions occur, generally the dependency of the earlier material is of a higher degree than is found in the DA text. Table 4, page 842, offers a comparison of the evaluations of 13 DA sentences, one of which shows a higher degree of dependency for the DA text.¹

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The compositional structure of chapter 84 consists of six thematic sections, three of major length and three smaller units. The chapter opens with 34 sentences detailing the return of the two disciples to the upper room in Jerusalem and the appearance of Jesus. The next 10 sentences relate to lessons to be learned from the visit of Jesus to His disciples. Seven sentences are then devoted

¹See line 3 of Table 4.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 84

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No.	<u>DA Text</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA Txt</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA</u>	<u>Eval</u>
01.	<u>DA10a/802</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>3SP6a/216</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>ST(88)71</u>	<u>P2</u>
02.	<u>DA11/802</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>ST(88)72</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
03.	<u>DA12/802</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>3SP7/216</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
04.	<u>DA15/802</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>MS(113)126</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>ST(88)73</u>	<u>P1</u>
05.	<u>DA34/803+</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>3SP36/218</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
06.	<u>DA40/804</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>3SP44/219</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
07.	<u>DA59/805</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>MS(149)39</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
08.	<u>DA66/805</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>MS(149)46</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
09.	<u>DA67/805</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>MS(149)59</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
10.	<u>DA97/806</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>MS(149)56</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
11.	<u>DA99/806</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>3SP49/219</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
12.	<u>DA119/807</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>3SP63/221</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>
13.	<u>DA120/807</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>3SP64/221</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>_____</u>	<u>_____</u>

"Peace Be Unto You"

to a commentary on what it meant for the disciples to be witnesses (Luke 24:48). Without a transitional sentence or paragraph Ellen White moves directly into the largest segment of the chapter. The following 47 sentences discuss the significance of the receiving of the Holy Spirit in terms of power and authority for the disciples and the church. A fifth section of 22 sentences treats the experience of doubting Thomas and the second upper room appearance of Jesus. The chapter closes with 17 sentences dedicated to pointing out the lessons to be learned from the way Thomas related to the resurrection and the method of Jesus in dealing with the doubts of Thomas.

With the exception of the second division the order of thematic development for chapter 84 follows the sequence of Hanna's account. The section on lessons to be learned from the post-resurrection appearance of Jesus appears to have been influenced by March's description of "The First Night After the Resurrection."¹ We should also note that Hanna's arrangement follows that of Scripture. We have already mentioned at the opening of this analysis that if one harmonizes the accounts of Mark, Luke, and John, the only gospels to record an appearance of Jesus at such a gathering of the disciples, three points of interest would emerge. There would have to be two appearances of Jesus before His disciples, the first without Thomas despite the fact that the Scriptures speak of "the eleven" and the second with

¹Night Scenes in the Bible, chapter XX, especially pages 422-427.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Thomas present. The third element would be the receiving of the Holy Spirit by those present at the first appearance. Were it not for the other details of correspondence between Hanna's commentary and Ellen White's we could be satisfied to argue that both are working mainly from Scripture.

Hanna's influence in the literary structure appears to have reached the DA text via MS 149 which will be discussed in more detail below. It also appears limited to the addition of certain segments involving narrative and admonition. It does not account for the specific order of sentences within the divisions of content nor for the Ellen White independent content scattered throughout the chapter. For example Hanna's commentary does not explain why the DA text departs from the sentence sequence of 3SP and MS 113 after 3SP25. Neither does Hanna's work explain why the DA text has in many places departed from the sentence sequence of MS 149 even when no other manuscript provides the material being presented.¹

We must, therefore, recognize not only a dependency factor for the structure of chapter 84 but also a degree of originality. Perhaps the picture will come into better focus once we have looked at the literary outlines of the earlier texts.

¹See Table A, pp. 825-829, for a comparative listing of parallel and non-parallel sentences.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The text of 3SP, chapter XVI, has two major parts. Lines 1-26 cover the first appearance of Jesus and lines 47-76, the second occasion when Jesus suddenly stands in their midst. The first section leans on March and Hanna for both extrabiblical details and on March alone for the lessons to be drawn. The source used behind the narrative on Jesus and Thomas and the teaching from this experience was Hanna. Apart from the added sections of exhortation the basic structure follows the Scripture outline. Though a few sentences do not appear in the DA text, especially some Bible quotations, the fundamental structure and text reappear in the DA text.

The only change in the structure of the text of 3SP when taken over into the DA text is the repositioning of sentences 26-34. These sentences on the witness of the apostles came before the lessons to be drawn from the first appearance of Jesus in the 3SP text. Apparently when the DA text added the section on the Holy Spirit it was felt that the discussion on witnessing should come after the practical exhortation. In this arrangement the unit on witnesses would lead more naturally into the part on the Holy Spirit, the Power needed for witnessing.

The Signs article covers the only Lukan account of the first appearance of Jesus in Jerusalem. In the 26 sentences dedicated to this encounter, eight sentences are taken up with Lukan quotations. Apart from the description of how

"Peace Be Unto You"

the two disciples come to meet the other disciples in the upper room the article does not contribute to the DA text. Even these sentences reach the text of chapter 84 indirectly through their influence on MS 113.

Manuscript 113, 1897, makes its greatest impact on the structure of chapter 84 in its introduction of John's reference to the reception of the Holy Spirit and the authority to deal with sins. While the 3SP commentary included John's record on the second appearance of Jesus and the interview with Thomas, no mention was made of the bestowal of the Holy Spirit on the disciples. Ellen White's comments on this aspect of the upper room experience are too brief to permit us to argue convincingly that Hanna's work has led her to introduce this feature of the story. Up to this place in her text she follows March's development of the story, the basic outline of which matches the Lukan account.

It is only to be expected that MS 113 would have little impact on the content arrangement of chapter 84. The major thrust of the document concerns the Emmaus road episode, the topic of chapter 83. We do find some influence of MS 113 in such matters as the editing of the text of 3SP and the Signs article.¹ Many of its sentences were taken over into the DA text as we have noted above.

¹The DA text follows MS 113 in omitting sentences 8-10/216 of the text of 3SP and the combining of 3SP14,15/217. The DA text also, however, departs from the structure of MS 113 in omitting MS(113)122-125 and changing the location of MS(113)134-139.

"Peace Be Unto You"

The final text to be considered for its influence on the structure of chapter 84 presents a complicated problem for analysis. There is no doubt that MS 149, 1897, had a direct bearing on the structure of chapter 84. It is only this text that contains the major commentary of Ellen White on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit and the authority of the church over sin as reflected in the DA text. Our source analysis clearly shows the dependency of the DA text on MS 149 and the dependency of MS 149 on Hanna's Life of Christ. Our comparative listing of the sentences of MS 149 and DA, as given in Table A,¹ indicates that the general order of thematic presentation in the section treating the Holy Spirit and authority over sin in chapter 84 parallels that of MS 149. Our study also reveals that MS 149 follows the general arrangement of Hanna's account.²

There are, however, many isolated exceptions. Ellen White at times breaks the sequential order of Hanna's sentences in writing the text of MS 149. The DA text also often departs from the sentence arrangement of MS 149. In addition, the DA text omits sections of MS 149³ and introduces small blocks of new material.⁴ Some of the additional comment involves Ellen White's independent work and other sentences show that the source is being consulted

¹See pp. 825ff above.

²See Appendix C and note the order of Hanna's sentences reflected in MS 149 and its sentence sequence.

³Cf. MS 149 sentences 29-32, 41-43, 64-68, 49-54, 79-83, and 87-98 for example.

⁴Cf. DA sentences 75-81 and 90-95.

"Peace Be Unto You"

once again.¹

The influence of MS 149 is also mitigated by a subtle editing process that is only apparent when each sentence is carefully compared. This type of literary analysis takes us beyond the scope of this investigation. We only make a brief comment here to point out the complicated nature of comparative literary analysis.

At times the restructuring of sentences may be only a stylistic consideration, such as the splitting of MS(149)72 into two separate sentences DA85,86/806. At other times such editing allows for a change of emphasis. MS(149)40a appears as DA61/805. The remainder of MS(149)40 as well as 41-43 are omitted from the DA text. The sentences omitted stress the obedience to God's law and the exaltation of God's law as the purpose of the bestowal of the Holy Spirit. The significance of the gift of the Holy Spirit is not the same as Hanna interprets this event but Ellen White's modification does bring her interpretation closer to Hanna's when the entire context is taken into consideration. The "attributes" of Christ are left undefined and could be taken as including the merciful and forgiving spirit as well as the warnings against doing evil. As such these characteristics would fit very well with Hanna's view that the power of the Spirit enables the ministry of the

¹The sentences under the previous two footnotes may be checked against Table A on pp. 825ff and with the complete text in Appendix D. Sentences under the previous footnote may also be studied in connection with Appendix A to note their dependency evaluations.

"Peace Be Unto You"

disciples to have an effect in the lives of those who hear the "witnesses."

MS 149, 1897, obviously had a major influence on the redaction of chapter 84 insofar as the section on the Holy Spirit is concerned. But having said this, we must also insist that just as the DA text exhibits an independence in its combination of materials from 3SP, MS 113, and MS 149, so does it exercise a strong measure of independence in the way it chooses to utilize the text of MS 149. As has been so typical of this entire study, we must admit to Ellen White's independent contributions as well as to her dependency on sources. This mixed approach to the conclusion involves not only her use of sources in the literary development of individual sentences but also in the structure of the chapter where such sentences find their order of presentation.

In conclusion, a few words about the content of chapter 84 may be of interest to the reader, particularly in respect to the Scriptures and the sources used.

The DA text combines the records of Luke and John but adds descriptive, theological, and devotional comment which, while found in the two sources, is not contained in Scripture. In sentences 28 to 31 of the DA text Ellen White moves from the quoting of Luke to taking a verse from John without any indication that she has done so. After some comment based upon the record of John she returns to Luke's record without the slightest hint apart from the use of

"Peace Be Unto You"

quotation marks.¹ In a few sentences she returns to quote John again with no indication she is combining Scripture accounts. Hanna also constructed a similar harmony of the gospel stories.

There is no attempt in either Ellen White's comments or those of March and Hanna to explain the conflicts between the four gospels as briefly introduced at the opening of this analysis. The DA text makes no apparent difference in the authenticity of the background descriptions as compared to the Scriptural material or theological comment. All remarks are presented as factual and/or true.

Finally, chapter 84 does not contain a lengthy block of independent Ellen White comment. There is one section of ten short sentences credited to Ellen White or the Bible.² These have to do with the church's duty to warn sinners of judgment to come upon all who continue to do evil. In subsequent comment she adds seven sentences on how to restore and encourage the repentant sinners. In view of the fact that the same general content of Ellen White's independent remarks may be found in the sources and in other sentences where the influence of the source is obvious, we are not able to establish a unique emphasis for Ellen White in chapter 84.

We did find one interesting extrabiblical piece of factual data not mentioned in the sources. In DA10b/802

¹Cf. DA46,47/804,805.

²DA68-77/805,806.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Ellen White explains how Jesus entered the upper chamber. He enters unseen with the two disciples returning from Emmaus.¹

Summary

The summary of chapter 84 brings to a close the survey of 15 chapters randomly selected from The Desire of Ages. Once again we pose 14 questions to be answered from the foregoing analysis.² The answers garnered from the summaries of the 15 chapters will form the basis for the conclusion of the study.

1. We found no handwritten manuscripts for the DA text or the earlier writings on the topic of chapter 84. Two manuscripts dating from 1897 do exist in corrected-copy typewritten form. Each bears the initials "M. H.," which stand for Margaret (Maggie) Hare, one of Ellen White's literary assistants. In neither case do we find either the handwritten or stamped signature of Ellen White.

2. We located four texts on the topic of chapter 84 written prior to the publication of DA. Chapter XVI of Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, treated the two appearances of Jesus in the upper room in Jerusalem. The 76 sentences of this published work did not include the bestowal of the Holy Spirit which received major coverage in the DA text.

¹The same point is made with other words in 3SP6b/216.

²These questions are formally stated in the Introduction, II. We do not repeat the questions for each summary. The answers, however, are stated so that the question may be inferred from the answer.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Another 27 sentences on the first encounter appear in a January 20, 1888, Signs article. The last 10 sentences of this text are really directed away from the content of chapter 84. Though we found many references to the experience of Thomas and warnings against nurturing doubts, as did this unbelieving disciple, Ellen White did not develop a narrative commentary on these post-resurrection appearances of Jesus in any other article, at least as far as we were able to discover.

The two manuscripts written on the topics of chapter 84 in 1897 appear to have been specifically written for the DA life of Christ project. Manuscript 113 obviously is revising the text of 3SP as the DA text was intended to accomplish. The title of the manuscript is identical to the caption for chapter 84 of DA. The latter part of the manuscript follows the Emmaus experience with some comment on Christ's appearance in the upper room to which the disciples from Emmaus return. This chapter on the two appearances of Jesus before the other disciples opens with sentences taken from this same section of MS 113.

The second manuscript from 1897, MS 149, appears to have been specifically written to provide commentary on several verses in John's gospel not covered in the earlier writings. Its extensive coverage on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit makes a major addition to the 76 sentences in 3SP on the two occasions when Jesus showed Himself to the disciples in the upper room.

"Peace Be Unto You"

We therefore conclude that the published DA text, even though only 137 sentences in length, offers a considerable expansion over Ellen White's earlier writings. The expansion is even greater if we count the sentences of the two manuscripts which, though written as DA text, in our judgment, were omitted from the final published edition.

3. If we grant the assumption that it is more accurate to view Manuscripts 113 and 149 of 1897 as early forms of the DA text, then we have the same general content between the DA texts and the early texts of 3SP and the Signs article. Both the early and later writings are treating two upper room visits of Jesus as presented in the gospels of Luke and John. Both the DA text and the pre-DA writings mention lessons to be drawn from these two experiences.

4. While the accounts of the DA text and 3SP are strikingly similar, there is one significant difference. The DA text, largely through the expansion provided by MS 149, has a major section on the Holy Spirit and the authority of the church to "retain" or "remit" sins. This material from John's gospel is not even mentioned in 3SP, chapter XVI, even though the encounter of Jesus and Thomas, also from the same context of John, is given full treatment by Ellen White.

5. Chapter 84 is composed of 137 sentences or 138 evaluation units. Of these, 95, or 69 percent of the chapter, registered as dependent.

6. We found 28 sentences, or 20 percent, of Ellen

"Peace Be Unto You"

White's text to be fully independent in respect to this literary form. The 15 Bible quotations taken from the gospel accounts were not credited to either the sources or to Ellen White.

7. According to the dependency rating scale, the average degree of dependency for the entire chapter apart from the gospel quotations, i.e., 123 out of the 138 sentence units, comes to 2.83. If we rate only the 95 dependent sentences, the average dependency is 3.66, or about midway between Loose and Simple Paraphrase.

8. The two main sources for chapter 84 were The Life of Christ by William Hanna and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. The former was used in the construction of 61 sentences and the latter influenced 34.

9. No other writers were found to have contributed to the literary form of chapter 84.

10. Strictly speaking we should limit the earlier writings to The Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, and to the Signs article of 1888. Manuscripts 113 and 149 were apparently written specifically for the DA text. Nevertheless, according to our method of analysis all such earlier texts are figured as pre-DA materials and rated as a group. These four earlier accounts also show dependency on the same two literary sources. The 68 dependent sentences duplicate much of the DA text. When rated in their own classification as pre-DA text the average dependency rate comes to 3.93.

"Peace Be Unto You"

11. We found no special characteristics which would justify distinguishing between the earlier and later use of the sources. The editing process involved more than one stage of revision. The 3SP text was in places modified in the production of MS 113, 1897. It was further revised in the formation of chapter 84. The final text appears to have condensed the earlier accounts of the two encounters in the upper room in Jerusalem. Ellen White did return to Hanna's commentary to add her remarks on the coming of the Holy Spirit and the charge of Jesus regarding authority over sin. This material as found in MS 149, 1897, became part of chapter 84.

Since Ellen White had alluded to the incident of the Holy Spirit in MS 113, 1897, had used the same sources for both the earlier writings and the DA text, and evidently wrote MS 149 more as a rough draft for a section of the DA text than as an independent pre-DA text, we have not viewed her comments on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit as constituting a different use of the sources.

12. There is no substantive difference between the dependent and independent comments of Ellen White in chapter 84. Both types of material include descriptive, theological, and spiritual remarks. Ellen White exhibits her independence in the areas of her emphasis and in her selective use of the two sources. She is also positive when her sources are "supposing" or "imagining." In one place she explains that Jesus enters the room in some unseen

"Peace Be Unto You"

fashion at the time the two disciples from Emmaus enter. This point is not made by her sources and is not carried over to explain how Jesus enters for his second appearance.

13. The large redactional units of the DA text follow the same order as given in the narrative as told by Luke and John. The three smaller sections dealing with the lessons to be learned from these three main episodes discussed in chapter 84 were arranged through the influence of her literary sources. March supplies the first segment and lessons, Hanna the last two sections and their lessons.

14. The major earlier writing, chapter 15 of 3SP, follows the compositional arrangement of March for the first appearance and Hanna for the second appearance a week later. The only other truly pre-DA text is the Signs article which largely follows the story line of 3SP. The two manuscripts, MS 113 and MS 149, are taken to be first drafts of the DA text. They do not overlap in their main segments, the first appearance and the giving of the Holy Spirit. Neither one of these manuscripts includes the second appearance. For comment on the encounter with Thomas, Ellen White returns to 3SP and to the text of Hanna.

Chapter 84 has proven to be one of the more "dependent" chapters of the 15 DA chapters. Its widespread use of March and Hanna poses a question for further study. Apart from literary style, how does the content of Ellen White's commentary differ from that of March or Hanna? Is it that very combination that is her unique contribution? What is

"Peace Be Unto You"

the difference in the content between chapter 84 of DA and the parallel chapters in March's or Hanna's work? Were her remarks on the role of the Holy Spirit's imparting the attributes of Jesus a basic difference from Hanna or only one of emphasis?

We might also find it of interest to compare the early writings or even the manuscript texts on the topic with the published text of DA chapter 84. Why does she omit in the DA text the references to the righteousness of the law that appeared in her earlier draft on the work of the Holy Spirit?

These questions over matters of content have been raised before in this study. They, along with the other issues raised or reinforced by our investigation will, hopefully, lead others to further analyze the writings of Ellen White.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 84

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	March NS/75/420	P1	051.	H LC/36, 46c/804, 806	P1
002.	March NS/76-78/420+	P1	052.	Hanna LC/48/806	B1
003.	March NS/78/421	P1	053.	Hanna LC/53/806	V2
004.	March NS/79/421	P1	054.	Hanna LC/54/806	P1
005.	March NS/79, 80/421	P2	055.	Hanna LC/50/806	P2
006.	March NS/81/421	P1	056.	Hanna LC/50/806	P2
007.	March NS/82/421	P1	057.	Hanna LC/50/806	I2
008.	March NS/82/421	P2	058.	Hanna LC/51/806	I2
009.	March NS/83a/421	P1	059.	Hanna LC/48, 56/806	P2
10a.	March NS/83b/421	P1	060.	Hanna LC/51/806	I2
10b.		I1	061.		I1
011.	March NS/85a/421	P2	062.	Hanna LC/57/807	I2
012.	Hanna LC/15/803	P1	063.	Hanna LC/58/807	B1
013.	March NS/84b/421	B1	064.	Hanna LC/60/807	P3
014.	March NS/85ab/421	P1	065.	Hanna LC/69a/808	I2
015.	March NS/86/421	P2	066.	Hanna LC/88/809	P2
016.	March NS/88/422	V2	067.	Hanna LC/76/808	P2
017.	March NS/89/422	P1	068.		I1
018.	March NS/91/422	V2	069.	Bible	B2
019.	March NS/87, 93/422	P1	070.		I1
020.	March NS/94/422	P2	071.		I1
021.		I1	072.		I1
022.	Bible	B2	073.		I1
023.	Bible	B2	074.		I1
024.	Bible	B2	075.	Bible	B2
025.	Bible	B2	076.		I1
026.	March NS/95/422	P1	077.		I1
027.	March NS/94/422	P2	078.	Hanna LC/77/808	P2
028.	Bible	B2	079.	Hanna LC/59/807	P2
029.	Bible	B2	080.	Hanna LC/77/808	I2
030.	Bible	B2	081.		I1
031.	March NS/99/422	B1	082.	Bible	B2
032.	Hanna LC/30/804	I2	083.		I1
033.	March NS/105/423	I2	084.	Hanna LC/88/809	I2
034.	Mar NS/102, 105/422+	P1	085.	Hanna LC/93/810	P2
035.	March NS/110/423	P2	086.	Hanna LC/90/810	P2
036.	March NS/113/423	P2	087.	Hanna LC/89, 90/809	P2
037.	March NS/114/423	B1	088.	Bible	B2
038.	March NS/147/426	P2	089.	Hanna LC/89/809	B1
039.	March NS/148/426	P1	090.		I1
040.	March NS/152/426	P1	091.		I1
041.	March NS/154/426	P2	092.		I1
042.	March NS/158/427	P2	093.	Hanna LC/59, 77/807+	P2
043.	March NS/157/427	P2	094.	Han LC/87, 78/809, 08	P2
044.	March NS/156/427	I2	095.	Hanna LC/88/809	P2
045.	Bible	B2	096.	Hanna LC/78/808	P2
046.	Bible	B2	097.	Hanna LC/83, 85/809	P2
047.	Bible	B2	098.		I1
048.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1	099.	Hanna LC/1/811	P1
049.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1	100.	Hanna LC/7/811	P2
050.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1			

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 84

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.	Hanna LC/7,8/811-12	P3	151.		
102.	Han LC/7,22/811,812	P2	152.		
103.	Hanna LC/71/816	P2	153.		
104.	Hanna LC/7/811	P1	154.		
105.	Hanna LC/13/812	B1	155.		
106.	Hanna LC/56/815	P2	156.		
107.		I1	157.		
108.		I1	158.		
109.		I1	159.		
110.	Hanna LC/81,87/816	P2	160.		
111.		I1	161.		
112.	Bible	B2	162.		
113.	Hanna LC/89/817	B1	163.		
114.	Hanna LC/91,93/817	I2	164.		
115.	Hanna LC/91a/817	V2	165.		
116.	Hanna LC/91b/817	P1	166.		
117.	Hanna LC/93/817	P2	167.		
118.	Hanna LC/98/817	P2	168.		
119.	Hanna LC/100/817	P2	169.		
120.	Hanna LC/110-12/818	P2	170.		
121.	Hanna LC/115/818	I2	171.		
122.	Hanna LC/117/818	I2	172.		
123.	Hanna LC/118/818	P2	173.		
124.	Hanna LC/119/818	I2	174.		
125.		I1	175.		
126.		I1	176.		
127.		I1	177.		
128.		I1	178.		
129.		I1	179.		
130.	Hanna LC/132/819	P2	180.		
131.	Hanna LC/132/819	I2	181.		
132.	Han LC/133,136/819	P2	182.		
133.	Hanna LC/137/819	P1	183.		
134.	Han LC/135,137/819	P1	184.		
135.		I1	185.		
136.		I1	186.		
137.	Hanna LC/138/819	I2	187.		
138.			188.		
139.			189.		
140.			190.		
141.			191.		
142.			192.		
143.			193.		
144.			194.		
145.			195.		
146.			196.		
147.			197.		
148.			198.		
149.			199.		
150.			200.		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 84

No.	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	3SP1/216	P1	1	051.	MS(149)45	I2	65
002.	3SP2/216	P1	2	052.	MS(149)46	P1	66
003.	3SP3/216	P1	4	053.	MS(149)51	B1	66
004.	MS(113)112	P1	4	054.	MS(149)52	B1	66
005.	MS(113)113	P2	5	055.	MS(149)53	B1	66
006.	3SP5/216	P1	5	056.	MS(149)54	B1	66
007.	MS(113)114	P1	6	057.	MS(149)59	P1	67
008.	MS(113)115	P1	7	058.	MS(149)61	P1	67
009.	MS(113)116	P2	8	059.	MS(149)62	I2	67
010.	MS(113)117	P1	9	060.	MS(149)55	I2	95
011.	3SP6a/216	P1	10a	061.	MS(149)86	P2	96
012.	ST(88)71	P2	10a	062.	MS(149)56	V2	97
013.	3SP6b/216	I1	10b	063.	3SP49/219	P1	99
014.	ST(88)72	P1	11	064.	3SP47/219	P1	99
015.	3SP7/216	P2	12	065.	3SP63/221	P1	119
016.	3SP9a/216	V2	12	066.	3SP64/221	P1	120
017.	3SP9b/216	I2	12	067.	3SP65/221	I2	121
018.	3SP10/216+	P2	12	068.	3SP72/222	I2	131
019.	3SP11/217	P2	13	069.	3SP73/222	P1	133
020.	MS(113)121	P1	14	070.	3SP74/222	P1	134
021.	MS(113)122	P3	14	071.			
022.	MS(113)123	P3	14	072.			
023.	MS(113)124	P3	14	073.			
024.	MS(113)125	P2	14	074.			
025.	MS(113)126	V2	15	075.			
026.	3SP14/217	P2	15	076.			
027.	3SP15/217	V2	15	077.			
028.	ST(88)73	P1	15	078.			
029.	ST(88)75	P1	17	079.			
030.	ST(88)76	V2	19	080.			
031.	3SP35/218	I2	33	081.			
032.	3SP36/218	V2	34	092.			
033.	3SP37/219	P2	35	083.			
034.	3SP40a/219	V2	37	084.			
035.	3SP40b/219	P1	37	085.			
036.	3SP40c/219	I2	37	086.			
037.	3SP41/219	P2	37	087.			
038.	3SP44/219	V2	40	088.			
039.	3SP31/218	P1	48	089.			
040.	MS(149)28	P2	51	090.			
041.	MS(149)29	I2	52	091.			
042.	MS(149)36	V2	53	092.			
043.	MS(149)35	I2	57	093.			
044.	MS(149)34	P1	58	094.			
045.	MS(149)38	P2	59	095.			
046.	MS(149)39	P1	59	096.			
047.	MS(149)33	I2	60	097.			
048.	MS(149)40	I1	61	098.			
049.	MS(149)47	B1	61	099.			
050.	MS(149)48	I2	62	100.			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 84

No.	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	3SP1/216	M/75/420		051.	MS(149)45	H/69a/808	
002.	3SP2/216	M/76-78/420		052.	MS(149)46	H/88/809	
003.	3SP3/216	M/78, 79/421		053.	MS(149)51	H/69b/808	
004.	MS(113)112	M/75-78/420f		054.	MS(149)52	H/70/808	
005.	MS(113)113	M/79, 80/421		055.	MS(149)53	H/71/808	
006.	3SP5/216	M/80/421		056.	MS(149)54	H/72/808	
007.	MS(113)114	M/81/421		057.	MS(149)59	H/76/808	
008.	MS(113)115	M/82/421		058.	MS(149)61	H/76/808	
009.	MS(113)116	M/82/421		059.	MS(149)62	H/76/808	
010.	MS(113)117	M/83a/421		060.	MS(149)55	H/83/808	
011.	3SP6a/216	M/83ab/421		061.	MS(149)86	H/78-80/808	
012.	ST(88)71	M/82, 83b/421		062.	MS(149)56	H/85/809	
013.	3SP6b/216			063.	3SP49/219	H/1/811	
014.	ST(88)72	M/83, 85a/421		064.	3SP47/219	H/6/811	
015.	3SP7/216	H/15/803		065.	3SP63/221	H/100/817	
016.	3SP9a/216	H/16a/803		066.	3SP64/221	H/110-112/818	
017.	3SP9b/216	H/16b/803		067.	3SP65/221	H/115/818	
018.	3SP10/216+	H/17a/803		068.	3SP72/222	H/132/819	
019.	3SP11/217	H/17b/803		069.	3SP73/222	H/133, 136+/819	
020.	MS(113)121	M/85ab/421		070.	3SP74/222	H/135, 137/819	
021.	MS(113)122	M/85c/421		071.			
022.	MS(113)123	M/85d, f/421		072.			
023.	MS(113)124	M/85f/421		073.			
024.	MS(113)125	M/85e, g/421		074.			
025.	MS(113)126	M/86/421		075.			
026.	3SP14/217	H/17-19/803		076.			
027.	3SP15/217	H/21/803		077.			
028.	ST(88)73	M/86/421		078.			
029.	ST(88)75	M/90/422		079.			
030.	ST(88)76	M/87, 91/422		080.			
031.	3SP35/218	M/105/423		081.			
032.	3SP36/218	M/102, 105+/423		082.			
033.	3SP37/219	M/110/423		083.			
034.	3SP40a/219	M/118/424		084.			
035.	3SP40b/219	M/119/424		085.			
036.	3SP40c/219	M/120/424		086.			
037.	3SP41/219	M/135/425		087.			
038.	3SP44/219	M/152/426		088.			
039.	3SP31/218	H/36/804		089.			
040.	MS(149)28	H/47/806		090.			
041.	MS(149)29	H/49/806		091.			
042.	MS(149)36	H/53/806		092.			
043.	MS(149)35	H/50/806		093.			
044.	MS(149)34	H/51/806		094.			
045.	MS(149)38	H/56/806		095.			
046.	MS(149)39	H/48, 50/806		096.			
047.	MS(149)33	H/50, 51/806		097.			
048.	MS(149)40			098.			
049.	MS(149)47	H/55/806		099.			
050.	MS(149)48	H/57/807		100.			